11/30/892

## APPEARANCES

2

3

1

Supreme Court of Texas:

Chief Justice Thomas R. Phillips
Justice Franklin S. Spears
Justice C.L. Ray
Justice Raul A. Gonzalez
Justice Oscar H. Mauzy
Justice Eugene A. Cook

Justice Jack Hightower (Not Present)
Justice Nathan L. Hecht

Justice Nathan L. Hecht Justice Lloyd Doggett

9

10

25

7

8

Speakers:

Page

11	Mr. Larry Niemann
	Judge Guy Jones 15
12	Mr. David Davis 34, 50, 73
	Mr. Gene Storie 42
13	Professor Patrick Hazel 44, 77, 141
	Mr. Bill Wade 47, 63
14	Mr. Bill Bailey 53, 146
	Mr. Gaston Broyles 58, 70, 80
15	Ms. Diane Shaw 66
	Professor Louis Muldrow 82
16	Mr. Clinard Hanby 94
	Mr. Russell McMains 97
17	Mr. Jim George 109
	Ms. Carole Kneeland
18	Mr. Harry Tindall 142, 155
-	Mr. John Williams
19	Mr. Stacy Suits 159
	Mr. Charles Babcock 165
20	Mr. John McElhaney 189
20	Mr. Tom Leatherbury 189
21	Mr. David Donaldson
21	Mr. Tommy Jacks
22	Mr. Tom Smith
2.2	Mr. Mack Kidd
23	Mr. Howard Nations
43	Mr. Luke Soules
0.4	
24	Mr. Brian Webb 314

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE \* AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 \* 512/452-0009

## PROCEEDINGS

morning, and welcome to the Supreme Court's public hearing on the adoption -- proposed adoption of new rules of civil and appellate procedure. We very much appreciate your interest in the rules of procedural law of the State of Texas and your taking time to be here to help give us the benefit of your thoughts on what rules we should adopt and -- and how they

This is, frankly, a bigger crowd than we had anticipated. It's going to necessitate our proceeding, I think -- rather than just letting everybody get up and give their whole say, we will proceed by blocks of rule numbers, and if you want to speak in that area, then we will speak to it.

Also, we are recording -- we are having these sessions reported. That is not something new. We have 40 or 50 years of reports on the Supreme Court Rules Advisory Committees, and those are very helpful sometimes in interpreting the rules, and so we are

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

Ÿ

ខ

should read.

1.5

## The state of the s

The state of the control of the cont

Yeard are the -- ins around a market to the transfer

and the top of the second of t

The managed of the production of the production of the control of

Construction of the constr

also reporting for posterity these proceedings today.

Since the court reporter does not know all of you by name, please state your name before you proceed to make any remarks so that she will be able to have an accurate statement. Why don't you state your name and home town so that she will have an accurate statement of who has said what in these proceedings.

Justice Nathan Hecht is the head of -- he is the liaison with the Supreme Court to the various rule-making advisory bodies that help the Supreme Court promulgate its rules, so Justice Hecht will preside over these proceedings today, and I will turn it over to him at this time.

JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, Mr. Chief Justice.

We want to begin by thanking our Rules Advisory Committee for its hard work and the proposals that they have laid upon the table. Some of the members are here including the chairman, Luke Soules, this morning, and many of these -- this committee has in the past served at its own expense and gives a lot of

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

and one can be les jourses for these sectors to be a sector of the contract of

This control is a part of the control of the contr

Togstee Fabren Rolls is the heat o -- hi in the lininon with the fabranc Court to the remions since the advinory bodies had no the Tupsone Court productate its rules, the facults take will recaise over these products of the Since Since.

\$1187 Co.

J €

٠ <u>١</u>

33

. :

· .

 $T^{-1}$ 

ï

.\*

٠.

٠. د

. 7

.. ..

. \

The state to booth by thanking one against the transfer of the control of the policy of the control of the cont

time and energy to the multitude of proposals that the Court gets each year on changes in the rules, and we thank them.

This is the first session that I recall, at least in recent memory, in which the Supreme Court has entertained direct comment on proposed changes in the rules, so if we were a little unsure as to how many would want to make comments, we have received over 50 letters in response to the invitation in the <u>Bar Journal</u>, and, of course, we have a good number of you here this morning.

The -- as the Chief Justice said, a record is being made of these proceedings, as of all committee proceedings, to help show some of the discussion that goes into the changes that are made.

Besides the proposed changes that were printed in the <u>State Bar Journal</u>, a number of other projects are pending which some of you wish to comment on today, too, by your forms that -- on which you signed up.

One of those is the local rules project: an effort to make some sense out of the local rules and to consolidate them.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

e de la completa de la completation de la proposición de la completa del completa del completa de la completa del la completa de la completa del la completa de la completa

This is the colour or raine that if it is a raine that if it is an expectable or representation of the colour of t

5.7

. 3

7.0

, L

3.5

17 3

Fig. -- as the Chief Sustice Sail, a control of the control of the

Togides the propose changes that service printer is the changes that service printer is the checkents that the constant, a number of the of the constant to the constant on today, the propose for ... that -- on which you signed up.

caus facos cost as secut he and

the the scane of the size of Stollar and the port

Sealing of court records: that subcommittee of the Rules Advisory Committee is proceeding in its work and has a tentative proposal, I believe, and is continuing to discuss it.

There is a long-term, ongoing project to try to recodify the rules and renumber them for simplicity's sake.

And then, of course, our ultimate concern, which is to simplify the rules and reduce the delay and expense in civil litigation.

So the rules changes are proceeding along different tracks, some fairly technical and some fairly general; and you are welcome to address any of those this morning.

I believe the best way to proceed is to go through the proposed changes that were printed in the State Bar Journal, and we will take them by blocks of rules. If you wish to comment on a specific rule when that block comes up, we'll ask you to come to the end of the table here and, as the Chief Justice said, state your name and anybody that you are representing, the city in which you reside, and then you are welcome to make whatever comments you wish. And

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	<u></u>
all participates and additional conversion and a	ŗ
the term of the later and the divine of the	
. M. news is no min. Jaco of the cover. Ad	
thor is a long- crass ones ag	
San ofar ont Angeon of Aan ea arefend	<i>&gt;</i>
-ಎಸ್ಗಟ ಸಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿಕಾಗಿದ್ದಾಗುಗಳ ಒತ್ತು ಸಾರಿಕ್ಕೆ ಇವರ <b>ಕ</b> ಾರ್	
ကုပ်က နေသည်ဟာ က <b>ယက ႏ</b> စ္စား လေလာ <b>ာ</b> သိန္း နေသမနေသို့ အိုတ္တို	
action of the continue of the same cost	
Leins tha felo and and are seed in civil	<u>.</u>
• 113 1 3 3 2 1. 1	ŗ "·
့ ကုန်လေ စစ်သွေး ကရာရ လေသည်လာ <b>ခေတ်သွေး ခေတ်သွေ့ ခ</b>	71 <del>. f</del>
, to a different bancks, some felany weshnica.	* ;·
ುತ್ತರೊಂದು ವಿಷ್ಣಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಅವರ ಸಂಪ್ರಕ್ಷಣೆಗಳು ಪ್ರಮುಖ ಮುಖ್ಯವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಮುಖ್ಯವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಮುಖ್ಯವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಮುಖ್ಯವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ	•
aldress eng ek these this mouning.	
ut Geograp, os gam bacd out ovoltos I	J.î.
ta ço tinençê the puaponeé changes that velo	ν΄.
ofineral in the feate for Honsues, and so will	Ç. <b>T</b>
is fair un la contra le adoptió el colta pass	/ · · ·
ក្រុងសម្រាស់ នៃសាស្ត្រ មានស្ត្រ ស្រុស្ស ស្រុស ស្រុស និងសាស្ត្រ ស្រុស និងសាស្ត្រ	•
စားကြား နေတြ မေ <b>ကျစ် ကြည် စာဆာ ကန္တာ</b> မှ မေတြ မှည့် <b>ဆိုထား</b> မှ သိသိ <sup>န်</sup> ကျစ် နေတွင်း	
estilt laged om , as the Chines Surling onld, little	<i>:</i> .
ciur nave end chyboty thet you are reprosontant,	~ •
್ಯಾನ್ ಸಮೆಟ್ರ ತೆಟ್ಟ ಅವಿನಿಯು ಇರಡ ನಿರ್ಧಾಪಕ್ಷ ಕರ್ಗಿಯ ಇರ್ಥ ನಿರ್ಧಾಪಕ್ಷ	•
the state of the s	

the Court may have some questions for you along the way, as well.

I think the first block that it makes sense to discuss are Texas Rules of Civil Procedure 1 through 21b, those rules. If -whoever wishes to speak to rules -- Texas Rules of Civil Procedure 1 through 21b, please come to the witness chair. Who will be first?

MR. NIEMANN: May I approach the bench, Your Honor?

JUSTICE HECHT: Yes, such as it is.

### LARRY NIEMANN,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

23

24

25

May it please the MR. NIEMANN: Court, my name is Larry Niemann. I represent the Texas Apartment Association, some 7,000 members in Texas, and the Texas Building Owners & Managers Association.

I wish to compliment the committee

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

the drief will allow and come are you allow the District the state of the state I with a can be unsured to be page the acceptance of the continuous states and the continuous states and the continuous states are Procedus. A through 31b, three rules. Fr -u, dever w alies to ajeak te de ca -- Cexer u.tu c. Cist Drosector C through The please amen to Ţ Vicinia ed 1112 of 12 of 100 approximation off isometra i get : Michiga ... Sapre & Course Tongs 6. J. THE TOTAL STREET STREET TO THE STREET Ţ., 40 180217112 5177012  $-f_{i}\int_{\mathbb{R}}$ combinate culture . espion to compiler p. eponer ĩ polow, .e uteroid strict la coint tolly to cojario : 1 කිස්ත්වය යන මෙසි යනුවේ වියත්වයක් මෙන්න මෙන්න සිත සම්බන්ති 7.5 : challo as bodate , objective fire. *.* ALL TERMINER: "AND IN THE MORRE LIKE 3... fourt, in mano da Savery Miohana. E regularant F - 5 toritorial Age thank and a couple to a contract 00 and the decimal decimal the decimans and the second contract ် ျင်းကျွင်းက သီလာတလုပ်လွင်းသော**း** 

Constitute of the datable trace of the first

for their hard work, but I also wish to register a -- an objection and state my reasons to the Court why we think that Texas Rule of Civil Procedure No. 4 has gone a bit too far. That is the rule in which the proposed change is for time periods under five days to have weekends and holidays not counted in the calculation of that time period. I have written a rather comprehensive letter to the Court regarding that, but let me try to summarize it.

The reason we are concerned is that these -- Rule 4 has a very serious effect on -- an adverse effect on the eviction process, forcible entries and detainers.

Just how important is this rule to our industry and to the people of Texas is exemplified by the fact that there are 900,000 civil cases filed in original jurisdiction courts in Texas every year. Very surprisingly, 12 percent of that total, or 106,000 cases, are forcible entry and detainer cases. So we're talking about a very serious effect on a lot of people in a lot of cases.

Now, how does the proposed change -- what is the basic reason, as I understand it,

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
Justines of entropy to the street of the str
              one of menor, you send our melde for he see .
                      The first of the contract of the second sections of the second
Then when the total side of the second page.
                         the critical in this man has a compared in the same
            la medeca i ved en nyob evit roman e millor e. ()
        The Australian of the State of the action of the
                          care due of a doing because of the care and
                         ាន ដែលស្ថិត នៅពេក្យ ១៨៦ ១៨ ខេត្ត ១ គឺ ក្រុង ខែក្រុងប្រ
                                                      which the document of the dollars that it
     File the son work of concorned the battle
     The contract the property and the second of the contract of th
                           radioocal neighbors and an include control of the
                                                                                   Land the court of and depicted as
        on a let insorbant is this we call
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        · .
                         or in the article on the call the case graph at and
          ್ರಿಸ್ಕ್ ೧ ರಂದ ರಜ್ಞಾನ ವಿಧಾರ ಚಿಕ್ಕಾರಿ ಜನಕ್ ಚಲನಗಳು
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      17
                          cholds abdout and the other abdout the to
      court, in News, every year. Wery insuling the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     2.1
     la percent of that cola , or 106,000 dance, and
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       . 4
                To caible energy and socainer of test. To be being
     talking about a very nerious affect on a low of
                                                                                                                 coasa is a sat of cases.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       7:
mm of all o house over our rook word such
```

wide to the constant of the charge of the office in the

for the proposed change in Rule 4? And that is to conform the calculation method to that of the federal rules where weekends are not counted in these short five-day time periods, and to prevent lawyers from playing games where they will deliver a five-day time period type notice or pleading on a Friday afternoon, and the opposing lawyer simply does not have time to properly prepare and react.

My comments there are that this game-playing problem does not exist in evictions. Now, where does the five-day rule come into evictions? Following the eviction judgment, the rules require that there be a mandatory five-day wait before the landlord can get a writ of possession to execute on the judgment he has just won. So after the landlord wins, the tenant still gets to stay there five more days before the landlord can get a writ of possession to implement the judgment.

The other way it comes into effect is that there can be no -- there is a five-day time period for appeal by the tenant -- or by the landlord, for that matter -- to the county court following an eviction.

#### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

constraint the solicity of the collection of the line of solicity and collection of the collection of the collection of the collection of the solicity of the solicity of the solicity of the collection of the co

ig dominants their the that thing ni មានការ ម៉ាប់ថា គេសេស សេសាស្រស់ ស្រុស្សាស្ថិត្តសេស .[. : ુષ્યોનુદ્રોને કે દેવા, ઓક્ટર પરંગ્ય કે લે જિલ્લા તેમ જ 6. co. a into evical as? Falloring the eviction ۲. ئ judyunat, tao ukso: . ಲ್ಲಾರಕ್ಕು ( ೧೯೮೬ ಲಿನಿಗರ ನಿರ್ಣ - 7- T are notional city of the law to the families of get a write of jourcasion to produte on the 2. jacg on the last just the go added the Landers ្រស់ នៃ ១៤១ ដែល ស្រី១ ១៦ ១៦. ភូមិស្រី ១៩ ១៣ភាព មានិសាស្ត្រ ស្ត្រី នេះ no fire a figure of and in Annal one trough byth erom obudasion is theyboachi the judgeont. 36

.

U

Ö

ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

Now, if this new rule is adopted -if, for example, a judgment was granted on a
Friday, the Saturday and Sunday wouldn't be
counted. The next five days would count, but
the landlord couldn't get his writ of possession
until the Monday following, so that is expanding
a five-day rule into a nine-day rule. And the
same applies for the eviction: the five days to
nine days under those circumstances. And, of
course, it cuts back to seven days if the
judgment is rendered on a Thursday.

Now, unfortunately, in nearly all evictions there are non-payment -- well, I would say at least 90 or 95 percent of all evictions are non-payment of rent evictions, and the substantive effect of the proposed rule is to give the tenants, as a practical matter, two to four days more free rent. Theoretically, it is not free rent, because the tenant is liable for it, but as a practical matter in a non-payment of rent eviction, it is -- it is very seldom a recovery of unpaid rent under those -- under those circumstances. So you're affecting the substantive pocketbook, so to speak, of the landlord, and we think it is an unfair

· .	the state of the control of the state of the
25	សា សាយនាដុវាជា នៃ <b>ខ</b> េះស្រ <b>ន្</b> មេ <b>១០%</b> ។ សម ស្ត បទ ប <mark>េះទ</mark> ាំ ១ភូ ៣៤៤
	្សាទីពេទ នៃ ខេត្តបានជាធិត្ត។ ខ្លួន ខែជារួតថា បញ្ជាក់ធម្ម ការ៉ា ខ្លួន។
ċ.	notes. A sign of the point of the $\lambda$ -constants of $\lambda$
. I	PI PROBLEM CONTRACTOR OF THE STREET OF ACOUNT FOR THE
2.3	ត្រ <sup>ស</sup> ေျပာင္း စားေရး ေရးကို ေရးကိ
ř.	net i eq nort, because the tenest is itbut ite
<i>.</i>	Sour Loye toko Sroo nost. to brothad Ays At a
\$ A.	$\partial_{+}\mathbf{A}\mathbf{e}$ for stable $\sigma\mathbf{e}$ $\mathbf{e}$ brack, we complete the fig.
ī :	and with a the confidence of the $x^\mu$ and $\zeta$ , when is the
1 <del></del>	(x,x) is $(x+y)$ and $(x+y)$ and $(x+y)$ and $(x+y)$ and $(x+y)$
y v	ANT OF CORE OF THE CORE OF BUILDING OF THE
2.	ಾಡಿಥಾರು. ಗವರು, ಗಾರ್ ಶಾವ್ ಸರ್ <b>ಕ</b> ಗತ್ತುಗಳ <b>ು ಈ ಎ</b> ದ್ದಾರ ಕಿ.ಮ ದರ್ಷಕ್ಕ
 2	ne auguspaan jojak gu upanja de
	falls and de real age, as a filter boys.
ij	asurio, út sata back fil ven a ya 'i kko
Ċ	il o days will thougo circustonens. Why if
	antas — jog ibni the estables: the divo lance
	ည္းသည္။ မုန္တြင္း မုန္းေရးကု <b>င္း အႏ</b> က္လာမည္းသို့ ေလးသာ∗္ လုတ္သည့္ နည္းသ
<b>u.</b>	្រុក ខេត្ត គឺ គឺ គឺ ១៩ ខេត្ត សិក្សា មួយសុខាធិក្សា ១៩ កុរស្ត ខ្លួន គឺជា ខែអ្នកសូម
. 6.	క్కాల కార్వండ్ అంక మి.్. ఉంద్ తక్కి ఎ <b>ట్క్ అ</b> న్ అందరంతే క
Ÿ	country, Suc nont flvo days soult docut, but
:	ក្នុង ខេត្ត ខាង ខាង ខាងពេលខេត្ត នេះ ដែលខេត្ត ទេសពី សមាណិ ស្ <sup>រ</sup> ង ខែ
;	19, to can the degree of the financial teal decopose of
j.	Electronic Actions and male that the state where

1	substantive effect to elongate the time for
2	getting the writ of possession and the time for
3	getting for appealing the case.
4	JUSTICE HECHT: Mr. Niemann, you
5	have also commented on 749c
6	MR. NIEMANN: Yes, Your Honor, I
7	have.
8	JUSTICE HECHT: the requirement
9	of a deposit of one month's rent to perfect an
10	appeal even if the appellant is in forma
11	pauperis.
12	MR. NIEMANN: That's right, Your
13	Honor.
14	JUSTICE HECHT: And you say in your
15	letter that when this rule was promulgated, the
16	Supreme Court and the Texas Tenants Association
17	were both of the opinion that these rules were
18	unconstitutional.
19	MR. NIEMANN: Did I say
20	"unconstitutional"?
21	JUSTICE HECHT: It seems a little
22	strange that I assume you meant that you
23	thought that they were both constitutional.
24	MR. NIEMANN: That was a very
25	serious typographical error, Your Honor, and I

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

the out to said dopen to be thank by a dring	
closed of the company of the contract of the c	٢.
•မယ္(၁ <b>၁</b> နည်း) ကြားရိုင္သည္ မွားသို့ မ− ကြည္ခ်ခြင့္သည္	•
art gamadail .o.t :Ompro. Jongo o	•
nevo alao combed en 76 e	:
No. 4 2 And No. 4 Book (4 And No. 4	
• <b>V</b>	:7
subscribed off : THOST COTTOUT	
of a legeral of one menth's cent to joifeet as	•
cypael even if the appellant is in forma	d+
-ខរិង១ ២១៥	i.
on. orunder: what's might, Youn	ŧ.
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	-
aums on some the you day in you	.*
នៅទី ᢏ ខេត្តស្ត្រស្ត្រ នេះ 🕒 នេះជា 🦁 នេះ ខេត្តស្ត្រ គ្រង់ទៅ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ ក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស់ គេក្រាស	
Carrent Court and the Feath Frinants wiscolott.	;
cord both of the spinfun bit t these lutes nerv	Υ,
andountibut and .	^ .
Variable of the state of the st	^
"uncenstitutiona, "?	. !
Troughn d.Cou. Th seet, a likele	r ·
carance that Carause you mount that you	الم
- ೧೯೮೪ ಕನ್ನಡಚಿತ್ರಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಚಿತ್ರವರಿ ೧೯೮೪ ಇತ್ತಾಗಿತೆ ಕನ್ನಡ ಸಿಸ್ಟೆಲ್ಲಾರಿಗಳು	* ,
grov a saw at India : The	4
	-1

can't blame that --

"No one has ever challenged the constitutionality of these rules." Actually, 749c has been challenged, although the point was not reached in our decision of Walker versus Blue Water Garden Apartments.

But why, if a month's deposit is required for supersedeas, doesn't that protect you against the problem that you are concerned about, which is the elongated holding-over period?

MR. NIEMANN: No, Your Honor, I don't think that a supersedeas bond is applicable in an eviction appeal. The special rules that apply to eviction appeals, I don't think, apply -- don't bring in the supersedeas bond. I -- I --

month's deposit to supercede the FE and D judgment and to hold over during the appeal. As long as you have that protection, why do you need also the deposit of a month's rent in order to perfect the appeal when the appellant is in forma pauperis and says he can't make the

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ాా మొక్కామి అందుకు కోర్టిందు.	
HOFFIGE	Mar Sad then you can:
50° 3 /√9 (	inge the
V constitutions (5) of	ະຊາມພາເລື່ອ: ເພື່າເຮົາການ ອະນຸ
g 76°c In bloom hall	su salar eds appoils a pe
Tue an homewore the sur	nucrev senkon Be Leis.
Francis sotoT outl	•
Committee	a secopo de <b>idro</b> n de i
esuoriza na lacalización de la porte de la composición de la compo	drodel dr. Dolfnesol (a
estry contributions are the	To anounce one of the second
nate of all and an end of all	197 - Tan 18 od 5. 96 ya
Siletino.	
C - 1 - CI	a May Mun Dener, I
n de Gradu (Sarate Grand) in the	១៣ ១ <b>៣១</b> ៩ ជ <b>ច១</b> ៤១១៤០
es as the shipping of the	်ရေးစေရရွား ဗေသာ ( .ရိမေရရွာ ne)
as which that down	ရက်များ သည်သည်။ ကျောင်း <b>ချာ</b>
ao y sa exaldo (75	းသီး။, ယား ကိုးမှ ကယားမှုမှုလေးလေရေးမ
en a notation of the second	
able place -	1. 4.1 Special action 1.4.1
್ರಾರ್ ಕಿಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಥಿಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಥಿಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಥಿಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ತ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ತ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ತ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ತ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ್ರ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ ಅಭಿಕ	to man the point of the part
្នាន់ មាន ខេត្ត និស្សស្រួសស្គ្រា និង	en la constant de la peconomica de la constant de l
and over not a.	Long Chargo and Litropy
construction of the constr	a o of the the that is le
e n. Sid di Din	i i i emalli el esta dost.
an mina an arman	AND A PART OF THE PROPERTY OF

## deposit?

MR. NIEMANN: I understand. The
749b says that during the appeal rent shall
continue to be paid. It doesn't say that any
monies must be tendered in to the court as a
condition of appeal. And I think what we will
find is that if -- if we simply have a rule that
during appeal rents must continue to be paid,
then that is not self-enforcing; the tenant
doesn't pay the rent and what the landlord has
to do is to go to court, get a hearing, set it,
get a -- get a judgment to say "This tenant has
not continued to pay the rent, Your Honor;
therefore, we" -- "we want him out."

And we think that as a practical matter what is going to happen is that following an eviction, a very astute tenant is going to say, "I'm a pauper. Even though I have lost my case on non-payment of rent, I'll sign a pauper's affidavit; and the judge certainly can't disprove that I'm a pauper, and the landlord can't disprove that I'm a pauper." And we think as a practical matter there are going to be frivolous appeals to the county courts based on pauper.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
$3.00 m
                       7135 tayer chat the ing the appeal tent place.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 - 6
                 gul teas with decade of the also at antitues
                    to be drawn will be an abinduct of damm to the
                     condition of a poet. And Tallit whose we will
The common tension of the committee of t
                         with ad of confidee dues admon frequent to us.
                            dien that to not cold-calleaching, the search
       seems to be the rent and what the ending i we
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               . .
       ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕರ್ಷಣ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್
        The transfer of the ground the grade a consens to
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 7. 7
                                    Tacks tank the colored the contract forms are
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  ~ <u>r</u>
                                                                                ".dre . til draw ed" -- "to .ordanodd
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  2.5
                            That to thank to be one a gradual of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    . .
  and the state of t
           and paint the service of many pays a quetal two gra
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 77
    He do not do to read sesting the part of white each
                                                is eight for a trop to one comments of the
                            ograficion cybro edico na (sivullabe ni econo
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    .
                                                  a life of the back that I'm a caper, the the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 . .
 and ".togues a will beid over at time of the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     ٠:
           to think as a production to bus, bushed the gains
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     ~ , .
                    of the control of the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                   17.5
```

Now, I would say, Your Honor, that 1 2 several years ago when these rules regarding pauper appeals and conditions for pauper appeals 3 were presented to the committee, they were, in 5 fact, initially drafted by the attorney for the tenants -- I think it was Mr. Jim Piper 7 (phonetic) at the time -- and myself, and thoroughly considered by the -- the Supreme 8 Court Advisory Committee. 10 And briefs were written at that time and submitted to the committee, and I think both 11 12 the tenant lawyer and myself were of the conclusion that requiring the payment of the one 13 14 rental period's rent in non-payment of rent 15 cases was a constitutional protection of the 16 landlord. 17 JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions 18 of Mr. Niemann? 19 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: What's your 20 solution to Rule 4? To just not make the change 21 at all, or make --22 MR. NIEMANN: No, no. 23 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- the five 24 days four days?

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

No.

As I -- as I

MR. NIEMANN:

25

```
The first of the control of the second of the second
                        ngalik Akris (19 Mil 18 nord abit urbin 1991). Babanda
          lacing a pect at any tions that the august and
            and tentum force these in the edition of the force of the
        and ref minimize so a diferent yunderenge in the
                                                              on the grant of the state of the second of t
                                ್ರಾಣ ಚರ್ಚಾಗಿ ಅವರ 🗕 ಅನೇಶ ಇಳಿ ತಾಡತ್ ೧೫ ೬ ಕೃತ್ಯ ಅತ್ಯಾತಿಕೆ
                                                                                                                                                                   that bridge no written to thet the chile
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              1 1
      ್ಲಿ ಎಂದು ವರ್ಷಗಳು ಇಂದರಿ ಅಂದು ಕಾರ್ಮಿಕ್ ಬರುಗಳು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷಣೆ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      ₹.7
                                                                 the first the second and morning control of the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             our off to during out only bords to action of the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        6. 5
                               the Rolling - and the transfer of the first Cadast
                        raded bar in dec Prime omen redtering of establish
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  ,5
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         - andida be selle just : the regarder
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             7:115.51 ... 12
           Control of the state of the sta
CONTROL NO DAME SOM MANTE MEST BOME DE L'AMPLES
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               ** **
                                                                                                                                                                                                                  -- odso to . Is or
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               ...
                                                                                                              .on .com : comment .com
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               4.0
. .
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       Coys thus ive
```

requested in my letter, Your Honor, we think 1 2 that the appropriate solution would simply be to carve out from Rule 4 the five-day time periods 3 contained in Rules 748 on a writ of possession, and Rule 749, I think, a, b, c, and d, regarding 5 appeals of eviction cases. You have similarly done that already in the proposed Rule 4 in that 7 8 you have carved out an exception for three days when service is made by registered certified 9 10 mail. 11 JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, Mr. 12 Niemann. 13 MR. NIEMANN: Thank you, Your Honor. 14 JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments to 15 Rules 1 through 21b? Yes, sir. 16 17 18 JUDGE GUY JONES, 19 appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in 20 administrative session to consider proposed 21 changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of 22 23 Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 24

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

25

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

JUDGE JONES: Mr. Chief Justice,

control of the tendent of the tendent of the control of the tendent of tende

.all .nos da. . P : mropp ar hopp

· Data Sala Control Control

1.5

Ĩ, ĵ

THE PLANT WELVE COME SOMEONER to

nuled & chrous a 2350

.Tia - aoT

# 

and the control of th

Consideration Consideration and the second control of

gentlemen, my name is Guy Jones. I'm judge of the 202nd District Court, Texarkana, Texas. I'm here representing myself. The record will reflect that it's at my own nickel and -- if it please the Court.

I appear before the Court today seeking a change in Rule 13. This Court adopted Rule 13, and as all of you know and are very familiar with the rule, there is an escape mechanism in the rule by what is known as the 90-day rule.

I wrote a letter to Justice Hecht and then didn't mail it. I decided to appear personally before the Court, because I have very strong feelings about the ineffectiveness of Rule 13.

To start with, I'll read just a portion of the letter that I had originally intended to mail to Justice Hecht. And I'm going to give it to him. In fact, I have copies for the Court, if you would like to have it.

But I'll read a portion of it, and it says that "the rule gives to the trial courts a very valuable weapon with which to correct an age-old problem of frivolous suits, irresponsible

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

- The same of the contract with a contract of the contract of the column of all the carry forestings, the carry the The concept coate in the even participation of the ដាន់ ទីនិក្សា មាន នេះ នាង ស្រុក ពេលមេ សុខ ជាង សេងទីនៃ ជាគេសែខាង មានសុខាធិក្សា \* 2000 10 12 0x 30 ۳. The same dress and chare, the same Λ, STACT STREET TO BE BELLEVILLE FOR BUT . № 355 ° 10 ° 10 ° 1543 ° 40295 ° 655 ° 4645 ° 10 ° 455 ° 23€ of the national state of the st
- Turnur a foot of the Justice of utility ہ ع trocra et seditoro I . if ...ta dan den I sedit da 21 rare on the moffere the decamp, because the rave very ٠, ٠ at any for. Sur court the inclinations of C. .C.I. oda

. 30gr 105-67

್ರ ದಲ್ಲಾ ಬರಲ್ ಬೆಟ್ಟ್ ಕಾಕ್ ಬೆಡುವ ಬರು ರ ng eine of the pitter took is bac aring as in 3 " instance to be suid to such see coll. And I'm 1 . ingo owner T satisfier of the color of putog Ü., for the details of your rand file to draw it.  $r \in$ ានទី២ កម្ពុជា ១៤ ខែលា 📲 ំ 😘 ១៩៩២៦៩៩៦ ។ ១០១៩ ជួន។ 🖰 នួម។ 🦠 🖰 0.5 with take cive to the error dougle c very 8.0 taiutio ne no. Teb matobile controt et anno-e r • Compression with the property of the more form . . pleadings, falsified documents, and general" -and this is important -- "general slipshod practice of law. But the addition of the sentence" -- the 90-day escape clause sentence -- "renders this almost totally ineffective. In addition to this sentence" -that is, the 90-day escape clause -- "it simply tells the trial judge that an attorney or party can offend the very heart of what Rule 13 tries to do and then says that you can escape by the simple expediency of just saying, 'Whoops, I'm sorry, Your Honor, I withdraw the offending pleading. The damage has been done, but I'm sorry, I withdraw the offending pleading,' and the case is over. There's no sanctions that can be applied under Rule 13."

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2.5

I submit to you, gentlemen, that once the heart of Rule 13 has been offended, the damage is immediate. The offended party or parties -- and which could be the Court, the taxpayers -- once they are offended, that damage is immediate. And if someone has, in fact -- has, in fact, offended the very heart of Rule 13 and what it strives to do, they should be allowed no escape mechanism.

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
was in it is the ment of the second of the second
                                     of the continue of the continu
                                                                    TERRET STEED OF STEED TO STEED TO BECKET
                                             - Works こう は a constraint and a state of the and constraint and 
          -- "concluse will be confidenced in the confidence
     The control of the area of the control of the contr
     record that the grade that an after way and the
   of the SI of the decidence is not been provided and Ice too.
       ಂದರ ಇದ ಅಭಿಕಾರ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಗಳಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಅವರ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕಾರ್ಯ
           ್ಲಿಸ್ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷೆಗಳ ಕುಲಕ್ಕಾರ ಅವರ ಕ್ರೀಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಅಂದರಿಗಳ ಅವರ ಅವರ ಕ್ರೀ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         ŢΓ
   e the way Wat in temperary the will man the edition of the content to
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          S 1
                     planding. To "energe ar been lone, but T'u
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           e. 1
        nors, T with raw tic cliffenting plending, and
                     the erge fa eve . There's no concessous will
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             -- F
                                                                                                                 ". Si oluk tepun beligat kulo 12."
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            7.5
                      That the roat gentions of it. That
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            7.
ance ಕೇನ ನೀಡುದ ಬಳಿ ಬಿಚ್ಚಾರ ತಿಳಿ ತಿನಿಗಳ ಇಲ್ಲಿಕಾಗ ನಿರ್ದೇಶಕ್ಕ ದಿ ರ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          !\ "
                         The sign to the distance. The offeet of ast, or
                        rdi vir. 63 blit of a yen delew has -- gritzha
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           . .
tennayorn -- enge bing one aften our that intage
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           ٠. ۴
                  -- dana di wasi edeb en li en wedaibemui di
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           6.
where a dract alleaded big were boost of the clin
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           ed a mode joingo to postrán a como no
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           V -
                                                                                                                          a him about constant a herotical
```

I'll give you an example of something that just happened to show you -- to show you why that this rule needs to be amended.

Incidentally, I have a proposed substitution to Rule 13. I'm not going to even suggest that I think that you gentlemen may adopt my rule in toto, but I'm hoping that by my presence here today and my presentation, and by giving you the proposed substitution to Rule 13 and my reasons therefor, that perhaps we can get some more teeth into Rule 13.

I had a lawsuit where a -- this is just one example. Now, I can sit here -- I can't take this much time; obviously, you have a lot of other people that want to appear. I will give you one prime example.

A car dealer sold an automobile to a lady. It was a used car, had 26,000 miles on it. The lady ultimately, some two years later -- a little less than two years later -- called the bank which was the lending institution, without recourse, and she said, "You can come get this car. I don't want it. It don't run. Come get it."

The bank comes and gets it, has the

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

$\mathcal{L}(\mathcal{S}_{i})$ ) is the second of the constant $\mathcal{L}_{i}$ , $\mathcal{L}_{i}$ , $\mathcal{L}_{i}$	Ţ
ed —— ಕಟ್ಟು ಗಾಗಣ of vene ಗಟ್ಟಿ ನಟಗು ಈ ಮಿಡಿ ಇಂಟಟಿಸುವುದು.	<b>&gt;</b>
. તરામાલ કાર્યા <b>લઇ લઇ લઇ છે. તરા છે</b> તાલું છે છે છે મુદ્દેલ કારણ જુ <b>ા</b> લ	<u></u>
The action of every of the water actions	
nubscienting to inke 12. I'm not noing to aven	
್ತರು ನಿಯಾವಾತಿಕಾರಣ ಕಾರತ್ನ ಕರ್ಣದ ಬಿಡಕಿಸುವ ಗ್ರಾಹಕಾಕಿಕ ವಿಷ್ಣಾಧಕಾರು	**
ರೂ ಇದೆ ಕಂಡರ ನಾಗುವುದಾಗಿ ಚಿತ್ರ ಕೆಲಕ್ಕೆ ಕಿರ್ಮಿಕ್ಕೆ ಅಧಿಕಾರ ಚಿತ್ರವಾಗಿ ಕೆಲ್ಲಿ ಸ	7
presence here today end my wesentation, and by	
Juding you the mraposed and litter "?	7
and my tearens the enter, that parhaps or can put	C T
sour and telling and a read 17.	££
l had no tursuit there a thin us	٦. ١
ි වස්සත් සි සි සම්ව වී දේශව මේ දේශව සිට වෙන සිටිමදී	s) en
can't fake tulu uch tire; a viously, pus lave s	₹.£
ted of other posple that while to armens. I will	UX
give you one wrine enemgle.	ē. <sup>-</sup>
n of classer and Control of the cont	ζ. <b>r</b>
Let $f_{\bullet}$ . To went in unequality has the polynomial will be the	2.1
ವಾಸಕತ್ವ owd ಅವರುವ ಕೃಷ್ಣ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಕೃತ್ಯ ಕೃತ್ತಿ ಕಾಗಿಗಳು ಕೃತ್ತಿಗಳು	, r
outem a libbut iend than two years dates	r c
calle"	
institution, without securno, and the mile,	•
.ಹೇಜ <b>ವಿಗು</b> ಪ್ಪ ಚಿತ್ರಣದಲ್ಲಿ 10 ಕಿಂಬರ್ಗ ಅಭಿವರ್ಧ ಆ <b>೧೮ ಗ</b> ಡರು ಮಾರ್ಚ್	٠.
ு நார்க்கு இருந்து இரு இருந்து	

ក្រុម ប្រភព្ធា ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុ

motor repaired, and sold it, sued the lady for the deficiency.

The lady went to a lawyer. Now, it was a very small deficiency, but it was district court case. She went to a lawyer; he immediately files a third-party action against the automobile dealer saying, "If you hadn't sold her a lemon" -- or -- "Judge, if that car dealer hadn't sold her a lemon, we wouldn't be here suffering this deficiency, so any deficiency judgment you render against her, we would ask you to carry that over to the defendant," a third-party defendant car dealer.

Now, there are some lawyers, gentlemen, and I'm sure you are all aware of this, that if you have got a person that comes into your office with a warm body and 50 bucks, they will file a lawsuit.

Now -- so this dealer has to go get him a lawyer and defend his third-party action.

Comes proof time. The lady gets on the stand.

The lawyer who filed the third-party action wasn't there. He sent some young boy that was just a young, wet-behind-the-ears lawyer over to try the case.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
ကြားသည်။ ကို ကျောင်းသည်။ မိတ္တာသည် သည်သည်။ မြောက်သည် မိတ်သည် သည်သည်။ မြောက်သည် မိတ်သည် မိတ်သည် မိတ်သည်။ မြောက်
                                  the infidients.
The city want to a targer. "s", it
nirectly care it but ty: but it was discharge as
          ರಾಮ (ಕಾರ್ಯಾಯ) ಗರ್ಚರಿಗಳ ಅಧಿಕ್ರಿಯ ಕಾರ್ಯ ನಿಯಾಗಿಕೆ ಮಾರು
 denings toited yearsy-builds a secilarly observant
   the subonovio Tealer paying wiff you been it
 ದರು ೧೯೭೮ ಕ ಹಿಡಲಾಡಿಗೆ ಈ ಆಗ ಆಗ "ಕ್ಯಡಿಳಿಯ, ಹಿಕ್ಕೆ ಮಾರ್ ಆಂಡ್
 cu d'abinou per nors e autorità d'abret solschi
         here offering tails 'efficiency, as any
it deficiency in to entry condent resides between
        of the cold you are not been over to the
fig. . . . . Coffourant, " a "him - posty defantant car desies.
       Tow, there are come lewyers,
                                                          . N. ₹.
  gentlemen, and T'm munc you are all award of
                                                          7 J
this, that if you have a dop over the dad that on
                                                          2.5
17 Into your olding water and 50 buck.
                       ther will fille r lawnuit.
                                                          \sim 1
dog in od had selected to on -- were
                                                           7. 1
anolidas vidua impartas abd the Cott tal acqua. a with
                                                          ~ e
Colde priod Pilia. The Previous of the st mi.
                                                          T.O
   noidean angus -balle ede tod a sou togus -elu
                                                          . · · · · ·
eren's tiese. "e senu cono pount por tint van
                                                          -\mathcal{E}_{\mathcal{L}}
នៃ ១០២០ ១០៥៧១៤ ១០១, កន្លានិក្សាន ខែលាក់និង២០ នេស្ស 🦠 🤫 📑
```

. . .

Here's the evidence: She bought the car when it had 26,000 miles on it. When the bank repossessed it on a voluntary repossession, it had 96,000 miles on it. This is not all. The plot thickens.

The lady, during that interim time in putting on that 70-something thousand miles on that car, never once, not one time, went back to that car dealer and carried that car back and made a complaint. The plot gets even thicker.

The engine that blew up in the car that -- when they returned it to the bank was not even the engine that was in the car at the time the car dealer sold it to the lady. It had burned up at some 78,000 miles and she had a shade-tree mechanic over at New Boston put her another one in it, and it blew up, so she just told the bank, "Come get this piece of junk."

Well, at the conclusion of her testimony, I looked at her and I said, "Ma'am, whose idea was it to sue this Mr. Mankins?"

(phonetic). The guy's name is Pete Mankins. I said, "Whose idea was it to sue this car dealer, yours or your lawyer's?"

She said, "I guess it was my

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

J.V	Sours of Assis gankon, the
ن ن	sade, "Those ifter and it to one this was weed
. 5	(plenetie). The gay's main is lete Mankins. I
<i>i</i>	where idea sand the an thin in Tambirds
•	the delinary, in decises at between the Washer "the mass
	This, at the concludation of her
1 'o	toll the fank, "fone gat thin vices of junb."
Lï	areabler one in it, and it blow up, so the jamp
٨ 、	allana-tras acchanic over of the last put for
<b>.</b> .	्राध्यम्बद्धः सः । १६ १००७० १००६० १०० एवः । पर समय समय सम्बद्धः ।
5 3	time the corrections agine in the Andy. It had
🕽	not even the engine that was in the car at the
ن د	tact sacr tack returned it to the bank we
. 7	the english bask bloss up in the say
<b>T</b> 3	ace a cany that. The yout gate even thicker.
% \ %	to that car dealer an corritor that car beat our
	an thot was asyst ace, not one this, work web
3	in weeting on that 76- onetains thousand differ
<u>.</u> :	Tie lady, cultr, thit threatin to
11	The grat thickens.
•	ုင္း ႏွစ္ေျပည္ႏို <b>ပ္</b> ပည္ေလျပည္သည္။ က ျပည္ေျပာက္သြား ျခင္းေတြက္သည္။
<u>.</u>	beak repaired of the swip so waters accordingly
;	$\epsilon$ by the interpolation of $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$
.i	iliano e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e

CADO CARRO LA CASTO STATE MEDICAL

•.\* . •

lawyer's. I don't have anything against Mr. Mankins."

Well, at that moment the young lawyer, being smarter than his old partner, jumped up and says, "Your Honor, we move to dismiss the case against Mr. Mankins."

I guess he had -- he had read the escape clause in Rule 13. But anyway, he dismissed his lawsuit.

This is just one example of slipshod law practice, filing pleadings where there is no reasonable inquiry into -- as to whether there is any legitimate basis for them or not. And that happens in the trial courts of this state much more than anyone might imagine, and it needs to be stopped.

I said to Justice Hecht in my

letter, we have to remember that the impact of

Rule 13, if it is offended and truly offended,

that impact is immediate. The damage that's

done is right then. The taxpayers' expense is

taken when you have to go into that clerk's

office and take up that clerk's time filing a

piece of meaningless pleadings or a motion. The

Court's time is immediately taken, and not only

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

THE STATE OF THE S B . DRAAL AM - 17 Folly of the moment the venue A Lowyer, bears are then him ore parities. tuned, up and says, "Work Honor, we love to **.** eigette fine dies geginnt fire Traking." old west the bit -- boll of bears to ĺ ondess dicted in build 16. But answay a he Cluminace bie lawau.l.  $C_{\bullet}$ Contaction for the error and county of align · 10 ( on the other orthogonest has a continuous of the notion of . . reservants ventre far em som em som proches there were P T 13 in any logithact. Bacia for thom on not. And chick anglean in the team counter of this of color 1.5 mudy mode then entere atent i ectes, and the きょ ncede to be etapped. 7. 1 I acie to Justico Recht in my 7 -To dispers bid dods toller or of evad of andrel ( · .\* Pare 13, 52 St is offender and analy diffended, n T eboth impage to that Pitte. The damege that's ~ ° ° Tend id aight blon. The tearryons oxorand in . . taken when you have be go hade that alous in 8.0 sidied and take to what elerkin bind dinc a 7.1 the compared on wourd agreer y enclaires or a socians. The

Land to no entitle without the first the necessity

. :

is the court time immediately taken on hearing such frivolous matters as this, the person who is involved outside of the court is damaged by

having to hire attorneys, incur expenses.

And it's my opinion that if somebody is going to willfully violate the heart of Rule 13, he should not have an escape mechanism. And if we are to stop, in my opinion, the wholesale filing of false pleadings and meaningless and groundless lawsuits and frivolous claims that clutter the dockets of this state -- and we all know it happens -- then I strongly urge that you gentlemen adopt a rule, some rule, that gives more power to the trial courts to issue sanctions for people that violate the rule.

And I certainly am not going to be one that says that this should be done without notice and hearing. It should be done after notice and hearing; it should be done after the accused, offended party has a full right to defend himself as to the accusations that he has filed something frivolously or for harassment, yes, and it should be fully subject to appellate review.

But the trial courts have got to

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

. •

The Algeria of the Action Action in the South Section 1	r
သည်။ ၁၈ ခုရှိ မောင်းကို သည်။ သည်။ မောက်သည် အားမှန်မြောင်းကို မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။	• •
in involved eathile commonder to court in a court in a court	C
Lating to Ille ottoxnoys, instructions.	,*.
្រឹងជាស្ថិត ខេត្ត និញ្ញី ស្រុក មានិស្សស ស្រុក ស្រីនេះ ស្រុក ស្រីនេះ ស្រុក ស្រីនេះ ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុ	<b>:</b>
is guing to distally violate the adort of Cale	i.
to, is all the not I for all endings of the	Ÿ
if te ere to acopy in my o wnom, the war cault	
filing of taled theadings and resmingless on	<b>^</b>
g. culdlens lausnits and frivolous claims that	οr
clutter the ecclets of this state and wo ask	2.4
kies it hapons then I strengul urge that yo	S.E
derblumen aftet a maio, none aule, that givus	9.1
re but to the trial courts to inque	<u> </u>
sanctions for people that violate the rule:	ar
And I certainly am not noing to be	a r
ie that cays that time chould be done without	₹ <b>™</b> # \$ +=
notice that have not should be consafter	27.5
ಾರಕ್ಕೆರಿಕ ಮಾರ್ಕ್ ಒಂದರ್ಜ ಜ್ವಾಕ್ಕ್ ಕೆಟ್ ಲಿಂಗಟ್ಟರ್ಟ್ ಆ ರೇಜರ್ ಪ್ರಾರ್ಟ್ ಆ ಆ	O.T.
addated , officanded or reg are a fix 1 right to	2
Jedens bil seld as to the accusations that to be	τ.,,
. 13.5 - a chhin- Erivolousay or Zar baesana.,	# P
year and it chemis be for ly subject to a, that	25
·veiva-	; <b>k</b> .

on dependently dentity and day

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

have -- if we are going to stop this type of thing that keeps cluttering our dockets -- and we started with Rule 13; we tried. But we put the escape clause in. I mean, it's a full escape vehicle for them, and this needs to be amended.

I suggest that we take the escape -the escape language totally out -- oh, incidentally, while I was looking back in -- I went back and got a paper, and I'll bet you-all have seen this. There was a paper that was delivered to the judicial section by Judge Joe Morris back in '88, and Judge Morris -- and I note with interest that he says in his conclusion on this paper -- he said, "There are several shortcomings to the rule, most notably the 90-day escape clause." And he says, "If attorneys' only fear under Rule 13 is that they may be required to withdraw or amend their pleadings in order to avoid sanctions, there would be little to deter attorneys from filing frivolous claims."

He goes further and says, "Nor would they be strongly motivated to reasonably inquire into the allegations contained within a paper

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

- the start -- if we had an about this type of the case this type of the case the case and the case the
- -- ogseso hid clat he taid daggar. T the caeast irrugage totaily out -- oh, inclidante. y, w. Lee I was - office rack in +e I erut brek and jot a pagen, and I'ul bet you-u b ĺ ್ರಾಟ್ ಕಿರ್ಮಿಕ ಇಂಟ್ರಾಟ್ ಕಾರ್ಡ್ ಅಂಗ್ರಾಟ್ ಕ್ರಾಟ್ ಕಿರ್ಮ್ f fFaltreged to the gr dra dection by Sudge Toe . . . Toursin back in 10%, and Judge Touris -- and I 85 note with intercouting to cayo in its - 5 f coae usion on this cour -- he cat , "whore are . . Yidsoon tao. . odys oft of apakeopiacie in the 77 5 the file, we cate o place. " This we care, " " " 7. attenneye' only foar union here la that that they gry be rongirof to withored or a creak their -0.1caeds (adeids de Cheva of tecae of realboot t 9. reculted to a fitting to detect a stance of the particle of the property of the contract of the property of the contract of th F ^, ".unio o apolovina 6.6
- con constant united and constant solves which constant constant into all or constant and constant within a sequent

filed with the Court." And, gentlemen, that has been the case since the adoption of Rule 13.

He goes on further and he says, "As pointed out earlier, the rule's teeth are not very sharp. It seems clear that one may avoid sanctions altogether by simply withdrawing his pleading, motion, or other document filed with the Court prior to the expiration of the cure period." That's true. That's happened.

Gentlemen, I don't want to take any more of your time; there's too many other people here that want to testify before the Court. But if you have any questions, I will be glad to ask (sic) them. I do have copies made that I will give to your clerk of the proposed change.

Oh, and may I add this? In Rule 13, we used too many "ands" and not "ors." For an example, what I would like to see the Court additionally do is take out all of these "ands." In other words, it's not -- if it's groundless, quote, "and" brought for the purpose of delay, if it's groundless, that's offensive to the rule. If it's brought for the purpose of delay, that's offensive to the rule. And so it shouldn't be groundless "and for"; it just

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

filed with the dotat." At , onliquen, this de-	.!
been the same mines have a lighten of thate 12.	Ç.
To note on fraction and he days, "A.,	· ·
pointed out surilor, the rulest teach are not	2
very short, the season of our obate and hay avoid	ē
cancifons altogother by chaply of therewise, and	`
deaulog, morron, or ether decreent filled with	**
test doubt arion to the explication of the dure	`
. ಿಂಗರ ೃನಿಗೆ ಬ <sup>ಕ್ಕ್</sup> ಟರ್ಗಿ . <b>ಎಸ್ಸರ</b> ಬಕ್ಕೆಯ <sup>ಇ</sup> . ಇಕ್ಕನ್ನು	^
Continuon, Count to take any	(* <u>r</u>
Love of year time, there's too many other geo, a	J. Z.
nere that least to testify before the Court. Dut	7.5
of you have one questions, o vill be ghad to	45 F
Total total naive have collect that I	2.5
with give to rour cierk of the proposed diange.	១ភ
The cast toy I as i griss In Itel 13.	2.5
de dael tech aug "ende" ons not "or". For un	7.7
end. ples what T would like to see the fourt	· <u>r</u>
್. ೧೯೩೮ ರಾಲ್ಕರ್ಣ ಎಂದು ಆತ್ರಕ್ಷಣ ಅತ್ಯಂತ ಅವಿ ರಾಜ್ಯವಿ ವರ್ಷಗಳಿಗಳು	ji
couparhamb colisi CP dom bida emilion collocul	€.
egan o Lo anacemo odi <b>zo</b> o bilgaeti "Dya" ode <b>z</b> e	
fuldeta expandiona, chatte offene ve to the	2.2
ಲ್ಲಿ ಎಂದು ಸಂಗೀತ ಅಥಾ ಕಟ್ಟು ಎಮ್ಮ ಇಂಡಿ ಹೆಚ್ಚು <b>ಪಾರ್ಯ ಕ</b> ಿಡಿಕೆ ಡಿಗಿ	*.*
the star and vector of order and as the	$v \rightarrow$
g out that be enopolition made Island, La income	; · · ·

should be groundless "or for" harassment.

You know, you gentlemen, I'm sure some of you have been on the trial benches. You see these lawyers get at each other's throats all the time, and they just -- they go berserk, bonkers. You know, they just fight each other and they end up and the Court gets in the middle. And certified questions: "Don't answer that question." And it's a good -- a real good question. They certify it, taking up my time. If -- if -- you know, what a first-grade law student -- a first-year law student would know better.

And the trial courts need some help in order to cure these things and to stop the clutter of these -- of our dockets and to go on with meaningful lawsuits and not frivolous motions and lawsuits made for the purpose of harassment.

JUSTICE DOGGETT: You are going to leave us a copy of your --

JUDGE JONES: Yes, sir. Anybody have any questions?

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Judge Jones, perhaps an observation: I agree wholeheartedly

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

- -

. The Gallacian of $A^{-\mathbf{u}_{G_{1}}}$ , which is the state of $A^{-\mathbf{u}_{G_{1}}}$ and $A^{-\mathbf{u}_{G_{1}}}$	3
e un traduction de l'encademne, d'anna une	2
್ - ಇಂದೆರ್ಬ್ ಟಿ ಡಾ. ರ ರವರ ಗಿ. ಇಂದರ ಕನಾಣಿ ರಾಣ್ಯ ಬಿಡ ರಾ. ಕಾ.	"
ກລະພະພາຍ ຄຳກວໄດ້ປະ ພາລະ ພັດ ເດຽ ຄາວຕາກຄົວ ດດຄຸມຄົວ ດວກ	۸,
a tale blue, crit arry jack they and tandoth,	- î
volue rap supid sumb years at mil m. T widned	<del>"</del> "
ರಾಕ್ಷಣ ಇದ್ದೇ ತೆಗಳ ಕಿ.ಎ. ಇವರ ಕರ್ಷಗರ ಕಾಗುತ್ತಿಯ	4
ಎಲ್.ಎ. <b>ತಿ.ಗೆಗಲ್" :ಾಗಲ</b> ್ತಿನ ಅರ್ಜ್ ಕ್ಲಿಗೆ ಮೇಲೆ ಅರ್ಜ ಕ್ಲಿಗೆ ಸ್ಥಿಯ	<b>(1)</b>
then woodiling. " . " 1995 of ook a roll ook	î Ç
emestion. They contiffy the calify up my time.	.T.
ME in you know, whethe fitted-grade has	ŗŗ
studout o first-year haw studont ron"d haou	<i>E</i> :
-ಇಲಾತಿಕಾಣ	1.3
and the trick course need nome belt	\$ £
in ender to cure these thing and to at the	7.5
eluther of those i our deshibe and to go on	in gr
cuo, ovini don fan adduumal lulgudunam ddia	<del>.</del> .
mobions and lawnuith rade for the property	ЗД
·Januarons'	Ċ.
ကောင့် ဥပဒေသ အ <b>သက္ ႏ</b> အမှ အစာတွင် စစ္စစ္စစ္စစ္	
active us as as years are	2.5
anger cormet were nir. Laybody	2.5
hava and euertavas?	E ·
aremote community them and domestic	3.0
poshess will asservation: Tajrew wholehorses in	۰ ۸

with you that we need to arm the trial court 1 2 with rules that have teeth in them, but I don't 3 think you want to leave the impression here today that most lawsuits that are filed in your 5 court are of this nature. JUDGE JONES: Oh, heavens, no, 7 Judge --JUSTICE GONZALEZ: This is an 9 aberration --10 JUDGE JONES: -- and I hope to know 11 whether you gathered that impression. 12 JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Well, we've got 13 the press here, and I don't want them to 14 think --15 JUDGE JONES: Oh, well, ladies and 16 gentlemen of the press, don't get that notion. 17 JUSTICE GONZALEZ: This is an 18 aberration. 19 JUDGE JONES: Please don't get that 20 impression. Most of them are not that way. 21 It's this handful or so that clutters up the 22 dockets of the court that we're trying to be 23 able to cure. 24 JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Yeah. 25 JUDGE JONES: We're looking for a

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

 $T_{i}^{-1}$ 

Trag of Mr: "o're . ooking fer .

cure mechanism to frivolous lawsuits and claims.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Judge

Jones, in -- in two sentences or less, how does

your proposal differ from Federal Rule 11?

JUDGE JONES: Not a whole lot; not a

whole lot. It's just a little bit tougher. It

doesn't -- Judge, listen, I'll admit that --

I'm -- I'm going to circulate my proposed

substitution to you, and I think it's a good

one.

And I think that -- why should a party offending Rule 13 have any greater right than a person adjudged of any contemptuous action? I mean, if the damage is done, it's immediately done. And if the trial court finds, subject to appellate review, that -- that -- that -- that damage was done, that the heart of the rule had been violated after hearing, why should that person be allowed to escape because of some 90-day rule we've got in Rule 13 -- or some escape clause in Rule 13? If he's done damage and he's violated the rule in the process of doing it, then he should be sanctioned.

JUSTICE COOK: How much of your time is taken up each week by lawyers on frivolous

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
core appearance de distroctous l'arrufta encodais.
                ्राष्ट्रीय है। इस अस्तारिक श्राप्त । १० वर्ष
   fones, in -- it by sectioners as they am dist
                 your erecond the first on the real daily
A SON (SOI ENDER SET : 13: 13) PROME
                                                                                                                                                              •
 ាមចាក់ និស្ស ប្រសិស ប្រឹក្សាស បានស្ថិត្ត និង ខេត្ត ស្ត្រី
           we in it will be the another to app we of adopt
                   fore easy wa statustic of males of -- ...
         magbitust to be year and a linear total
                                                                                                                                                             3
                                                                                                                            . . . . . .
                                                                                                                                                            0.5
          and think that -- why should no
                                                                                                                                                            j. "
     with after the this th laws in grotter the transfer
                                                                                                                                                            ٠, ٢
              strain a greatin e juiger of any conforçusmus
                                                                                                                                                            * J.
           coess no verses the big lange is cones to
                                                                                                                                                              `, r
s cellerasy who was it the edit in the authorized that
           -- daid -- dail coston of dieg s of thegical
                                                                                                                                                            . T.
  that -- thet Camere was come, that the horse of
                                                                                                                                                            77.5
      the rule has been violated after hecitaly Cay
                                                                                                                                                             3.0
  Thouse thet person by allewes to escape because
                                                                                                                                                             • r
    T some Po-day rule refue tot in Emile 20 -- or
                                                                                                                                                             100
          each escape cause in it olice to lot lot con-
                                                                                                                                                             III
a consequent at a military matrix of the found of the configurations of the found of the configuration of the found of the
                                                                                                                                                            . J. C.
              of loin 't, then in should be mindfinded.
                                                                                                                                                             23
gramman dogn: Cob mack of yer than
                                                                                                                                                              A. (3)
       is bedeen as a control of heavy a control of
```

1	motions and matters of the kind you've outlined?
2	JUDGE JONES: Your Honor, I couldn't
3	answer that question. That's I mean, I
4	wouldn't it happens, you know, but I wouldn't
5	want to speculate on there is a certain
6	amount of time. I mean, we spend a lot of time
7	on frivolity.
8	JUSTICE COOK: I know.
9	JUDGE JONES: We spend lots of time
10	on frivolity.
11	JUSTICE RAY: Some weeks more than
12	others.
13	JUDGE JONES: Huh?
14	JUSTICE RAY: Some weeks more than
15	others.
16	JUDGE JONES: Oh, yeah, yeah.
17	Good morning, Justice Ray. You're a little
18	you weren't here the whole time to hear my
19	pitch.
20	JUSTICE RAY: I heard it on the
21	telephone before you got down here.
22	JUDGE JONES: Oh, did you? That's
23	right, I I gave it to him before I got here.
24	JUSTICE RAY: I can't figure out why
25	it is you are getting so gray-headed.

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

~ 3	Te in hon our contribe to way-passer.
√ V	andthe level i can't whouse out any
J 3	richt, a 8 agus it to hit bolore ? get bold.
<b>ು</b> ತ	anner count: oh, did your Sharin
75	goyouyedo pendro Nom êor qonu joza:
J 0	larendo ant i hoore de on cho
I.	ेम्ब्रिक्ष
3	That whenthe Caro the whole this to test in
22	Cood marning, Crusice Tay. Noutre a likeble
. 2	TOBAR TOTAL: OF MOSP' Acces hose
1 :4	្នុក្ <b>ទ</b> ន្ទ៖
ΪŸ	Cudato : DM: Gone weeks more than
13	andur coulds this
<b>3</b> 3	94 % 6 % 6 % 6 % 6 % 6 % 6 % 6 % 6 % 6 %
ïï	FUSCIECE NOW: Gene weels nove than
T 3	er 223 volúky.
**	ក្សាទទីព ១ <b>០</b> ៤៤ ពុង ១០ ខេស្ <b>ទំព</b> ញ់ ជួចស្គ ៤ភូ ជុំព្យាទ
<b>,</b>	within and the property
, to	ου υγ <b>λο</b> γουλ•
٠.	arount at the . Theans we apere a let et bine
•	အျားရှာ ၂၀ က <b>ဲ့မ</b> ေလး လူေစား မမတ္တြင္းမွာ ရက္ခြင္းကို
٧.	would the the begroups you know, was I would to
Č	ន នាក្សាស្ត្រ ស្ពាល់ ស្ពេសស្រែសស្ត្រ ស្នាល់ ស្នង ស្គ្រាស្ត្រ ស្រែសស្ត្រ ស្នង ស្ត្
٠.	ច្រុស្ស ចិស្ស ដូច្នេះ ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ទី ក្រុម បានស្រុស បាន ប្រុ
ii j	ellome and accepter at a bit of you ve ortitimed.

1

1

# BEFORE THE SUPREME COURT OF TEXAS

3

IN ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION TO CONSIDER CHANGES PROPOSED IN TEXAS RULES OF COURT

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Texas.

\*-\*-\*-\*-\*-\*-\*-\*

BE IT REMEMBERED that the above entitled matter came on for hearing on the 30th day of November, 1989, beginning at 9:00 o'clock a.m. in the courtroom of the Supreme Court of Texas, Supreme Court Building, Austin, Texas, before the Justices of the Supreme Court of Texas, and the following proceedings were reported by JUDITH CAROLYN COX, Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

ORIGINAL

# CRIGINAL

Can 5' .	.5 4 4	1210	( ده : ۱۰ ،	يت فَعْقَافِهِ ع	17,13	مآءات بأ	Grand of
	L	::	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	inches .	11		ۇۋە ئالى

William December 1

C. BAC CERTINOR WEREOUT BOID BY MOR TOURST LOW THE

The second of th

<u>.</u>` :: 'n .,

Cherchel Cymerk . In the the blocked of CONTRACTOR STATES COLUMN CONTRACTOR The second of th ុល**ៈ ខាង ស្**ត្រូវន**្ទ បុ**ស្ត្រ ស្រុស្ស <mark>សម្រាប់ សម្រាប់ ស្រ</mark>ុស្ស ស្រុស ស្រ . : There's of Texars business tours tour subjected. And the and the contraction of the contraction of the Supre a 17 \$600 - 54 3 \$60000 - \$ \$550 \$ \$60000 ar 5:00 á,

17

4 40

Y :

,,

4.0 % 3.

JUDGE JONES: Well, Ava is out --1 over here. Look at her. She's -- she's --2 she's been -- she's been -- she's causing me to 3 get this way. 5 Justice Hecht, here are the proposed copies of the rule that I think -- and it's 7 got -- and those have teeth in it. They just 8 don't give you an escape clause. It just says -- and I take out the "ands," put the 10 "ors." If you file a case for the purpose of 11 harassing somebody else, you are subject to 12 sanctions. 13 If -- you know, gentlemen, if -- if 14 you-all have any further questions, I know 15 this -- I don't want to take up --16 JUSTICE SPEARS: I have one 17 question. 18 JUDGE JONES: -- an inordinate 19 amount of time. 20 JUSTICE SPEARS: I have a question. 21 JUDGE JONES: You have a question? 22 JUSTICE SPEARS: Has it been 23 interpreted under the federal rule, or is it 24 anywhere in your proposal, as to what you do with the lawsuits that are filed in an effort to 25

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
unges comme, to t, her is ent ---
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  5
                       over here. Fook reliek. The's -- she'd --
   ാൻ താം. ഇങ്ങളെ ഒ്ടി. —— ഒരുവ ദ്രവം —— അനുവ് മ്രമുള
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    3
                                                                                                                                                                                     d get elis vay.
  Tustice Todi', hare are the propert
                          egilos de diversión de la collección de 
                gub -- and those days teeth in it. They just
                                  saut of the second of the second of the guarante
                              ್ಯಾಗ್ರೆ ನೀಕ "ಕಟ್ಟಿಯಾಗಿ ದನ್ನು ಭಾಗದ ದಲ್ಲಿಗೆ ನಿರ್ದೇ -- ಅಳ್ಳು ಕ
                The money and the second of the more in the contract of
                        TO SEE TO TOP OF THE SEE OF THE SEE OF THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          2.1
                                                                                                                                                                                                       .ogeldens.
    TE -- geu krev, jentlomen, is -- id
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    ^` <u>r</u>
                              romi " ,ecrideor suderbi (15 ov 1 ",e-p; r
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            to the calculation discrete the calculation of the 
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            : 1
                                           Land Cross & Parker of the Parker
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 .
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  N.S.
                                                                                                                                                                                                        .au.dosd
                             obtación contra en emporent de des
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   * P
                                                                                                                                                                           .o.id to insele
      Judito, a predict : Allere, a geotean.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   00
        THATA GATAS: Yet have a question?
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    P
                                       gerryns commons: as it been
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 2.3
                 into, we test the first subject of the design of the
                  to story form of his chareful they are a largue
res doctor to at less Boots do do tigadas vill nota.
```

. .

change the common law or to change an 1 interpretation of a statutory provision --2 JUDGE JONES: Yes --3 JUSTICE SPEARS: -- or is that considered -- that's considered by some judges 5 as frivolous and by other judges as legitimate 7 effort. Well, in my opinion, 8 JUDGE JONES: that's legitimate effort. If -- you know, if it 9 10 is filed for the sincere purpose of change 11 because -- the law is -- is a -- is a -- always 12 a never-ending change, as we all --13 JUSTICE SPEARS: Well, I can foresee some district judge saying, "Well, this is the 14 15 settled law, and you just filed a frivolous lawsuit and I'm going to hit you." 16 17 JUDGE JONES: Well, I can understand 18 that, and -- and --19 JUSTICE SPEARS: How do you protect 20 against that? 21 JUDGE JONES: By the language in the same rule, that a -- that a -- that a legitimate 22 lawsuit filed to change an existing law is not 23 violative of the rule. In fact, that's in there 24 25

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

now, and, in fact, in my proposal also I -- not

a lighted at the unitary of landing	
Anti-Twest - Copyright of Distance Sales established	;'*
ALCOND BUILDING FORD	ŗ.
పారణేకి ఎన్ ఇంకా ఈఈ కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా	.3
ດວຽມສຽ ຄວອກ ຊູປ ພັດຊາຍອີໄສເຄື່ອ ເລື່ອ Wil —— ຄວາມພຸລສ	E.
១៨០៨៨២ខែ៨ ១០ ១០ភូមិស្នា ១៩៤៩១ មួយ ១៤៤ ស្រុកព្រែកព្រះ ១៤	*e
	ï
reads for mo . Total : Teres	ę
t ki vuenz sog Pil listonue odalikačno eldeli	
de di a lle conseque galerone di ci and	.r.
SPORTS - CONTROL - CONTROL - CONTROL	r.
ee cos so ျခင္းရဲ႕ေန႔ ျခင္းမွာ မေန႔	· ·
grang grange (1971) to this and donesee	, *
ರಚಿತ ಆದಿ ಇತಿಮಿಕ ಇಟ್ಟರ <sup>ು ಕ</sup> ್ಕಾಣಬಹ್ಮಗಳ ಗೃತ್ವಿ ತಿರ್ದಾಶಕ್ಕು ಅವರು.	<u>ئ</u> د
ಇರ ಸಂಶಸ್ತಿಯ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿದ ಈ ಆಕ್ಷ ರಲ್ಲಿ ನಿಯಮ ಕರ್ಯ ಬರು ಗಳಿಸಿಂದ	i.
transference of the page of the goast	7
ruduaokan aro mukada ukan kanasa 1990 sa	₹° :
***	ē,
သလာလေသည်။ အမေတြ လ ကလမ္မေတ ႏွစ္သားသည္။ ကိုလို သည္။ မေတြသည္	<i>*</i>
\$2 \\\$3 3 44.07 <b>3</b> 6	<b>©</b> -
ం మాణపై తాగ్రామంలో అడేదే కైద్యాలు కార్యాలు - పారామాలు కార్యాలు	<b>C.</b> :
ලි. මාය්ථමේ වුවර ව මියන්ම —— ව ලිටුම්බේ —— වියන්ම දර්වර විශයට	Ş.,
som at las junistica na pyslub ot letik stromer	r.
ರಗ ಈ ಧಾರತ್ವರಿಕ ಕೂಡು ಮೇ ನಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಅಧಿಕಾರಿಗಳು	•
of in the first principle of the state of the state of	٠ (

only do I safeguard the parties who may be accused of offending the rule by appellate review, you know, the amount of damages claimed cannot be -- cannot offend the rule; a general denial cannot offend the rule. But --

JUSTICE SPEARS: Well, I -- I was specifically referring to your suggestion that we replace the "ands" in the rule with "ors."

JUDGE JONES: Well, here's --

JUSTICE SPEARS: That would make it a little stickier, wouldn't it?

JUDGE JONES: No. In fact, it gives it -- it gives it some teeth. If you say "groundless and for the purpose of delay," that means that if you want to file it for the purpose of delay, if it has some merit, even though it is for delay purposes only, you don't offend the rule.

My -- my thinking is this: If you file a lawsuit or a motion or any other paper before a court that you know to be groundless, you know it's done for harassment purposes, you know, you know it to be frivolous or you have filed it without making any kind of reasonable or diligent inquiry as to the validity of what

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the contract and the set of the later of the later. orderit och på på blar blar blaret, ber til bet blar beste conjects read in the Ed. of the description of the description denn i is ee dennoù dillan bisa ruiog a gal mm date and all and Scott of Spanish China e ्राहरू भ चच र दृष्टि हो। इत्या सम्बद्धि समाप्त aboutfication of the low too our erroger than this e. won do w old life "alem" the collection The state of the s might design as the state of th ^.[ So the bear and and the control J. 7 COUNTY BOURDS ... IN COCK, AS ITOM *(- :* The mod gr. Tribat end to some fire -- 40 ter's "tank and the the obey one of the bare and there 1. 1 indicated the state of the second of the testion in cove (fire a orea in the the gase to one in - F this may walne sees just we go would it done to 7.5 olfena the rule. 1 Ty -- uy thinking to this a first war OF or in the article particle was assisted as in the respective of the wole is midenth that you harm in a cast conti-J 1 the groupe out of day who the back of the well boy . . . kier, yer treat it to be drive on on jet i eve (C) + pairs: happy Lo oned run rabby, dued by the best li ေန သို့က ဂါ**ဝ**က္ကို ၁ ဆီလာလာလည်း ကို ကို **မက**ိုက္သည်း မေနာက္ခဲ့သည်။ ကို သည်မေနာက် 7.5

you are doing, that's slipshod law practice. 1 2 And it's -- also, it's taking up time of the courts and cluttering the dockets, just the one 3 I just -- the example I gave: filing that 5 third-party action. I looked at the car dealer and said, 6 "I'm sorry, sir, that you had to be brought 7 before the Court. We hope that justice is better than this, but I can't do anything for 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

you."

Now, under my proposal on a tougher, more teeth than Rule 13, I could have said, "I can do something for you. I'm going to have that lawyer that filed that third-party action before the Court on contemptuous action and see if I'd gain them both sanctions."

And the people of this state,

Justice Spears, need to be made whole when

they're damaged by people that do things like

that. You see?

JUSTICE HECHT: Any others -
JUDGE JONES: So I say harassment
means harassment; delay means delay.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions of Judge Jones?

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

<ul> <li>but the low writing of feds of the contraction</li> </ul>	,5
రావార్ కండా ఉంది. ఎద్దా పాటక్షించిన కార్స్ • • • ప్రవేస్తున్నారి. ప్రతి కోడు	
one car terry entorion out patrors in to any of the	د.
gelit grith Book on the and on the employed	j
•ငက် မိမ္မာ ကျယ်ကန္းမာ သွားကို ခဲ့	*
ද දී උපතු සහ පතුව දෙනු එක් එක් සිට <sup>සිට</sup>	
သီးလ <b>ွေးရင</b> ်လို့ စပါး စညီ စနားမှု မေးသည်။ နေသည်။ နေသည် ကျောင်းများ	₹
පතරින් ද එකි. කට විසිට ක්රේක විසිට පතරකිය.	
The secretary of the second	
	ŗ
្នាស់ បានប្រជាព្រះ ព្រះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេ	 
on Astronomy Direct (CI) after what direct gure	•
ovsi ខេត្ត ប្រលិក្ខិត្ត នេះ ប្រសាធិត្ត ប្រជាធិត្ត បានស្រាស់ ស្រាស់	Ç.
that Newyor the Miles that that this of act on	2
beaute the dead on conteas enough after the last	••
Control of the contro	• \
್ರ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿದ ಬೆಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಬರು ಅಂದು ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿದ ಬಿಡಿಸಿದು.	· •
ရေလာင်က <b>မာနစ္အေတြ ေကြ ေကြ ေကြ ေကြသည္။ ေကြေခင့္က ျဖစ္ႏို ျဖစ္</b> ေရးမွာတ္	•
ခော်သို့ ကြောင်းကြီး တွင် ပြုချော်သို့ ရေးသည်မှာရေးကြွေကြီး အတွေသူ သည် မက <b>်မှစ</b> မြောက်	ţ
	•
Juneau Par Parter - Juneau	
चे प्रकार भाषा । एका है है है । <b>:व</b> ाल के के रहे हैं	••
•• ខេត្ត និង និង <b>ក្នុង ស្គ្រាស្ត្រ និង្គស្ត្រ មួយ</b> ប្រុស្ស និង ស្គ្រាស្ត្រ ស្គ្រាស្ត្រ	

The Mote Cartina and the Control of the Cartina and the Cartin

1	Judge, we thank you for coming.
2	JUDGE JONES: Thank you, sir. I
3	appreciate the attention of the Court and
4	JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you so much.
5	JUDGE JONES: and appreciate it
6	very much.
7	JUSTICE HECHT: You bet.
8	JUDGE JONES: I thank you.
9	JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you.
10	Any other comments on Rules 1
11	through 21b?
12	JUSTICE DOGGETT: Rule 13 that we
13	just heard testimony on was not in the committee
14	recommendation
15	JUSTICE HECHT: Yeah.
16	JUSTICE DOGGETT: so if anyone
17	has a suggestion on a rule covered by this
18	cluster of numbers as we go along, they can
19	offer it, even if it's not
20	JUSTICE HECHT: Yes.
21	JUSTICE DOGGETT: anything the
22	committee is considering.
23	JUSTICE HECHT: Right. If you if
24	you didn't hear that, if you have any comment on
25	any of these rules, whether a change is proposed

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

· Library on Early Adversariance of the Commission of the Commissi	4
.pine - set o y line o 1. line set o the transfer of the tra	.*
the larger wis the weathered with the best of	••
elign on more institute to the organization of	
్రి లక్షిణ లాక్షణ లు:కా ాాలు కా <sup>ర్</sup> కాండ్	; <del>*</del>
· Turk of the	
.to but the property we	
Log Amada To Protest Write	,
.ជាក្នុងស្នាក់ ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុក	
Jacob at anthony on the Jacob A.	* ··
ក, 10 ខេត្តនៅថា	5.5
್ರಾಟ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ	ţ* ;
jusk iskel to itikony tu sas tot in the co. Kitta	ζ. •.
raca muan bion	• •
• Carton क्रांस्ट्रिया है । एट्टिस्स्ट्रिया व	· " "
១៩៩ក្នុងក្នុង នៃ ១០ 🖚 🖫 🕬 ១០ ១០១២ ១០១២ ១០១២	₹"
ire a culyo. Dion on a unua correr by tile	Ç*
a duting ve marling of the good high blog car	t
—— మిగ్రామ్ కోవీస్ క్ష్మ్ గుర్వర్ కంప్ కా	* <b>*</b>
oli • ™it olima	43.50
DOD ON ADMIN ** ** TO COMPANY OF THE SERVICE	P.C
wommartne is conmidetion.	• •
े एक १ केट -इ.कि.स. : क्षाराक्ष एक व्यवस्था ।	•• /3
go design to bear towers is now and could be	10
to a color of these cauceds are a color of the target of	; <b>¢</b>

or not, why, feel free to make it.

Ą

DAVID DAVIS,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. DAVIS: Justice Hecht, my name is David Davis. I'm from Austin. I'm here in two capacities: one as a -- as a trial lawyer with primarily a defense practice, and also as a representative of the Texas Association of Defense Counsel.

I have just a number of comments on the rules, and I have provided to the clerk a copy of our -- of our comments, and there are several of us that will speak at different times in writing that summarizes it.

As to Rule 10, the proposed rules eliminate the provision that simply allows the filing of a notice to substitute an attorney when there's an -- in particular, where the client consents to the change and a new attorney

**ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES** 

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

• ់ ១៥១៣ ១៨ ៩៩៩៩ <sup>រ</sup> ិក្ខដិស្រី ភូមិក្រុង ប្	ŗ
	••
A CONTRACT OF STATE	4
at an all to the Blamer who det all the likeno in	•
is a Gaussian for the $oldsymbol{r}$ and $oldsymbol{r}$ and $oldsymbol{r}$ and $oldsymbol{r}$	••
ປະຕິທິດພາກ ປອດການ ໃຊ້ກຳກັນ ຂໍ້ ເຄັນປ່ອຍພວກ, ຄວັນຄວາມເກັ	~
le ಇರ್ಲಿ.' ದಾವರಣ ಸರಣ ಸರಣಕ್ಕಾರದಕ್ಕೆ ಕಡೆಕೆ "ನಡ್ಡನ್ ನರ ಏರತಿಕ್	6
navit Tricopoe, stabu - na dribopos:	•
	`
TI, TAUTE: Tuntino Tocht, y acua	* •
nk ened marte. The Lees Cu. Din. The Some in	
THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY OF THE CONTROL OF THE	?
ofto palkasitt o doffonso paratice, smd akno ca c	^
rojeor endraive ou the mouse hapostoties el	٨.
**Sagrot cureRet	<b>.</b>
as often moo in recent a traff event at the	۹.
ာ က်ားလက္မာ မာဒီတို့ လာတာ ခဲ့တက်အသည်သည် မေလာက်သေး သည် က လေသက်သောသည် က (ည	₹.
n in partical and endingers of the 2 miles and the witter	
ာ (ကြီး ကြီးပတ္တေလို့ အကို ကြန္းစီးသည့္မေန ကြီးအေန ကြီးအေန ကြီးအေန ကြားအေန ကြားအေန ကြားအေန ကြားအေန ကြားအေန ကြားအေန	~
.i. ropinamma ands indition si	, ·
1000 to 1000 general and 100 for 100 f	.f. 9
សស៊ីប៉ា ណា ។ ស៊ីបា ឃុំ ប្រសិទ្ធ ។ ហើយ <b>ព</b> លការកិបាលពេល នៅថា <b>១២</b> 0 សុខិចនិយិត	? '
ಗಾರಣ <b>ರ</b> ಭರದ ಪತ್ರ ದಭರ್ಷದಿ <b>ಭ</b> ಟನೆಗಳು <b>ರ</b> ದ ಅರತಿನನ್ನು ತತ್ತಿಗೆ ೧೯೭೩	~.
ండిందు కాతక్టా శాగు ఉందాని కూడు ఉంది. అంది కూడు కూడు కూడు కూడు కూడు కూడు కూడు కూడు	<b>K</b> /
d line community to the discreption of a new otto nor	

is substituted in.

,

And we -- it is our feeling that by doing this, by requiring a motion showing good cause of situations where there is an agreement, it is unnecessary involvement by the Court and eliminates a process that is used fairly frequently and can be done without any purpose of hurting anybody in the actual lawsuit.

Now, what I'm talking about is simply the case where the client decides to change attorneys and the attorneys make the decision to comply with that. If there is problems, there's other provisions within the rule that can make certain that such a substitution does not occasion any delay in the case. Say if an attorney is willing to take it upon himself to substitute in and his client is agreeable to that, and a reasonable notice is given to all parties and the Court of that substitution, we feel that — that provision should be allowed left in the rules.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Do you have language -- if I heard you, what you are saying is if there is an express written consent of the client and a statement that it would occasion no

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

e tert rid e atetarent bile de vould oacreten e

7 (\*)

. .-

1 delay, then you see no need to have to have a 2 written motion for good cause. 3 MR. DAVIS: Right. Essentially, what --5 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: But that's stronger than the current rule is now, isn't it? б 7 MR. DAVIS: Well, basically, under Rule 10, the current item to be --CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: The problem we have now is -- is sometimes the client has no 10 11 idea these things are going. I mean, there's 12 no -- there's no protection in the rule to 13 keep -- for a client to demonstrate to the Court 14 that they are aware of what's happening, 15 particularly the withdrawals. We have a lot of -- the attorney 16 17 loses his client and doesn't make a very 18 diligent effort to find the client --19 MR. DAVIS: Right. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- and the 20 21 case just disappears in smoke and there's nobody 22 accountable for it. 23 MR. DAVIS: Chief Justice Phillips, 24 what we are asking is under the current Rule 10 25 provision, sub-item (b) in the rules following

do no finite and an arm of the lave to fine ŗ ic u b / op col dollar acc. ita ( The state of the same of the s attice but added attended to another addition g choon of than blo stureus rule is now, icuit i ? wolfer a freight a of the Wallet THE COLOR CONTRACT STREET OF THE CERNY UNGERON OF PAREN: 18 c problem and and the tree and considered at -- an error own to be 2.5 riotest trace to enaber and enable concile cost ^ .**r** no ee thorolo at horotopassi in the tube to hoos -- for a dent co for experate to the fauck ្សាក្រាស់ សេងស្នាស់ សេងស្នេស សេងសេង ១៩១ មួយ សេងស្ន 9 F . . .ភពកាក់ស់ដល់។ ១៧៦ មួយ១១ ស្តេចដែរភេ To have a "ot of -- the atterney 13. Lacer his allend form frame t would 6. -- droits of trail of trollo tropicts . dipir : organ .fr ~ I griph ausunds of haund: -- car tho 36 ាស្ត្រាល់ ។ បានសុខិត និង សុខិស្សា នៅ មានសុខសុខ ។ ប្រជាជាធិប្បារាធិប្បារិ TU .di res olistanoson (5.5 ne. oavro: Chiof Charles Diilliga, 2.3 មាន ១១១៩ ១៤៩៩៩៩ ១៨៩ ១១ ៩៩ ១៦ ខ្លាំទី១១ ១២១ ១២ ១៩ មិន V. ..

control of the car the the the sector of the sector

- .

the "or": "upon presentation by such attorney of a notice of substitution designating the name, address, telephone number, and State Bar ... number of the substitute attorney, with the signature of the attorney to be substituted, and an averment that such substitution has the approval of the client and that the withdrawal is not sought for delay only."

It would appear to be that there is protection of all of the Court and the parties through that. If it's abused by an attorney, then, you know, perhaps that could be -- if -- if there would be a requirement, not only an averment that the client has agreed to it, but a provision that the -- the notice also include the signed consent of the client, that would satisfy the requirement of assuring that the client did consent to this. When--

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Your problem is having to bring a motion before the Court which would --

MR. DAVIS: Right.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- lead to some delay --

MR. DAVIS: You just have to do it,

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

the " '": " " in a creating which is twenter and	
មុខ ៤ ១០០ ការ ១៩ ការអ្នក L ដាក់វិទុស ៥១១១ជូសខេត្តណៃ ប្រ	,,
ကြောက်အာဏ်ကြီး ပြီးကျားသွင့်တောင်းပြားသောကရာတည်းများသည်။ နေသည် မောင်းသွင့်သည်။	.•
ods Asim ou. to. of the abbe bute cated areas.	
nichrature of the ritorney to be suidthoused	۾
out and anithatiacium doun thait the mov. no	
rovation the diseast and state the witherest	7
". plac wo bel mod fribuso den mi	• •
Translation of the particular the sheet are	٦
raction of the Che Count and the Contractor	
t repris then. "I it's abuned by an atterney,	$\mathcal{I}_{i} \subset$
t en, yet knew, jesteren tint entist be is	f. L
is thene would be a segntwinent, wit only in	<i>?</i> -
evariont thit whe elient he sympthet to strong to sut	
provinion to the the ablide uses include	5.5
the missing congent of the diffent, thut sould	7.
datiufy the requirement of socuring that the	$\nabla \mathbb{E}$
disont did donadt beo thin. Then-	Ĉ r
cror : nordere coreste warro	7.5
roblum in having to bring a motion hoffore the	2.0
Court callen weald	
ro. orver: might.	00
व्यात्राचा वाच्याचा वाच्याचा वाच्याचा च्या है १०६४ ६०	٤n
Jomes et al. V. Comes and C. Co	* .* 5. • .

a construction of the state of

and it auto -- automatically has a delay with that.

1

2

3

5

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

As to Rule 13, I won't repeat Judge Jones' comments except to indicate that at the time we speak also about Rule 87, that I believe that -- that a stronger Rule 11 -- I mean a stronger Rule 13, perhaps based upon some provision similar to Federal Rule 11, would provide some mechanism whereby a party in a venue hearing where a cause of action is taken as true without any requirement of a prima facie showing, but should it be later determined that the cause of action was frivolous, then under a strengthened Rule 13, there would be some remedy other than simply by an appeal. But I won't make any more comments on Rule 13 except to the extent of indicating we do believe it should be stronger.

Under Rule 21a, I do want to comment about the telephonic document transfer that we typically refer to as "fax."

The problems that we perceive are two: One is that fax provides no inherent verification of receipt, which makes it more analogous to a first-class letter. It's not, I

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

್ರಿಟ್ಟಿನ ಕೃಷ್ಣಿಯ ಅವರಿ ಕೃಷ್ಣಿ ಬೆಂದು ಅವರು ಈಈ ಅತ್ಯ ಹಾಗಿ ಬರು ಬರು ಅವರಿ ಪ್ರಾಣಿಕ್ಕಿ ಬರು ಬರು ಪ್ರಾಣಿಕ್ಕಿ ಬರು ಪ್ರಾಣಿಕ್ಕಿ ಆರಂಭಕ್ಕೆ

adjora y to the second of the

.copacata

1 ( 1)

to be take 13, F wen't repend in gr ్రణేవి తాడ్ విరాష్థ్ కాళిఖర్గుడ్ అని సక్తుందింది. క్రామం క్రామం క్రామం క్రామం క్రామం Rice we diseak and others that a 37, that I no iera fired -- thota convenger unical -- I masm a tropec នេះ ប្រជាព្រះ ប្រជាព្រះ ក្រពុះដូចក្រុម មិនគេចថា សុខមាន ជាសុខ 7 g start of the attention of the advection of the weather ar arise como hechanida do ebra a perty in a and the control of the control of and the control of the telephone of on the limit of the demonstration of the fire early infood for inverse to be the following for the section of the caune of detten par frivelous, then under a vàowor promost Palace vousé se nordana, to 7 ether Glen thouly by an egueel. But T wen't take ony nore comments on Rulo 13 endopt to the - 13 F extent of totanting we do doltove it chemic be 7.1

10 grade to see the control of the seed of the control of the cont

**ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES** 

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE \* AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 \* 512/452-0009

don't believe, technically analogous to certified, registered mail delivered by an attorney or his agent, or use of a courier. In each one of those situations, there is a provision whereby we see as verified.

This could be corrected simply by requiring that if faxes are used to provide, that the party faxing the document has some obligation to provide a mechanism for obtaining receipt of that document, even if it includes --simply includes a separate sheet that needs to be acknowledged and then faxed back to the faxing party to show some indication that the document was received by the party to whom it is directed. Without that, then the Court will be involved again in disputes as to whether documents that were allegedly faxed were actually received by the party to whom the document was faxed.

The second problem that we perceive is that there still is no reasonably accepted period of delivery for faxes, unlike every other method of delivery of any of these notices, which are all generally limited to some type of normal business hour. Fax machines, unless a

```
Court ing a vor backering on e out to
               ಗು -ಾರ್ಮಗಳಂತ - ಎಂದು ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕ್ಷಣ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿದ ಕೊ
                     eme one of those of the air and there is
                               revision wherever we accommunities.
       This could be corrected simily by
         requiring that if faxed one used to provide.
                                                                                                                                                          Ź.
            that the seaty faring the locuront has some
  obligation of vertica mechanian for of a ning
-- ខេចកំពុះនិងនៅ នៅក្នុំ និង ខេត្ត «ជាសេខភេស». មេសាជា ដែល អារួមប្រភព្
                                                                                                                                                        0.0
    of the transfer of the contract of the transfer the contract of the contract o
                                                                                                                                                        ŗ.,
              he lakino received lead than Sami Dada to the
                                                                                                                                                      £*
        tanker to the the independent that the
                                                                                                                                                        1 🖯
cocument was secsived by the party to whose it in
                                                                                                                                                          ^ .C
 Circulad. Withlank theb, then bla Court will his
                    invalue of agric it dispets at the wiether
                    coros ata that that was a la colly fame, were
                                                                                                                                                        7.5
               odinaliy received by the gardy to whom the
                                                                                                                                                        1
                                                                               . Tund now don't de the
                                                                                                                                                <u>`.</u> f
   The second grabbal that we excelve
                                                                                                                                                          2.
      further there weilt in no reconcium recepted.
                                                                                                                                                         1.0
or and the different for famous unlake array which
                                                                                                                                                         11.0
            nection of the layery of the object notices;
 phinh are all conteally limited to some ty to of
                                                                                                                                                         * ^
```

no to busine a leur. Pan acchiness unless co

\_

firm sets its own on and off times for the fax machine, can receive documents 24 hours a day.

I know the rules have been changed to allow inclusion -- or the exclusion of Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays from notice provisions, but still that doesn't address the problem, for example, with depositions where it is reasonable notice, or in some of the other provisions for so-called reasonable notice, when the document is faxed to the recipient party after normal business hours on a Friday or before a holiday, and then shows up when the attorney returns to his office on the normal business hour, finds the fax that came in two to three days before, and has very short notice within which to respond.

There is a remedy by going to Court, of course, and asking for some kind of relief through a motion to protect, or for something of that nature, but I think that unnecessarily involves the Court.

I think, again, if you simply provide that where a fax is used, that it is to be -- any delivery by fax can only be accomplished to the extent that it is initiated

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

nate action of the analysis of afron 200 and the Fan	1
cochine, a magaive documento . The company	·*
್ ಗುರಚ ಕುಡಿಕ ೧೯೮೭ ಕಟ್ಟಾಟರು ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿದ್ದಾರೆ	Ċ
ic fig o indian on er the endirisen of	* (**
Matter ava, Sundaye, .: Lekidaye From notice	5
arovicion, but setth inc Commit cikero tic	7
r rubia for ar ar ar a range iti	-
ಎಂದು≢ದ ಅವರ <sup>9</sup> ಜ ಕಾಮಗು ಎ' ಕ ಕೃತ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಪ್ರಧಾಗಿಗಳು ಪ್ರ	t*
ron - postron on innonsou possible-en les nobloises ;	•
ખૂલવાદા પ્રાથમ કેલા છે. કેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા છે. જેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા કેલા ક	€ <b>*</b> 1, 1
will by more a Gurinera late of $u \in \mathbb{N}^{n} Y$ or	7 A
paid dedw gu awallo នាd ប្រាណ ស្គ្រាស់ នៅ នេះ analad	e /
atterprey retuins to bit office on the normal	<i>?</i> ".
Suginers hour, finde the tan that case in the to	, st
er.co. 'ny hotoro, era an very ahord nolike	J. "
- 181 - 180 - 184 - 18 - 18 - 18 - 18 - 18 - 18 - 1	7.5
Pache in a case, by coing to the Co	7.7
of course, and acking for some kind of rottef	e r
through mobion to protect, or for conetain of	. <u>.</u> .
alet a unway but T think that unnoce actily	t c
invalves the Taurt.	15
Colink, again, lf you alogay	23
rovine the date of a second second contract the traces	3.2
of which can built with wear to be were bi	* *

ent coccupilished to the entrut blate it to up that other

within a period of time, say, 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 1 p.m. of customary business hours, of customary 2 business days, or something of that nature. But 3 there is no limit at this time as to that. And perhaps, if a party chooses not to do that, to 5 deliver it during these customary business 6 7 hours, then it should be presumed to be untimely 8 if an issue arises as to whether the fax was sent. That is all I have as to that particular 10 rule. 11 JUSTICE HECHT: Any questions of Mr. 12 Davis on these rules? 13 Thank you. MR. DAVIS: Thank you, Judge. 14 JUSTICE HECHT: Any other comments 15 16 on Texas Rules of Civil Procedure 1 through 21b? 17 All right. We'll move to the next block of 18 rules --19 MR. STORIE: Excuse me, Your Honor; 20 I just -- very briefly, if I may. JUSTICE HECHT: Yes. 21 22 23

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

24

25

J'A	
<b>3</b> .	
បូរ	
€3 * €7 #	CECHACIA CALLAR LECO
30	I Jack acua priesyra, so i tos.
73	n. Branca no. Your Daner;
¥ J	unijan —
<b>3</b> %	II. wicht. Wardh move to the new offer of
ï	on Hanga Marra on Tivil Proceeds the acreb Pic?
	Macadell (2) at the sonar cource.
ſ.	រប់ ខែបានប្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្
3 J	apen, los.
15	ಪ್ರಭಾಗ ಕರ್ಮನ್ನಿ ಕರ್ಮನಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಕರ್ಮನಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಕರ್ಮನಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಕರ್ಮನಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಕರ್ಮನಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಕರ್ಮನಿಗಳ ಪ
3.7	uden med de diales e l'il en entrone de l'us
73	na te•
Ĉ	come. Which is said I have no be have warbleules
J	if on losue artaer on to who her the flux was
-	្រុសនេះ ស្រែស ខេត្ត មគ្គល់រុស្ស ១. នេះ១០២២ <b>០១</b> ខុស ១០ សមន្ត្រាមព្រះ
	olivens in reing there authorizely bunknoon
	orbotos 12 a party chaence ast to de theth to
V	all the in to this out this bise on to that. Ind
j	the first of the $(a_{i}, a_{i})$ constitution of the $a_{i}$ because, $(a_{i}, a_{i})$
	y of emphones, business hours, of everanor.
3	in the state of th

2

3

5

Ţ

## GENE STORIE,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

7

MR. STORIE: I'm Gene Storie. I'm here on my own. I'm an assistant attorney general, and I have a very brief comment about Rule 21a. It seems rather minor in view of some of the others we've heard, but I wonder why we don't include the courier delivery in the three-day rule. That is, if we are going to make allowance to give the three extra days for mail, it seems to me we ought to do the same with a courier. Because as I read the rule now, you could send it off, say, by Federal Express, if your due date is a Thursday, and you would be late if it arrived on Friday, whereas you could mail it on Thursday and be timely if the materials were received on a Monday.

JUSTICE HECHT: Some proposal in the correspondence that we received is to not extend the three-day rule to either that sort of

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

8

10

11

12

15

16

17

18

13

19

21

20

22

23

24

25

\*

\*

30

· 1

i. . among it with done thecit. . . .

Borro on any own . The an endertant ablances denomily and I have a viry budef comment about r That fire the wear applied when in view of mand Ţ. on why accord that , sold union arother odd do 1.3 Con't instruction courism desired in the threse ay may, That the are going to 5.5 mate of the need to vive the three entra doyer from 7 carso not by at dipute out an ed to both it select with a court of the contract of the court of the 10 1 who deal double for effective and according · <u>I</u> on and beging the antiquest of the control for ~ <u>r</u> Little Control of the , 1 ానికి ఇక్కు ఈ గా కార్ ఉన్నాయి. సినిమాన్ని ఉన్నాయి. ఇక్ 1. ., which is a farleger ator all comes 5.5 sess at Empage in light among throughput in

្រុកប្រជាព្រះ ប៉ុន្តែ ១៩ ២៤ ដីក្នុងក្នុង១៩ ១៩ ១៩៨៨ ១៦៩១ ៣ ភូមិនប្រជាព្

to dren field willie of the grammar of the

1	delivery or fax delivery. But you think it
2	ought to be the other way?
3	MR. STORIE: I just I guess I
4	don't understand why it should be treated
5	differently, because it seems to me a lot of
6	people do business that way, and if the
7	objective is to set a deadline so the materials
8	are received timely, then it seems to me that
9	something that's going to come to a person on
10	Friday should be timely, as timely as something
11	that's going to typically come to them on
12	Monday. That's all I have.
13	JUSTICE HECHT: Any questions of Mr.
14	Storie?
15	Did you fill out one of these slips,
16	Mr. Storie?
17	MR. STORIE: No, I haven't.
18	JUSTICE HECHT: Would you do that
19	before you leave, sir, please?
20	MR. STORIE: I will, sir. Thank
21	you.
22	JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you.
23	All right. We'll move to the next
24	block of rules, if there are no other comments
2 5	on that block.

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

go in the or fut of two or with a first or a very time.	ï
output to be that we were	ŗ
Location of the Model of the Control of the	ε
್ರಾಗ ಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕಾಗು ಗಟ್ಟಿಯೇ ಬಿಂದಾಗು ಅಂತಿ ಜೀನಾಗಿಗಳು	`
ចូល ស្នាប់ តា ១០១៨ ១៣១០០០ <b>១១២</b> ១២១២ 📆 🔩 ១០១២៦	~•
end in the contract the transfer and the the	••
್ (ನಿರಾಧಕ್ಕೆ ಎಸ್. ನೀರ್ ಕರ್ನಿ ನೀರ್ ಪ್ರವಾಣ ಕರ್ನಿನಿ ನಿರ್ದೇಶವಾಗಿಯ	•
and rous ves timely, then it seems to see tact	÷
womething blocks joing to done on reason on	ť •
Fritz: should be timely, as timely as constitue	0.5
that's juing to tryically come to then on	T.E.
"on "ay. Thetis a"l I lace.	C.F.
JUSTICE SECHE: Any questions of Hr.	$\epsilon \tau$
rtories	; T
Old you find one one blead soling,	Fţ
Tr. Stories	, í
ME. SWERRE: Fo, I haven't.	1.7
austrin midur: noull gov do that	~ r
bolore you leave, sir, please?	r r
TR. STORIE: C. v. C., Cit. Thank	e e
you.	2.2.
JUSTICE "GOUT: Thank you.	8.4
ALL misht. Joil Lauve to the nort	23
Danck of rules, if there are no other componen	70
on that block.	7.8

on that block.

Rules 22 through 100 -- 22 through 100, but omitting -- we'll save the court sealing proposed rule, which I think is proposed Rule 76a, till we finish these other rules, so we will pass on that one for now. But any other -- other Rules of Civil Procedure 22 through 100?

Yes, sir, Professor.

9

11

12

13

14

15

# 10

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

PROFESSOR PATRICK HAZEL,

16

17

18

19

20

PROFESSOR HAZEL: Members of the Court, I'm Patrick Hazel from Austin, Texas, and I'm here, I suppose, only representing myself, or nobody, if that would turn out to be.

I would like to speak -- I sent a

21

letter, and the one that -- to Justice Hecht.

The one I would speak to at this moment is

87 (5), the venue provision that, I think, has

2425

23

been misinterpreted by a couple of Courts of

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

armental 28 601 aspectals for as no	Ţ
1977 ಕ್ಷಣ ಬ್ಯತ್ತಿಕ್ಕೆ ಬ್ಯತ್ತಿಕ್ಕೆ ಗಡಿಗಳ ಕೊಂಡ ಆರಾಜ್ಯ	را
ending property will, which washing and provence	C
ngle 77., titu no finish chare other rules, do	3
្នាល់ នៅពីបានក្រុងនៅ សម្រេច និង នេះ និង នេះ និង នេះ និង នេះ ប្រេច និង នេះ និង នេះ និង នេះ និង នេះ និង នេះ និង	3
ction other Ealer of Civil Proceeday 22	ra.
( 41 mg/n 1002	₹*
Yar, Dackensor.	v.
	;
WENAT COLUMN LORDING	<u> </u>
anneasime Lafero the Tunrone tous of Jens un	" r
ြီးမရတ္ကုန္းကို အာဂ်ႏွင့် ကေသာင္း မခါ တာလည်းလည္း က <b>ုလုပ္ခ်င္း</b> လည္း ကို	7 P
sloraço, do Weran in co ow Civil Broceduro. Pena	3 ;
neles et lyselsate leccedume, and Charas sullessels	^ <u>r</u>
: ಉಳಾತಿ (ಕಿ ಇಂ ) ಅತಿನತಿಲ <b>್ನಂಲ</b> ಗಡನಿಸಿ∀್ ಕ. ೪ ೫	(4 p
	15 p
ಾವರ ೩೨ ರಾಖಕವರ್ತ :ವರ್ಷಗಳ ೯ <b>೦೩</b> ೮೪೩೮೪	$C_{-\epsilon}$
Jours, Tim Patrick Cases from Aurein, Terro, car	· . T
T's here, I suppose, only retrescenting Typell,	3.5
or nobedy, if thet wou" turn ont to he.	to to
ಎ ರಿದಾರವು ೧ ಜೀವರ್ಷದ ರ. ಅಸಿಕ್ಟಿ ಶಾಸ್ತರು ೪	ï.
rotter, em the one that is suctice thenkt.	(* ?
Vic one I wonier ಆಭಾರಣಿ ಆರ ಎಟ ಕಟ್ಟಿಗಿ ಮರೂರಗಳ I	2.6
77 (8), the senue growingen through thinks has	2.6
ಿರವಿಗೆ ಚಲನೆಸಿದ್ದರು ಗಳಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಬಳ ಜ. ಆಲಚನ್ನಲ್ಲಿ ಆಸ್ಟ್ ನೇ ಆಸ್ಟ್ ನಿನ್ನ	<u>,,,</u>

Appeals. And I think that it was not the intention of this Court -- or if it was, I think it should be changed -- that once a trial on the merits has been heard or is in process, that the trial court can no longer reconsider what was done during a venue hearing. At the venue hearing, the trial court can only rule on affidavits and pleadings that are before the trial court.

1.3

The appellate court is mandated by statute to consider the entire record including the trial on the merits. Now, because of Rule 87 (5) -- and, also, the latest case used that statute as well -- at least two courts have said the trial court has no power. Even if the trial on the merits shows conclusively that what was decided during the venue hearing on affidavits now is shown to be wrong, the trial court must proceed with the entire trial, let it go up on appeal, and then the appellate court says there's no -- no such thing as harmless error, so we have to reverse it. There are some other problems in that area that don't really pertain here, but....

I simply would ask the Court for two

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

interaction of this court and not the solution of the conformation of this court and the conformation of t

**`**,

The comments count in ancions were sational density of the said the least to teast the ş+ ++ the trial on the merits. Moss because of Rule 7.5 to 77 (8) -- ard, also, the latest case used that sintule is well -- at legat two courts have said 5 T the trial court has no power. "ver if the trial , ` F on the agrits shows constantivery shit while so odei ed ett ag the vonce caltag en affidevita 7.1 for in shown the leading, the trial court function eredeed with the evalue brial, let it we up an - (4) ₹ - (4) (4) appeals and that the appealate cours aspe 20 blose'n no -- ne cuch thing as has sleds orasm, # (\*) to we have to reverte it. Where are come chack . . . . thistory vision dinob dollars and della ni amelder-24 inches setters.

ರಾಜನೆ ಇ - ತಿಂದಾರರ್ ಜಿನ್ ಜೀರ್ ತಿನ್ನಡಗ ಇನ್ನು ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆಗಳು ಅವರ ಕಾರ್

things that I mentioned in the letter. First, to retitle number 5. It's called now, "No Rehearing." I don't think the body of Rule 87 (5) talks about that. It really talks about no new motions to be heard. But by calling it "No Rehearing," it sounds like you are saying we can't -- the trial court has no power, no jurisdiction to reconsider. I would simply call it "Hearing New Motions," and then the body of the thing talks about you can't hear new motions. And then I would add the -- the additional phrase: "The trial court shall reconsider, in light of the trial on the merits, motions already ruled on when brought to its attention."

I think this does two things.

It, first of all, lets us -- the trial court know you have the authority to reconsider in light of the trial on the merits, and you shall do that if it's brought to your attention. And I think that will also add another factor; and that is, if a party wants to complain about this on appeal and has not brought it to the trial court's attention so we could have saved all that appeal time, and everything, then they have

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

staring and a consistent of the state of the A secretific at them I. It's a less association of Po coranc." T don't blant the search of unite 67 (3) halks Loue ther. "E really talks alone political telegraph to be beard. Tut by calling the 3 "" tehear republic down in the you are partury we on and the the file of the fact of the off the ۲, ್ ನಾರ್ ಇಕ್ಟಡಗಳು ಚಲಾಕರ ಇದ್ದಾರಿಗಳು ಬರು ಚಲಾಕರ ಇದ್ದಾಗಿಳ ಆದರ ಇ in "Tangine Tem Toutions," and then the Dear of the time talk: about you denia hear sew 1.5 obions. And thon I touch the we thou **.** . addicional a come: "The total court that I econsides: In Italia of the Bridt on the men tes, objons blucady helds on than brought to the 73.7 Toblink this deep two blings. 7.5 nt, first of als, sets us -- the trial court 11 know you have ble authorally be reconsided in " r ಿಕ್ಕಿತ್ರಿಕ್ಕ ಆರ್ಥ್ ಕ್ಷಾರ್ಡ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ ಕ್ 7.1 do that it it is brought to good attention. The 08 this this wite whit also all crotter factors and 16 that is, if a party works to constain about thin €, 6 un commend her not proude to the testal S. \* ian Dovad ound things to be meldaedad nightage 26

read read and I space transport was small to law our space.

\*\* \*\*

l waived it.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any questions of Professor Hazel?

Thank you, professor.

Any other comments to Rules 22 through 100?

## BILL WADE,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. WADE: Justice Hecht, my name is Bill Wade, and I'm from Lubbock, Texas, and I do trial work and I'm here as a representative of the Texas Association of Defense Counsel.

And I would like to join in some of the comments that Professor Hazel has made. I think that is certainly some valid observations. I am concerned, and we are concerned, about the proposed change to Rule 87 requiring -- or not allowing any issue to be made of a cause of action.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

· And Andrew Commencer (Commencer Commencer Co	£
ដឹង ខេសាស្រីបានមានអ្នក ប្រាប់ប្រាប់ ប្រាប់ប្រាប់ប្រ	,
ទីដាស់ជាស្ថិ (X ទី១) នៃបាន នៃបាន នៃបាន ប្រ	:
.zontofrag (mon) imp.	€.
જાજ જૂ જે છે છે છે તાલા છેલા કાર્યો છે. માથે કાર્યો હાથે	**
ិស្សី ដែលមួយស្នាន់ថា	e.g.
	1"
copearing before the Turrence Take of Bound in	•
acainsatactive acquion to constrar ja vosco	^1
changes to executa so divid Processes, Texas	* *
Trles of Appoltate Procedure, and Tenan Duken of	: 1.
Tiv. Tv ndo, stated . o fol bus:	<b>7.</b> .!
	. •
OL. TABE: Testico "echt, my nout i	P.1
siff Tade, and the from Switchie Teans, the take	ត្
tries yank and I'n bea an a negrene. tative of	•••
the Bogas Arteclation of tellaria dounge.	. 1
Int " would like to join in wome of	r
to a some enter thirt Production Han C har cace of	<b>9</b> "
think that is certainly nowe varial observations.	T.,
T at conserned and we are converned, about the	e c
per enod chance to have W requising or not	÷.
ations of early infine to be the compact of the confidence	<b>\$</b> 6

.noteon

2.0

1 Our concern about this is a 2 situation where you could have forum shopping, 3 and you could have multiple defendants, and several of these defendants are held by the 5 allegations against the resident defendant, but 6 they cannot raise the issue of proper joinder 7 unless they are able to raise the issue of 8 the -- of the validity of the cause of action that the plaintiff has against the resident 10 defendant. And without being able to do that, 11 of course, then, they are -- they are hung in 12 that situation and -- and their venue is --13 their venue challege is really of no merit. 14 And we feel that this would 15 certainly not be fair to those defendants, and I 16 think that is probably the situation that I think of that's most glaring, is there would be 17 18 no way to raise the issue of proper joinder. 19 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Are you for 20 no change in --21 MR. WADE: Well, apparently, there's 22 some --23 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- 87 (2), 24 or --

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

MR. WADE:

Excuse me, Judge. I'm

25

```
ting concert to the like the co
                                                                                                                                                            1
     2 s. bgotk on the got of the lave forum observance.
              ind you belied have multiplied refer innes, the
              nevero. This biscus selencante se bell by the
   the election that the couldes the design aloudes. In
      thing sinable silve the initia of traject frince
                 navoss they are ed a to unine the ladge of
      the -- of the validity of the cause of action
                                                                                                                                                           8
            theo tid plateties that quinut the cest art
    describer. And without being alle to do thet,
                                                                                                                                                            0.5
      in of serious, there can your employ are thought
             tive of abouten one -- and their vence is --
                                                                                                                                                         8.0
             is the state of the state of the saily of no merit.
                         and we feet that this would
                                                                                                                                                             . . !
centringy not be fair to those defendants, and i
              think what is probably the situation bist I
                                                                                                                                                            7.5
think of thet's lost gloring it than world be
                                                                                                                                                           1.7
           co way to raine the issue of graner join ca.
                                                                                                                                                            i î ț
nerg suggested protections served
                                                                                                                                                             · r
                                                                                           -- ni connate on
                                                                                                                                                            0.0
The FADR: Tell, the ment y, thought
                                                                                                                                                            £ 5
                                                                                                                  -- ೨೫೧೮
                                                                                                                                                            10 C
  ्राप्ताल मार्ग प्राप्ता कार्याच्या । । ११ (१)
                                                                                                                                                             . . .
                                                                                                                                                            25
                                                                                                                      aria anne ma
           The income and a compared the control of the contro
                                                                                                                                                            ( . * .
```

sorry to interrupt.

8

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

10

Apparently, there is some question 2 about whether or not what the law is in that 3 area, whether or not you can challenge the existence of a valid cause of action against the 5 resident defendant, but I don't think this is 6 7 the way to solve that -- that issue. certainly would put that issue to bed, but it would also -- when it does that, there would be 9 10 some victims along the way, and that is our 11 objection to the proposed change.

JUSTICE HECHT: Mr. Wade, you have not written us on this change, I don't believe.

MR. WADE: I have joined with Mr. Davis in -- in the written presentation to the Court --

JUSTICE HECHT: All right.

MR. WADE: -- which has been filed with the clerk.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions of Mr. Wade on this subject?

> MR. WADE: Thank you, Your Honor.

> JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments to

Rules 22 through 100?

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

- Indiana on the state of the s ſ relided the all offers of rotates contract thether or not to the contract the beautiful the aged, of allow of and part of the deal of the age the tur dende of a politic comit action against the ed thing and documents a device think this is cally .orgal sold -- Sana syles & reposit ្នាស់ ជាមាល់ 🗘 🕩 🤊 🧿 បានស្នាធិបានស្រែវ 🐧 🔭 ប្រកាស់ស្រុកស្រែក ស្រែង ರದ ಸರ್ಕಾರ ಅತರಿಗೆ ಕನ್ನಡೆಗೆ ಚಾರುಸಿ ಸ್ಥಾರ್ ಕ --- ಸ್ವಾಪ್ ಸರ್ಕ true ni domi ma gim odd yn a billott ee n. - - 15 tt chigeed on to the required distings. reserve madels: "e. care, you have act whiteen no or tain shange, I don't 11. .ovelfar N. CANS: Thave joined with L. . T. Nivis in -- in the brittin gresentation to Fig. "ourt --**V** .  $\mathcal{T}$ ng. mins: -- which hed soon filed ^ . T with the above 0.0 guarda andie: Any it or acctions 1 ... Sapoliting at the La balance of the Enthioper "". "Bar: "":cnk you, Wur Tono .

and the control of the state of

3

TO NOT IN MICHAEL OF BOOK OF THE COMME

MR. DAVIS: Justice Hecht, under 1 2 Rule 63 --UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: 3 Name? MR. DAVIS: I'm sorry. David Davis. 5 6 DAVID DAVIS, 7 appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in 8 administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas 9 10 Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 11 12 MR. DAVIS: Under Rule 63, the --13 14 the rule has been amended to include responses 15 as being required to be filed no later than 16 within -- or outside of the seven days of trial. 17 The problem that -- I understand that one of the reasons perhaps this has been 18 19 done is to avoid an apparent loophole in the 20 rules involving filing supplemental pleadings 21 that don't appear to be covered by the current 22 Rule 63. 23 But with the change that's imposed 24 by the proposed rule, a respondent, whether it 25 be a plaintiff in some circumstances responding

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	•
	î.
variation : Forest of the winter w	÷.
- Promise example and income	`
	:
V Y Z. C. V.	
នារី ខាងទៅ និង ដល់នេះ ១៧ ខេត្ត នេះ នេះ ១៧ ខេត្ត ១៣៣ និង ១៣៣ និង ១៣៣ ខេត្ត ១៣៣ ខេត្ត	7
ລາ ໂທໂມສະຕານໂຕຍ ຮອຍສາ <mark>ວກະນຸດ</mark> ເຄດເພື່ອກະເທັດ ເຂດ	<b>£</b> `
Constitution of the first of the contract of t	
ಡ ಬಡ ಅತ್ಯ ನಿಶ್ವಧಿಕಾಸಿ ಮುಂದು ನಡೆದಲ್ಲಿ ಕನಕ್ಕೆ ನೀಡುಕ್ ನಿರ್ಣಕ್ಷಣ	
o d y 1 1/ medada, nuabao to 10 lena:	<u> </u>
	£ I
HH DIE (IR DIE LELEVI : TUTT : .TT	•
ವಿಸ್ತರ ನಡ ನಿನಾಗಿ ಕಿನ್ನು ನೀಡು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಕ ಸಂಪ್ರತಿ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಸಂಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಕ ಸಂಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಕ ಸಂಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಕ ಸಂಪ	A.F
mand with a survey of the contract of the contract of	<b>;</b> ; ·
· The State of the	• •
From the $x = x^{-\alpha}$ And the $x_{\alpha} = x^{-\alpha}$	** **
that increase where parks that the constraint	<b></b>
Cur al Sush jos remuse s ma leva es el mol	**
to all a contrader of the pair of the court beden	es de Soli
That south the banks of the bloomer to blo surrout	.*
Marc M.	SF
ေ မေသာက ကြန်း ကြောက်တွင် ကြောက်သည်။ ကြောင်းသည် ကြောင်းသည် သည်သည်။	cr
ದಿ ನಾಕುದ ಮೇ ಇನಡರಲ್ಲಿ ಆಲಾರ್ ಇ ಭಾರತಿಗಳು ಅರ್ಥ ಅತ್ಯು ಅನ್ನ ಮೈ	
y a coincida in maio distante tende. Cojon ing	3.0

to an affirmative defense, or perhaps the defendant in responding to an affirmative -- a pleading by the plaintiff, if the pleading is filed at the last possible moment, then the respondent has no way to file a response to that -- to any specific changes, but through going before the Court.

Currently, you can respond to a new allegation, whether it be an affirmative defense, perhaps, by a plaintiff where the plaintiff responds, or a new cause of action or a change in the cause of action by the defendant.

And I would simply request that some mechanism be provided that doesn't require the party to go before the Court to file a response to a new pleading. Perhaps a period of three days from -- at that stage to respond, or something of that nature.

I may be not making myself clear.

Currently, if somebody files an amended petition or amended answer that raises something new -
JUSTICE HECHT: Eight days before trial --

MR. DAVIS: -- eight days before

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ed a company of the contract o egon to the regionaline to an efficientive -- to and perioded to be all the contract of the contract of of the state of the Lead of the control of the control company of the property of the area of the pagent. donoská dně vechono mělánosti mna od -- dede 1. The matery, you can throng to be need enging out the state of the section and the sections coffence, be in a fig a statistiff where the 0.5 weathfill a coon ay or a new canse of cartee or c disher to are cause of oction by the 5 1 . 1 \*\* 34316 : ٠, ٥ A F neihanim he providet thet cocunic coquire the 2.5 marty to co havere the faced to file a coupan -- F

The modest and the provided that consider that the consideration are provided that consideration the provided that consideration this marky to go become the fourth to file a congruent to a red plending. Perhasis a section a force days flow -- at that otenge to componer, or constitute of that nature.

ng turnentily, if not waking lynals closes of turnentily, if not ebody stones an accorded wattion or unender another that laises so tables now --

-- (6 to 4

7.1

**7** [

٠, ۲

which they have men a comment

1	trial
2	JUSTICE HECHT: then you are
3	concerned that they can't get a response in on
4	time?
5	MR. DAVIS: Right. And when you are
6	simply responding, not raising any other new
7	issues.
8	JUSTICE HECHT: All right. Any
9	other questions of Mr. Davis on this subject?
10	MR. DAVIS: Thank you, Justice.
11	JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments to 22
12	through 100? All right. We will move, then, to
13	Rules 103 through 165a. Any comments on Rules
14	103 to 165a?
15	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Mr. Hecht, aren't
16	you going to take the sealing of the court
17	records next?
18	JUSTICE HECHT: No, we're going to
19	save it for the last.
20	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Oh.
21	MR. BAILEY: How are you?
22	JUSTICE HECHT: Fine.
23	
24	

1.7 4.5 ha	
€ 3	
j'u	
J 3	ABOUTED LINGLES LINGS
3 Ï	LL' CALPLA: GOT AND BORS
J 0	andwidz dowatudz: do:
ï 🕽	process to the tent.
70	ಸುಗಿನಗೊಳಿದಿ ಗಿಡಿ <b>ರುಗೇ</b> ಬಿಳಿ* ಗಿರ್ಕಿಸರ ಗರ್ಕಸಳ ನರ
T.2	ပတ္လာလုပ္သည္။ အမွ <b>ားကုန္</b>
#1 1/ \ds	wen going to take the nathtier on the court
13	ulbalde adakular:
a V	162 to 155a2
: <i>:</i>	Suder 1.3 through 1975. And dericato on Russa.
ŢŞ	purpose for a compatible for a fill cover their
د ڏ	. Made du lingue (proper proper prope
·. 0	្សាស់ ១០៤ <b>ខ</b> ុ ស្សាស់ស និងស <sup>េ</sup> ព្រះស <sub>ុ</sub> ធស
<b>u</b>	to the energy section of the transfer of grid call pools
•	ARGANTA LEGALOS TOTANISTES DA
.3	ittau *
4	ကုန် ကြသည်။ မေးသည် အကြေးသည် သည် ကောင်းမျှသည် မေးသည် ကြည်သည် သည်။ ကျေးသည် ကျေးသည်။ ကျေးသည် ကျေးသည်။ ကျေးသည် ကျေ
d Sp	$223^*$ Figure $0$ , $0$
Ç	a meg
	$oldsymbol{arphi}_{n}$ and $oldsymbol{arphi}_{n}$ and $oldsymbol{arphi}_{n}$ and $oldsymbol{arphi}_{n}$ and $oldsymbol{arphi}_{n}$ and $oldsymbol{arphi}_{n}$
Ç	ol mich lacent amerika as
3	€ × ( A T ) <del></del>

## BILL BAILEY,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in

administrative session to consider proposed

changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas

Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of

Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. BAILEY: My name is Bill Bailey.

I'm from Harris County, Pasadena. I'm here
representing the Justices of the Peace and
Constables Association of Texas.

returning to language similar to the original Rule 103 prior to its being changed. "Who May Serve" the citation, leaving it to officers of the Court, the sheriffs and the constables, or other person authorized by law, changing that section to "upon a written motion to the Court showing good cause as to why." We will be addressing other changes a little later on in the proposed changes that would go hand in hand, but while we had Rule 103, we wanted to make our position known on that, as well.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Mr. Bailey, there is a growing industry of private process

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The same of the sa	.,
ក្រុមខេត្តស្រី ដែល បានស្រី ១០០ ក្រុមិក ស្រី ១០០ ដែល បានសម្រាប់ ប្រជាធិប្រជាធិប្រជាធិប្រជាធិប្រជាធិប្រជាធិប្រជា	<u>,                                    </u>
ကရာအတွင်သားကို ကြာလုပ် ကြာသော <b>စပါ ကျင</b> ်းအရာလေးက ကျောင်းသည်တွင် ကြုံသော	•:
and the commence of fiving to be unique of animate.	δ,
్డి (మ్మాన్ రడుకుండు త్రిపుడు ఇందుకు గణగు)మ ఉందికి ఓ ఉంది. కోత్త ఇంది ఈ	•
್ರಾಶಾಸ್ತ್ರ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಅವರು ಅಭಿವರ್ಣ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ	ę
	Ü
and Pion Bill to bill smade and a company of the Total department of the company	
oles for the complete of the second of the s	C
rengedo: fine blo Justileed es blo Posco and	0.7
Co. Pagalas 7 spaciation of "marer.	· ··
ાયકેંદ્ર ૧૧૧ જાણ ૧૧૧ કુટિક ૧૧૧ લાગ ૧૧૧ લાગ ભાગભાવ	5.7
retu miner to insermentation to the oraginal	7 5
"High 192 h for the its leins changes. "The Hey	3.6
rongot the dicetura, leaving it to eachidance	門馬
the dours, the discribing the bio correlator, or	D. C.
other germen such ordered by Jews changen, teles	7.7
section to "abon a satten notion to the George	C. Z.
aproving good cause or to way. * To will be	ÓΙ
နည်း ကာလ ညာသိသည့် စာလိုသည်။ ၁၂ ပရာကာတစ် <b>သာ သတ</b> င်သီတာ ကွက်သည်မသည် ၁၅	20
tan project disness that weeks (constitutions)	5.00
tub wifte me and Tuae 183, as wenter to wate our	SS
easition knows on thet, or red .	<b>^</b> (*
ರಾವರ ಕಳ್ಳಾಗಿಗಳು ಚರ್ಚ ಚರ್ಚಿಗಳು ಅರ್ಥಿಕರು	j. 194
modebly claying Book daying balware sof	#4 7% 2

1 | servers --

1.5

2.5

MR. BAILEY: Yes, sir.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: -- that are competing with the constables, obviously, for this business. Are there some problems with that other than competition?

MR. BAILEY: Well, that's a many-faceted question, Your Honor. Obviously and clearly, it is. We don't think that -- we -- we're -- we're for privatization whenever privatization serves the public good.

A peace officer and an officer of the Court serves process and has as his goal good service and not a profit. The counties receive the money, and goes to pay salaries and the cost of doing county government. It is not a profit center. We don't think it should be a profit center.

We have seen cases where a \$35 citation, because someone's -- and when we serve a citation it's 35 if we go by and catch him on the first attempt or it's the twentieth attempt. We have seen cases in private process where the cost has gone much higher. Who -- who bears that cost? Obviously, it's the defendant,

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

elet serth Obytorily, ltts the tolerant,

5.0

1 | which -- we don't think it's a good rule.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: The complaint was that many attorneys have difficulty in getting their civil process served by the constable.

Very little effort is made, and they had to resort to private process servers because the private process servers guarantee that it will be served.

MR. BAILEY: I have no problem with that, sir. And under -- and under written motion, that -- that was certainly available to where -- the cases where they couldn't get service from the officers of the court, yes, sir. I have no problem with that.

But wholesale, it is not the case that you can't get good service. My office served 91 percent of the process through October of this year. There is a profit motive there, and profits -- I'm not -- I'm -- I'm for the American way. I'm for profits, but not in government, and not with -- not with papers of the court.

Now, let's be honest. There's money in them there papers, and -- and a paper that's a \$35 paper -- you men are all lawyers, and I'm

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

.ం. గూ⊞ ఎల్లు ని లోఫీస్ నియోగియి. నిట్ చాకా చేతుం. ఏం	ĩ
ನರ್ಯ ಕಾರ್ಮಿಕೃಷ <b>ಂ</b> ದ ಆಗಳ ಕ್ರಾನಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿಗಳು ಪರಿಸರಿಗಳು	ç
ក្រសាស្ត្រ នេះ ប្រែក្រសាស្ត្រ ប្រសាស្ត្រ ស្ត្រសាស្ត្រសាស្ត្រ ស្ត្រសាស្ត្រសាស្ត្រសាស្ត្រសាស្ត្រសាស្ត្រសាស្ត្រសា	ε
cuois civil search resto by the desettle.	v,
ామా క్రమ్మి గ్రామ్మ కాటాలు ఇండుకుంటే అడి చెప్పున్ని అన్నానకి	7
ರಮ್ಶಿ ಧಟ್ಟಾಗಳಾದಿಗೆ ಇತ್ತಿಳುವರು ಏರಾಗಾಗ ಗ ಧಾಕ್ಷಾಕ್ಷಣ ಪ್ರತಿಕರ್ಗಳು	õ
e in the contract of provide a consert observing	m3
	,*
rein makeur en oven I : 'I mad .em	3
ស្គម្រីប៉ុន្ម ២ ខេស្ស <b>មិស្ទ ១</b> ១៥ស្ស ចិស្សិ (ស្វាប) «សាលប	e.t
ುರಲ್ಲಿಂದು ಕುರ್ನಾಕ ಗಟ್ಟಾಗ ಅಗ್ರ ಜನ್ನು ಸ್ಥಾರ್ ಎಂಟ್ರಿಂದ	
ಶ್ರ ೧೯೩೩ <b>ರಲ್ಲಿ ಅಂಬರ</b> ್ಕ ಗಳಿಗಳ ಕಾಗಿದ್ದ <b>ಅಂಬ</b> ಹಿಯಾಗಿದೆ. ಆ <b>ಕ</b>	ti f
corrido de the eddinome of t.e court, res.	7.5
our. F bowe no problem witte that.	', <u>r</u>
Sub violentie, it is not the case	7.1
tint you can't got good senvice. My affice	7
norved fit terest of the process through Odicher	7.7
estable wester these is a profit toots there,	"I
and gradite tim not tim tim dar the	3.5
a caucen saw. " a kor gredike, bus not	3.6
government, and not with and while juggern of	7.0
.ວານຄວາມປ່	22
wines toyedt .acand in atable .wor	^ <u>6</u>
್ತಿ ಕೆಪ್ಟಿಗ್ ವಿರಂಭ ಶ್ವಾರ್ಥ್ ಚಾರ್ ರಾಗಲ್ಲಿ ಭಾರತ್ನ ವಿಶೇಕ್ಷ್ಣ	* <b>(</b> *)
a CCS course you were and as anyour, and Th	<i>5.</i> •

just a little old country constable from the east end of Harris County in the poverty pocket over there. I'm not telling you anything you don't know. It's -- it's a matter of fairness and who do you trust.

JUSTICE DOGGETT: You said you had,

I gather, comments on some other rules, but do

they all center on this problem of private

process servers?

MR. BAILEY: Well, it's not -- I don't want to just say it's private process servers. That is a big part of it, yes, sir, but we -- first of all, Justice Doggett, in practice, how many people that are getting this private process -- or let's just say -- and we're going to speak to 536, in the justice courts where the rules will be relaxed where anybody can serve without motion. How many of those are actually going to be unbiased and not -- not have some interest in it? That's open to speculation.

We know that an officer of the Court, a sworn officer of the law, is -- is going to be trustworthy. His sworn oath -- he has got a constitutional oath he's taken, and we

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

မရုံးစေ အလည်း မာတိုင်းခံရာက လေးမှု ပေါ့သားအစား ကို ကြောင့် သည်သို့ သည် ချာမများ	Ť
eart and of Tardia County in the Boverty Bearet	
over drome. I'm now well'ing you amybhing you	? ?
Contw Enor. Itte itte e monter of Cakenood	Δ
-បិធម <sup>្រុស</sup> ប្រក ស ១៩២ នេះសា	<i>•</i>
TESH St tuppers : For heir yes haw,	:
ಾರ್ಯ ತಿಖ್ಯ ಸಂದರ್ಭ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ರಿಯ ಅಂದು ಮತ್ತು ನಡೆಗಲಾಗುವುದು ಕನ್ನಡಚಿತ್ರುವುದು	7
they of I contex of this term of grivate	Ĉ.
<b>ទ</b> ីពេសស្សាត្រ។ សម្រេសន	^*
ಸ್ <del>– ಕರ್ಣದಿಕ್ಕೆ ನಿಕ್ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕ್ರಾಕ್ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕರ್</del> ಕಿ	l, i
repriser to jant eary it's protective under	五五
ಆಗುಳ ಇರು. ್ಲಿಗಳ ನೆಗ ಆ ಸಿನೀಕ ಇಂದರ ಅನೆ ತಿಕ್ಕು ಗ್ರಾಣ ಕನ್ನಡ	( • F
buy we list to of alt, Tundice Deggett, in	3. S
processes, for any paopin that are getting this	<b>₹</b>
ುಗಡ —— ಇದರ ಹಲಕ್ಕೆ ಬಿಕಿಕಲ್ ಇದ —— ೨೯೧೮ರಲ್ಲಿ ನಿನ್ನಳಸಿದ್ದ	2.1
we'to go an to speak to 98%, in the juntion	Şr
ರಾಷ, to ಗಾರಾಜರ ಜಿಸಿಕ ಗಟ್ಟಿಕಾ ಚಿತ್ರಿಸಿ ೨೦ ಜಕ್ಷಣಜರು ಆಕ್ರಿಸ್ಟ	<b>**</b> **
orghody can norwe without notion. The name of	•
មុន ស៊ុខ ប្រជុំជំនួន ១០ <b>១៦ ខេត្ត ឬរំ</b> រឹក្សេងស្គ ១០១ ១៩១៨៩	k' (*
not not have so entered the top machi-	to
open to rocentrates.	ī.
ic irrow that on affideer of the	១ន
ವಿಶ್ವಕ್ಕೆ ೧ ರಚಲವಾಗಿ ೧೭೫೩ರಲ್ಲಿ ಚಿರ್ಣಿಸಿದರು, ಕೊಂದ್ರ ಕೊಂದ್ರ	e 13
ಗಾರ್ವಿ ೮೧ ಇಂ ಕುಳಾಬರುಗಳಿಸಿದ್ದ. ಶ್ವಿಚ ಒಳಕಾಗಿ ತನ್ನ <b>ಿಗಿ ಒ</b>	2.5
ការ ទាស់ខា ខ្ពស់ងាស់គ្នា លេវត្ស នាគាល់ និងសេខដឹងស្ដេវិធីសក្សា ស ជាសក្ដា សភាព	3.5

feel that the public is certainly better served

by having these kind of people handle their

papers. It's worked in the past.

And, Justice Gonzalez, I'll admit there's been problems, and we're addressing those problems now. Through this Court we have received — through the Justice of the Peace and Constables Association, the Justice Court Training Center, we're — we're — we're training great numbers of constables and deputies all across Texas for the first time. And, you know, we've been to the moon and back and we've never had a school for newly elected constables until this year, under a grant from the Governor's office. We had a — a 40—hour school for newly elected constables.

We're making great strides, and it's being done through education, but it's being done through officers of the Court, and it's not being done with a profit motive in mind.

Certainly, Texas has seen enough profit motives in the dispensing of justice, and I'll just stop my comments there.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions?

MR. BAILEY: Thank you very much,

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

form that the matter we will be included and the matter of the control of the con	Ţ
or L wine there lived of people harite thour	5
apeas. The parked in the part.	•
7:3, Justice Genzeles, I'll ocuit	•,
ျပည္သြင္း သို႔ရက္ သူအတုိင္ေတြက ျပင္းသည္။ အေလးျပည္သည့္	<b>?</b> '.
Lower problems new. Threat tehin densit we care	3
අත වර්ගත වැඩිම සහ කත්මෙන්වර කිසිම් ක්කුස්ත නියම් 🗝 වල්ගි කතරයි.	* 1
The stable of Abusedation, two Justice Court	^
ರಜ್ಯ, ಈ ಅಥಕ್ಷಣ ಈ ಅಥಕ್ಷಣ ಭಾರತಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಇದ್ದಿಗಳು ಇ	•
e chain great ammistra of a minabled car	υï
್ಯಾಟಕ್ಕೆ ಅವರ ಬಿಟ್ಟ ಅಥವಾಗು ಚಿಲಾಕವಾಹ ಕೊಂಡು ಹೆಬ್ಬರ ಅವರ ಕಟ್ಟಲ	1.1
tal, you know, wive aboute the lite and bedu	C.T.
and we've alber a school fee newly cless of	13
convectues until this year, under a grant from	11
the foweracris affice. We had a a 40-eers	8.5
achon! For nawly elected constables.	2.5
្នាស់ ខេត្ត (ខេត្ត ពេល ដែលជា great នេះ ខេត្ត ខេត្ត នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ ខេត្ត នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ ន	ĹΪ
being done through olumption, but it's being	2.5
dore through officers of the double, and is not	.1
being done with a profit motive in mind.	û.c
Cortainly, Texas has seen enough profile motives	16
In the Clarenting of gastise, and Ital ster	23
.nt alia alianta di consenta d	€ 1
The left to the gale of the theory of the succession of	\$ 0
AND HANDER OF THE STATE OF THE	7"

sir.

JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, sir.

165a?

Yes, sir.

# GASTON BROYLES,

Other comments to Rules 103 through

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. BROYLES: My name is Gaston
Broyles from Corpus Christi, and I am here
representing myself; and I am also a member of
Mr. Davis's ad hoc committee from the Texas
Association of Defense Counsel, and consequently
my comments are contained in the letter that Mr.
Davis delivered to the clerk this morning.

We are concerned with that provision of Rule 120a contained in paragraph two of part three wherein it appears that the opposing party to a 120a motion is going to be allowed a second

opportunity, if he did not make it the first

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

• 2.13	
∙ងក្នុង ខ្លួនទៅ នៅក្រុង : "MOST" បាស្បា ការ្យូ	۶
ಾಶಕ್ಕಾತ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ ಇತ್ತಾಗಿದ್ದ ಅವೆ ನಡೆಗಾಗಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಅಗುತ್ತದೆ.	r
15"47	, " ;
Yes, sit.	а
	ō
And the state of t	۲.
ik comed to draw the energy of edd colors (%) region	
(age) is protected to stipp to enactional process.	^
changed du Medac Bukad of nivît v onadaret nada	0.7
Ru on of tripol ree troperiuse, or I that the or of	4 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Tryfl Tvidence, ntate: . u follows:	2.1
	z r
mm, noomend: Tv name is Gaston	<i>.</i>
regien from Colour Chideti, and Tom here	à t
epussenting dredf; and " a chro a merier of	35 E
normal wide and Long word drame the the Terror	
Lascoletion of Pofense Caundol, and consequently	o r
$_{\rm MS}$ dordinks and dontwinds the idetter thick $^{\rm mag}$	
Tyvin Jodiver d to the glerk this morning.	0::
We are gencerated with theb growing.	1.8
of Raie 180a contained in paragreph two of work	7.5
tiree dierein it angeamn that a encocing that	2.5
ic 179a cotion in going he be attured a sicent	2.0
Julia one di onem son with on at avern the co	7 ^

time, whereas the moving party is not. This is an opportunity to go back and try again, in addition to the current rules that allow for discretion on the part of the trial court to grant continuances prior to a hearing.

2.5

The way the proposed rule currently reads, it appears that if an opposing party is not able to adequately oppose the motion through the affidavits the first go-round, or during the hearing, that the Court may order a continuance to allow him to try again. And such an opportunity is not afforded to the movant, and we did not think that was particularly appropriate.

JUSTICE HECHT: Specifically, what language are you referring to, Mr. Broyles?

MR. BROYLES: The language which reads as follows in Rule 120a, part three, paragraph two: "Should it appear from the affidavits of a party opposing the motion that he cannot for reasons stated present by affidavit facts essential to justify his opposition, the Court may order a continuance to permit affidavits to be obtained or depositions to be taken or discovery to be had or may make

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
is as a light of the matter of the second of
                                                                                                                                                                  Ţ.
            ામ અનુ લગાવા દેષ્ણ છે. લુક ગરહી દેશને ઉત્તર લાભ
           accepted to the outlant rules about allow for
          First continue the gard of the court court in
                             The meditionaced that the Locality of the
     the det ble rosquare rate eurreab.
      garda, te asserva that if an opporing porty or
                                                                                                                                                                      7
                        not able to clovetely on one the iction
         the such three admit and a bac three to the one of
     ាស្រ្តី ប្រាស់ ស្ត្រី ប្រាស់ ស្រ្តី ស្រែង ស្រេង ស
                                                                                                                                                   0.5
 inga inga salaga and ol win gra. Tod one grigare
                                                                                                                                                                 10.00
        a optorist of ant abborder to the rovens,
                                                                                                                                                                    6.5
                2.3 . The role of the bound was particularly.
                                                                                                          •ာင်းခ်ေး ရက္နေရ မော
                                                                                                                                                                     - 3 J
      TOUR CO THOMS: Thoughtoning, unit
                                                                                                                                                                      ; <u>J</u>
             ្ទិសភាពខាង " «១៥ «១៨ ក្សារំដែល១៥៩៦ សូមហ្គួលភាគ ខ្លួនមុខ្លួន
                                                                                                                                                                     nn. mortan: The language radeb
                                                                                                                                                                      7.
                  reces to for two in by o 139m, here abreco
                                                                                                                                                                    /\ r
                  coragraph two: "Sabally to at one fire the
                                                                                                                                                                      ^ P
      affidavite of a carty occurs the cotton thou
                                                                                                                                                                    C 6
                        ic cannot ser recount etched second by
                                                                                                                                                                    18
                       aktiderit Cocte oscential to justify bio
                                                                                                                                                                    50
e confescion, the Court 122 recent conthaunce to
                                                                                                                                                                    23
```

randificances to i situate of od od.var \$20 dt .get

to in taken or director; to be before at any

**→** 7 (\*)

ه بر

such other order as is just." 1 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: 2 Broyles, that language tracts Rule 166a (f) 3 almost to a tee. Have you had any problems on summary judgments with a movant -- I mean, any 5 time a movant decides they are not ready on a 6 summary judgment, you can file a second motion 7 for summary judgment. Is there anything in the rule that prevents a second attempt of a special 9 10 appearance? 11 MR. BROYLES: Not a second attempt, 12 necessarily --13 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: I mean, the 14 movant controls when they are ready to -- to go 15 forward --16 MR. BROYLES: Correct. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- with a 17 18 special appearance or a summary judgment, and --19 20 MR. BROYLES: The movant gets to set 21 the hearing, yes. 22 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: And the 23 respondent is on a short -- has to respond to 24 that on a shorter time frame. And secondly, is 25 there anything that prohibits the movant, if

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

មិនជាពី ខ្លាំ និង ១៦២០ ស្គ្រាមិន សិស្សា	۲.
.४) : क्षण्यास्य १ ८ १७ स्वामस्य १७ १७	e,
Trey no. to tempuago touche hule lais C	ç
್ಲಾ 'ಲಾಗ್ ಜೈಕರ್ ಜಮ್ ಕಾಲ್ಫ್ ಲಾಲಾನ್ . ಎಂಡುಗೆ 11 ಅಂದೇ ದಿಇವರಲ್ಲಿ	٢.
acumany ក្នុំ ក្នុងនៅ នៅ ន	<b>;</b> .
time a newton weather they are ask rengal	• *
enmany field ert, reu cen ii u a nouchd e	7
រាងស្រីស្ពីពេទ្ធ ស្រីស្រី នេះ នេះ ប្រាសាធិត្ត និងសេស នេះ	: *
្ត្រី ស្រុក ដោយស្រីដូវ៉ា ស្រុសស្រាស់ ស្រុសស្រាស់ ស្រុសស្រាស់ ស្រុសស្រាស់ ស្រុសស្រាស់ ស្រុសស្រាស់ ស្រុសស្រាស់ ស	<b>~</b>
\$4.500 at 100 at	• •
uk limacak a dolla shiromona .sm	<i>7 1</i> .
100 tanks ( <b>100 f</b>	* *
em ក : :១៩៦៩១២២ មហាសាកា ស ្រ	٠,
covers; controls then bloy are esty to be	* <u>*</u>
eren og skriver i det eren eren eren eren eren eren eren er	7.1
•इंक्पूल्य के कुलस्थलाल्य • १००	** **
ा −− । कुंचे प्रशास्त्र एका समाप्तक स्थानस्क	Ţŗ
a notal e pacetrue or a inama, y jungacat.	5 t
5n3	ρſ
ಲಾಕ್ರೂ ಮಾಡಲಾಗು ರಚ್ಚಿ : ್ರಾರಾಗ್ . ್ರಾ	e (
the Learing, yes.	1.5
និងទី : "បានផ្សាយ។ សហភាពធាល់ មាល់ បាន	٠. ٠
နေရ ၁၁% ထားသည်။ <del>မက</del> ဘီအားက စေး အေသည် <b>ဘီကက်ပို့အကရွ</b> သည်။	0.5
(ind. ಅಡ ನ ರಕ್ಕಾರ್ಯ ಅನ್ನು ಹೆಚ್ಚು ನಿರ್ಮ ನಿರ್ಮ	45
and the state of the manifest day of the state of the sta	4.3

materially different evidence appears, from 1 2 making a second motion, just as there are second motions for summary judgment if a movant fails 3 the first time but -- but acquires new information? 5 MR. BROYLES: On juris --6 7 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Yes. MR. BROYES: No. Your Honor. 8 9 JUSTICE HECHT: Your problem is that 10 the hearing might get underway and look bad for 11 a party and then they want to regroup 12 midhearing? 13 MR. BROYLES: Precisely. That --14 that's --15 JUSTICE HECHT: You see the -- one 16 of the other concerns of the change is that a 17 hearing would be set on affidavit, and another responding party would say, "Wait a minute. 18 19 These affidavits aren't going to do it. We've 20 got to take this fellow's deposition and show 21 that he's not telling the truth in these 22 affidavits." You don't have any problem with 23 that? 24 MR. BROYLES: No, Your Honor. 25 that -- in fact, a continuance before a hearing

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

*!* 

```
and the second to the second of the second o
Strain and consider the great great and the control of the
    ార్ట్ మెడ్కారుండ్ క్షోట్ బ్యాంక్ ప్రాట్లో కార్డ్ క్షామ్స్ క్ష్మ్ క్ష్మ్ క్ష్మ్ క్ష్మ్ క్ష్మ్ క్ష్మ్ క్ష్మ్ క్ష్మ్
                              the first blac but -- tur combinering
                                                                                                             informatic ?
                               T. 100 TRS: On justs --
                      ·ack :arregoor company apres
                                                                                                                                                                             ζ.
                       it. Cooyets Hos Your Bones.
west at the cold are west and the transfer
                                                                                                                                                                             4
 the coeffice of the get union by an least to for
                                                                                                                                                                           ا 🌣 ا
                                 a sette ein then blief went to regreup
                                                                                                                                                                          ۲...
                                                                                                                 ្សាស់ នៃ១០៩២៩៣ ខ
        T. 3. Vinn: Precisely. That --
                                                                                                                       -- ຄໍສິລຄໍ,
                                                                                                                                                                            3.5
      CHEERTS! CHOTTE: Tot Boo the -- enc
                                                                                                                                                                           - 3° E
       ດ ປີພິບ ດະນິດກ່ຽວກາດພະການ ປະຕິ ພັດຄະດູດ ຳຄົ້ນວະ ພົ
                                                                                                                                                                           7 J
      coarded would be set on affil avit, and amether
                                                                                                                                                                          13 F
              rosjon ing jarty routh say, "this a minute.
                                                                                                                                                                            7.5
      Those afficavita aren't soing to do it. "o've
       got at the till featowis capabition one case
                                                                                                                                                                          that hais act to hilling the truth in those
                                                                                                                                                                           T.
        callering was even denia even ary problem of the
                                                                                                                                                                           3.5
                                                                                                                                   62023
                                                                                                                                                                            Cc
    un. reorrus: To, vove voces. Pass
                                                                                                                                                                            66
   thick on in fact, a continuance positro a scaping
                                                                                                                                                                           73 E
```

could be granted. And I think that this addresses Justice Phillips' problem, too.

Or my problem there is that I don't necessarily want the opposing party to be able to go to a hearing, all -- get all the way up there without having moved for a continuance.

If they are not ready, they can move to continue the hearing, either move to continue the hearing on a summary judgment or move to continue a hearing on the 120a motion. But my problem is getting there, seeing what the truth is, deciding at that point that they are not ready, and then going out and trying again.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, I don't see anything in 120a that limits it to the time of the hearing; nor is there anything that obliges the trial judge to grant such a request.

MR. BROYLES: He is not obliged to grant such a request; that's correct. It just allows for the continuance at the time.

JUSTICE HECHT: Other questions of Mr. Broyles?

Thank you very much.

MR. BROYLES: Thank you.

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

```
serieses Justinia Phylicial Color to Dauge access the
Or my problem thor in that "don'r
 observablily went the son of the saidy to be able
  ాకు భాగు చేసిన కొన్నవర్గాల విష్యాత్రికి అన్నా ఉంది. అంది
  .common titant care Dove. gairan duritin car.
of busy sic not recay, bloy ear hove be contiined:
inc action sold sold sold sold and sold and sold of a
                                                     *,
    ្នុសព្រីសម្រេច ១ភ្នំ ១០០០ ក្នុង ២០០០ ស្ត្រី ស្គ្រាស្រុស ស្នេក ប្រ
 Learning on the 190s petion. By my tobles is
                                                     0.7
       gg cetting there, sector shot the frute way
Goodding as thet cant that they are not much,
                                                     C. L
           then oing out and trying again.
     CITES JUSTICE PHREEPER: Toll,
                                                     V.
   won't see ampthing in 1200 than limit it to
                                                     21
 the time of the hearing; nor is there anything
                                                     ا ئ
  that oldings, the frist james of the stable
                                                     7. 1
                                                      ŗ
                                      request.
 ".. ERCYES": "e i: not obliged co
                                                      1
 gar at such a request; that's correct. the deat
                                                     35
        all oug for the continuence of 2.2 act.
                                                     33.
 fo manifully and the fall of the grown
                                                     P 44
                                                     - C
                                Shothory . The
              Thenk you yet, adda.
                                                     . . .
```

TV. TOTOTO: Cuenk you.

13 0

JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments on

1 103 through 165a? All right. We will take up,

next, Rules 166 through 166a, those two rules;

166 and 166a.

## BILL WADE,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

1.5

MR. WADE: May it please the Court, I'm Bill Wade, again, who earlier talked about the venue. I am here representing the Texas Association of Defense Counsel, and also myself as a trial practitioner.

It -- it would appear to us, and to me personally, that if the Court is working and laboring to reduce the cost of litigation and to streamline litigation, that to put on the trial bench and the trial bar the requirement of a free trial order, much like we have in federal court, seems to be counterproductive.

I think the trial judges now have

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

ត្ស «១៣០ន»០២ ១១៩៤៣ : 10000 ប្រុប្បញ្ជា	
documentation of the property	6.3
nouts the on I'm of outsh I'm, the ere walters	8
. 40° 5	<i>ĵ.</i>
	•-
	::
អ <sup>ែក</sup> ព្រះប្រឹក្សា និងសុខការ មុខ១៦ <b>វាជិ ១៩</b> ៩៧ ១២ <b>១១០ ភូព</b> េ ១ ១១	ŗ
and into the time nearton to enable ourosened	*
changer to freque Pales of Civil Dandeet en. Calven	Q
talon of Alpellate Drodedane, and Teran Pales of	ſŗ
Clyss Tyidence, stated en sa kowe:	5.8
	£ f.
TR. What Tay it please the Court,	#• # • • • •
of a fill care, again, who earsion tailer along	Ar
tio verne. I an jede hishenidan blo thats	६ ह
And color on es Dosent Councel, and also eguess	I
ar a triol grantitioner.	7.
no it , u a appear to mr, and to	1 5
ce personsily, that if the foari is verting on	^ (
teboting to reduce the cost of timigation one	0 p
to otreamiine sinigotion, el o de joi on tea	Tr
urie, banch has the trains the requirement to	13.7
o free this border, much tike we have in fowers.	Ec
getht, incas te ha dounter was nother.	• /2
nval von hegent Indes sets detail I	77.5

the ample authority that they need to, in appropriate cases, request and get a pre-trial order put together which would take care and encompass most of the things mentioned here in the proposed rule without the necessity of it being codified as it is here.

If I -- and I may -- there are certainly other people here better qualified to speak on this, and -- but if I read the language in the first sentence, it says, "In any action, the Court may in its discretion, or on request of any party."

It would appear to me that by including that, then a party can force a pre-trial order in a case which the case may not merit it, and I think this cuts on both sides of the docket, that the cost of litigation would increase terrifically in the state court if we were required to have pre-trial orders and go through the pre-trial procedure that's set out here.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: You -- you don't have any problem with -- right now our rule indicates some things that can be done in a pre-trial order, and it's obviously incomplete;

#### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

ಕ್ಟ್ ಕರತ ತನ್ನಡಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಗಳು	
ಕೃತ್ಯದ ಜನೆಡಾರ ದಡು ಇ. ಜ್ಯಾಅರಾಗಿ ನಡಗಿ çet ರ ೧೯೮-೬೫ನಿವರಿ	¢.
graigh ant complice which wor a take date and	
encomplete rock with the tolings cornioned base in	Ŋ
the prepare out was saut the notens by ed it	<b>6</b> ~
.o.od તેને 2ે લગ કેલ્લીટેલ છે.	

TE T PACE T AND TOTAL	7
der zaming odher door bere beidan erstilling t	,
nyeark an throw one and is I rest the Jacque, a	•
in the direct sentence, it sope, an and action,	4.
site thank to by in the discoveration, as no regression	<u>, F</u>
************************************	44 - 4

The would suggest to me that by  $\mathbb{Z}[\Gamma]$ including that, then a gosty can force a S ... conception of der in a case which the case of asi ") ! nerth it, and a third this cure on soth surer eff 11 end inchet, which the capt of ittigation router ĭ ſ. independ to sinically in the orete dougle 2 we rery to using to have ame-tains orders and go-3 L through the gratte al grocedure that's not out 00 .9: 36 ئ ۽

on the five and problem of the sent of a section of the sent of th

that is, stipulations. So your problem isn't 1 2 really fleshing out more what a pre-trial order could contain. It's ambi -- it doesn't even 3 appear to be ambiguous, does it? It's the 5 language in the first sentence that --That -- that really MR. WADE: 7 bothers me, and that could be, I think, abused 8 by either side of the docket. And we obviously know that there's 9 10 some cases in the district court -- and I handle quite a few of them -- that can't bear the 11 12 expense of this sort of time and effort spent on 13 both sides of -- of the case. 14 JUSTICE HECHT: You do not want one 15 party to be able to force another party to 16 prepare a pre-trial order --MR. WADE: That's correct, Your 17 18 I would prefer to leave that to the 19 discretion of the Court in an appropriate case 20 where that can aid in the disposition of the --21 of the matter. 22 JUSTICE HECHT: All right. Thank 23 you. 24 MR. WADE: Thank you. 25 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Thank you.

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
Mara continuo agray of the art of the gain day of
 retail them and the love that a rechilation for
   could contain. The cold -- it doesn't even
     age a to be a his course ince at a second
          . chrquaes in the litust seateness that --
                                                             73
     military dead -- tand :draw . . .
  oction is, and they contained thank, alumb
                    ty of her thin of the codes.
 and a partion by know that there's
Gove dones in the circuitat court -- as " hard o
      on the distribution of the condition of the state of
្រុក ដូចទៅស្រី ជាមុនកំណុង កំណាន់ សុស្សិធិ ណាក់ ការក្រុក កំណង់ ពិក ស្នាពេក សេ
                    .arto odd lo -- l. in. dit.
                                                             3.5
                                                             N 5
June to many the ten do not want one
     buty to enable to force areales marty to
                                                            - Ei
                                                             ~ <u>r</u>
                      prepare a statemial order --
     Th. Dink: Phat's street, Your
                                                             7.1
     loaner. I would roller to leave that to die
                                                             0.5
                                                             . Ç. F
 dinectifies of the Court in an appropriate each
                                                             6.5
 These that can big it the the fishesillen of the --
                                     .rodin. :id ha
                                                             . . ·
   ausan .danka fil : encer normana
                                                             2.3
                                                             23
                                                . 307
                " ". IADU: Thank you.
                                                             *, **
     ្នាស់ក្នុងពេក្យការ ស្ត្រាក់ក្នុងស្ត្រាក់ក្នុងស្ត្រាក់
                                                              .. 6
```

JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments on

location 166 and 166a? All right. Then we'll move to

the discovery rules, 166b through 215; 166b

through 215.

## DIANE SHAW,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MS. SHAW: My name is Diane Shaw.

I'm from Dallas, Texas. I'm here as a trial

attorney and a representative of the Texas

Association of Defense Counsel.

We had two comments on 166b, and the initial one, starting with Section 4,
"Presentation of Objections," only one statement with regard to the seven-day requirement of the affidavits.

We believe this may work as a situation representing some traps for the parties, because many times, as you know, it's difficult enough to get everything in order --

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

to the rice weight of the poster of

totick time and reduce. The rect was total total total transfer and the same of the same o

"TO FORES

# 

constitution of two the former and admit of two factors white and two constitutions of two constitutions and two constitutions and the constitution of the constitutio

9.5

: . . .

r r

ი "

Tr. Cutts: Ty as a de Ciene Suew.

Is the formation of the bear as a tribler as a tribel

35 Canodichia od historic Connoc.

r (nil)ini independent til w. t., Bodblon in

grown the sentation of higherth of the original one will be come

್ಯಾಯ ಬರು ಮಾರುವಾಗುತ್ತಿದ್ದಾರು. ಆಗು ೯೦೩ ರಾಗಕ್ಕೆ ೨೨ ವಿಸ್ತರ್ಣದ ವಿಶೇಷಣೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗೆ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆಗೆಗೆ ಪ್ರತಿಕೆಗಳಿಸಿಕೆಗೆ ಪ್ರತಿಕೆಗಳಿಗೆ ಪಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿಕೆಗೆಗೆಗೆಗೆ ಪ್ರತಿಕೆಗೆಗೆ ಪ್ರತಿಕೆಗೆಗೆಗೆ ಪಿಸ

.affesbfile ff

To bolineve than any work an a

o e it not more the congruence for college the con-

្រៅថាស ស្គាល់អណ្តាល់ បានស្ថិត្ត ស្ថាល់សុខ ស្គ្រាស់ ១០១១១៤៨ ភ្លាស់ ដោយស្គ

emminante de la completación de

your evidence, affidavits, and so forth -- prior 1 2 to the hearing. But more importantly, the attorneys, as a practical matter, are working 3 4 out negotiations during this seven-day period to see what they can come to an agreement on: "Do 5 we really need this hearing?" "Well, perhaps if 6 I can get you this, then we don't need to 7 8 proceed on the hearing," or, "I'll give you two of these, so we only need to go on one matter 9 10 toward the hearing." There's --CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: 11 12 specific part of the rule are you referring to? 13 MS. SHAW: 166b (4), "Presentation 14 of Objections" --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Okay. Thank you.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. SHAW: -- where it has a seven-day requirement for the affidavits. Many times the attorneys are working on the negotiations during this seven-day period, and if they are working on the negotiations during this period, they are not considering the affidavit, hoping that we may not even need the hearing. Then two days before the hearing, things may fall through; you don't have your

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

```
contract to the state of the st
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                one of the manufacture of the contract of the 
The statement of the control of the 
   with colonoly we recove at a pail to be at the fact and
       <u>;:</u>:
   di de dise : (1601 " "Comissos bidd - 152 m (611) os
                                                                      ្នាល់ ចំគ្នា នាក្រស់ ១០ ១១៨៨ 🕡 🖒 ១០១ ១៩៦ ១៣១ 🦠
                       neces on the late ", at ", it is no a recor
                             na altera, so wa on y neos to o the end rateour
                                                                                                                                                                         -- rio out ".; alless old sycura
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       0.1
                                                                            র মারে । : সংগ্রম সাম প্রস্তুর্থন কর পর্
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  5.
              Section to the term of the distribution of the contract the contract the contract the contract that the contract the contr
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              71 F
                  ng. max: 1951 (6), "Arosontation
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 3.5
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    -- "nnwisoshow is
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 15 P
                                                                     Andrew Comment of the contract of the contract of the contract of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   ·* •
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      . uny sanding
                                                                            on the form of the -- inertains . The
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               ۳. "
             gasentally adjusted the relationships a value sever
                                                                                                          the force of the are are not the area of
                     nocetistisms turns to a coven-cay period, and
                 off they are notified or the coldinations in any
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   1
                                                                     tyl samme y lleg mak mot deamidering bloc
             efficiently bo and tast will say not over need the
                                                 and the sold of the color of the state of the color of th
                                     Common restriction for the comment of the gradient of
```

affidavit. And it seems to work as somewhat of a trap.

Alternatively, it may well chill the effect of the negotiations prior to the hearing because of the need for the affidavit or the evidence to be submitted in that seven-day period prior to the hearing. And that's all I have to say about that particular rule.

JUSTICE HECHT: And then you have a comment on 7, Section 7?

MS. SHAW: That's right, 166b,

Section 7. We would propose that the

certificate of conference, instead of it being

worded "all discovery motions," if we could

interject "all requests for hearings on

discovery motions." It seems that the effect of

having the certificate of conference on all

discovery motions when it pertains to protective

orders actually minimizes the 30 days that one

has to respond to interrogatories, requests for

production, and the like.

Many times, as a practical matter, you're -- you're getting your objections and answers in on the thirtieth day for the interrogatories, and you file the motion for

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

ĺ

```
the three control of the three control of the three th
                                                                                                                                                                                                   the unitarial contract displaying the traction
     ាននិយាសនាត្រាស់ នៅ ស្នាន់ ១១១០ និងការព័ត្តនៅពីសង្គម នៅ ១០១១១៩ នៃការប្រទេវិទី២០១០១០១៩ ស
                ాశంతో ఎం. దో∨ాన్నిస్తుంది. దేదకుండి ఉందు. ఉందు ఉంది. దేశం ఉందు జేకక్
                      The state of the first of the state of the s
                                        Consider the state of the state of the state of
            NAME OF A LOCAL COMPANY OF STATE
                                                                                                           TO MODERATE AT MEN THE COME
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               i t
                          oget til gillett til til gillet
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            7.7
                                                     Teading T. To the Commission of the
         graph of its lost the contract contract of the item of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             ~ ··
                            Tuck on Bi "kapain of a mealth Institution of any
                                        etariant "so" requests to riencings on
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             គ្នារ
   ្ស ជាក្រុះប្រឹក្សាស្ត្រី ជាក្រុម ក្រុមខ្លួន ប្រឹក្សាស្ត្រី និងស្ត្រីស្ត្រី ស្ត្រីបានសុខភាពស៊ី
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             brying the cartificate of conference on all
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             71
Tirenvery metions when it restains to pro calive
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             .
     orded tody by. - 22 odd upstately of toyen passivo
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             r r
      ినడి ఎన్ సాఖ్యడి ఇంగుప్పూడి (జాతతాగారాడు). దర్ స్టాత్రాగు, ఉన్నారాడు
                                                                                                            . All odd ins incidencer :
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            ľ
         Camp throng on a rendulter calter.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               puntes -- graine jettine yen) objection en-
                                       raduler in on the bitthictive of the
                 Chbestagaberties, are growth of the competagate
```

protective order along with the objections, as 1 is now required. Therefore, if you have to have 2 a certificate of conference, conferring prior to 3 that time, it does minimize what has always been 5 the 30-day requirement. And, really, the purpose of this is 6 to make sure that the attorneys have tried to 7 work things out before they waste the Court's time at a hearing, or the attorneys' time. 9 10 So if that language could be interjected that the certificate of conference 11 only be necessitated in the instance where a 12 13 hearing is requested, that would solve that 14 problem. 15 JUSTICE HECHT: Questions of Ms. 16 Shaw? 17 JUSTICE RAY: Have you submitted the 18 proposed language that you would like for us to 19 use? 20 MS. SHAW: Yes. Yes, we have. 21 Thank you. 22 JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments on the discovery rules, 166b to 215? 23 24

25

STED OF GOOD FOREST CONNECTIONS FOR

4.5

3 🤨

1.5

# GASTON BROYLES,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. BROYLES: Gaston Broyles again, from Corpus Christi. I'm a trial attorney and I'm a representative of the Texas Association of Defense Counsel.

We have a problem with the proposed changes to Rule 169, "Request for Admission," specifically that portion of the change that allows for the service of a request for admissions on a defendant before that defendant has had an opportunity to hire an attorney.

It appears that this change may very well result in a trap for an unwary, unsophisticated defendant who does not understand the importance of a request for admissions if those requests accompany the petition and citation.

It appears that it would be possible for a plaintiff's attorney to include requests for admissions that essentially prove up damages

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7	
$H^{(1)}$ for the $\Omega$ is the $\Omega$ and $\Omega$ and $\Omega$ and $\Omega$ and $\Omega$ and $\Omega$	
ກ ໄດ້ເປັນຕ້ອຍປະເພດ ກາ <b>ຕອ</b> ່ງ ທ <mark>າດອີ ທີ່ ຕົດ ອີດ</mark> ສຸດໄດ້ພຸດ ຫຼາຍເຫຼືອຍ	.•
allen e. to leren meller of the little of section of	5
thile of the classes were considered this prince of	ר
divis nvicendo, clated en liblett:	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
and were configurated and the statement and	<b>*</b>
the forms of inti- Til a trick attorney car	r.
The accommentative of the Sener Isrociation of	
• `00 mate 7 _0 to 2.60 to	5.
್ರಾಣದಾರ್ಥ ಅಗುತ್ತೆ ಚಿತ್ರೀರ ಒಂಪಿಸಿರಿಂಗಳ ಇಂದಿಗಾಗಿ ಅಗ್	
dher es ta Drie 140, "Termast iba list an rado"	/* ·
assectifically that portion of the carne tiat	1.00 6.00
n'lave for ervice of a loquest for	Α.
aduirsions on a dedendrat before back coffenates	
ben het an openstreptty to him oft thege.	•.
Tt spycans thet this chance may vorm	۲.
well secult in a trap for an uncomp.	1.
marophischicated defeniont who see not	<u>^</u>
understand the importancy of a request for	<b>.</b>
eduincions if these requests accompany the	<i>r.</i> (
_atition and ditation.	; · · ·

of corrections that the country to include requestry of the control of the contro

enough that in the event of a default he would be able to prove up liability and damages without anything further than admissions that went unresponded to when they arrived along with the petition. The same opportunity is not afforded the defendant, as plaintiff necessarily goes first.

I do not see that there are any benefits to this change. We would much prefer to have requests for admissions sent to a party after that party has had an opportunity to employ the services of an attorney who understands the significance of requests for admissions and what may occur if those admissions are not responded to adequately or in a timely fashion.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: What specific language are you referring to?

MR. BROYLES: The language at the very beginning that states: "At any time after commencement of the action, a party may serve upon any other party a written request for the admission," as opposed to the language that states that they may be sent after a defendant has made an appearance in the cause or the time

ſ	रिमार अर्थ कि एक कि जीवन है है है जिल्ला के अर्थ के कि के महिल्ला है
وتم	ುರ ಗರ್ಶಿನ ಒಳ ಚರ್ನನನ್ನು ಬೃ ಕಿನ್ನಡಿಕೆಗಳ ನಿರ್ವಾ ನಿರ್ವನಿಗಳು
	odther a crystin - Tuntuer them relaterions that
^	work ware, concest to worm they sagewood olong well-
	the mobile that came emperiumity is not
ĩ	eifforded the disseniant, or plaintiff necessors p
Ĺ	.d: 10 mach
6	This net was thet there are any
*	leasfits to bits of rge. We noute duch product
~1	to been to not be Earles invierd control to a
ΙΙ	alien thet earty has had an coestunity to
7 F	ravior the nervices of an attornar who
-T	underected the elgnificance of requests for
, T	cestingions and what was occur is those
£ T	acut cfrns are not recounced to edequately or in
~ r	a tiraly feshion.
7.7	alfibera dani : tearingo a inata
Ĉ.	enguare are you rofersing to?
6.5	on in the engine and the same of the
Ű.c.	very beginnin that etabes: "It ong bine all -
<i>*</i> * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	demander of the action, a lar y lay orvo
Ç	ayen any strom party a unitien rejund don the

demended unt ou une determ, a lar y la, corvoagree any etrar restry a refitten or jonet for the
aestion." a. oppore to the inaquage that
attates what they may be contacted or cafend. The
hos nor a manage errande in the weap or the the

εή.

1 10

ú u

1	thereafter has elapsed.
2	So I am simply opposed to sending
3	out requests for admissions along with the
4	petition and citation, as is currently possible
5	with interrogatories and requests for
6	production.
7	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: You see
8	admissions as really being in a different
9	category because of their binding
10	MR. BROYLES: I absolutely see
11	admissions being in a different category because
12	of the binding effect, yes, sir.
13	JUSTICE HECHT: Other questions?
14	Thank you.
15	JUSTICE RAY: You recommend it be
16	done after answer date?
17	THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.
18	JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, Mr.
19	Broyles.
20	Other comments? Professor? All
21	right.
22	MR. DAVIS: Justice Hecht?
23	JUSTICE HECHT: You have to be
2 4	quicker on the draw.

•ခဲ့စ္လာသည္။ ကို လုပ္သည့္သည္ ကို ကိုယ္သည္သည့္ ကို ကိုယ္သည့္သည့္ ကို ကိုယ္သည့္သည့္ ကို ကိုယ္သည့္သည့္ ကိုယ္သည့္သည့္	ŗ
లైనిక్టుండి <b>ం</b> ది ఎందిందా - కృ. కి.మీ.మం. కి.మీ.మం. కి.మీ.	8
est requests den ach lactons ofon, with the	· .
nedition of vital samme of the same thing on this political	<b>%</b>
1:1 admonyor bus nainedsyeroget idim	•
.noldonlorg	
ser new :sanderne aprovince angre	1,
edulasions on really boins in a different	
detegery bodouse of their binding	<b>/</b> +
no. province E aboututoly oco	^ <b>r</b>
adminsions being in a vifferent category because	Ęſ
of the Bindine alleet, year air.	4≒ • - } √
ಸರ್ವದ ಭರ್ವದ ಭರ್ವನ್ನು ಕ್ಷಾಪ್ರಕ್ಷಣ ಪ್ರವಿಧ್ಯಾಪ್ತ ಪ್ರವಿಧ್ಯಾಪ್ತ ಪ್ರವಿಧ್ಯಾಪ್ತ ಪ್ರವಿಧ್ಯಾಪ್ತ ಪ್ರವಿಧ್ಯಾಪ್ತ ಪ್ರವಿಧ್ಯಾಪ್ತ	Ç
• छ <b>ुण अंग्र</b> ाहरू	; . <b>.</b>
ರವೆ 31 ಡಿವರ ಗಾದರನ್ನು ಚರ∛ : ∀A/ ೧೮೮೮ <b>ಇಭ</b> ಕ	ոյ
dens after answer date?	<b>~</b>
•ುಗೆಕ ಕರ್ನ ಕರ್ನಟ್ಟಿಗಳು ೧೯೩	; p
र महाराष्ट्रकार स्वावनायः विदेशकार १००५ 🗆 🕝 🕝	3.1
·anh jows	9.5
Other columnstal Profesent? The	j. 15
·defpir	1.
TO. TIVER: Justice Voolber	50
gerings parties   You lave to be	0.0
·while oil an collabra	5,0

2

3

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

## DAVID DAVIS,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows: MR. DAVIS: David Davis. 7 8

JUSTICE HECHT: Yes, sir.

MR. DAVIS: And I believe this is probably my last comment.

We do, by our presence, want to indicate also that we -- we really wholeheartedly endorse the bulk of everything that's being done here, and we feel it's -it's -- it's a very good way of correcting a lot of problems we're all having to deal with.

As to Rule 167, it's more of an inquiry than a -- and a comment as to why the need for Texas licensure for psychologists. The proposed rule by an addition at the very end of the rule sets out: "For the purpose of this rule, a psychologist is a psychologist licensed by the State of Texas."

No similar requirement is for physicians, and I can't for the life of me

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

A CONTRACTOR OF THE STATE OF TH	<del>.</del>
at many to the fire out of the state of the second of the	$\Sigma$
a diniatrative loanion by conditor gradone.	c
congre to Cezes Palca of Civil Drozefale, Toxac	<b>A</b>
Tulen of Late Tracedure, and Tures To refur	7.
first vidence, these as is lows:	~
PR. DAVIE: David: Davie.	7
.xin .nov : ""DTTTQU:	7
The mayis: New Todation of	ů.
(thurbly sy same connent.	<b>~</b> 1
ie do, by our presence, pant to	1.1
in ichte abor that we we really	
wholeheastedly endorse the butk of everything	r I
that's being done here, and we feel it's	<b>.</b> [
itis itis a very god say of correcting a let	<b>a</b> .
of problems we're all having to dead with.	•
As to Rule 197, it's one of an	;•
insuiry than a and a concent on to vhy the	*1
need for maxad ligensuso for mayebusessets. mgo	Ç
the new years of the month of the very on the	5
the rule sets cut: "For the cuttons of tile	£
mule, a jourchologist is a mychologist linconses	^
by the fight of Mexico."	ξ.
c "iniilar republicatent is for	۲.

istrictions, and to can't decite . if a of the

decide why there is a distinction being made for psychologists, as opposed to physicians, in this -- in this situation.

"physician" carries the connotation of licensure, whereas "psychologist" does not have -- does not carry that distinction by itself. You wouldn't think this would happen. But it might just add, "Anybody's Name, Psychologist," and how would that qualify them to conduct a compulsory mental examination?

MR. DAVIS: One -- we -- we discussed that possibility, and we felt like that perhaps if the rule provided a psychologist as a psychologist licensed by the State of Texas, or otherwise eligible for reciprocity, licensure by reciprocity by Texas, some mechanism whereby a truly licensed psychologist from another state who would otherwise satisfy the requirements in Texas, that that same individual could be used in a -- for independent --

JUSTICE SPEARS: How would we be able to determine that? We've had similar questions in other fields about when someone is

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
no. John prince housemisself in at easily and offering
             ្នាស់ ខ្លានប្រាប់ ប្រាប់ ស្ទី ស្ពេង ខ្លាន ប្រាប់ ខ្លានការក្រុម ស្ថានក្នុង
                                                                                                                                                             1.
                                                             ella -- in bhis aitaction.
     Jungan audum: the common in thet
                            " ysician" derries the someorthich of
               " "Gernres Juerees "Jayahelerics" "Geo nes
               the contract of the carety that elacinotion the
     stong sa carow relation to the black care. Success
                        The least the edder "or group to any
     They sho 'order to " and he would that guelist then
                                                                                                                                                            Ι...
           the some well of surveying or endal executing though
                                                                                                                                                               7.5
                                                                                                                                           on -- on -- one in the
           in of ourself that cashidity, ind we fold like
that porbles if the rule provided a supeholociat
                                                                                                                                                              : 1
                on a saycheloriat Licenses by the State of
                                                                                                                                           7.5
        Wexas, or otherwise elective for realpacethy.
                                                                                                                                                               35
                         licents to by rectificating by tenor, come
                                                                                                                                                             7. 5
  contact on the coly a truly literature cupded in the
                                                                                                                                                               ÜĹ
   That and or exceeds who would reflession or Jone or I.
                                                                                                                                                             7.
                   occasion to the design of a contract that the contract of the 
                                                                                                                                                               2.4
                                 included could be under in a -- for
                                                                                                                                                              7.5
                                                                                                insensalost --
                                                                                                                                                              CC
        of our study of the following sources.
                                                                                                                                                                78
              - 28 ఎగుక్ష క్రాంత్ అగ్రక్ - $ే కాట్మ జాక్యు అంకార్ ఈ అధ్యమ
                                                                                                                                                                * 6
```

ruentism for ot collaboration of the chemical on a

ٽ ر

licensed in another state. Does that
automatically give them comity in Texas to
practice their trade, or testify, or something?

MR. DAVIS: Your Honor --

JUSTICE SPEARS: We don't -- have no idea what the other states' standards are.

MR. DAVIS: There -- there --

JUSTICE SPEARS: I'm thinking of the bar exam, for example.

MR. DAVIS: Yes, Your Honor. There are mechanisms in place in each of the licensing boards, to my knowledge, that set out the requirements very specifically under the rules for reciprosity, and perhaps there should be some need -- or the party proposing an individual who is not licensed in Texas would have to have the burden of establishing it if such, you know, situation were questioned. It seems like there is a mechanism in place by those agencies to determine.

In fact, you know, licensed psychologists from outside of Texas routinely come into the state to provide continuing education to Texas psychologists, and it seems like some of those individuals ought to be able

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
ដូចនៅមាន ស្រាស់ នេះ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់
                     appropriety give those training with the
       ್ರಾಟ್ 'ಕ್ರವರ್ಣ ಕರ ವೃತ್ತ ಚಿಗ್ದಾರ ಕರ್ಕಾರ್ ಅದ್ಯ ಚಾರ್ಡ್ ಗಟ್ಟಿಕರು ಮಾ
                                     THE PORTS YOU TONG --
    the state of the said about the said of
                                                                                                                                                                           ~
                       .Sca what the biler scates! From "rd: orc.
                        יד. יישור: היותצפ -- נוממים --
                                                                                                                                                                           Ŷ*
granging on thicks of a chinicity of the
                                                                                 one carella lorg ent green
     no. navin: vec, vens monor. Micse
                                                                                                                                                                          ₹.5
    and moderaisms in place in each of the licensing
                                                                                                                                                                           " Ţ
                         boards, to ay brow sage, that act and the
                                                                                                                                                                         \mathbb{C}^{1}
        re wirrhanth vary clerifically encar the rules
                                                                                                                                                                           + 6+
              Lot really touity, and perhaps there showed he
                                                                                                                                                                         ^ E
                                in core need -- or the jarky proposite; an
           individual who is not licensed in Peras repla-
                                                                                                                                                                          2.5
             have to lave the luvden of establiabing it is
                                                                                                                                                                         1.7
         such, wor know, elteation here quartions'. 't
                                                                                                                                                                           ٦, ١
                 remain the thought a wouldn't in particular
                                                                                                                                                                          thone a choice to determine.
                                                                                                                                                                           0.5
                               vn fiet, you know, iscenced
                                                                                                                                                                           P 65
            The cific of the colored out of the colored control of the colored col
                         tore into the chate to provide continuing
                                                                                                                                                                           J. 6
        nt endeation to tempt beyond it to, and it comes
```

The come of those individual count to be the

73 6

1	to, through some mechanism, be utilized in these
2	situations.
3	JUSTICE HECHT: All right. Are you
4	in favor of the addition of psychologists to the
5	rule?
6	MR. DAVIS: Yes. Favor the
7	addition, but with some broadening of it.
8	JUSTICE HECHT: All right. Thank
9	you.
10	Does the Court want to take a
11	recess, or
12	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: The Court's
13	trying to find out if there's coffee available.
14	JUSTICE HECHT: Oh.
15	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Well, in the
16	meantime we can proceed till we find out.
17	JUSTICE HECHT: All right.
18	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Hazel has
19	JUSTICE HECHT: Professor Hazel?
20	PROFESSOR HAZEL: I'll be very
21	brief.
22	JUSTICE HECHT: We'll keep going.
23	UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: We ordinarily
24	don't break till 10:30.
25	

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

!

roid ma illit du oc., ilanduse ence limbach (es	
.aq≮ារិស្សាវៈព	. **
name of the addition of the companies of	t.
13 - ఎ రాహ్హార్ల విధర్తారుల కుర్మామికి ఎందుకున్నాయి. ఉన్	•
\$14 B	ę
ానిత గల⊀ాండ్ . జులక్  ు ఖామాకాష్ట్ .ాక	3
e all le gridon de la company de la company en la company	#405
agree od not the collection of the mileni	
្សាល់ - មេសប្តី	
Sugar the first want is take a	** .
== xo √asebo.	7 <u>1</u>
್ರಾಣದ ಅಕ್ಷಣ ಕರ್ಮದಲ್ಲಿ ಅದ್ದಾರಿಗಳು ಮುಂದು ಬಿಡುಗಳು ಮುಂದು ಬಿಡುಗಳು	2.2
espine to file out if there's diffee availtence.	~
Juneau Rammer Con-	<u> </u>
ಂಬಿದೆ ಬಸ್ ೯ಬ.೩೦೫ : ೯೯೯೩೩೮೮೦ : ೧೯೯೮೦೮೮	<b>-</b> 7
neenti m we can weece till no find ont.	•
ragare of a south warman.	7.7
Trumman constant: Tame 1-	3.5
FPGRET TOROUGES DEEDWORD FRANCES	<b>~1</b>
grower filte : arsim menagreers	0 %
• Brown and	* <u>C</u>
. ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗಳು ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷವಾಗಿ ಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಕ್ರ	5.5
STRENGT OF STORY WITH SECTION	90
•0°: គឺ សដ្ឋា ឯសព្ធថា ដូចិត្ត	NO

₹) **(\*** 

## 

PROFESSOR PATRICK HAZEL,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

PROFESSOR HAZEL: I'm the same
Patrick Hazel that was here before, representing
the same people.

Rule 168, I believe, still has a slight glitch in it. You have made very specific, with respect to Rule 167, that requests for production and responses to requests for production are not to be filed and the recipient is to keep -- keep the original. I simply think that ought to be made clear with respect to interrogatories in Rule 168, as well.

All you did with 168 in the '88 amendments was drop the language that said a copy was to be filed with the clerk, so that's just not there. But it doesn't say what is to happen with them. I don't think there is any real question among lawyers now that they are not to be filed, and that sort of thing. I simply say: Why not take almost the same

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The state of the s	F
a course he game, oues at sold souther impassed in	<i>&gt;</i> >
a infataculas sesciam do dunsia as asocio	r
ರಾಗ್ಯಾಕ್ಟ್ ಕೆಲ ಇನ್ನಡ ಬಿಗ್ ರಾಕ್ಟ್ ನಿರ್ಮೇ ಇತ್ತಾರೆ. ಇತ್ತು ಬರುಗಾಗ	۵
Tules of Typellate Procedure, and Punos Bullours	<del>.</del> .
involtation todata (concedien litein	7
ುಗಾರ್ಡಬಡಿಸಲಾ : "ಗಳಿಗಾ ಕರ್ಯವರ್ಷ	7
Pereser nuzel that was here hafters, repro- it.ne	
the same energy a.	Ç
rate 168, 7 Delieve, octil har a	13
aliete gribe' : it. You have hade very	· . T
aneedfile, which sampeet to mule 167, that	٠. ز
rocuents for junduction and respondes to	C T
requests for production are not to be filed in:	N. 7
ည်းချင်း တခုက်တွင်းရေးကို သိမ္မာ သို့မှာ သို့ တောင်းသည်။ ကောင်းရေး စာသည်တွင် သည်။	r
in a sear to blink that sught to be ward of con with	3.1
unentiate to interrogatorica in Bulo 150, ca coll.	7.1
ARL you did with 150 in the '80	t T
amendating of a crap the language that laif a	. f
copy was to be filled with the clark, o theilt	2.0
doub not there. Tut it doesn't bey which in to	.f. *
Lowen with them. I Conit think theme is ony	<b>?</b>
roal gandalon adong suyuda nor thet thuy are	S.C.
and to be filled, and there out of taling.	1.5
ទាងគេដា ១៨៨ ដាងគេការ៉ាន (បាន) ដាងគេ កូរ៉ាស៊ី (១៤មួយ។ កូរ៉ាស្សារ៉ាន	#

language from 167 and add it to 168 so that it's 1 2 also clear, and that the Court may order them to be filed for good cause shown so that the Court has the same power with respect to 168 as 167. 5 I have supplied that language for the Court in a

letter to Justice Hecht.

3

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The only other thing that is even more minor than that: With respect to 166b you have rewritten the "Presentation" -- Section 4 -- "Presentation of Objections," and you have added something there that says: "Either an objection or a motion for protective order made by a party to discovery .... You just added the "protective order" in there, and that makes good sense.

You also brought over from 168 into 166b the provision about late filing of objections, that they are waived. And it states that "After the date on which answers are to be served, objections are waived unless an extension of time has been obtained .... Well, as I say, this may be very, very minor, but somebody is going to pick it up and say, "Well, they didn't say the motions for protective order are waived, though," and they have included

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

,			<i>:</i> 3	**	;	^ F	<b>.</b>	*	:	3.25		ŗ	¢ :.	•,	:	700	, U	**	•
: .		h.e.	ij	% f	··••	•			იკა	3 2 2	•	.: .	4	• •	£° 2°	D '		. ^	***
	· · · · · ·	- 5		1	د ن		<b>-</b> 11	francisco	. 35		. (	• .		12	30		. :	mi	m
	• 's	ī		` : `	<b>7.</b> .5	- N	÷r	<b>3</b>		ii a i	s.: /	r	n.	ខ្លួ	C	t:		; £Î	P.
Ω	i.	•!	: °;	î .	-".:	ታ ኌ 6	7 i.	33341.	£ 5	;; ·	.*	·,c, ,	1.1	. ,	·	l.; '.	٠.		••
									. 31	   <b> </b>	္၁	<u>.</u>	i je i	. 0				, .	

7 Security of the thick of the control of the local control of the control of the

is all of " such to very terms of eals will - [ The builting of the supply definition of the Conf. objections, that they are welted. In it it attec 15 F that "Afrer the date on which arther need to se-() F se ved, objectivnu era unived univen an 0.3 chiconston of the harder obtained .... " while 1.0 as I ware this cay be very, very manas bee 3.2 can listly so coing to jidt it up out law, "se li-.... notice evidentials and the little edd ten stribing year ¥ , is afort order mode Can H. Investor on the con-\*\* ...

motions for protective order. 1 2 All I'm saying is probably all that would need to be done is enforce -- say, "Either 3 an objection or a motion for protective order timely made shall preserve the objection," and 5 that may save you ever having to have to decide 6 7 that on appeal. 8 Thank you. 9 JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, 10 Professor. 11 Other comments to 166b through 215? 12 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Let's 13 proceed until --JUSTICE HECHT: All right. 14 15 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- we see 16 that we're estopped. 17 JUSTICE HECHT: All right. The next 18 area of rules that we'll take up, then, is Rules 19 216 through 295; 216 through 295. 20 Yes, sir. 21 22 23 24 25

. Resta vidand or vel relien r COSSOCIATE TO THE TRANSPORT OF THE supdain the colors of care to set were religion of the control of the control of the control of ban "...oipogdo ald oviches- lifeda of a yhou's This are all owned as the heart solve from a vice from shads · Ann v to the daily . १९९९ अस्टब्रुट - uog suase : emem estengt. Professor. Geron et Lebes to 2005 et reage 2009 5" (" e tre anegrica mariane: notes 9.5 -- 165gg 5 7 - 364 19 3.5 . Digital Sime : 1985 Contract **N** T ्रका वर्षे नाम :**वर्**ष्ट्राहरू है । इस्तार के वर्ष **-** 5 . `990€9**3**09 6. '60 3743 î,Ţ erca of three then worth token us, then, in Juden  $\circ$   $\mathfrak{x}$ Old through 2000 Pls thioday 500 Yen, ohr. F .3

, į.

. . .

## GASTON BROYLES,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in

2 3 5

administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas

Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of

Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

7

6

MR. BROYLES: My name is Gaston Broyles from Corpus Christi, again representing myself as a trial attorney and the Texas Association of Defense Counsel, and this will be my last -- my last appearance.

I really had more of a question about the change in Rule 216, and the inquiry is basically whether this change in the rule will allow for actually less uniformity rather than greater uniformity in terms of jury fees.

By -- by the addition of the language "Unless otherwise provided by law," is it now going to be incumbent upon trial attorneys who practice in more than one county to find out in -- in the future what that particular county's jury fee is going to be?

JUSTICE HECHT: Unfortunately, the answer to that question is yes. The Legislature

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

# នេះ ប្រទេស និង ដូច្ចេះ ខេត្តបានមួយថា ១៨៦ បន្ទះនិងថា Autosope ។ administrative superior to be deposited as senecior of the contraction of the con Tries of Aprellate Procedure, and Perso Tulor of tipit Twittens, atatod as follows: te. Dievanie: The word in Gentler rowles from Corpus Christi, acain regresenting agralf an a triol attourng and die Conce 0.5 II conditation of Neferra Councel, see this will be my Lead -- my act appearance. Ç ... Tirrolly had more of a quantion 8.5 chayt the charge in Dule 215, and the inquiry in . j line that could be subjected by the ngc in the cult will be and it we down you include the could yell prove the totally ] ~ greater uniformity in terms of jury fore. ... I ny -- by the addition of the J The appropriate ${f v}$ with ${f v}$ we have the properties of ${f v}$ and ${f v}$ and ${f v}$ ~ <u>. r</u> it now going to so incustent upon tria. - a -្នាស់ពីសាស្ត្រ ស្ត្រ នេះ មាន នេះ មាន នេះ មាន ស្ត្រ ស្ត្រ ស្ត្រ ស្ត្រ ស្ត្រ ស្ត្រ 1.0 ್ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ಬೆಳಗಿ ಬರು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ಬರು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ಬರು ಬರು ಬರು ಬರು ಬರು ಬರು ಬರುಕ್ಕ ្សិតស៊ី ស្ដា ក្រស់សុទ្ធភាព សុខ សែខ ខែសុខស្នា សេខសាស្ត្រ ខេត្ត ស្**នុះ**កិន្ត្រស ends againstains, or in simply appropria \* 0 a same of the slag of he description is also of the same of the

has answered that by changing the jury fee in 1 Texas Government Code, Section 51.604. 2 MR. BROYLES: All right. We'll look 3 that up. JUSTICE HECHT: In a certain area --5 I've forgotten what -- where that was, Luke. 6 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Oh, it's Harris 7 8 County. MR. BROYLES: Harris County. It's -- the population is over -- over two 10 11 million. 12 MR. SOULES: To support their ADR. MR. BROYLES: Pardon me? 13 14 MR. SOULES: It would support their 15 ADR. 16 MR. BROYLES: Okay. It's for populations over -- over two million, I believe, 17 18 is how it is. Is this going to -- so this was 19 just in there to make that consistent so the 20 people would look for -- Harris County? 21 JUSTICE HECHT: So that they 22 wouldn't look at Rule 216 and say, "Well, thank 23 goodness, that's all we have to pay is \$10," and 24 then send the money in to Harris County and find 25 out that they have not properly demanded a jury

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
to the chart of that is as mains the fact form
                              Compared Corps and Code, Section 51.186.
Control of the state of the sta
                                                                                                     OFF CALL
 TURFTED LECTY: In a perfein aron --
          ాండ్రాన్ ఇండు మంది చేశాకు తాగా నుండి చేశాకున్నారు. చేశాకున్నారు చేశాకున్నారు.
 THE REST OF THE PARTY OF THE PARTY.
                                                                                                                             ... nod and land land.
                                                                                                                                                                        ;
                 in this -- the wall ation is over -- were two
                                                                                                                          .H.J. in
                                                                                                                                                                    1. COULDS: No on wort their 200.
                                                                                                                                                                          7 j
                                   .. D REEL: Perden ne?
                                                                                                                                                                         11.5
  m. coemia: Tt weuld aughort their
                                                                                                                                                                        15
                                                                                                                                      4 17 6 B
                     in. neovers: have to term for
 sy youration, over -- even who will don, The fever
     de now it for Te this young to -- so this was
           furt in there be hake hits consistent so the
                                                                                                                                                                        - 5 L
                          coole wat & look for -- To ris County?
                                                                                                                                                                       . .
                         gurrangs gactur: so that they
                                                                                                                                                                         1.1
  gog gints took at this 20 and say, "roll, thank
                                                                                                                                                                       60
 on near, the side we have to pay in the end
 Lach cont the ten y in to Currie County and died
```

ort tilt tios gave kot e e en godon och til

1	because they have not paid the proper fees.
2	MR. BROYLES: Is it anticipated that
3	other counties will have similar changes so that
4	counties between 399,000 and 420,000 will have
5	their own jury fee set?
6	JUSTICE HECHT: I doubt it. I I
7	certainly hope not, but
8	JUSTICE MAUZY: If we can get 76
9	votes in the House and 16 in the Senate, you
10	bet.
11	MR. BROYLES: Thank you.
12	JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments on
13	216 to 2 whatever I said 95?
14	Yes, sir.
15	
16	LOUIS MULDROW,
17	appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in
18	administrative session to consider proposed
19	changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas
20	Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of
21	Civil Evidence, stated as follows:
22	
23	PROFESSOR MULDROW: My name is
2 4	Muldrow. I teach at Baylor Law School, advanced
25	procedure and the practice before the courts.

ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

. Order to the control of the state of the s	<b>.</b>
nada radbyteldas dl (I) :nppyynys	2
atter dermuler (13) bevo einder charges so wert	Ç
opinakon bakana 500,000 una 430,000 ukit buva	۸
ទីដី <b>១៧ ១៤. មួនប</b> ៀ ស្គ្រា ក្រិក្សាជួ	;
ಶ <del></del> -ವರ <b>ಕಲ್</b> ಡಬಹುತ್ತ : ಚರ್ಚಕ್ಕ ಚರ್ಚಾಗಾಗ	•
es t inty in not, but	7
JUSTICA TARE : II .: CAB GOD 75	,
votes in the House and 25 in the Senate, You	~
het.	cr
. noy faste : ngayear .cu	7.5
Transan near me ather cosments on	r 5
92° to 2 vastever I haid 252	2.3
"en, rir.	i.P
	2.5
.".ogr.uu gruca	7.1
m peak is before the Supreme Court of warrs in	7.7
administrative session to noncider traposes	ę, r
chanton to Menas Tulon of Mivis Proceduro, to co	"ï
aulos if majellete Drumodure, on Dexe : Dulos co	٠
Tivil Tvidence, atabee as is is interes	To
	r e
াই ভারতার দু" । ∶েটা, রাল্যাল েটা শাস্ত্রাদ্ পাতি	€:
tudd two. T teepel at Roylor taw factors also alvert	٠, ٥
ared who and the grapulas because the courts.	;1 🗢

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

15

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

My comments relate to the proposed changes in Rules 217 through 279, and my comments relate only to the charge, and specifically to permitting preservation of error based solely on objections, dispensing with the necessity of requests.

I -- I think that dispensing with requests and allowing preservation of error on the basis of objections alone simplifies the task of the lawyer, particularly the defense lawyer. My former colleagues at the defense bar would probably be surprised and distressed at my saying this, and the plaintiffs' lawyers who are here are going to be surprised, as well, but I think that this is a very significant advantage to the defense lawyer. It is a disadvantage, in my opinion, to the trial judge, and, I think as well, probably a disadvantage to the plaintiff's lawyer.

This Court has observed in a number of opinions that there is a considerable difference between sitting back and objecting The objections go by rapidly, we all orally. They are frequently mumbled just so that the court reporter can get them down. They go

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ന്നു ആരു കാർ വി നർക്കുന്നു. വി നിവരം വൂന

eta . We also to Rules SL7 bigs only  $57^{\circ}$  , and aand copyride oils of the Los Los assets on great tocity where thing carryation of street Green Golest en objection a Mingening with the recessity of reconstr.

The think that the main and the no rorre in aristratival tir grainolis out arres or tis Nesia til objection, albne ofr, iffice tir that of the lawyer, atticumers the infense lewion. I for or col estate at the defease her weald to bookers be currenteed and distressed at my saying this, and the pisindiffer lawyers who are here are going to be durwrised, as well, but € T. think that blin is a very significant odvertice F t the defence cattor. It is a shadwanteger in my a finian, to the trial judge, end, I though an 7 . wall, archably a dischuration of the plaintiffs . 13"USI

7

0

^ r

1.1

10

1

2.5

CI

This tent has chasted in a nation \* : : of minimum that there is a dominating £ : in ifference lectures withing bruk and objusting erat v. The objections of y which  $y_{\ell}$  we also ... (° tros. They are free rently haddled just to chat . c. by the transmitted only it than count. They are 4 6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

by rapidly at a tense and tough time in the lawsuit, anyway, and this Court has previously observed that the trial court is helped greatly by having tendered to the Court written requests for issues, definitions, or instructions, and they are there and the judge can look at them and study them and understand them much more readily than a rapidly expressed oral objection.

It's -- it's remarkable to me that we are going back to a practice that existed apparently prior to the adoption of the rules in 1941. I can't claim to have been here in the '20s and '30s, but the commentaries following the adoption of Rule 279 in 1941 indicate very clearly that dispensing with objections alone as a sufficient basis for preserving errors, irrespective of what kind they are, was initiated in large part to help the trial judge by assuring full and complete cooperation from the lawyers with respect to the precise wording that ought to be used in the questions, definitions, and instructions. I think it's a lot easier to object than it is to draft, in substantially correct wording, the question, the definition, or instruction that ought to be

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The above 12 words one of the 1992 of the og springer case dones al done (granger chan work) The same of the collection of the decorate សទាសាសាសា សុខនាស់ ស. នាស្សាសាស្រី មានទី សុខ ប៉ុន្តែស្រី មួយ។ អ្នកសំពុងនៅ សូសិ To alloues, definible of his recisions and bling and throw and the judge son look at them ored leng and bushule has deal the glocke him - ១៩៩៩៦ ដែល នៃជាម លេខពល់ខុងស្គាល់ ស្គ្រស់ ួន៤ នេះ សុខភាព មួនិស ១០១ for a cd of an adversarial -- alar ្រះ ទី០ នៃ។ ទី១ ទី ១ ម៉ង់ទី២ ខេត្ត ២ ១០ ដើម្បាស់ មួយ ខែភ្នាស់ ១ ខេធ a sample by right to the displice of the condition of old mi ocou mest ovsi et islo d'est F .INII 1511 . w 121s, but the concentaries following ~ ~ the ado then of the CVI in 1941 naticate very v l chief whether it pantime with objections with the t buffleient be to for the training of reacts The goar gold will dails to overdence the · r infulated in Lax o gart to call the trace fuelou ( <u>.</u>F. out the artifactor of the story of a to be a controlled and the - : <u>r</u> rul was a labor out ou real consider region of 60.64 in a file of a file of the second of the second of P 25 of the state of the traditional for the the the tradition

1

0.7

er e dies to rigaet vara da da serife, a

used.

JUSTICE HECHT: Why isn't that tool still available to the trial judge in Rule 271 (1)?

PROFESSOR MULDROW: A good question.

And there does not appear to me to be in this cluster of rules an apparent, clear consequence of the trial lawyer not complying.

"Compliance or noncompliance with 271 (1) shall never constitute waiver of any objection to the court's charge made in compliance with Rules 272 and 273." So the lawyer has got to object. If the judge says, "I want you to tender to me in writing the proposed charge," what is the consequence if the lawyers fail to do so? What is the consequence if what they tender is not exactly right? What if they tender something and then turn around and object to it?

I think, arguably, Subsection 5 of 273, when it says "Compliance or noncompliance" with the judge's request or order to tender "shall never constitute a waiver of any objection," could be said to dispense with invited error or estoppel. Now, I don't know.

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

	<b>.</b>
of the India state of the first of the state	4 3
ణ సాగులోని క్రస్తర్ అక్ <b>రా</b> స్త్రు స్టార్ట్ స్టార్ట్	, ,
C(I) INF JAFC	`.
acidecus acopiti : "formation necession.	
$\mathcal{C}^{*}(\mathcal{C})$ at $(\mathfrak{o}, \mathfrak{o})$ and $(\mathfrak{o}, \mathfrak{o})$ and $(\mathfrak{o}, \mathfrak{o})$ and $(\mathfrak{o}, \mathfrak{o})$ and $(\mathfrak{o}, \mathfrak{o})$	
s ta n dunon a có <b>o</b> sun van an mho athrolos an anto	₹
-1.೯ (೩ ೧೯೯೮ ರಲ್ಲಿ ಗಲ್ಲಾಟಕ್ಕೆ ೧೯೯೮ ಕ್ಷೇತ್ರ ೧೯೯೮	Α,
Thus, $\sigma_{ij} = -i \sigma_{ij} \sigma_{ij} + i \sigma_{ij} \sigma_{ij} \sigma_{ij} + i \sigma_{ij} \sigma_{ij} \sigma_{ij} \sigma_{ij}$	
with (I) FOR and committee rive to remain them.	0.3
Sver zern illett valver vi cay skjadvion to the	Į. į
non semilation de la compacta de la	21
and 772." Fo the ladger had got to object. If	8.5
the judge caye, "" went you to tender to be in	• .
odi si drit "konzode imeoget sid pridi i	: *
Talle 16st and on a Transport of 1d the commence of the	7 (
is the sound general true they beness to met	7. 1
and story of the contract the contract of a something	<u>''</u> '
n, bind tour execution of unique Librarians	- 7
Bo The Idooudn't Ax. domestic which is the	45 🗪
The state of companies at the companies of the companies	.۶۰
ការប្រជាពល់ ដី ដែល ១០០០ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ប្រ <mark>ាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់</mark> ស្រាស់ <b>នេះ</b> ជាប្រាស់	<b>a</b> .
jan li tuni va a ndrdilinan ovin eka u	<i>و</i> د دې د
នាក់ស្រុកសម្ព័ទ្ធ និសិក្សាសាល្រ្តី ស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកសម្រេច ស	, ·
-which winds to a simple power of the filler	• •

.

objection."

understand it now, is that if I, as the lawyer, request or tender something to the judge and the judge submits it, my lips are sealed thereafter to complain about that. I've invited it, and I'm estopped to say that what I led the Court into now was error, if this means that compliance or noncompliance shall never constitute waiver of any objection. It doesn't say "doesn't constitute waiver of the obligation

to object." It says "constitute waiver of any

The -- the -- the law, as I

Then, arguably, a lawyer who -might under some circumstances be satisfied with
a reversible error. I think most of time,
frankly, that's going to be the defense lawyer.
"If I can win before the jury, that's great, but
if I don't win before the jury, I'm sometimes
just as satisfied to have a reversible error in
there, and if all I have to do is object..."
then I think the trial judge has an immeasurably
more difficult task -- the trial judge and the
plaintiff's lawyer have, in my opinion, an
immeasurably more difficult task; I think more
difficult from the plaintiff's viewpoint now,

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

diffit agit in on the coint ffte ristroint now,

" F

, L

3.1

1 5

50

87 because there doesn't seem to be any limitation 1 2 under 271 (1) as to whether the judge may order one or both to tender or request just their own 3 questions, definitions, or instructions, or whether or not that does not, as it seems to me, 5 6 extend to the charge as a whole. JUSTICE HECHT: But if there was an 7 objection: "Your Honor, this charge does not 8 contain satisfactory instruction, a definition 9 10 of negligence," and the trial judge says, "Well,

of negligence," and the trial judge says, "We would you submit that in writing? In fact, I direct you to submit what you consider to be satisfactory in writing and for my consideration."

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So -- and he goes off and writes it up and brings it back in, hands it to the judge and says, "All right, this is what I request."

And the trial judge says, "If I give this instruction now, will that eliminate your objection?"

And he says, "No, that won't eliminate it."

He says, "Well, what will?"

"Well, you need to change it up some
more."

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

```
emplication than on or republic of comments
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          r
     union 273 (1) o te solotion the just of (1) of an orien
    one of high the toreder of cognect three their own
                             on which the confinition of the traction of the confiner confiners and the confiners
 you so a need it is wien now the term to the terms.
                                                                                        ertessii to tite diametra cu i voice.
            TO STATE OF STATE OF THE STATE 
            an applicate "true tears, this placed food apic
          Contact of the Calendary of truckion of collinations
 of an Algeneo," and the tries judge mayer, "" also
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          J.
               ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಟ್ ಆಗ್ ನಿರ್ಣಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಟ್ ಪ್ರತಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಸಂಗ್ರಹಿಸಿದ ಪ್ರಾರ್ಥಕ್ಷಣಗಳು
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         FF
                   First was to white thit you dond it to be
                                                                         datish ato y in writing and for by
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        13
                                                                                                                                                                                 don i eration."
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         -N f
     Te -- and le goes off and urites it
    up and brings it back in, serin it to the inage
         and sayer, "the estable, black in what " secoone."
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         7. 1.
and the trief judge caye, "The T give
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          , J
         th a instruction now, vir that eliminate your
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            J. ^
                                                                                                                                                                                                      Projection?"
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            ~ ~
                                         And he cars, "to, that ten't
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         Ι...
                                                                                                                                                                                      e faincee it."
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        0.0
                                                 " saye, "Voll, vhot will?"
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          3
media, give norther change it is conce
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          26
```

" . O % C & &

77 (\*

"Well, I told you to give me what you wanted."

All right. So he goes off again.

And isn't the trial judge able, in essence,

through the process, to be sure that the

objection is either covered or is not going to

be covered?

PROFESSOR MULDROW: If -- if we retain, I think, invited error for estoppel -- and that's a question that I have about Subsection 5 -- if -- if the lawyer requests it, the lawyer is not going to be heard then to level objections at it. I think that clarifies a lot of it.

I -- I don't understand exactly why we're dispensing with the obligations to request, sort of in advance, other than to try to come into some sort of compliance with what the federal rule has. It seems to me that the process of objecting, considering the objections, and then directing the lawyer to draft a request, is going to be a more time consuming process, perhaps, than we have now.

JUSTICE HECHT: I think the concern -- some of the concerns expressed at the

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

M. Todhad mit	2
the circle coop of an experie	•
ಿಕಾಣ ಕೆಯಲಿಸಿದ (ಒಂದ ಅಗರಿಷ್ಟ ಗೊಡಗಿ) ಎಂದು ಸಹಿತ ಅವರ್ಷ <b>ಾಣಲ</b> ್ಯ	•
నాయిగ్ చేరు గ్రామంలో నావి ఇంటి ఎట్టులు ఉంది. చిరిమా గాత్రి	***
ιά φαρος άση με ο Βισενού πεάφλε ολ κοίφετής.	پ
ราบบองจุด (cc	i.
90 01 <del>4-</del> 27 : 17 <b>.67</b> 7   <b>20</b> 0   19075	
—— ్రంగులుకుండా కూడు. కారశుక్వ క్రామాక్ఖాయి. ఇవ్వక్షేల ఓ ఇయ్రామాతక	r
and theten a gree bios, that whise chost	CE
್ರಿ ಅತಿಯಾಗುತ್ತು ಇಂಗಳು ಒಂದು ಸಿಪಿ ಈ ನಿಷ್ಠಿ ಈ ನಿರ್ದೇಶಕಾಗು ಬಳಿ	T.
က ရက္ကေနာ့ ကောက္သင့္ ကုတ္ေကာင္းတက္ သိတ္သင္းနဲ႔ ကလုတ္လည္း ကုိန္း	pr
Lare objections of in. I toink that distantiation	2.5
.df (೧೮೮೮)	<u>*</u> •
7 1 confit underschend unactiv shr	3.1
មនៅលេក ការសេសពេលនៃសេក នេះ មេសាស ebb ក្នុងនេះ once to	<b>~</b> .*
request, rest of in edvance, otion than to try	£į
to cold into some fine from the with wint	`.*
ರಿಗೆತ ಹಿಡಗೆನ ಆನ ದರ ಗಟ್ಟರಿಗೆ ತಿಗ್ಗೆ ಎಂದು ರಿದಿದರು ಚಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗಳ ಅಭಿಕ	() y
ျဖစ္ခရာ ကို	^ -
chicetions, and then directing and howyer to	Le
creat a roque, to de et palar de tâuc	ę. c
derendend codeed, pockers, then we have now.	C.C.
ುಷಕ ಸಣಗಳು ಗ :ಬಡರಿಗಳ ಗರಸಳುಗಳು	<b>^</b>
ರಾಗಿದೆ ಚಿನ ಆರಂಭಾ ಧಾರ್ಯ ಗಾಗಲಾಗಾಧಾ ಅಭಿಕೃತಿ ಈ ಈ ಅಂತಾಗಾಧಾ	** E,

committee hearing were that the -- what is required to preserve error in the charge under our current rules is a complex body of law and very difficult for even skilled and frequent practitioners at the courthouse.

б

PROFESSOR MULDROW: Primarily,
because I think errors of commission and
omission blur into one another, and we don't
really -- it's not absolutely clear when there
is an omission and when there's a commission,
and that's the main problem, I think, in that
respect.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: It's past our break time, and I know we're going to have more questions of you, but I'd like to request the Court to take a 15-minute break. And I think we will -- I have some questions of you.

PROFESSOR MULDROW: All right, sir.

the blurring of -- as we go to a more general charge, whose burden it is to carry an issue is getting more and more blurred, and we would like to keep this body of law manageable but at the same time give protections to the trial court and the attorneys. So maybe -- maybe out of

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ended the constant of the chart with and the con-	ï.
នាក្រស់ សុខាធិស្ស ទៅ ខា នេះ	ç
att engres e tulas la coup an body of law ent	.•
vory dilifeuha in evan adilika and frequenc	•
<ul> <li>ឯងអាចកាដាក្នុងកុខ ១៩៤៤ និង ស្ត្រស្តី និងស្នាស់ក្រុម</li> </ul>	<b>(%</b> )
.viltandias : ""scaut gonango a	Ţ
ក៏នេះស្រាស់ក្រុង ស្រែក 10 ប្រ <b>ុខ</b> ាស្ត្រ ប្រាស់ថ្ងៃ ។ កស្តុខ ១៩	(-a
oringion blue inter one chether, end to denit	120
೨೫೦೪ಕ ಬರಿಕೆಳ ಇದಲ್ಲರ ಸೃತ್ಯಿಕರ ಕರಣಗ ಕಂಡ ಡಿಕೆಕ ಇಸಿತ್ಯೆಕ	3
to ca sutratanjané when theretu a caurdacton,	T X
ಶಿನ್ಯಿತ ಆಹ ಇನಿಗಾಹಿಗೆನ II ಇಮಾರಿಕಿಲ್ಲಾನ ಕುಸ್ತರ ಅಗೆದ ರಗಡೆಯಾಗಿನ ಸಿಚ್ಚಾ	Ţ.f
. ಭಿ <b>ರ</b> ಾಗ ನಿರಾಸ	~ <b>.</b>
ಕರ್ಮ ಬಿಕ್ಕಾ :ದಾನಾವಾಗಾದ ಚರ್ಚಹಾದರು ಉಬ್ಬರಣ	2.5
ord breck time, and I know we're roing to have	2.6
ತ್ರಾಣ್ಯ ಕ್ಷಾಣ್ಯ	* 1
end Count to Eako a 15-minute Orcen. Ind "	~ T
think be with " have send sucething of ser.	. F
. Lu .depta Ela :meassan an nagena	(* °
sata : esendaros nomesat autrop	0.5
પોલ પોતાથા પ્રાથમિક છે. 🛨 કહ્યું છેલે છે છે. હું પ્રાથમિક પુરા મારા જો	20
connect there burden it is to early an issue is	ŗ¢
gotting more and more binared, and weath isted	ęc
to kees this body of lew daneged do but at the	2.2
druco laire old o lane do tox loveg oald band	30

page the sttermacy. To vert ver maying sut of

(° £

this process we can think of a way to achieve 1 2 all those goals. We'll take a 15-minute recess. 3 (At this time there was a brief 4 recess.) 5 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Okay. 6 7 We've got a quorum. PROFESSOR MULDROW: 8 Shall we go, Your Honor? 9 10 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Yes, if you 11 don't mind proceeding. 12 PROFESSOR MULDROW: Back -- back to the -- back to that first sentence in 271 (1). 13 14 What if -- what if the trial judge says, "Well, 15 you've objected; just draft," or the trial 16 judge, without having gotten to the objecting 17 stage, directs the lawyers to tender what they 18 think the charge ought to be, and the lawyer 19 says, "Judge, I'm sorry to admit it, but I will 20 be frank with you: I don't know; I can't figure 21 out what the law is, and I don't know how that 22 thing ought to be worded, and I can't." 23 But they get down to the objections 24 and he says, "But I don't think what you have

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

got here is right, and so I'm objecting to it

25

```
is an independent of the control of 
                                                                                                                                                                          Carron chest st
                             mail: lake o l'- invete nodes.
                         1.8 19891.
                            THE THEFT OF SUITE TORY CLAY.
                                                                                                                                                          -serous a ser sylate
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            7
                    was an along amounting anophimous
                                                                                                                                                                                                    ""Qu" "nams
De de gir & 30 de Barrianace mesurende eile inde
                                                                                                                                            . National Day Day Birth
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          ? T
 The standing of the standing o
        213 -- Tok to land fines contoned in 27% (1).
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       C 4
    That is -- whet is the world juices caye, "Wells
                                route, of cecoe; frot (Jost, es the lesse.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       : <u>.</u> .
             galdoofile odd od aeddoo galvad daeddii eglaf
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         ₹.
       ctage, wiredee the fawnes to tended what they
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       7.5
                  ್ರಾರ್ಟ್ ಬಿಟ್ಟ್ ಡೆಟಿಡ್ಗೂಡ ಅಭರಗಳ ಕರ್ಣ ನಿರ್ವಹಣಕ ಕಾರ್ಟ್ ಜೀರ್ಟ್ ನ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        never "Suege, "In corey to adult it, but ? will
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            1
be Free's with your I don't knew; I cen'e figure
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       € C. C.
        out what the law in, and " don't have how the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          . . .
                                                 0.0
     ການໄປສຸດເປີດ ຄົນ ລະ ແລະ ເດກ ຊຸດພົມ ສະພັ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            3.2
            ovad nov data detail ofner i dud" coyou od bea
```

ాడ్లు సార్థిలలోలు ఉన్న తానా సంజాల ఇచ్చానినా ఈ గాండ్ చెందా

# P

for these reasons, but what all it ought to be,

I'm not sure." And it doesn't seem to me that

there is a clear consequence to the lawyer's

failure or refusal to tender.

1.5

If, in response to the judge's question, it gave me an idea, perhaps, that one of the reasons the thing may be proposed the way it is, is that when the trial judge starts hearing the objections, the lawyer says, "We object to this issue," or "this instruction," or "this omission for the following reasons," object, object, object.

The judge says, "Well, if you find what is there objectionable, I order you to draft what you think it ought to be."

I think there will probably be trial judges who, out of an excess of precaution, perhaps, direct the lawyer with respect to every objection that is made: We'll just draft what you say it ought to be, and it will take three days to prepare the charge instead of two or three hours, maybe, if that is the practice that's adopted. At any rate --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, is it your sentiment that the current system is

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
the design of the section of the sec
                                                                                                                                                                             Ţ
               Tig not unc." And it december of the term to
                     there it a corporational to the lawyer's
                                                                 Light of English to the interest
                           ការ៉ាំទី១១៩១ ១៩៨ ១៨ ១៩៣០ . ១ ១៤ 👫
           gase said to a section of an investigation of the com-
         of the commence the new lay be care, but this way
                                                                                                                                                                             ,-0
                         it in, i the back where the tests judge blacks.
                    corres the objections, the dayer day, "To
          angedt to thie incure," es "this inclination," er
                                                                                                                                                                          ٠.
                            "the sufficient for the Leflerine rule and,"
                                                                                                                                                                           7.5
                                                                                 coject, object, coject.
                                                                                                                                                                            S 6
The judge eags, "Well, if you file?
                                                                                                                                                                             m ::
                        wast in the ere objectionable, I order you to
                                                                                                                                                                             31
                                          c aft what you think it sucht to be."
                                                                                                                                                                            ; · · · · ·
         think there well crovery be laied
                                                                                                                                                                             T. 1
                        judgae who, out of an endade of grounding,
                                                                                                                                                                           6.2
          ್ಮ ೧೯೯೬ ಕೆ ಕಿರ್ದಾರ ಚಿತ್ರದ ಬರಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಅಗಿತ ತಿಂದ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷಗಳು ತಿ
                                                                                                                                                                            ^ <del>-</del>
             objection that in the correct function deals to the
                                                                                                                                                                           15
             gow any it curkt to be, and it will take three
                                                                                                                                                                            ^{\circ}S
                   taga da manase the charge in teach of two er
                                                                                                                                                                           P (*
                       elico borro, seyan, il thet is the place produced
                                                                                                                                                                           C 12
                                                           ના કાંગ્રાફિક ના તાલુકા છે. તેલું કાંગ્રાફ સ્થાપ્ય મા
         केंद्रे राज्य 🐧 🔞 🕹 🛊 १८६४८ वर्षा वर्षा वर्षा मुल्ला है. स्ट्रिक्ट
                                                                                                                                                                             . 6
```

gord and algorithm the current yetablish

.. 6

working all right?

PROFESSOR MULDROW: Well, it's a very -- it's a very difficult area. It's -- we all know that there is no -- in my opinion, no single part of a trial that it is -- that is as technical and hazardous as the charge, and I just don't see how changing the rule is going to simplify what, by its nature, is an inherently difficult and technical area.

I think there is something to say for the fact that since the Pepper (phonetic) case and since the adoption of the rules in 1941, at least we have got about 50 years of precedent that gives us specific directions, not always answering all the questions, because it continues to cloud. I don't know that scrapping it and starting over from scratch is necessarily going to accomplish what is desired.

I don't -- I don't know that I can say that I think it works fine. We see a lot of cases where lawyers have done their very best to draft definitions and instructions, only to be told on appeal that that's not in substantially correct wording.

JUSTICE HECHT: Or that they have

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE \*AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 \* 512/452-0009

ទីស៊ីពិស្ថិស ដីប៉ុន្តា ស្រួកិ <b>ដ្</b> ងស្ន	
A BISE COUNTY CONTROL CONTROL	
ງ ພຳພະ ເຂດນາ ງ ກຸນປີພົຊີຊີ, ກຸ່ນວ <b>ູ</b> ນ ຄຳລີຊີ ຫຸນປະ	۶.
on ancombes we had on a crods done cond to	ç,
20 1 9002 01 31 2014 0124 2 00 2 20 185.16	77.
ំ ពិធី 🖟 🗈 មិន 🖟 នេះ នេះ បានប្រសិប្បធាន ភាព ប្រឹក្សា សុខសុខ 🔭 🔭 មិន 🖰 ប្រឹក្សា ប្រឹក្សា សុខសុខសុខ ភាព 🥂	•
just Longa and to abouting ind the russ of the colony to	7
where they where, by the measure, is an independing	
61fffdeult the Ethunical rate.	•
This this to so the solution of this got one	C.I.
day the fact they of so is new to near then called	1.7
နားကို အားသက္သည့္ ကိုလည္း အေျပာင္းကို အေတြကို သည္။ ကိုလည္း ကိုလည္း ကိုလည္း ကိုလည္း ကိုလည္း ကိုလည္း ကိုလည္း ကိုလ	*• r
ROAR, at Readt in have got subut 50 years	7. r.
receiona thet yaran an apadifie disoctions, nor	1.0
etways unrequiry alt the packlone, because the	類 : P.
ುದಾರ್ದಿಗಳು ೧೦ ಆಗಿಗಳು ೨ ನಿರ್ಮಿಕ ತಿಂದರ ರೇಗ್ ನಿರ್ಮ	7.5
to ell than what wo medical committee is a committee of the committee of t	V.C
edding to recomplice their in westrof.	S.E.
" - oi't J don't ham histor con	ę r
car thav T think in works fine. U dee a sut of	9.0
នេះ និកថ្ម កា ឯក នេះក្នុង ១០០% ៦០១ ព្រះប្រជាធិប្រភព <b>ថា ១១១១</b>	ìs
draft definitions in Characteristics in problem to the	<b>F</b> 69
្រង់ដែលនៅប្រាស់ គេ ស្រែក សុខិតិសុខិត ជនសេស ខែសុខិត្ត គេម (គឺម)	Ĉŝ
•က <b>က</b> ြည်းသည်။ တို့တောင်သည်။ မြောင်းသည်။	2.1
ಎಲ್ಡಡಿ <b>ಭಾ</b> ತಿಕ ಹಡಗೂ ಕ್ರ <sup>ೂ</sup> :ಬಗಾಟ್ ದ್ರಾಗ <b>ರಗ</b> ು	7.0

requested matters be included in the charge 1 2 without objecting, only to be told on appeal 3 that by requesting, rather than specifically objecting, they waive any error in the charge. That's right; PROFESSOR MULDROW: 5 that's right. But if we say to the lawyer, "All 6 you have got to do is object," we've got to say 7 8 to somebody somehow, however you interpret it, "Somebody has got to draft it." And if I were 10 the trial judges, I think I would be down here complaining, because I think if the lawyer says, 11 12 "I'm sorry, Judge, I don't know how to draft that thing" --13 14 JUSTICE HECHT: A good many have 15 written, so -- and their voices are being heard. 16 PROFESSOR MULDROW: -- and when the rule says compliance or noncompliance doesn't 17 affect a waiver of the objections that the guy 18 19 then makes, I think you can hook the judge with 20 the dilemma. That's all I have. JUSTICE HECHT: 21 Thank you, 22 Professor. 23 PROFESSOR MULDROW: Thank you. 24 JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments on 25 these rules up through 295?

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

Logueston Little by Ancie en 13 and consequent without objecting, only to the table of the cet and by roquenting, receber took appealing of equing, they thive any error in the challe. ್ಕರ್ಷನ್ಯ ಇತ್ತನ್ನು ಕಾರ್ಡಿಸಿದ್ದಾರೆಗಳು entity sight. The if no cay is the line of the that of the seton "vissife it is at don over new to some boy acmabon, concret you interpret the aromebody har got to eacht it." In if I wole the triot fudges, " think I would be even lore 0.5 or ha mine, secundo T think if the lawyer ongul, 7.5 "The core, success to don't here how to seemb ." 5 ... 1 thet tains ---FUGTICE ISCIT: A good Lany have 15 r itten, so -- end their volume are being start. i. r contraga, empett : -- and when the rul says cor, lither or nonconthiance forsn't 7 1 affect a waiver of the objections wat the guy 35 then baker, T think you can hook the judge with  $\cap f$ the dile, wa. " at's all I have. 10 JUSTICE FORES: TEAR FORES r <: Professes. S ... Bernthen Birdhone: Thank you. project trung: Game, can ente on-

the deal of the extending 2050

# CLINARD HANBY,

2 3

5

17

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. HANBY: I'm Clinard Hanby from Houston, and I came to watch and wasn't planning on saying anything, but after the last gentleman raised the issue, I decided to come and say something.

It's really between a rock and a hard place. The current system under these rules is intolerable. I -- I consider myself an extremely technical lawyer, and I frequently can't figure out when a party is required to object and when a party is required to submit a -- an instruction or a definition or an issue in substantially correct form in order to preserve error. But I'm not sure whether going to just "all you have got to do is object" is the right solution to the problem. It is a major problem.

There are a lot of legitimate errors

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

÷.	Taken in dealth e was an orthograph of mileson	,
	ໂດຍ <b>ເອ</b> ະ <b>ອ</b> ະຖຸ ຂອງຄຳພາຍ ພາກ ຄອງຄົວລວນ ຮູ້ປະຊຸດສຸດສຸດພົມພິນກ	
กลแย่ง	ebungan to Beaus Bulas of divil Beasedures	Š
Sa or	ಿಗಳು ಇವರ ಗಿತ್ತಾ ಅತಿಕರ್ತಿಯ ಗಾರವಾಗ ಗಾರು ಸಂಪರ್ಧಿಸಿದ ಕಾರ್ಯವಾಗಿ ಗಾರು	3
	divil Trifonco, chrief an Lollower:	;

on aging anghing, the Transcription density on care and anghing on caying anghing, but after the last rentia on the start and after the last rentia on the start and a second of the start and and a second of the start and a sec

7

It's really between a rock and a 77. 5 hard place. The current explon unler book Ţ rused to intelerable. " -- I consider Tydes ar autre: ely technical "ergor, and " frequent' v ., t o sit dicure but chos a certy o required to 7.7 "Sect and when a party is required to outself 0.5 a -- an irrtruction or r dofinition or an issue ٦, ٢ in duistantia y a preud form in cutur to 17.0 galog redisodu esus des min dut la como ev recons . . . to just "will you have job to do it ligoth" to  $S^{\pm}$ on at the subtree of the this relation adds of the co 80 . oldan achar 1. 1.

్ములు కూడా అయినా సమీమ్లు - జైల్ కాట్లు కాట్లు అని కూడా అని కైన్

that occur that are waived on some kind of a technicality, and we're supposed to be trying to promote substance over form sometimes. But if I were doing recommendations, my recommendation would be to treat these rules the way you treated many of the other rules, which is: you change the rule -- for example, Rule 166b in the case law -- you have always rewritten the rule to conform with what the case law is. The major problem here is that when a party needs to object and when a party needs to submit, you can't tell by reading the rule. 13 And my recommendation to the Court 14 would be to rewrite the rule and spell out that 15 if it's part of your case, or an instruction

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that you are relying on, you have to submit it in substantially correct form. If it's the other guy's case, there is something he is relying on, an objection suffices, and spell that out one, two, three in the rule.

Now, I haven't written a proposed rule for the Court, but --

JUSTICE HECHT: With a general charge, however, that becomes increasingly difficult, for some language in the charge is

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

က်ကမုတ္တရား မေးကတ္ထားသည်တွာက အခါရာလကာသည် က မွတ္တာက

. Olima of the state of the sta

7.6

Caracop a cata contract to the contract of the

cs diagge, hogover, that premus facrecaingly of fight school darguage in the charge of

<u>.</u>

٠.

almost in the middle. Both sides --

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. HANBY: That's true. Things like if you are objecting to the definition of "proximate cause," for example, and saying it should be producing cause in this case, then there may be issues that relate to both, which the solution may be to -- to say that any time it's an instruction, and it's one that you conceivably could be relying on, you have to -to give the judge a -- a copy of it.

But my -- my point is that the rule ought to be -- ought to specify when you have to object and when you have to request, rather than having to go to a lot of case law that is very confusing and very contradictory to try and figure that out.

And I think that whatever solution you come to on "when" is going to be better than the present system, and that I'm -- I'm kind of disinclined if you just go to everything as an objection, because that does -- that does have, as the last gentleman was saying, a lot of potential for sandbagging the judge, although you have eliminated some of that by putting in the rule about hiding your objection amongst --

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The management of the second o er aligner and alternation of the Afile to you early of patrict on the doubter the offer " rocktante winso," io. enakjik, eni naring it. edeat speciments are no in this ecosy thou the claw to the read a that willed to both, which of the cultures on may be to see the block that there 7 ible of inchipation and ible one that you consecte this party for the political year fixed as to the the fulle after a sec y of it. 7.7 but my -- iy point is that has wie f r anght to so -- ourly no esectly when you have ta 2.7 ebred sud when you have to request, rather than Seving to yo to a lot off dasc for that is very ornfaming and vory control subory to try and figure that out. 2.2 And I think that whatevor nourtherin i regard to on "when" in coing to be better than 0.5 and with a tropic and the care the training and the and the state of the you just to even this and the <u>ي ر</u> objaction, haduate tast coes -- thut lock have  $-J \subseteq$ To dit a spation can have itselfan does life to ~ c potential for corplacy ing the justice, shorted will have distribed oreme of that he within the

-- In does a disposition as you have to be to be early

. .

1	amongst a bunch of frivolous objections.
2	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: As I
3	recall, the committee tried to write a rule such
4	as you mentioned, and it was after trying to
5	write that, that they came up with this side
6	to
7	MR. HANBY: They gave up.
8	JUSTICE HECHT: We couldn't agree
9	about what the law was.
10	Any other questions for Mr. Hanby?
11	Mr. Hanby, would you fill this out,
12	please, and hand it to the lady in the back
13	before you leave?
14	MR. HANBY: Thank you, Your Honor.
15	JUSTICE HECHT: Who else on this
16	group of rules?
17	MR. McMAINS: Your Honor, it
18	JUSTICE HECHT: Yes.
19	
20	RUSSELL McMAINS,
21	appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in
22	administrative session to consider proposed
23	changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas
2 4	Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of
25	Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

۲.

$oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$ and $oldsymbol{eta}$	۲.
TO BE TO BE TO BE SEEN OF THE	
ಇದರು ಸಿಕ್ಕರ ಇದು ಮಹಿಳಿದ್ದಾರೆ ಕಾರಿಗಳು ಅವರ ಪ್ರಕಾರಿಗಳು ಅವರ ಪ್ರಕಾರಿಗಳು ಪ್ರಕಾರಿಗಳು ಪ್ರಕಾರಿಗಳು ಪ್ರಕಾರಿಗಳು ಪ್ರಕಾರಿಗಳು ಪ	•
an you not blontes and it we water triking te	•.
ទារិ ២ ព្រះស៊ីម៉ា ប៉ុន្តិ . ១០ ១០១២ មួយ ប៉ុស្ ១០១៦ មូន១០០ ១០១២»	5.
equipate tod : Yaran .em	7
rung d <mark>im</mark> g works to the same of the	i,
÷ាល់ស្រាស់ នៅ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស	`
ಕ್ರಾರಿ <b>ಗರ</b> ್ . ್ ಇಂಟ ನಗರಸಿಕೆಟಗಳು ಅಂತರ ಇತ್	ខ្ម
្នាប់មន្ត្រីម៉ាន់ ប៉ុន្តែ បានស្គាល់គ្នា ស <b>ត្</b> បូរីកាប់ប៉ុន្តាប៉ុ	<u>.</u>
ಮೇ ನನ್ನ ಅಂದರ್ಥ ಆನ್ರೆ ಇನೀತನ್ನ ಅನೆ <b>ತ್ ಅನ್ನ</b> ನಿರ್ದೇಶಕ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರಗಳು ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರಗಳು	er
Seva	٠,٣
a. Tomor word took word Your Const.	<u> </u>
ရာ 'd ແຮ မရာပီဝ စု'က :၏: ၁၈၅ မရာ ၏ ၏ (ပ	17 m
లోటులు, టార్మ్ మీ <b>ర్</b> స్థాణాగాన్న	₹, €
3° tuono auer :0.maer .cm	;; •
CONTRACTOR CONTRACTS	o.c
	? f,
AD CIDE ACCOUNT	19.70 1
នេះខែលាល ឃើញ បាន ទី២២០២០ ខែលេខក្នុងមើល ១៩៤០០១៤៣១៤៤ ក្នុងនៃសមាន ១០	r,
အကြေးသည္မရာကို သည့္ သို႔လည္း ကုန္းနည္း ကိုအလည္း ကိုန္းကို သည့္သည့္သည့္သည့္ ကိုအစီး လည္း	ci
ರಾ <b>ರ್ ಇಂಗಾ</b> ಅಧಿಕಾರ ಬೆಳಗಳ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ ಬಿಡಿಗಳಿಗೆ	?
್ ಇರ್.ಇ. ರಾಜ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಿಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಿಮಿಕ್	* p*
ူး မေးသေလာက္ ကိုလုတ္သည့္ သည္သည္ လည္းသည္။ မေရးတြင္းကို နီးမတ္တြင္းမွာ သည္။ မူးသည္သည့္ ကိုလုတ္သည့္ သည္သည့္ သည္သည္ မေရးတြင္းသည္။ မရုတ္သည္ သည္သည့္ သည္သည့္ သည္သည့္သည့္ သည္သည့္သည့္ သည္သည့္သည	;. <b>^</b>

MR. McMAINS: May it please the Court, I'm Russell McMains from Corpus Christi; and apparently I'm appearing in defense of the Supreme Court Advisory Committee under assault by the academic community, which, actually, we have our share of academics on the committee, and they couldn't come up with a better rule, either.

The fact of the matter is -- and I think I really wanted an opportunity to talk with the rest of the members of the Court, because I am assuming that there is much pressure from the trial bench, privately in the halls and judicial conferences, and whatever, with regards to, you know, massive alterations of the rules.

And, of course, as Justice Hecht recalls, there was some fairly vocal opposition when we passed the rule in the Supreme Court Advisory Committee, anyway, by some members of the judiciary that were there: Justice Peoples, for instance, and yourself, for that matter; you expressed some reservations. And so I knew that it was going to be hotly debated.

And for us who do appear in the back

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

24	(# "TE Coatt to the Cotto (o) then
	್ರಾಗ್ನ ಗಾರ್ಕ್ ೩ ಅದ ನಿರ್ಣ ಕಡಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ಆರ್. ಅದಿರು ಕರ್ತಿಯಿತ
\$ <b>.3</b>	The incommon stance of the particle in the particle of the
) ( )	the factolary that were there. Sathand Societies
~ ~ ·	្រុងស្គ្រប្រ. គ្នា 💯 💯 (ស្គ្រប់ ស្គ្រប់ 🐧 (ស្គ្រប់ ស្គ្រប់ ស្គ្រប់ ស្គ្រប់ 🔊 (ស្គ្រប់ ស្គ្រប់ ស្គ្រប់ ស្គ្រប់ 🔊
i 🗸	တည္ၿပီး ေျပာသလည္း ညွာေျကာက္ေတ့မွာ ျပည္သည္ေတြ ဥယၥာင္ေ
f '	sealing there has some Catriw week buyes to
î â	រីកាល់, កាត់ ៤១សក្សាស្និ ណ.) សិស្តមុំខែក វី១២សៃ
fv.	ж ( - Т) <b>с</b> - Лит <b>с</b> р •
: <u>-</u>	nith wear is the year though accelled offerthing
: <b>\</b>	[some crossadian derionant end whateve .
, 3	then we ame the total poses, priviled in the
	The brook of the arrest of the tension of the tree of
l	स्कृतिक है। एक इसके एक समाव है। इसके उत्तर है
•	which is the might cantach consequence by the following $oldsymbol{e}_{i}$
**	ုန္မာ ရွိနာန္မာ လည္း လက္သည္သည္။ မမ္းမည္း ျ
<b>C</b>	<b>3</b> ( ) 4 ( ) 2 *
•,	which is $p(x) = \mathbf{c} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , then $\mathbf{c} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , then $p(x) = \mathbf{c} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , which is $p(x) = \mathbf{c} \in \mathbb{R}^n$
	្តាស្រុក (Cub ) (Cub ) (Cub ) បាន បានក្រុមបណ្តាល (Cub ) ដូច្នេះ ១០១២ ក្រុមប្រទេស
	or the condense of the form and contact to the contact
<b>\</b>	हुम रा <b>टाल ए</b> वम हे एवंद्रह्मा के एक गामुक्किया मान्य र संस्थान रहे
ن	ម្នាក់ ស្រស់ សេស្ត្រី ្រូក មេ ម៉ែល សុខស ខ្លាប់ «ទួក្សស់ ខេត្ត ស្ត្រ
• ,	standard and the court was the more than the same
ï	

THE DOLL BUT IS 30 HERREY TO SPOKE WAS

.. 1

have to request.

rooms and chambers to -- and called in frequently at the last moment for objecting purposes, preservation purposes, and to attempt to wrestle with and get the case submitted at least the best way you can, the one area that is unclear in our rules by virtue of the injection of the movement to the general charge is the principle question of -- under our current rules -- when do you have to object, when do you

And now the Corpus court, two months ago, in the Valero (phonetic) versus National Union case, has held for the second time that you have to do both or suffer waiver. Now, frankly, with all due respect to our Court, I do not believe that anybody interprets the rule, nor can it be legitimately read, to require you to do both at the same time. It may not be clear which one you do have to do, but it doesn't require that you do both of them.

On the other hand, every academic and every person in this room that has spoken at seminars, of which there are probably 30 or 40, on the charge always say to the practitioner:

"When in doubt, do both." So now the Courts of

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

- the commert to the first court to the first court to goding of the first state and action goding of the granders, researched accesses the true and the court to goding the state at the state of the state of the concentration of the state of the concentration of the state of the concentration of the state of the state
- ind now the Corpus court, two wouther 55 note that is a new (phonetic) versus Entioned 0.7 Union rate, her hold for the second time that , P. E. you are o to do do! or suffer vaivor. "our 7. J The high sath sail cur respect to suc Conre. This not believe to it auginer, round to be united to. - nor can it be legitimated, roud, to so wire you 4. to an both of the came lime. I has not to alear which can you do have to have but it 1. - spear to the that you for other at the as-0.5 In the other nem, evely academic
- nn the other asm, every academic that the same, every academic of the control of

Appeals have picked up on it and require that you do both, which is the worst of all possible worlds, if there is some divergence.

Now, I disagree respectfully with Professor Muldrow with regard to his contention that you have the ability as a lawyer to sandbag the judge in terms of, say, "I'm not going to do something that I actually want in the charge; I'm just going to sit back and object to it, and I don't have to tell you how to do it, because I just don't know."

We have included in the definition of "objection" what the court has -- what the courts are already saying and have said is the standard for an objection. It must be clear as to what your legal grounds of complaint are, and how to fix it.

Now, if the objection that you make is not good enough to identify to the judge or the party litigant's attorney, the other parties, as to how to fix it, you can't figure it out, there is not going to be any reversible error. That objection is not good enough, and it is not going to be preserved.

We did take out, and we intended to

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

Example of the more supported to the state of the second state of the second	••
ကြည်အနေတကျည်။ ကြို့ကို သောကာကသေး လည်းသို့ လုံးကို ကျောင်းလည်း လုံးကြုံသည်။	44
· copyonic will so and some so the got last	a
earth Allegabodeon octobrog (* ** c)	ķ
್ ಕರ್ನಾರಕ್ಷಣದ ಸಂಸ್ಥೆ ಆನ್ನೆ ಸಹ್ಮ ಅಥಾ ವಿಶೇಷಿಸಿ ಪ್ರಾಣ ಕಟ್ಟಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಇಳು ಇಲ್ಲಾಗಳಲ್ಲಿ	17
ు ఆడుకు అంది. అన్నులు గ్రామం ఇక్కు నట్లు అందుకే కాంట్లో కో	* 1,
சுசி நாக்குற இரு வ <sup>ந்து ந</sup> ிரும் இரு நில நாற்ற நடித் குறு நடித் கடித்	Ĺ.
ន្ទារៈ គឺ២ ១៨៦ ៩៦ ៩០៤៦ ឡូវ ១៩ <b>៩១</b> ៤០ មិក្សាថា ១៩៦,000 ០១	<i>,</i> ,
ကို မွန်း မက သီးအသည်လို့ မကားသည်လောင်း သည်။ <del>စကား ကျည်မြော့ သီးအကြို့ သွင်း</del>	•
ా నా చిత్రంలో ఇదా కారాడు కార్యాలో ఉంది. ఆడ్ కాటుంట్ కా	0.0
ត្រូវបាលសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុខ នៅក្នុងសុ	£.f
apidia uok odd as ipumitan pand a	•
ខណ្ឌ ទី១ បែ 🖚 ១១០ ក់ក្រុម ១០០០ ជាក្នុម ១០០០ ជាក្នុម "គេក្រុម» ក្រុម 🖫	
ede th Olsa cent Car agia each of are thate	% <i>P</i> .
acente, i not an objection. " the for daily	03 - 00 7 - 3
ಾ ಬಹುಕ ಹಿಡುಕಿಸುತ್ತಿದ್ದಾರು. ಇತ್ತು ಇಂದಿ ಬಹುಕ್ಕು ಕೆಲ್ಲಿ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ ಕಾರ್ಯ	<b>č</b> /
.di territari	∇.r.
ాక్షా - <b>ఆ</b> గ్రా ప్రాంతి ఉంది. ఎంది చేశా అయిన క్షేమ్ - ఇంగా	1.
င်က မ စား၌ ရက်ခံ မက ကာလိုင်းသည် လည်း စားသီး ရီလေလျက်သည် မချို့သော့ သည်။ ကျောင်း	
ស ណ័រ១ ស្ទីជី «ស្គ ៤ និសិស <b>ស"្វាស់ "ទីក្</b> រី" ស្តីស្គ សណ្ឋា	0
ವಶಕ್ಕಾರ್ ಕ್ರಮ ಹಾಡಳ ಕನ್ನೆ ಮನೆಗೆ ನ್ಯ ನಕ್ಸ್ ಎನ್ ಎನ್ ಕರಣಸನೆಯಲ್ಲಿ	* (`

take out, the principles of invited error that 1 2 had been applied in circumstances where as two lawyers are tussling, trying to find out some 3 4 middle ground to submit cases that we may not have pattern jury charges on -- and -- and the 5 way things are going, may never have on some of 7 them -- when you are tussling on that issue, 8 then the question that comes to mind is: shouldn't you have a right to try and do the 10 best you can with the issues going to be 11 submitted against you without having to worry 12 about somebody coming back later on and saying, "Well, you invited the submission of that issue, 13 14 you requested it, it's right there in the charge 15 conference, your name is on it, and you said do 16 it this way," when, in truth, what you are saying is, "If you're going to do it to me, do 17 18 it this way"? 19 And the opportunity to wrestle with 20 21

22

23

24

25

the charge first is a recognition of the pragmatic operation of the charge practice, which is that one side or the other, or both, do, in fact -- will give requests to the judges.

Most of the time the plaintiff and defendant will both come with a complete charge.

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

in distriction in the country of the	+
out to see a constitutor of the self-constitution.	
who due only or solve, all the end of the	^
ាលថា មួយ១៩១ និងនៅជា (១១១៦ ភាក់ ១៩១១ ១៩១៦ ១៩១១ ១៩១១	۸.
at the one as the area of the continue of the	,
To real moneyale veneral continues and provide a continue of	
engas eris na ja nadu dza oz nadu detu	·.
ស្នាន ខាង គមិន «ជា គ្នាសេស ជាគ្នានេះ ដែលមិន អស់វិទ្ធាស្នា ស្រាប់ ស ប្រ	
and the getting the direct a time of the call	
သည် နေအို မွန်စေက လက္ကာရာရှိ မော်သိုင် လည်းမေး ကျော်သည်။ မောင်းမေးမြောင်းမေးမြောင်းမေးမြောင်းမေးမြောင်းမေးမြော	<i></i>
possibled as after you subtract herday to see go	P :
The Targette no medal double pair on y collect duelo	<b>~</b> ]
"To we you invited the manual manual that were seen	٠. ١
್ಲಾರ್ಡ್ ಅತ್ಯೆಗಳ ಅತ್ಯಾಪ್ತಿಕ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳಿಕೆ ಒಳಕು ಅರ್ಥ ಪ್ರಾಸ್ತಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ	i
લાકેટલ ભારણ સાલ્લ ເ <sup>27</sup> કે હતું કહેલા પ્ <b>રાવધ પ્રાવ</b> ભ કે કે પ્રાથમ કે લાક	€.3
್ರಗ ಚರಾಜ್ಯ ಹಿರುಮೇಗು ಕೃತಿಕ್ರಾಗಿ ಮತ್ತು ಕೊಡ್ಡುಗಳು ಅತ್ಯ ಕೃತ್ತಿಗಳು	
no you on at all of the order of all the to the	<b>:</b>
	ì
The also orthogodo do un undado alvio	· •
కటిళ్ నిర్ణుత్స్ <mark>గారం</mark> లలా గ్రామం ఉంది. ప్రామానకు అంది.	1, *
များများကို ပြုံသော ကြောက်သည်။ သည်သော သို့ကောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည် ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်	<u>.</u>
ကုန်လ အက 📢 ကိုသည် မေတာက်ကို ၁၀ ဝက်ခံအ မြောက် အား ကို တို့အား အကြောင့်	S
్రామా, గాశ్రీ అంట ఉందేటంగాలుందా ఉళ్ళి చెక్కల —— చేరుంట్లో ఉంది.	76 / 1 1 a
្នា មាន ខ្លុស់ក្រុម ១០១ ១៤៤២ ១៩៤ និង ៤១៩៣	•
్. ఇంది లెక్టిందిన సంగా <del>త్రి కొన్నారు. మందిన మందిన నిర్మామంలో మందిన మందిన మందిన మందిన మందిన మందిన మందిన మందిన మందిన</del>	

The idea expressed by the trial judges that you 1 2 are going to show up with no charge is really fairly preposterous to those of us who show up 3 in the trial court and have to look a judge square in the eye and tell him that we don't 5 have our questions ready, despite the fact that 6 7 we are required to do so. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: 8 In fairness, as a former trial judge, I will say 10 there's a surprising number of cases that 11 lawyers do not present you with any charge --MR. McMAINS: I understand that. 12 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- and 13 14 point to the rule that it's the trial judges, 15 and I have stayed up late at night --MR. McMAINS: I understand that, 16 17 Your Honor. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- doing 18 19 the best I can, and, of course, the penalty is, 20 under our current rules, that their appeal is going to be pretty.... 21 MR. McMAINS: And the odds are their 22 charge isn't going to be too good, either. 23 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, we 24

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

have a little more --

25

	-
ార్క్ కార్ ఇక్కుకున్న కార్కట్ని ప్రాటక్ట్రాయ్ ఉంది. ఆటిక్ ఆటిక్	`
ైక్ మాడుకే కి. తారు. కార్క్ కుండి కి. కి. కార్యం దేశాల్ ఉంది. క్లోక్ కోట్ల	?
កក្នុងស្គ្រី ១ ជាខែមាន ការី ០៥៦៩ ខែ២៩ ខែ២៩២ និង១៩២ និង១ ខែ	
ကို မေျာက် အကြား မေးကိုသို့သည်။ ကြောင်းသည် အကြားအောက်သည်။ မေးကိုသည် မေးကိုသည်။ မေးကိုသည်။	*!
do d de 1 valé villjas 🦏 kost adelikase kir. evil	.,
• ( )	***
the form the comment of the man	••
the State of State Control of the Co	4
volt terms Declar massible time scattering	r.
ကာက စစ္ကာကရုံသို့ ကိုအားက လွန်နိန္နဲ့ အချိန္ အချိန္သာသည်။ လွန္နာက လုံးသည္ အချိန္သည့္ ကိုလွန္	.\$
.មិនសិទី ប៉ុន្តែសិស (សេសស្មា X ) :8 ស.ស.ស.ស	<i>(</i> *
Note that the second of the se	,
	•
	<del>*</del> ;
si in benefaro, an " et time .	*
The second secon	÷
griso 🕶 eta vari eta sun entra sonta so	· ·
្នាន់ ឬជាវិទ្ធាធាល្អ ប្រាក់ ខ្លាស់ ២ ២ ខែ ខ្លាស់ធាន ១ ១២ ១ ២៤០១ ១ ២	
లో కొన్నాడు. అవ్నవి వికామం ఉక్ <b>రువు</b> కు కొండుకు కూటా కాటల కాక్రామ	<b>ፉ</b> ን
•••• ကြို့ကို ကြိုင်း မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။ မြို့သည်။	ŗ ·
್ರಾ ) ರವಣ ಇಳಿವರ ಅವರ ಸಹ್ :MET&JET .:T	i,
∙్ విమామ్ర బొనకు కుంత కార <b>్నావి</b> కుండ్నార్ చేకింది. ఈ కానణింది	e (
र १ (विकिट्ट) १००० महाराष्ट्र १९५० भू <b>म</b> १९ ५ <mark>०</mark>	<i>u</i> 2 ·
en en la grand production de la grand particular de la grand particu	1

MR. McMAINS: Because if the other 1 side -- I mean --2 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: I resent 3 4 that. MR. McMAINS: I'm talking about 5 attorneys with the other side jumps in and helps 6 you. It is a problem when neither side is 7 8 prepared. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Yeah. 9 10 Well, that happens --MR. McMAINS: And I understand that. 11 12 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- on more 13 than you would suspect. 14 MR. McMAINS: But I think that -- I 15 think -- you know, and obviously the real 16 problem -- if we want to get down to that problematic, is that the trial courts don't have 17 18 independent legal assistants in terms of staff 19 attorneys or clerks running around by which they 20 can sort any of this out anyway, which is 21 what -- the benefit the federal courts have. But frankly, I think, 22 23 pragmatically -- and this was the consensus of 24 the committee, as Your Honor will remember, as 25 he was there, is that there really is ample

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

... .

*/ 14	in the character of the $oldsymbol{th}$ that $oldsymbol{th}$ the $oldsymbol{th}$
J' v	F - John Trans & B Mont Louis Light Kending to the
4	That is quest, $X$ == the approximation for constant. On
<i>એ</i> <b>અ</b>	
	សាសសា 🗝 🚓 🚓 ្សាសាស្ត្រ ក្នុងស្រាស់ ស្រាស្ត្រ និងស្រាស់ 🧸 ប្រធានាធិប្ប
+/ \u	್ರಾರ್ಥ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ಷಮಿಸಿಕ ಪ್ರಾನಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿ ಪ್ರಾನಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕ್ಕಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಿನಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಾನಿಕೆ ಕ್ಷಿನಿಕೆ ಕ್
	စနားများလည္း မရ အန္းမွားေပး ကေသာန္ၿပီး စုပ္တာ့မွားက လံုးေနာက္မွာလည္း လ
a ()	incolon cat form nopictiate from a of othis
۵. د	restances of the testing triple of the contract of the second
а	್ಷಾರ್ಯಾಗಿ ಕಾರ್ವಿಸಿಕ್ಕೆ ಗಾರು ಬ್ಯಾಪ್ ಪ್ರಭಾವಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಪ್ರಭಾವಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಪ್ರಭಾವಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಪ್ರಭಾವಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಪ್ರಭಾವಿಸಿಕ
e tr	thank Lon proma on the oner to con-
i Ç	for the remarks the salable stop 1
2.5	f GB 408 C Mg Can thap*
	construction with the management of the second state of the second
a :	$p_{ij}$ . The $p_{ij}$ $p_{i$
. <b>v</b>	and the second of the second o
Ç.	A stable of a same of a more and a market of the market of the same of the sam
	FIGURE 1 CONTRACTOR OF THE STATE OF THE STAT
è.	်နေရင်း မြန်မာတို့မှ ရေး ကိုလုပ်လျှင်းမှ ပညာမျှနောင်း စာများသို့သည်။ မြန်မာတို့မှ မြန်မာတို့မှ
ei.	thouseness with the earlier rates in the course of
9 	The ARTHER STREET
·,	
ij	Common address and all the common of the second
e d	, <sup>10</sup> , 10a0
	* the light to the second production

power -- if nothing else, by moral persuasion of the trial judge -- to get the assistance of the lawyers with regards to putting together the best you can do. But you still need to be in a position for the protection of your client's interest to object to it. The fact that you agree that to the extent it's going to get done to you, this is what it is, you still need a vehicle to object to it.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The second problem of trying to incorporate or complete requests in terms of requiring those on a regular basis is it's altogether unclear, as Your Honor has pointed out, as to whose burden it is under the current rule, because basically your request obligation is in all cases of definitions instructions, and then the question of a question is as to whose burden it is. Well, the problem is that many, many defenses, as well as claims, are being presented in the course of the instructions now. And if you literally apply our -- our principles where that, in fact, a general charge is given to where basically all of the theories of grounds of recovery and defense are presented in, more or less, one or two questions with all

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The interest to the test with the set of the වෙන්න සිත තමය ජනා වසර රාජ්ත වනු මෙම සස වෙන්නු විශ්යාජ වෙන්නු වෙන්න and the second temperature and the second of the party was a ಗಾಗಿ 90 ನಡೆ ಹಿಂದಾಗ ನಿನೀತ ಅಂತರ ಅಂತರ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷಣ ಅಂತರಣಕ್ಕೆ in the property of the control of the control of - May down 98 € 5 10 10 € 68 68 68 64 980 678 or observed alog of the far far of their dead on a in these files, was set in the first in the second

.d' .d down or or theory

् **ग**्

j, r

(\*) F

1

€ ₹

₹ ?

, ,

`` የ

10

...

্ <u>ে</u>

.

₹ ..

and party 20 of the meters of the ్షాల్ గున్నాయి. ఇక్ సహిగ్రాజులు - కాండ్రిక్ ఇంత్రిక్ అత్తున్నారి. ఇంత్రిక్ కాండ్రిక్స్ కాండ్రిక్స్ కాండ్రిక్స్ and the contract of the property of the second of the contract ់ទាន់ជារំខេញ ខណៈក៏ ឃុំពេញ ឃុំពេញ ១ 📢 ១ ១១១ ឃុំ១ វូវ ១១១២១ 🥫 🥫 and so to to might be the set of the control of the control and the ables described and gradient consisted specialist The in a case of decirations instructions of condition of he had notenously to be relatively out to with and the ្នុប្រធន្ធ ប្រជាទី ១៦ ១១១១៩ ១៩៦ ភូមិ១៩ ១៩៦ ១៩ ១៩ ១៩ ១៩ cated or constate on the one endanglet as concenter in the doping of the instructions ago. గారం పల్లోన్నా ఇదాల ఈఈ కారాల సమీదలను కూడి కారాలనికి కా**ర్లు** చ్యేతింది. ್ಯಾಕ್ ೬ ಕ. ವಾಡದಲ್ಲಿ ದಶ್ರಕ್ತ ಪರ್ಕಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಡಿ. ಇಲ್ಲಾಗಿತ ರಾಜನಗಳ

నివ దూరి గ్రామం నిమి నీత్రగ్రామం కాని చూడి తార్కారు.

is defined the  $oldsymbol{o}^{\frac{1}{2}}$  . Here is the transfer and sets the constant  $oldsymbol{e}_{i}$  ,  $oldsymbol{e}_{i}$ 

To decide the contract of the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

19

10

11

12

13 14

1.5

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

of the involved legal principles involved in the instructions, both parties have the obligation to fix those instructions right and to sub -- and to correct -- tender in substantially correct form.

And the problem is that it doesn't save any time to require a request, because if you are going to tender it before trial, the odds are some of it's going to be in there anyway, in which case you have duplicative material in there and you've got to go back and recraft the request or else you have encumbered it with material that's already going to be in the charge. So you wind up in technical violation of the rule, as the Court is well aware, in the Posencio (phonetic) case which I had presented to the Court, that if there is a basis by which the trial court has a reason to say, "I'm not going to submit that," whether it's duplicative, whether it's already in there, or whether it is technically wrong, arguably in some respect, even if nobody pointed it out, then the definition of "substantially correct" has extended to mean, well, there is no error, and not give it; whereas in reality the

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

I STATE OF STREET OF THE PROPERTY OF THE STREET OF THE STR inch parions - back or third known in the coloration one of the and Gran All the engagement at another that we can ard to correct -- topics in rebetantial y The state of the s and the perbada in that it as no nin The same bine or required a reserve of bod most file ۴. ven are er mild touder it if to till, the orodia i con ed geton nici Ju omen oro need contact to the contact of the contact of the contact of PF Sea don' or od der avisag imp oleda et feinodem , , , receinib tea magnera on alta gar com distinction 0.5 the material Metha thready doing to be in the charge. To you wind up in technical. 3.5 vislation of the rule, on the first is well ē 1 oware, a the Pesendie (thettie) hase thirt had promoted by the darking that the first of a ್ರಾಟ್ಟ್ ಗ್ರೋಗಿಗೆ ಕರ್ಣಿಸಿ ಕರ್ನಾಗಿ ಆಯುಬರ ಬರು ಸಂಪರ್ಧಿಗಳ new, "" not going to with thet," where 7. The interpretation of access of the reducing a property of the comments of the er thether it is rechnisatly urons, as ye in aowe consect, oven if nebely cultred it out, 0.0 then the lefter blos of "interactintial ty cir inth 0.0 fig intended to the vent will, where it no traces \* \*\*

out griden at an easy this gip day in

objection process should be where we think -- I think the consensus of the committee was we needed to do one or the other and that the objection process, I agreed, was easier. And that was really one of the theories: that it ought to be a little easier to know what you have to do to protect your client's rights.

JUSTICE HECHT: Do you think the proposed change favors one side of the case?

MR. McMAINS: I really do not; I really do not; I really do not. I do not believe that -- that either side has an advantage under the current rules. I think there is an equal degree. And I represent both sides periodically, whoever might be in trouble on any given case, and there are disadvantages to plaintiffs and defendants under the current practice. There are disadvantages to plaintiffs and defendants under the new rule with regards to what might happen to you.

But I really think that the new rules that we have proposed by -- are just primarily more notice of what is actually required of the lawyer in order to preserve his appellate complaint, and less concern about the fact that he is running around with these dual

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

. . . .

```
movemental of production of almost the second includes the
     w asw outsides odi it asum deco off fated
      ned of to do and in the other and that Ho
   objection codest; the washing analysis and
   the control of the car of the thoughters that it
   orgina to le a liation desied to know that was
    Lave to early concert your chiantin cirbbs.
                                                              7
    edd (अधेकी प्रवाह e' :शाक्रमा प्रकार करें
                                                              • 7
   Source at the aria one appear one the opening
                                                              1
   T. .. dr. Trini. I ros by de net; "
                                                              e r
   ការ 1 កក់ សីខាស្ថា ១២ និង១៩ ជាមាន ស ា នេះ រក់ឲ្ង សភា មុខនិង មេ បាន ប្រើប្រាស់
  ofthor alio har an obventage moles who current
                                                             CI
ng gulen. I think there in ourse to corect. An T
. oprosent betweender orientering, whoever tight
                                                             - <u>₹</u>, ₹
 in troubin or any given case, and diese and
ellasfrontsged to plaintiffe and defendant: under
                                                              7.
Chester on contractions where are Chaadvintages
                                                            7 -
to plaintiffs on refordable under the second
       ones, had not call adaption death our abusives dated
    not I roadly think that the non-
                                                             . . .
     ានប្រាក្សិ ១៩០ 🛨 gd មិនមេស្សស្រាប នេះ គឺនៃ ២០ នៅនៅនៅ ជា ហើយនា 🗀
                                                             F 24
      y first that a secondary executives the
                                                             00
ាក់ទី ១៩ ខេត្ត គ្នា ១៩ ខេត្ត នេះ ១៩៩ ១៩៩ ១៩៩ កែ ខេត្ត មាន
                                                             ~ _
originativista ancest o como interpolação e acesta por esta en acesta por esta en acesta por esta en esta en e
                                                             1 / m
 ារនាក់ បារាធានា បាក់ប្រាប់ ប្រារុប្រាប់ ក្នុងមិនសម្រេច ធ្វើ ក្រុម ជាសម្រែក នាងនេះ
```

functions of trying to get the charge the best way he can without somehow being claimed to have invited an area.

And I don't think it encourages sandbagging if the objection has to be specific enough to specifically object and to explain how to fix it, because if there is a technical defect, or just a wording defect, or something that can be added, that's going to be necessary to make the objection clear in order for it to be preserved.

On the other hand, if -- if what it is, is that you don't think the concept should be submitted, as I'm sure the Court is inundated with cases on good faith and fair dealing as -- as a theory of recovery -- now, as a defendant, if you are faced with an issue on good faith and fair dealing, and your position is in a particular context arising out of a loan transaction, or whatever, that that is not a legitimate theory of recovery.

Any system that requires you to start defining good faith and fair dealing as a prerequisite to making a complaint on appeal is a system that is unfair to that party, just like

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

the second of th	et.
$(x,y)$ he can vicious nemetros, sino costa $(a^{-1},a^{-1})$ to $(ax,y)$	•
inviter an ic.	c.
The Contest of the encourages	•
នាន់ព្យាសាស្ត្រីសេស្ត្រ នេះ ខា <b>១២១២១២</b> . ១៤ នៃខា ១៩ ២៩ ១៩ នេះ ១៩	
enores to apportioally object and so my aim io	
ee និដែរ នៃស ឯកពត៌បាន និង នេះ are និង គឺ ប្រាសារថៃស	۲.
್ರಿಕೆಟ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಾನ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಾನ್ ಕ್ರ	
ការ ស្តេចស្រុក ស ស្ត្រី ស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រី ស សុខ នេះ	* *
to selle bud neglection afore in erics afor bud in	· ,
• Downson sangersa	т <b>Г</b>
Cn the other hand, if il whet it	e •
in. if the yea cont to ind the concept should	• #
be aubmittend, as I'm sure the "ourt in inuncete	<b>N.</b> 5.
with ecues or prod fadia and lair dealing on	gr
es a theory of recovery now, as a defendable	ť
ina difek iser do emak de deku astel ene e jel	1.7
all dealine, one your soltion is in	( 7.
partitionier content over no ent of one as	o I
to lacking or catheran, the black in not a	to c
legisthate Chessy of greevers.	F 13
<b>០៨</b> ១៩៤ ខេ <b>ចជារាហ្</b> មាន ១១៩៨ <b>៥១</b> ៨៩ស្នេ ទូ <b>០</b> ភ	28 fe
t tori, conintro cood frith the Pote Cooling to t	Se
r systematic ee actions a double an appoint on appoint so	·. <b>(</b> •

a symbol smat is and it to the for the  $\gamma_{ij}$  from the  $\gamma_{ij}$ 

in terms of trying to characterize a defense that someone is wishing to urge is some kind of new defense.

To impose upon the plaintiff the burden to define a term that is used in a question is just unfair, and that is what the status of our current rules are, is that the definitions and instructions all have to be substantially requested, or else it's -- it's waived. And that doesn't make any sense. There should be an ability to object to it: "That's not a defense; that's not a ground of recovery, or legitimate theory of recovery," so that you can identify what it is that your complaint is without having to do the other side's work on those theories that you are resisting.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions of Mr. McMains?

Thank you, Mr. McMains.

MR. McMAINS: Thank you, Your Honor.

JUSTICE HECHT: Other comments on

this block of rules?

We -- with the Court's leave, we have a couple -- a couple of people to testify about the use of cameras in the courtroom which

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

တုိ႔ သို့သည်။ က ကက္ခိုက္ကန္အားများများများသည္။ ကို ကို ကို သို့သည္။ ကို	ŗ
Bould common to be the common of the common of the distance of the common of the commo	es.
now country.	
သည်တို့ မြောက်ကြောင်းမှု လေသည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည်။	٦
ស្ត្រាស់ ១០០ សេខ <b>ជាស្រុក</b> ខេត្ត ស្រុក សេខ	
ជាថា មាយសាយ ២៦ ជាក្រាប ១៦១ ៤១៥១៥២៨ ជាយាលក្រ ប៉ុន្តាការយ៉ា ១២៤	-
ನನೆದೆ ಚಿರಾಮನೆ ಇಸ್ತಿ ನಾರ್ಥರ ಪಟ್ಟಲಾಗಿ ನೀಡು ಬಳಗಾ ಹಿಡುಗಳು ಅಭಿವರ್ಷಣೆಗಳು	r., l
od od ovije ing amelikan domi kama napidiniko.	
್ <sup>ರಾಕ್ಸ್</sup> ಈ ರಿ <sup>ತಿ</sup> ತ್ತಿ ಅನ್ನು ಒಟ್ಟು ಪಾ <b>ತ್ರವಾದ್ಯ</b> ಅಂತರ ಕ್ರಾಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಾಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಾಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್	•
ాండ్లో ఉంది. ఇంది అనికర్ తోకట్ తోకట్లో కోడ్ చేస్తున్నారి.	F # 15
రిక్షామ్ కల్లు కారి తెలలెక్టెట్ నట్సిక్స్క్ ఇం అని సమ్యాంటిన	°.£
ត្រូវការ <b>ទ⊙២១៤ ដែល សំព្រះប</b> ាក្យ <b>១ ១០៣ ១</b> ១០០៩ ១០០៩១២១៤ ១ ១ <b>០</b> ៤	
reg doid on ".vaoveboo lo granda odocka još 🕬	2.5
enn ideatify must it in that your complicint is	Ŋ. F.
నడి మూతాల ద <b>ి</b> డిస్త్రింది అడ <b>ుకెడ</b> కట్రి <b>డ</b> ్ క కుడు. ఇదాడే తెబ్బాడ్కోక్ట	<b>~</b> nj •••
•೧೯೬೩ರ ಕ್ಷಣದ ಅವರ ೧೯೮೪ ಕ್ಷಣಕ್ಕೆ ಅಂತರ ಅಂತರ ಅವರ ಕ್ಷಣಕ್ಕೆ ಕ	- P
ាត់ ដែលប្រសាស្ត្រ បានដែល (100 - 100	Ţ. <b>f</b> ,
Suchors : The	
-cointen -st -post instit	Λ° ι'.
. norman gray tas de la cate no	( )
40 (51 ) 38 00 (80 ) 80 (80 ) 10 (80 ) 10 (80 ) 10 (80 )	<u>*</u> *
ళ్≎ కాగా మీట <b>పట్</b> టిన ఉన్నారి.	<b>?</b> ·
ර 1 .ටෙම්ලට් පිරවර්ගත්වී දක්ව .ක්ටේම පත රට	· ·
ရွယ်ကိုသိုင်လေတဲ့ ရည်း လ က က သန်လာ က သည် သွေး ⇔+ စုိ အမ္ဘာ က လာကာလေ	``, <b>;</b> •
on the properties at all analysis of the persons of the contractions.	•

have scheduling problems -- who have scheduling problems, and I know everybody has scheduling concerns --

at least one of those witnesses so that the press will grace us with their presence.

JUSTICE HECHT: We will go ahead and hear these, unless -- unless there's objection.

Mr. George?

# JIM GEORGE,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. GEORGE: I'm Jim George from

Austin. I represent KTBC-TV and other

television and broadcast companies on a regular

basis, and I'm here to support the proposal that

this court have the authority to allow truly

open proceedings to occur in this court in hope

that some day all of the courts in the state of

Texas will be authorized to have truly open

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ស្រុក្សាស្រុសស្រុស ស្រុស ក្រុម សម្រេច ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស្ស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុ	<u>F</u>
ైక్ గోత్తిందింది. గాణ్ గృత్త కారుకుండి గతπి కి. ఉంది. ఈ తటిక కా	•
concerna	• •
ស្តារ ព្រះស្រែក <b>«២</b> ជួយស្រែស សម្រាប់ <b>ស្រាប់ ក្នុ</b> ស់ក្រុ	, , , p
add fri . oa chapetiin baa - Ba aga tarat da	••
. ကောက္ခရာတည္။ လုန္ကာရီလို အမြားသြား မွမ္းကြက္ မွန္းသည္။ အစ္ကာက္ မွန္းသည္။ အစ္ကာက္မွန္းမွာ အစ္ကာက္မွန္းမွာ အစ္	7
ు. కా ప్రుప్పుకు తగ్గు ఉంది • కా. కాటా కార్డ్ కాటాకాళ్	•
.a. ໄສ່ຄວຽນໄດ້ ຄຳເ <b>ວດເລື່ອ ກ່ອວນັ້ນມີ ~~ a</b> ລຸມໄຊກ ຊຸລຸມ ທີ່ສື່ ເໝັນ	n
\$000±00° .₹™	
	3.5
VILLE TITE	S.L
್ ಸ್ಥಾನಕ್ಕು ಶಿವಕ್ರಿಸ್ಕ ಕೆಗಳ ನೇ ಇತ್ತಾರ ಆರಾಜಕ ಇತ್ತಿ ಇರುತ್ತದೆ ಸ	t: J
n thinton of the country to be despised of proving	e r
esacom , saubement l'ivit de messer describé de legal de	۴۴
rassa of Appaliate Dragodare, and Wisher Rules or	19 F
ninty ty Twines are a tabled as 2010ets:	» <u>,</u> r
	Li
ರ್ಣಕ್ಕೆ <b>ಎ</b> ಹಿಸಲಾಗಿ ಬಿ.ಗಿ ಚಿ.ಗಿ ಕಿ.ಗಿ ಕಿ.ಗ	Ç.F
ಸಹಾಯಿಕರು ಅವರ <sup>ಕ್ಷಾ</sup> ಕ್ಕಾರಿಯಲ್ಲಿ ಹೆಚ್ಚುರುತ್ತಿರು. ೧೯೯೩ ಕೆಯುಗಳು	^ <u>f</u>
ຕິຜ <b>ິດ</b> ທີ່, ຕິ <b>ວກ</b> ຕານ ໄດ້ກາຄຄ <b>ປະຕິບ</b> ປອມ ຈານສັດປະຕິບ <i>ປະຕິ</i> ຊີບຸກ	
leutes and the Lore to the test the exercise which	**
មួយស្នេក ពេលពីការ ស្ថា ក្រៅពីពេទ្យដែកការ កាម៉ាស់ ស្សានាស្រី ឯកមានស ១១ ដែ	i.,
្រុក ប្រជាជា ស្រាម <b>្នាក់ ខ</b> ុស្ស ស្រុក	7.0
that come dry all is the courts in the chate of	ē <b>?</b>
The transfer of the first of th	<b>=</b> 0

proceedings.

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

As the court is aware, most states in this country, and I believe over 40, allow electronic communications to broadcast or telecast, in some manner, their proceedings. They -- if you go to Florida or California or New York or Illinois, or most every place else in the country, the current technology allows nonobtrusive, nonobstructive communications by broadcast medium of what goes on in the courts.

And in Texas we have failed to keep pace with this trend, and it's truly a tragedy in a state which has a unique -- unique commitment to both freedom of the press, through its constitutional provisions, which are at least as extensive as the United States Constitution -- under this Court's rulings probably more so -- and a unique provision or provisions that do not appear in the Constitution of the United States guaranteeing open courts.

We, the founders -- the people who wrote the Constitution of Texas -- made a commitment in that era that we would truly have an aggressive press and open courts. And today

#### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

```
· talk and to a
         to the deprit is energy countries.
             insite of the voltation has established it
                                 re tunin co. unientional to l'addeant or
                    . Coant, it is a manner, footh arocces up.
                ్రాములో కొంటింది. అంది కారాయ్లు కార్ట్ క
                    may rect on "illineic, o subserved to the
            in the dentity of equations technology alists.
         ennobbranive, nenebotractive decountications by
       to the first terms and figure of that the court of
        that the Bound to bear finited to bear the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    7.5
      recorded which trond, and it's truly a trace y
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   8.5
                                             in a state which has a unique -- unique
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   0.0
collistent to both Incedor of the bream, thrown.
                       gg ten con titution. Trovinical, caich can all
                                           Thirst as aut nsive of the Upfted Statem
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    T.
                            17 . Condition -- uncorp that a dust on the condition of 
              condistration of the solution of the condition of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    0 E
                                                        provintions that so not the or the the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    - € ₹
        condition of the United Cated guarentering
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    ,*, *.
                                                                                                                                                                                   . Proposition of the contraction of the contraction
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    T.
        To, the foundars -- the people tio
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    S .,
                                 ಾ ೧೯೯೬ ಈ ಜನಕರ್ ನಿರ್ವೀರಿಕೆಯಕ್ಕಿತಿಯಾಗಿ ನಟ್ಟಿ ಆಕಿಂದು
```

ាស្ត្រស្រានទី ១ ១៩៩ ១៩ នេះស្រី ១៩៤ ១៩៣៩ ១៩៤ នៃស្រែក្រុម ១៩៤៩ ១៩៩៩ ១៩៩៩៩ ១៩៩៩៩ ១៩៩៩៩

កាល់ ទៅ ប៉ុងលើ នេះ (ការស ខ. ១០០ ពុង **ខឧទ**ការ មូ**ប**រស្ធា<del>មម</del>ុក្ស សុខ

the medium of television is truly the way that people of this state can have access to their courts to see what happens.

And I believe -- speaking as a lawyer who tries cases day in, day out, of all sorts, as well as representing the communications industry -- that the public confidence in the judiciary in the process of deciding disputes, both criminal and civil -- civil in this particular case -- would be drastically increased if the public, by and large, could see how well those obligations are carried on by the lawyers and the judges. And this Court, the proposal that's currently before you, to allow it to be the first to allow public access, true public access, would enhance its stature.

And in -- in my judgment, in this era when so many of our public issues are going to be decided by this Court and other state courts, it is imperative that we look closely to our traditions of openness and free press in this state, unique traditions, and allow -- begin to put our toe in this water that so many people are freely -- freely swimming in, in the

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the form of the Country of the count control of the control of the control of the control of consta to soc white bill in a. in as prideo a -- swo to 10 has Large of tries dense and ins against its again soft and to I as representian the communicate and incurry -- thether the the diministrated in the furthern in the page or edicing tarater, both driving car day's arof a nation of the political and the contract of the contract r I Theret be theretained if the public of he and ~ г one arela to a cook. They would see blumb se and 7.5 seeming on by the inspensional the judgess and this doubt, the proposet that's currently bedue posses and the contract of the contract of the contract of esseed, true yub in access, weally enhanced tre-7. 1. 4 3 2 m d 3 3 7. And An -- in my judgment, in this ٢ ٢ agy by decired on this force an affice observed 10 c)

car, and to dedice the public form public form a factor of a car company of the company of the car capture of the car capture of the capture

other parts of this country, and see that truly it is a method allowing the people of the state of Texas to see how well the judges of this state perform, to see how well the juries and lawyers by and large perform, and improve both the access to the courts and the public's informational base through a fully-informed, free press.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: You're not saying that 40 states allow cameras in the trial --

MR. GEORGE: I believe -- and I have not checked that -- but I believe that there are approximately 44 states that allow some sort of broadcast medium in some of their judicial proceedings, and I had --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Would that include just the states' appellate courts?

MR. GEORGE: In various forms of things. Now, many -- as the Court knows, many jurisdictions -- most of the larger states like Texas; Florida; California; New York; and Illinois, in some current cases -- the big states -- most every one of them allow full access to the trial court

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

អ្នកប្រជាពល បានប្រធាន (ប្រធាន បុន្ត្រាស់ បានប្រជាពល ប្រជាពល បានប្រធាន បានប្រជាពល បានប្រធាន បានប្រជាពល បានប្រធាន បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាន បានប្រជាពល បានប្រាព្យ បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពិល បានបានប្រជាពិសិស្សា បានប្រជាពិសិស្សា បានប្រជាពិសិស្សា បានប្រជាពិសិស្សា បានប្រជាពិសិស្

Language Comb

rr

7.1

1 [

7.5

7.1

77

\*\* \*\*

~ J

0.5

. \* :1

ما ما

\_\_\_\_\_C

និក្សា ស្ត្រីស្ត្រី : "។ មុខមិន ។ សិក្សាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រី សិក្សាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត សិក្សាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រី សាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រ —— (ឯកសុវិស្តិស

In. Charks and I are holder -- call the volume of sets the chart the charks the chart the chart the chart the call of the call of the call of the call of the case of their judicial chart are the I are chart the case of the chart the case of the chart the chart the case of the chart the

dal. Siest : magramme apresson agreng
'actione stateshoof asystiches conside?

For such the fire traces of the such as such as such as

t inge. Tow, mass --- an the Conthiness, asay furiosischion -- any ju isdiotions -- nost - tost tell carrox states uline Sense; is situated for the Santia Sense; is situated for the Sense -- took overy out to the sense -- took overy out to the took overy out to the took overy

24

25

proceedings through electronic media. If you go to Florida or California or New York, or some place, and turn on the local television, you will see a trial judge hearing a case broadcast on television, not unlike C-Span. I mean, they have -- we have, you know, the -- I believe last week the British House of Commons allowed television in for the first time, and the Senate of the United States. And if the British House of Commons and the Senate of the United States can allow television in, it certainly -- the courts of the state of Texas, particularly this Court, ought to be able to allow the same medium to coverage. We see it as -- it is the norm in most parts of the world, particularly in other jurisdictions of the United States, and there is no reason not to do it here.

probably know, twice in this decade this Court has requested a referendum of the trial judges -- of all the judges of this state at the judicial section meeting. In 1981 it was a four to one margin against cameras. Progress being made for your position, it was only slightly more than two to one against it in the most

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ုက္ခရင္ေနတာ္သည္။ ကို ေတြေကြသည္။ ကို ေကာက္သြင္ေတြကို မည္သည္ကေတြကို ကို သည္။ ကိုလ ten minister of difference are the contract of the miados am como de deservo do contribiro, por with the a trial judge certain a case budgeda. of televicion, not uniske C-Cyan. To same thus hard -- se have, you know, t. -- ' 'olive and some the Drig sh Parace e descent sit acces iclevision in for the Sirch Ling, and had forabe one the first of terror. It is the Tritical Econ of the open and the Canade of the United that a , ï and the gratest to all soft male to the mosts have ٣.٣ courts of technice of massas resticulation this 2 J 13 court, such to be to use to be on the came redium. ್ರಾಗಿ ಬರಣದ ಇದ್ದರು. ಇದು ಕಾಡಲ ಬಿಟ್ಟಾಟ್ -- ಸೆಟ್ಟಿಬ್ ನಿರ್ಣಿಸಿಗಳು ಕಾರ್ಡ್ ಸಿಟ್ಟ್ wond entto of the vor. Ty itious arty for other garian' stions of the Unites "tester, and those 7 ! go readon not to do do de de 7.7 ୍ଷ୍ଟେ ବ୍ୟୁ :ମିମ୍ନ୍ୟୁମ୍ନ ମୁମ୍ମ୍ୟୁମ୍ୟ ସୃଷ୍ଟେମ୍ probabily know, twice in this decode this found ĴĹ han rotuested a referencial of the brief guages -- of all the jud of this atore or c Γ, fudichal section keesing. In 1882 is use a lour sa ese mest, in a cather that enterest on a same one ະຊາ ລັບປ**ີ** ໂດຍປະຕິດ ຄວາມສັດ ລັດ ຊຸດຄົນທີ່ຄວາມ ປ່ຽ<mark>ວກູ</mark> ປຸລຸດີ ລີໄຂປ 15

Carolic Call al all aliair es par el relative el compositiones

71.63

٢

1 5

l recent --

MR. GEORGE: Well, one of the advantages --

what do you suggest we do to -- if there are those of us who believe that there is no reason why the courts should not be open to cameras, what do we do to convince the -- the trial bench that this is not something that will impede the administration of justice in their own courtrooms?

MR. GEORGE: The first -- I think the solution to that is what is proposed: to begin with, this Court standing up and allowing its proceedings to be open to the electronic media. It has the facilities, it has the capacity, and it can show the leadership.

responsibility -- not only in revising these rules, the rules of procedure that we are here today talking about -- to provide leadership to both the appellate -- all the appellate courts and the trial courts, and to provide leadership in other areas. And this is an area of leadership by letting it in -- let my clients

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

nome in the second of and their all administrations

....

• •

and others in -- to telecast the proceedings in this court, and will go a long way.

I mean, I doubt that the court will fault, and I doubt that the administration of justice will be greatly impeded in this court, and at least those trial judges will have some comfort that it -- it can be, and it is not the end of the world, to allow television in the courtrooms.

JUSTICE DOGGETT: The proposal that you refer to that I have made is aimed just at giving discretion to this court.

MR. GEORGE: Yes.

videotaping done during the Edgewood case, which was then embargoed under the code of conduct, and this will take the change in the code of conduct, as well as the -- the rules. But is there a way in this court that you can have video for various television stations and not interrupt and -- the strife from the -- from the arguments?

MR. GEORGE: We're doing it today, and --

JUSTICE DOGGETT: Well, we've got

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

3

5

10

23

25

-	ු දැනුවට පවසිට වැනි මිනිම් මින සිට සිට සිට සිට සිට සිට සිට
•	ရေးသောက် ကောင်းသည်။ ကောင်းသည် မောက်သည် ကောင်းသည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။ မ
^	ន <sup>ន</sup> ន ជាប្រសេ <b>ទ ១៩៩ ៤៤៨៩ ៤៤៤៤</b> ខេត្ត <sub>ខេ</sub> ព្ធ ប្រ
.•	is colt, and Trophy that the arministration of
•	ನಾವರು ಕಾರ್ಮನಿ ಕಾರ್ಮಿ ಅಂದಿಕ್ಕಾರ್ ರೈ. ಅಂದು ೧ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ೧೯೩೩ ಎಂದು ಈ ನಿರ್ಣ
•	on at least those trial judged will have dede
7	willy less to dr ind with and the miles of bedd drobbing
•	and of the term of term contests the fact
٨	• 8 300 7 3 7 <b>20</b> 6 3
-	Casal Artegore edge : Tamping of this
۴.	ကို အောင်းသည်။ သို့ သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည်သည်။ အသည်သည် အသည်သည် အသည်သည်။ သည်သည် သည်သည် သည်သည် သည်သည် သည်သည်
· ·	girine d november vito chia sonnte.
4	in. The Tone
<b>`</b> .	a bad on : memphon mornant
	vivestoring descripting the "Agewood ends, with
7	ras then ethan red unter the comment of the
**	ed the well take had change in his ones of
•.	confuct, on radi as the the trees. Tal in
<b>(4</b> )	There a vay on this court that you cen have
: 5	vides for verious television stations and not
۲.	laterrupt and the derife from the from the
9.	င်း မွှားသော ငေးခဲ့
<b>?</b> .	of mangant of the total today.
٠. إ	mo con the second secon
	In the contract of the contrac

,

more light in here today than we have had in recent years.

MR. GEORGE: The technology, I'm sure, can be handled. The providing of additional lighting to the courtroom shouldn't be a tremendous problem, but even with the lower lights, there is technology available. If you have ever seen the Friday night football game highlight films, they do manage to videotape the Bastrop Bears playing the Lockhart Lions, and the lighting in those stadiums is not great; and your technology is available to do that. I think that the quality of the medium would be improved with a little -- little more light in the courtroom, but that's not a --

JUSTICE RAY: Some think we need more light, anyway.

MR. GEORGE: Both -- both real and substantive and figuratively.

JUSTICE SPEARS: I have another question which is not new, but I've never heard a good answer for it. We have had requests of this same nature for the 11 years I have been on the Court, and with the two exceptions, we have declined to authorize them.

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

\$4°	the Court, and with the the med though we for a
% W	thin one asture for the M years I have been an
o J	ောင်လူတွင် <b>စား</b> မေရသေး သိ <b>ုသင်း</b> သို့တာ သို့တွင် လေးသည်များ လေသို့
د ت	acation which is not news but "ve mover beand
<b>3</b> 3	Trusta Casalla - 1   the anorper
a - ,	substantive an Thursdawely.
<b>.</b>	And whomas is the me became of
I 7	nord ights angwey.
a 🔾	ានាធិតិសេខ និងស្គ្រាស់ ដូចស្គ្រាស់ បានប្រាស់
<b>3</b> .3	%ರು <b>ರಂಗ</b> ಸ್ಥಿತಿರಿದ್ದಾರೆ ನೀಡಿ ಕಿರ್ದೇಶಿಗಳು ವರಕ್ಕರ ಈಈ
<b>4</b> 4	i mever with a litting littic ince light in
50 50	then that the quality of the medium round by
7 J	) on the thought of $r$ and $r$ is the formula $x$
17	the lightens in thome needless in met grant, ero
j .	"strep Fear: Maying the Loubhart Tions, on:
J	Negalitett ("tuns they do neunlo to videotas v the
<b>;</b> :	herr ever the Princy wight Sectional was a
	Thurs there is termolory availables. If you
	Les transmious replaces but even with the lesson
2	in the telegraph of the training to the securities on thousands
Ç	and, and he bendief. Fire providing at
	့ ကို အသည်အသည်။ ၂၉၉၄ က <b>ာရေးအလွ</b> ေးသို့ (၁၉၉၄)
e <sub>3</sub>	μωσους Συγαν.
ĵ	em services of the following Arministration programs
	•

terfliet to think in the time.

One of the problems that's been cited is that the coverage of the television media necessarily must be very brief because they are in short segments, and it is interesting to note in that line that there have been two television cameras in the courtroom today, and not until you testified did they jump up and start filming. I'm sure there will be excerpts of your testimony that will appear on news programs, and so forth.

The problem that we perceive is that it's impossible -- and I think that's a fair word -- to accurately portray to television viewers the sense of a trial that maybe lasts over weeks, or even days, in a one-minute segment, and that it necessarily requires an editor to selectively choose certain elements of the testimony or of the evidence that could, in effect, not give a true picture of what the trial is all about. And that -- that can be done by the print media, but it cannot be done in a one-minute segment for the evening news.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Thirty-second bite.

MR. GEORGE: There is a -- there's

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

```
the constant to content the Europe
                                                                                                                                                                    r
           actual is that the coveres of the talker of
           continued folia with at the refer bounders, be,
                                 they are in chort decuence, and it we
 interpolating to rote in that inc blat blone Luce
             been two toleviation demotes in the courtered
 comme, and and until you tentisies of the the just
        ay and start line. The mark will be will be
     ences in all god teacts only fixly will in our in-
                                                           . Matel on the fall along about
                                                                                                                                                                     · J.
this all evicato, on it is it in dom, of t
                                                                                                                                                                    1.5
           the impose to -- as think that to Cair
                                                                                                                                                                   2.1
             ward -- to weem ately carting to television
                                                                                                                                                                   ۵.
        vie. age the name of a tainal that maying land.
                                                                                                                                                                    * *
                     , ver weels, or even ays, is a one-inute
                                                                                                                                                                    3.5
           serm we, and that it nocernarily requires on
                                                                                                                                                                   7.5
effice to purectively all had destain elements - -
                                                                                                                                                                    . .
  the sectiment of of the chide so black contra
             coloct, no la breta contact con la contact con la contact cont
                                                                                                                                                                    · r
                                                                                                                                                                    20
            trial is all court. But that -- thee a fin in
      Bond by the child medical art is countries and
                                                                                                                                                                     - (1
        in a one-minuse or gateria dia tos evening nacio
             Changarian en annantiam chairigh
                                                                                                                                                                    80
                                                                                                                                                                    2.0
                                                                                                                            . 3210
```

TO AND HE SEE SOME STORES TO SEE

two responses to that. And the nature of the media is that the electronic medium on commercial television stations, by and large, is local news segments in which they try to cover the events of the world in 30 minutes. By the nature of that medium, it cannot include a two-or three-hour proceeding in this court to determine how the Rules of Civil Procedure are modified, because you just simply don't have the methodology to do so.

We have, however, experienced today -- if you will -- if you have cable on your television, Justice Spears, you will see that the full proceedings of the Senate of the United States debating the entire proceeding are on C-Span. The full proceedings of the House Committee on the impeachment of a federal judge -- the Senate trial of the impeachment of a federal judge was on C-Span, the entire thing. You get up in the morning, you turn it on.

Now, their -- the cable networks provide outlets for extended coverage. That is a reality that exists in all sorts of public forums today. And if you go to other jurisdictions, you will see the cable systems

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

.

\* 1

in and the contract of the contract of about the contract of ్రార్ స్ట్ర్ క్షార్ అయ్య ని మండ్ర్ స్ట్ర్ ng sommer an yi yakobasah kelaive di Joi ese un ានមាន ស្គាន់ ខ្លាន់ ឬខណី ១០៩៧៤ ៤៤ ២៤២០ ១០១៦ ១២៤៣ ១០២៤៣ opening the anodernia and a contract of the administration of the contract of intuin of budh soften, it dramat indian or the ಾರಿ ದಿಗಗಾಡ ಇತ್ತಿಗೆ 🧓 🤥 ಚಿಂದಗಾರಕ್ಕೆ ಅದರ 🗕೧೮೩೩೩ 🦠 or the common of the first that was also had been able or a contract you be or term and the state of the set of the s 更五 an older aved ut. If -- little any 71 -- great yene belev eton, Justine Tynsen, yeurstu vill soe thee tie full ervise ings of the feneta of the This is the team of the fine and as a respective as . . no the state of the presidence of the state domitted on the daggraph off a lower to 7 o Janualasa ti odi be totta at calloit -- gelgt 1 F Model of the control of r the single the same continuous and the transfer of the A .. of the forest of the second of the first of the second • •• and the action of the control of the the state of the state of the state of the second state of the sec and to by an more than the comment was an area outsing picks out on I to the end indicate birds.

carry extended coverages. The local news, like the local paper, contain snippets, because that's the only way you can, because it's not the only event happening, to do so. And with all due respect, the nature -- the nature of the press is to edit the world for the rest of us, because we all can't be there, and we all can't see everything.

JUSTICE SPEARS: Some of us find that, in some senses and in some instances, a rather arrogant approach.

MR. GEORGE: Well, you can't all be in Czechoslovakia this morning, and we can't all see what happens there entirely. We have to depend upon some medium to select for the rest of us what part of the events happening in eastern Europe we can see. There's no -- it's simply the physical limits of the world.

The press has always, whether it's electronic, or print, or otherwise, had to play editor, because you can't simply recreate the entire world through a newspaper or a television or a radio broadcast. It has to be selected.

And our commitment in this state to the freedom of that selection through our constitutional

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

•	$v_{ij}$ , which is the state of $v_{ij}$ , which is the proof of $v_{ij}$ , $v_{ij}$ , $v_{ij}$
, ,	e so tunto till si di di e e es e l'odi
· · ·	ទី ៩ នៅជាប់ ១ ១០១៩ នេះ <b>ជប់១</b> ២ ភូ ភ្លាយ ឬវេជា២ ១៨៨ ស្វែក្សា
	udin 127 in non chall vo su na denovo v a lit
•	្សីទី ពីការសម្រេចស្រុស្សីស៊ី mm ខណ្ឌប្រាស់ ស្រៀង ខ្លាស់ ស្រុស្ស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស
•	లు 18 కి.మీ. కుండా కుండి అతమైన సూజాక ఉన్న వేస్స్ ఉన్నవే ఉందిన క
4**	en e
•	
	en de la companya de La companya de la co
•	ា «ពេលមានប្រាស់» ១០១ ជា ខែការ «១០១១ ១១១១ ១១១១ ១១១១១
£.:	• Important Application of the state of the
٠	्रिक्ष के किया किया का कार्य के कार्य के किया किया किया है। किया किया किया किया किया किया किया किया
•	in the coordinate of the corptage and we correct the the
•	the property of the continuation of the contin
; (	and grow the election to religible tor some from all two
<del>-</del> .	it cains pai thas volument to dure outtoned in
77	eigneer imm me no eam and. Passein ms ibis
	• North add the all filespinyde end in the
<b>⊘</b> 1	ធ្ <sup>រ</sup> ាក់ ទទ្ឋស្រស •្សក្សសុវិក ក្នុងរៀបក្រពុជ <b>្ឈ</b> ាក្
đ	್ತ ೧ ಅಥಿ ನಾರು ಕರಣದಲ್ಲಿ ಬಿಡಲ ಒಂದು ಕರ್ಯ ಇದು ಅಥ ಕರಣದಲ್ಲಿಗಳು
	ශරිස් උදවරු තමට පතිවතරයි. මේ සිසිසුව සි සි විසුසුකිකට දෙන සිටිමේ සි
<i>ç-</i> :	ရားကို အနောင်းသော အချောင်းသည် ကျောက်သည်။ သည် သည် ရောက်သည်။ သည် သည် အချောင်းသည်။ သည် သည် အချောင်းသည်။ သည် သည် အ
Ç 41	. `'ಅಂಚರ್ಣವಿಕ್ಕಾರ್ ಕಡೆ ಕಡ್ಡಿಸಿದ್ದ ಕ್ಷೇತ್ರ ಕ್ಷೇತ್ರ ಕ್ಷಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ಷಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ಷಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ಷಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ಷಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ಷಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ಷಾಂತ್ರ
	్ గణ్ఖంగామ్ రామ్మ్ ర్వామికమోగు గ్రామం చేస్తున్నారు. ఈ మూర్తి కా

In relability not the discussion and a hospital to

provisions is dramatic.

2

3

· 4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2.3

24

25

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, just

as an aside, 44 states have a freedom of speech

clause that has some press responsibility

language in it, and 39 states have a

substantially similar open courts provision to

Texas, so --

MR. GEORGE: Most of --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: It's not --

I mean, we are following the majority of other

states in being different than the federal

constitution on those --

MR. GEORGE: That's true. There is

no question about that. But 40 of those states

also allowed broadcast medium in their courts.

Now that suggests that, you know, maybe those

other fellows are reading their constitutions

more openly than we have, and I would suggest

that -- the federal constitution not

particularly a good guide -- the federal courts

have never done it, but they have -- there is no

open court provision in the federal

constitution. There is no -- the free press

provisions of the federal constitution is not --

are not as protective as the state constitutions

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

•က်က်ကြသည်။ ကျားရုံသည်တွေးသည်။ ကျားရုံသည်တွေးသည်။	ť.
dami, €2.600 stromander cominación decimando	•
es an enten- th above tave a looken of the all	^
ကျွန်းကိုသို့သို့သည်တယ် သူတွင် စာလည်းသော သည် သောလက်သော လက်သောက်သော	*,
ា ១ <b>០១</b> ១ ១៩១៩២ ប៉ីនី ចិល្ខេ ភ្លាំដំ លដ្ឋ បុក្ខព្យល់។	**
od notribone na coo do cos inin yffetantalla	*
man to a first of the second	<b>!</b> "
—— ప్రవాహం ప్రాలం	
লল রাধ্য গোরিক (±স্কুল্লাস্পল ক্তৃক্ত্রুল্লু ক্তৃক্ত্	e
າ ແອຂກ, we are ໂຮໂມນະໂທດ the cajority of cabor	m.
reater in bothe fifficient than the federal	<u></u>
constitution an thore	; -
of oneder . That's Exue. There is	Ē,
no quantion about thet. But 40 of those states	•
. The allowed break dark median in Sigir constr.	
Table E. E. bagger to thete, you know, waybu those	**
other ist and are sending their constitutions	<b>"</b> "
core oyen t than we have, end t court suggest	•
1. t the federa constitution not	
adamon (significant confidence — the lovers) were noticed	- 01
na ai erodi nval. yedi und (di easa novia evil)	<b>J</b> :
Forest medaling in the decomposition of	₹* (
ದಾರ್ಯ (೨ <b>೦</b> ೯) ರತ್ನಿತ ಈಗ ದರ್ಧನಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭಿರಚಿತ್ರ - ಎಪ್ಪನಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಗೆಗಡನ <b>ರ</b>	<i>y</i> s. 2
er feldand ol the ffeleres equatilitation on the e-	-
The state of the s	

are.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Can you summarize briefly your proposal?

MR. GEORGE: My proposal is essentially the one -- today?

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Yes.

MR. GEORGE: Today this Court should have the discretion to authorize the telecasting and broadcasting of proceedings it selects. I think we -- if I was to write on the perfect world, I would recreate the systems that are in Florida or California or New York or Rhode Island, or many of the other jurisdictions. I don't think the state trial bench is ready for that.

you would move in the direction that you want the trial proceedings. You will want to have access -- you will want the ability to have TV in your -- you want any -- any barriers that would prohibit you from being in the trial courts where the action is -- a majority of the action -- I mean live action that is sensational in the nature of a -- that can be seen or shown, you know, in a 30-minute -- a 30-second sound

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

• **	
THE THE WITH MAIN AND SECURITION OF THE SECURITIES.	<u>.</u> **
Of notice and another than the	<i>:</i>
1 do emerco de importo . To	•
Specious our add glleidason	::
•वर्षः । • १८८मम् १८८ ४० लक्ष्मणकाम् ।	•
್ರಾಗ್ಯಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್	· •
aryo the literation to authorize the teamen thre	^
and translating of proceedings to access to a	• .
hainb so il tura to write on the neufrot	C.
20 <b>೨೩೨೦ ಕ</b> ಾಗುವ ದಿನಗಳ ಗಾಗಾರ ಅವರ ಬರುವಾಗುವ ಕಾಗುವುದ ಕಾಗುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವುದು ಬರುವುದ ಬರುವ ಬ	J 1
១៦០៧៣ ៥០ នាក្រ។ មក។ ១០ ៩៦៣៩ ភិក្សា ភិក្សា គឺ ខែក្សា	i,
great , on thing of the other fraktallations.	~ 1
, att think the ntite trial bends in $real$ for	Δı
•ដាក់ <b>ព</b> ី	<u></u>
A trapulate while to latence at tensor	••• •
you would devo in the discostion that you want	٤ ز
ರಾಶ್ರವ ಅದೇ ಅದರ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಅದ್ಯಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರವ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರವ್ ಕ್ರ	~ r
notens you will mant blo chillby in morn un	^ <u>,</u>
in your you want any any border at the	<b>^</b> 4
and of many the sound on the the the tree.	7.0
departe canque file mution in e angostity of the	ព្រ
್ಷಣ ತರವಣ್ಣ ಸ್ಥಿತಿ ಕಾರ್ಸ್ಟ್ ಕಾರ್ಡ್ ಬ್ಯಾಟ್ ಗಳ ಪಟ್ಟಿಗಳು	<b>^</b> ^
in the mature of the that can be dron in actual	1. <b>.</b>

nomen base of A. e. -- ofensile to a more one

71.0

1 ||

bite.

MR. GEORGE: You would have to couple it with the technology provisions that allow -- if you watch television, or your cable systems have these trials on them here in Austin, you can watch them. They have technology requirements that the court has to be equipped with one camera. There can't be news people standing around the courtroom, for example, in these other jurisdictions. Those kinds of provisions would be included, but the cameras could be turned on in the preceding telecast.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: There's some concern about invasions of privacy, for example, of showing the jury -- the camera spanning the jury and the trial bench, and there's some legitimate concerns about that. Or a sensational sex trial or rape witness, for example, invasions of privacy.

MR. GEORGE: What is it --

JUSTICE DOGGETT: I think those are the kind of concerns that the Chief mentioned of the poll we took -- a couple of them that have been taken -- that there seemed to be strong

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

•	ರಾಜ ರಾಶಕ ಬಂದಿಕ್ಕಾನಿ ಅದ್ದಾ ಕಡ್ಡಾರ್ಟ್ . ಇ
	tails as it ivers you eads a lib dilly all pluges
•,	ofdon and the god out ob the cutterno, or your arbita
<del>.</del>	systems have these trials on Flam here in
F	್ಯಾಟರಿಗೂ ೧೯೮೮ ಅವರು ಗುರಿತಿಗಳ ಗಾರ್ಬರ ನಿರ್ವಹಣ
5,	terbuology republic entri that had bound bus to
٠٠,	ncuin ped until one dametra. Chose comits to nown
O	news rtanding around the countrols for
C	orem of in those other jurishidutions. Table
<u>,</u> r	per to of madvinion, while be included, but the
S	comerca daule in turnes on in the commercias
~	•្វាល់ •្វាល់ •្វាល់
•	""UTTOR COUNTRY: There's so s
	convoca chert investons of relvery, ler exagre,
	c. "how'ng t.o fury tin ramero manning the
7	jung one who tria bench, and there's same
(5	Teginalizata donda no about blat. On a
pa	consentance our trial or rive withour, for
Ĺ.	encoming in vasions of guidvacy.

whe him? of concerns true the Shiel aration of all the product of the horses we then the hard have seen access when the true constants with the street.

en. garanr: That in it --

ාතම සහසක්ම කිස්වීම ම දැනු සංසා**ලල ප**ද සමුසය ය

2

sentiment of trial judges against doing this
thing, and why this proposal really is narrow
and just simply gives this court and the Court
of Criminal Appeals, if it wants to join in,
the discretion to do this.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: The concern of my fellow judges is that, you know, as we go, they will go, you know. And in a --

JUSTICE DOGGETT: Well, I guess that depends on what our experience is. If that experience is not a favorable one, they are not likely to do so.

JUSTICE HECHT: The U.S. Supreme
Court has considered this. What is the status
of their consideration?

MR. GEORGE: As I understand it, they have considered it. They have never allowed the live broadcast of their proceedings. They have had some videotapes made of some of the oral arguments. The current Chief Justice has suggested that they consider changing that rule. I don't know that there is any great movement afoot in that court to -- to make any change, although I believe that it is something that they are actively considering.

#### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

ကြောင်းသို့သည်။ ၁၁ တို့ရသည်တက္က မချာများမြဲတွင် ကြသည်။ သို့သည်တကြသည်သောကမည	\$* . *
thing on the thin erogonal of the in marror	<b>,</b>
no juck siroly gived little louce and the drett	
of Cedarant Asserbs, if it wante to join in,	٥,
The eigenstant $oldsymbol{ au}$ of $oldsymbol{ au}$ and $oldsymbol{ au}$	
ವರ್ಷ- ಕರ್ಮಾಗಿ ಕರ್ಮಾಗಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಇತ್ತಿ ಎಂದಿ ಎಂದಿ ಎಂದಿ ಎಂದಿ ಎಂದಿ ಎಂದಿ ಎಂದಿ ಎಂದ	**
noticer justice to three you have an recycler to	
sie un word net war thim	eş *
with nasung " . I far : "mnoode morreng	<u>^</u>
copendr on what our exparience in. If that	3.5
on extend to not a ferounble one, they are not	TI
•em <b>o</b> 8 ad ç eak;	st
ucords 'nours vie U.f. Fubscae	er
Caurt has considered being that is the atatus	<u>∿.π</u>
បីយល់សេខភេឌប្រើបានសម្បាយ ស្រួស្បាប់ ប្រ	3.5
್ಯ ಕ್ಷಮ್ ' ಆರಾಧಿಸಿಗಳು ಕ್ಷಮ್ ಕ್ಷಮ	es, f
ing have countilized the miser have nowns	
elucaci the transferst of their product ner	n.c
They brue led some videotries ande of some of	٠, Ē
the era, exquanthe, The surrent 6 4cf Sril se	3 3
ತಿರುವ ಆರಂಭವಾಗಲ ಸಂಚಿತ್ರಗಾರ ಭಾಷಕ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಅಂತರ್ಜ್ಯಕ್ಕಾರ ನಿವರ್ಷ	. I.
विष्ट्रा पुराव को एक देन संवर्धन चन्त्री प्रस्तान मा कर्माच	ÇC
weverent after in that grant to to rake our	ÇS
abraro, although i holisvo that it is ourship	15
that they sur outively annoticeting.	<u>i</u> 10

A

It is again, as we got -- you know, we got the Senate to open up to television

last -- two years ago, and the British House of

Commons this week. It seems to me that we're

making small steps.

And the Supreme Court of the United States hopefully will understand the medium as a -- as a method by the way the people can really see its court. It is, after all, their court, as this court is the court of the people of the state of Texas, and the only true way that they can ever see it. The only way that those folks in Houston can ever see what happens in here is if there is some electronic medium that allows them to participate via television.

JUSTICE RAY: Jim, let me suggest that, as one who had a pretty high profile a couple of years ago, that the hate mail and the kooks all come out of the woodwork when -- when your picture gets shown on TV, even from people that you don't know or never had any contact with.

The folks in the penitentiary start writing and say, "Uh-huh, that's that judge that

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

٠.	్రమా <b>గ</b> ్ గార్లా— ఓ పై భావా ఉద్దాయి. ఆది మూవా ఉద్
£	to the despete to enem no verbetes
~	To emuliarist. To a las tope bungmout dor
	್ರಾಯಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ಬರುಗಳ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿಗಳ ಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ಬರುಕ್ಕಾಗಿಗಳ ಇಂತ್ರಾಯಕ್ಕೆ
**	aking .pg 1 mee m.
	Ind the Surgery Stung of the United
ć	minted hone Rully will unsermiand to modium au
	ದಾರಾ ೧ ೧ <b>೦</b> ೧ - ೧೯೫೮ ಅಲ್ಲಿ ಇಲ್ಲಿ ನಿರಾಶಿತ್ರ. ೨ ಇನ್ —— ಇ
<i>,</i> ·	ಕರ್ಯತ್ರಿಗೆ ನರು ಸರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಸರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆಗಳು ಸಂಪರ್ಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಸರಿಗಳು
n	dought, an this coupt in the coupt of the scoring
ï	of the etate of Texas, and the entry true way
S	the they son over nocit. The may place
3	thone folk: in Pounton can ever see what
	has one in here in if block is some electronic
,	Reditu - that - thoughto anxietaffate via
-	•reinive: \d
7	ជាជនស្វាធាធា ១២ ជាគ. «ប្រ <sup>ក្ស</sup> » «ស្គី។ ប្រាស់ក្សាក
.3.	that, so one who it is protty him. profite a
n	out bar liat rapid that would be of actioned to
45.	Rocks at some rut of the weetrick short with
£	post giberge geta chown on 'V, even from pospic
ទ	let vou don't know or revol and any contact
.~	. दिचे <i>रे प</i>
Ą	the felle in the sentrant and and

ి.కు. అనందర్ చేకుకటి ద్విడక్కి ఇకటుండాకాకి ఇంటుడు స్థానికి అందిన క్రామా

20

\*1 -5

must have put me in this institution, or had something to do with putting me in the institution," and the letters started coming saying, "Boy, when I get out of the penitentiary, I'm going to kill you." And they didn't write just one letter; they wrote a lot of letters. And there were a lot of people writing the letters.

And you put judges at risk from the kooks of the world as they get more of a high profile, particularly on television.

MR. GEORGE: Well, I suppose that the problem with that argument just raised is that fundamentally those of you who offer yourself up for service on these courts have chosen to respond to, and appear, and deal with the people of Texas in their entirety, including those kooks. They're your constituents, too.

And it seems to me unfortunate to suggest that lack of information for the people to not know who you are is somehow in the interest of good government and good justice. I think that while that may be that the more well-known people -- Robert Bass was recently --

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
the first one and the first of the bundless of the
          connection to the pathing of the the
   ngalas: lodords the deltel bendel saniag
             banded, "thropy other Wilder out of the
 senteentiary, "'m coint to kis you." An the co-
 ettyte briter funt one kettyr theer i cho nikula
    ed Indicto. And there were a dot of people
                             west aing the deutera.
 the rout with fredges at that the most find
    kooks of the work as they set wore of a .i.
            sinfine, rapidedictly on tolevition.
                                                          , " F
   ידי. מדמתמד: וימור, ב מענו אופ בערט
   the problem with that argument just rained is
                                                          13
       that fundebentally those of you who offer
                                                          - A F
    vourment up for norvice on these courts have
                                                          7 7
     discented rangend to, and aspear, and de in
                                                          - P
    17 with the proofe of Terus in their exploser
            instabline there keeks. "bey've your
                                                          , r
                               •ರಾಣದ ∢ರಾಶ್ ಜರ್ವಾದಕರಗಳಲ
                                                          A .F
  rn. it comes to andortusate to
outge. Until the front of inter ablen dut the neo the
                                                          T.
      to not linear who out the in colorium in the
                                                          2.2
The stand of a confidence where the confidence of
                                                          ...
     ాకులు అటివి కారుకు అంది కుండు జి.సాఫె సెక్ట్స్ టీండ్ కే కేస్క్ సె
om to despend the district of or off mm billed appended by
```

٦ٿ

they arrested somebody trying to kidnap him because he is a well-known person -- maybe a rich person, as well -- but a well-known person.

And well-known people are subject to more attention and unusual mail than not well-known people.

But after all, you are elected by all the people of this state of Texas, and you have to choose in some way, by seeking this office, to risk that notariety, because, in fact, it is important -- I think it's important that people do know what Justice Gonzalez looks like and who he is.

JUSTICE RAY: The drug dealers would delight in that. Drug dealers now, you know, are after judges, particularly who are tough on drugs.

MR. GEORGE: There's no question, and --

JUSTICE DOGGETT: Most of those folks know the people who sentence them, though.

MR. GEORGE: Well, I don't know that there is -- those folks probably know who you are already. I mean, it's the rest of the people that don't.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

్ గ్రామంలో నిమ్ ఉంది. సైమక్ టైమర్ కామ్లానక్కార్లో కో కార్యుడుడు. కామకేద	
termuse no in a west-income no spe Typh -	•
-೧೯೮೪ರ - ಉಗಾಗಿಗಳಿಸಿ <b>ರು</b> ತರ್ಕಣೆ ನಿಕ್ಕೆಗಳ ಬರ್ ನಿರಾಕಿಸುವ ಎಂದು	 
ು ನಮ್ಮ ಅರ್ಥ ಚಿಕ್ಕಾಲಾದಿ ಎಂದು ಕೃತ್ಯಾಗಿ ಕೇರ್ಲಿಯ ಕೆಲ	٠
normal+Alem den undd ik blovnami Smi meld-baron	<b>*</b> 1
•01quay	es.
Fut adter at a group are alored	7
all the paorie of this state of manua, and gre	**
have to choose in come cay, by section, this	(°)
el ico, co minh thei metagleby, becaune, in	Ç.
feet, it is is estable Tubink it's important	f j
ಟಿಸಿಡಲ್ಲಿ ಇಲ್ಲಿ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿ ಕೆಲ್ಲಿ ಕೆಲ್ಲಿ ಕೆಲ್ಲಿ ಕೆಲ್ಲಿ ಇಲ್ಲಿ ಬಿಡಿಗೆಟ್	۲.
lara an' who he it	<b>;</b>
Sugardn DAM: The drug Tealers unu. o	<b>R</b>
olight of that. Trug seasers now, you have,	wq .
ಇಸಂ ಪಟ್ಟಿಂದ ಕೊಡೆಗಳು, ಗರ್ವಕ್ಷರಚಿತ್ರವಿಲ್ಲಿ ಚಟ್ಟಿ ನೀರು ನೀರು ಕಂಟ್ಯಾಪ	₹.
• ចមួយថា ធែ	ţ,,
√ಡಡಸಿಕೆಗಳಲ್ಲ ಅವ ಕ್ರತಿಕಟ್ಟ್ ಇಗಳುತ್ತಾಗಿ ಎಗ್	<b>?</b> .
i:r.	0
লংকরে ৪০ জন্ত <sup>া</sup> : শাস্ত্রস্কল র্মণালন্ত্র	~ ;
the the mest to paralla who contends that a three L.	Д.
ರಾಜಕ್ ಇಂದರ <b>ತಿಗಾರ</b> ಂ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಕಾರ್ಯದಲ್ಲಿ ಕಾರ್	5
Wore in thong folks restably know was ser	0.
ond to ment old office to any the or was	.,5

.dinor contact to

JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions 1 2 of Mr. George? Thank you --MR. GEORGE: Thank you. 3 JUSTICE HECHT: -- Mr. George. And Ms. Kneeland is here also to 5 share her views. 7 CAROLE KNEELAND, appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in 10 administrative session to consider proposed 11 changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas 12 Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of 13 Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 14 15 MS. KNEELAND: I brought my remarks 16 written, and I'll read them and try to go 17 through them relatively quickly. We -- we 18 double up a little bit on what we say, but --19 and then I -- I would like specifically to address your question, Justice Spears. 20 My name is Carole Kneeland. I'm the 21 22 news director at KVUE television station, 23 Channel 24, here in Austin, which is the ABC 24 affiliate here.

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

I'm here to speak in support of a

25

ក្រសួននេះ ខ្លាស់ និង និង នេះ ប្រាស់ និង	Ţ
no: නිගසන්ව විදෙල ලබන යන ධල	;•
RELATIONS OF THE PROPERTY OF THE	7
	r.
os vala ego. o particoal tal Sal	
.aveiv ed enca	`
	7
CONCIDE IN PERCOS	ţ
នាក់ ឯក <b>នេស ដែល ជានាសក្សា ១៤១១ ១៩១ ១៤១១ ១៣</b> ១១៤១ ១៣	.•
runinistrativo sendina la condider proposed	٢
chanced to Wenge Bulles of Civil Procedure, Pain	."
Triles of Tireniate Trocentie, and Terzan Trico o	٠.
Tivir Tvidende, statet as flotleu:	
	Λ.
odranes que delapos ( " : calamena .ng	r.
unitten, and that read that and tay to go	÷.
th ough than subatively procedy. To ve	7
ರಶನ .ಇದರ ಅಕ್ಕರ್ಯ ಈ ಕಾರಿದ ರತ್ನಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಯ ಅತಿದ್ದಾರಿ	0.1
ond thon " T while "in a destroally to	#h .
of the sear that stone fronties figure as	ů.
Ty nake the the theoton. The te	Ϊć
pare of rateox at KVDD telestation station,	ŗ
Channel 74, here in Tautin, which is two 174	5.1
•ంగాలున్ ఎందింగ్ ఉన్ని మ	<b>P</b> S. 1
က ပါသန်တယ်ကွေအားသူ အနေ အသည်။ မောက်သည် မောက်သည်။ မောက်သည်။	·· ,

resolution to allow television cameras inside this courtroom to record the legal proceedings of the Texas Supreme Court, proceedings normally open to the public and covered regularly now by news reporters without cameras. We feel opening up the Texas Supreme Court would be a tremendous first step toward television coverage of courtroom proceedings at all levels in Texas.

There are several reasons we think that's important. First, we feel the public's right to a public trial is abridged if cameras are excluded.

When that right was protected originally by our forefathers, television cameras hadn't been invented. But today more citizens say they receive their news through television than any other medium.

for most people, unless they are directly involved in a trial as an attorney, a juror, or a witness, there's no opportunity to watch the courts in action. We could provide that if we could televise the proceedings. We feel if we are to comply with the spirit of that right to a public trial in this day and age, television coverage is important.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

.5.	. The total of the control of the second sections with
<i>:</i> ·	agration noon goldens on the language of medianess of the
	្រុង ទីការស្រែក្រុង ស្ត្រាវៈ នៃពេល ១១១១ ១៩២៥១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩
<b>.</b>	i min glas មេទូ១០ honores boo o his outs cd mage
••	news ಕರ್ನಡಳಿತರು ಆಗಿಗೆನಿಂದ ತನ ಇನಾ. ಟೆಲ ಕೆಡಡ ರಾಗರಿಸಿನ
7	នេះ សុខ ភាពនៃ ១ គ្នា ខាងលាសុខ <b>នាក្សាទី ១ ១១៤២នី ១៩១១</b> ស្ទឹង  នេះ
,,	29 - 2 ເສ <b>ະ</b> ປະຕິດ <b>ປອງພ</b> ດຄາດ <b>ປອງໄອທ</b> ີ່ວ່າ <b>ກະ ບອ</b> ຫພຣະພຽມ ເປັ
0	• 30.၄ ကျဉ်း လမ္မာလာတ္က သီးသီတာ ဆီလာ ဆာလ္တာသည့္ လမ္းေလးကြားက လမ္း
ė,	There are nown in hands $v$
ņ.r	ಕ <b>ಿಡ</b> ್ (೧೯೯ ೪ನಕೆ ವಿ <b>ರ</b> ೯೩ ೧೬ ಕಿಕೆಗಳಿಗೆ) .ಕಾಗಡಲಿಗಡ <i>್ಯ</i> ಚಿತ ಆಕರಣಿನ
r ţ	గాకుండాల చిర్వంతి కాట్లుక్ కాట్లుక్ ముక్కార్ అన్నారులు ఈ ఆ కాటా
ιί	.Boas trop own
ça ve	. ඉමෙ <mark>මම්</mark> මයේද පතිය ස්සුවුවිට මිල් ඕස් උපුණුව
: 1	erigically by our wordstic or tolerician
i r	er, area lacer't beca invented. Tut tedav mere
**.f	comence a see who is evidence your well as a translation
<b>7</b> 9 P	-ជាស់ដែល ១០១០០ ឬ២០ ២០៨៦ ស្គ.១/មួយ១១៦
· r	ରହଣ <b>ହୁଠାରୀ ପ୍ରତିଶ</b> ଣ କୃତ୍ୟୁ ଅନ୍ତର୍ଶ ହେଇଥିବା ଓଡ଼
e r	Firedt" g invo ved in a brief et en et ennov.
ეტ	್ತಿ ಗ್ರೀಜಾಗಿಗಳು ಅಂದಿ ಆಗಾಗಿ ಅಭಾರತಿ ಕುಂಡಾಗಿಗಳು ಅಂದಿ ಕಾರ್ಮ್ನ
<b>₹</b> →	್ರವ್ಯ ಕಿಕ್ಕಿನ ಅರ್ಥಾಕ್ಷನ ಮು ಕ್ಯಾಪಿಸಿಯ. ಆ ಆನ್ಯಾಕ್ಟಿಸ್ ಭಾರಶವೆನ್ನ್
و ،	က် မက္ကာသည် စက္ကာကူသာ ျဖစ္သည်။ သည် က <b>ုလ</b> ေတြသည်။ ကုက္ကေတြ တက္ ညာနိုင္ငံတွင္ မြန္မာကို တြင္းသည္။
٨.	down Training of the Site was more as here on the woods

where  $n \in \mathbb{R}^n$  is the  $n \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $n \in \mathbb{R}^n$  in  $n \in \mathbb{R}^n$  . The  $n \in \mathbb{R}^n$ 

The same of the second second

′

Further, we believe if we could televise court proceedings, it would lead to a more -- much more informed public, giving people more confidence in the judicial process. By providing more accurate and complete court coverage, we could contribute to wider public acceptance and understanding of court decisions.

Under our form of government, there must be a constant concern for educating and informing people about all three branches of government. There may be no field of governmental activity where people are as poorly informed as the courts. Many of us complain about the apathy of voters in judicial elections, but we feel that by banning cameras from the courtrooms, we are closing the windows of information from which they might see and learn.

Beyond what we feel our coverage could do to promote understanding and respect for what's happening in our courtrooms, we feel it would eliminate some of the chaos that sometimes occurs outside the courtroom now, as we must chase people down in the hallways to get the television pictures we need to illustrate

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

Tenderic energy of the state of

government. There was constant of the order constant of the co

count where we feet our covarence

config to to promite understailing and reagest

confidential inggrenin in our courtzache, we filed

ch four villableth or en bli chack that

constitute desire outside the courtzach now, as

constituted cours outside the courtzach now, as

constituted to apple dens file the latitude for the latitude for the

1 our stories. We wouldn't have to do that if we

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

could get our pictures quietly in the courtroom.

And this is where, in addressing your -- your concern, I think what -- one of the -- one of the problems that happens with trial judges now is that their only experience is seeing us crashing around in hallways and seeing on the air, you know, defendants kicking at us, or -- or whatever.

And if you think that our editing of what happened in a courtroom would perhaps be mistaken, you know, and misunderstood, I think -- I would argue that right now it's much more misunderstood because of the pictures that you are seeing over what we are saying. They are the only pictures we can get, and they frequently are very distracting from what really happened in the courtroom. We didn't really see a defendant in the courtroom, you know, walking down the hallway with a -- with a book in front of his face kicking at people; that's not what happened there. But that, right now, is the only thing we can show, because that's all we can get, outside of -- unless we have courtroom artists, which also don't depict the actual

#### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

```
out it mound by of by the new . The best of the
3 gen degree sail in dannen god der in the gonetiers .
             ាស្ថាលមេខាង ស្រែង ស្រែកស្ថិត សុខាងស្រែង ស្រែក
               your -- your concern, " think weak -- one off
             the che one of the problem that hap one with
     trio julges sent to that the only on ordinal
               bar in ital ni lamore palacero en palece et
    seciae on the all, you know, ledowdank liefflig
                                                                                              t my or -- or whatevous.
And if you think that our cuiling of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       ^ <u>[</u>
            that is care in a doughnost acual paria, be
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    FF
                                 misticken, yer know, and dirunderstoof, "
  think -- " yea'd ar me that right now tt'r tress
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   2...
   mann Misendirencosa beacquia dE the Metarrat that
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 the gone of seeing erect whether anythere where
                        are the anny plutures no den get, and they
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    ٦ ٢
17 frequently one very distrecting from with torain
happened in the court weam. The Atin't really don
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     . .
  content in the courtsons you hasws childry
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  ~ <u>,</u> r
   from the the transfer a little a little the transfer in
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   100
      the first factor thetring at pooles the the bar not week
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 ÷ ,*
             ារដ្ឋ ២៨ «មានស្ថាស់ នៅស្នាស់ ស្នាស់ ស្នាស់ សមានសង្គ្រាស់ ដែល ដែល ដែល សង្គ្រាស់ សងគ្គ្រាស់ សងគ្គ្គ្រាស់ សងគ្គ្រាស់ សងគ្គ្រាស់ សងគ្គ្រាស់ សងគ្គ្រាស់ សងគ្គ្រាស់ សង
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   30
        or thin thin to be an in along beautiful that the
 the start of the contract of the deficiency of the start 
                  ್ರಕಾಸರಿಕಾ ದಲ್ಲಿ ಗರಕ್ಕಿಸ್ ಹಿಂದಿಗಳ ಚಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಕೆಂದರ ಕೆಲಗ
```

thing that happened in the courtroom.

2

3

5

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Once Texas was one of only two states that permitted television cameras in the courtroom. As I'm sure you know, it was the notorious 1965 Texas case of Billy Sol Estes that led to a ban of cameras in the courts. in 1981, the U.S. Supreme Court ruled that the presence of television cameras is not inherently unconstitutional, throwing the issue back into the state courts. Since then, 44 other states have allowed cameras access to the courts, and not just the appellate courts, but in many cases the lower civil and criminal courts, as well.

Florida was the state that brought the issue to the U.S. Supreme Court in 1981. And I brought you a copy of the 1979 Florida quidelines which ensure that television cameras are as unobtrusive as possible so as not to prejudice court proceedings in any way. I will leave that with you.

You will see that the Florida experience has shown that the presence of the cameras in the courtroom has little negative effect on trial participants' perception of the judiciary or the dignity of the proceedings.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ullet and $ullet$ is a sum of the $ullet$ constraint $ullet$ and $ullet$ constraints $ullet$	
ကောင်းလျှင်တာက မေးက မေးက မေးက ကွေးကမေးက ကွေးစားပါး	,
efficiency and describe and the described and and and an end	
ರಲ್ಲಿ ನಾಲಕ್ಕೆ ನಿಜಲಾಗುವ ಆರ್ಥ ನಿಜ್ಞಾನಗಳ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ನಿಜ್ಞಾನಕ್ಕೆ ನಿಜ್ಜಾನಕ್ಕೆ ನಿಜ್ಜಾನಕ್ಷಿದಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಾನಕ್ಕೆ ನಿಜ್ಜಿನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಾನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಿನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಾನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಾನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಾನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಿನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಸಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಿನಕ್ಕಿ ನಿಜ್ಜಿನಕ್ಕಿ	^
ుగుతున్నా నిల్క్ వై.ని. క్రామం ఉంది. గ్రామం గ్రామం గ్రామం చేశాలో ఉంది. ఇద్దార్థుల	
្ស - ពេញ ១០៦ ១៧ <b>៤ ១០ ២១០១០១</b> ខែ មានមុខ ១០១២ ១៤ ១ <u>២</u>	
ిమ్మ చేరికోహిక్కు కాట కారు <b>కల</b> ో ఉంటున్నాయి. చారి చేస్తున్న మన	دء
ស្ទាល់២០២០ (A.) នាទី១ ( ) គេ១២០១០២០ ១៩ ២ឆ្នាំ២៩ ស្រែង ១២ ១២ ១២១	
్రికి కోర్ కొన్నారి. మార్క్ మార్క్ క్రిస్తారికి తెలుగుత్వారి.	
ವರ್ಷಗಡ ಗರಗಳನ್ನು ನಿರ್ದೇಶ ರಾಗುತ್ತಿ ಕೆಂದ್ರ ರಾಗುತ್ತಿ ಕೆಂದ್ರ	•
ាណភ «កាល់" មាខាស ស "គឺ ១ ស ខា នេះ <b>១១៩</b> ១ ២ <b>១៤៩ ១១១</b> " ១២១" (១២១" (១១១៩)	£.
not ಗಣರಕ ಬಗಿಗ ಪ್ರಭಾ <b>ತ</b> ಸಿ <mark>ವರದ ಹಲ್ಲಾಕರ</mark> ಕ ನಿರ್ಣ ಪರ್ಮ ಹರ್ಣಾ	/•
the heart dayle and driving that south, as well.	
ddyseul daid odado old eau hilmalt	, A.
∗్ <sup>రా</sup> డ్ మో. మాగాకంటే 180ర్లో కాటెంక్ లే అని పట్టుగ్ పాలేద	
allocate in the contraction is an $oldsymbol{v}$ and $oldsymbol{v}$ and $oldsymbol{v}$	7
tion so we like the design of the section of the se	. · ·
ino an unebtradive of the class and he	, ·
No in the source of the contract of the care of the contract o	<b>?</b> .
•##\\@\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\	^
ាន និង និង ខេត្ត និងស្ថិត ខេត្ត និងស្រី <b>១០១</b>	÷
စေလိန် နှစ် စာလုံးသက္ကရာ စက်သိ သိရက်သော လုံးက လုံး ကားကား ကောင်းကောင်းကောင်းကောင်းကောင်းကောင်းကောင်းကောင်းကောင်	
्ष्रीमृद्धाः स्था स्थाति वर्षाया १००० हिस्सा १९५१ व १९५१ व	^
allengt on itant orthich ontast perception of the	•
र्षेत्रा के किल्ला का कार्य के किल्ला के किल्ला का किल्ला का किल्ला का किल्ला के किल्ला के किल्ला का किल्ला का	

They found the cameras disrupt the trial either not at all or just slightly. The ability for jurors and judges to decide the truthfulness of witnesses or concentrate on testimony is unaffected, and no one seems to feel self-conscious. In fact, the Florida experience showed the presence of the cameras makes the jurors and witnesses feel slightly more responsible for their actions.

Technical advances have reduced the size, noise, and light levels of the electronic equipment so cameras can be used unobtrusively. And while you may find these lights distracting today, if we were -- if we were shooting in here on a regular basis, we could work out a better lighting arrangement that would more -- more fill in the room without having these spotlights like we have now. It's just that -- and I don't mean this in any -- in any more powerful way than I say it, but it's kind of dark in this room. It only --

JUSTICE HECHT: Literally.

MS. KNEELAND: Yeah, I mean it

literally. No offense, please.

It only requires one camera

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

politic leist that diprocesses the library continues	,5
ಇಗರ ಬಳಕ ಡಾಗಿ ಎಂಬ ವಿಶಾಲಕ ಚರ್ಮಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿಯ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆಗಳ	Ç
កិច្ច ១ ១៧៨៩ និស្ស ៤ ១៨៤ - រកិ <b>១១៦</b> ១៤ ៤០, ១៩៩ ២៤១ ១២៤ ១២៤	
witness ou on zenombrate on teaching by $\log$	3
rnaffourer, and no end court by 200	:
servine one suites words ("pal av ecler non-11sa	• <b>• •</b> • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
ರಾಗಿಯ ಅದಿಕ್ಕಾರ್ ಆರೋಗಿಯ ಅವರ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ ಆರ್ಥಿಯ	7
ino graditario dell'apparate Datibale dell'appropri	
conjos dor telefacion.	r
Thebniant advanced same ceduen to	es P
ofser noise, one light develor of the electronic	ŗŗ
arudyment no cararas den be used unobtrusivo y.	r.r.
that white you may fine thene lights distrcting	13
er. rg. eff wo make if ve were abooting in here	<b>7</b> f.
on a require hand is to death out a action	j r
១៤១៤ ១៥១៩ ជំរំបក់ស ដាប់ដៅ កាលបក្សាក់ងារក ក្ការដៅក្រ	E.T.
Title in the second sitebout inving the secondary that	,
lice we have now. Thin just that e- and I can't	- <del>*</del>
rorn tide in our in ong some pelositei ver	~ r
ಪತ್ರಿಯ ಸ್ವರ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಮಾಡುವ ಬಿಡಿಕಿನ ಚಿಕ್ಕಾರ ಕರ್ಮನಿಗಳು ಸ್ವರ್ಥಕ್ಕೆ	6.0
ការស្គម និង ក្រុងស្រីស្គ្រី <del>គេ</del> កា	J. Y
•পুঠ- <sup>†</sup> ্লভাটনী : সাদাস্থাস প্রতিষ্ঠান্ত্র	<i>€</i> ↔
भागित्व के का भागित्व विक्राणां विकास का अधिकार के प्राप्त के प्राप्त के प्राप्त के प्राप्त के प्राप्त के प्रा स्थान	* 24
•ខាធាកាលពីកា ÷្យម <b>ព</b> េធិសិស ស ៖ "ប៉ុស្ធក្នាក់"	A.C
នេះជាក្រុម ១៣៤ ខាងក្រុម $\pi_{i}^{i}$ $\pi_{i}^{i}$ $\pi_{i}^{i}$ $\pi_{i}^{i}$ $\pi_{i}^{i}$ $\pi_{i}^{i}$ $\pi_{i}^{i}$	

stationed in one place throughout the proceeding with video fed out of the courtroom through one cable for pool coverage by several television stations at once. Existing sound systems used by court reporters can be modified to provide sound for the television cameras.

WFAA, the ABC affiliate in Dallas, has done a tape of television coverage of some mock trials, both appellate and criminal, and I'm getting that sent down to you as soon as possible for you to see for yourselves what it involved. They actually -- they shot video of the -- the camera involved.

Beyond the technical advantages of the latest equipment, the authority given judges in Florida and other states to control their own courtrooms has proven to be very effective.

Judges can, themselves, prevent videotaping of juries, children, victims of sex crimes, some informants, and particularly timid witnesses who might be unduly affected by the -- by the camera. I think in most cases, television stations will be more than happy to comply with those kinds of limitations, understanding that we do not want to change the outcome of a trial

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

. . .

ကေလအား ကြာသည်။ တြင္းတာ တြင္းသည္ လာမ္းကိုက္သည္။
ျားနီး မကားစုံးမှစ ကောင်းသည်။ ရေး ကောက္ကာတွင့် မြော့ ထုံးမေ စစ်သည်။ မေ
್ರಾಣ ಕನಕ್ಕಿರಿಗಳ ಅರ್ಜ್ನ ಮುಕ್ತಿರಿಗಳು ಅವರ ಕರ್ಮಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮ
collection and accomplishing the date of parameters
त्या पुरस्कात एक विकास का स्थान विकास का विकास का विकास है।
The wat the guarantees by tomes and produce the

The Cope that the control of the con

the intent the teens of winterper of the teens on a winterper of the teen intention of winterper of the teens of the teens

. .

· .

. 1 3

. ;

.. .

ء ديد اد

1 1

3 ::

1.

i.

. ان

.. .

. . , ,

by our presence.

I only heard about this resolution you're considering very recently, so my testimony was prepared rather hurriedly. I know there are other news directors around the state who would welcome the opportunity to discuss this with you further, and I'd be happy to answer any questions or try gather other materials for you that would help you make the decision on this. In fact, I brought a documentary that we did at KVUE a couple of years ago for you to look at, if you would like to, about the issue.

We feel this is one of the most significant actions you can take to enhance the public's understanding of the important job that you have.

JUSTICE HECHT: Have you left us a copy of your --

MS. KNEELAND: Yeah. Here's my remarks, and here is the copy of the Florida -- the 1979 opinion that the Florida court rendered, with their guidelines, which was upheld by the U.S. Supreme Court in 1981.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Ms.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

and property of the late of the most The Property of the party of the property of the second of មានក្នុង ។ បានក្រុម មានក្រុម នេះ បានប្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស వేరక్ష తుందిన నిఘారంఖరు ఎదాతారంగులు అందిన కండా కార్యం అన్నాయి. .7 of  $\mathbf{v}$ an for  $\mathbf{b}^{(i)}$  , and small of the policy  $\mathbf{a}$  by  $\mathbf{a}$  by  $\mathbf{c}$ 1 charge sug readcond or try gobler other ాజిక లమిణును ఆటర్ టైరాజ పర్జుణా చియితే జూడ్న కాట్ని గ్రామ్నక్షా గ్ 13 ordining a thirt . I, doub, I waspit a 0.5 ರಿ ೨ ಇರಿಯ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಟ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ ಕ್ರಿಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಮ್ J. " the simer days of the deal of me had the more than The floor this in the of the cout sign Clarat that say you don this to enhance the 21 The state of the s ٦, -- 176 C 28 7 E ^ Ï TO TO MENT OF THE PARTY OF THE STATE OF THE 0.0 -- ಇಲ್ಲಿ ಆಶ್ ಇ ಈ ಓಸಿ V ಸಂಕರ್ಣದ ಮಾರಿ ಅಂದಲ್ಲಿ ಎಂದು ಇಲ್ಲಿಯಾಗಿತ the state of the second of the second of the second not the introduction in the condition of both the

The design of the second of th

 $\sim 4.77$  T m  $^{\circ}$  T m  $^{\circ}$  T  $^{\circ}$ 

1	Kneeland, are you aware of the Arizona
2	experiment with their Supreme Court
3	MS. KNEELAND: No, I'm not.
4	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: on
5	public television?
6	MS. KNEELAND: I'm not.
7	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: They
8	selected a few cases to broadcast their
9	proceedings, and and the public television
10	station in Arizona provided background on the
11	case, went to the scene of where the
12	MS. KNEELAND: Oh, uh-huh.
13	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: the
14	facts where the occurrence in question
15	occurred and interviewed the attorneys and made
16	a broadcast out of it.
17	Do you think that there would be
18	enough interest in some of our proceedings for
19	your station, or perhaps a public station or a
20	cable station, to provide the background
21	information
22	MS. KNEELAND: Certainly.
23	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: that
2 4	would make our proceedings understandable?
25	You you have sat here this morning through a

$\mathbf{p}_{t}(\mathbf{p}_{t}) = \mathbf{p}_{t}(\mathbf{p}_{t})$ , where $\mathbf{p}_{t}(\mathbf{p}_{t}) = \mathbf{p}_{t}(\mathbf{p}_{t})$ , where $\mathbf{p}_{t}(\mathbf{p}_{t})$	•
—— ঐমল টে গ.০০ ্লট জ'ল' (১৯ জৈ এল. গছ জা.	"
.dea of the second of the open	•
en la la companya de	
M <b>n</b> ໂກລິກໝາລາ ເປັນສາ	
· com of To the term of	
en den de demonstration de départuis le descrip	ŗ
ರ <b>ದ</b> ್ದಿಗಳಿಕೆ ಇ ತಿಂಡಿ <b>ರವರ</b> ಂದ ಕಡ ಹಿನಗಳುತ್ತರು ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸ	•
cades into, e.g sub that we be taked in ou	445
etation in the done eravious of digramma of the	r
en prid burks to earp, odd od fram (cosp	រៈភ្
-⊹ಟಾಗ−ನರ -ಚರ ಕಗಣಗರಣಕಗಣ .೧೮	C
१ <b>८८ —— :</b> १९८८ स्थान सम्म <b>ण्यामा त्</b> लार म	e r
foots where the edourrence in juention	<u>.</u>
ನ ೧೯ ಆಗಿ ಬಗ್ಗಳ ಇದ್ದರೆಗೆ ರಚಿಕೆ ಈ <b>ಇತ್ತಿಸ</b> ಾತಿ <b>ಗ</b> ್ಗೆ ಗಿರುತ ಗಿರುತ್ತದೆ.	. •
.ಪಟ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಚರ್ಚ ನಿರ್ವಹಣ ಸಂಪ್ರಾಸ್ ಸ	٠ ,
ា ១១៩ ១១១៦១៩៨ ទាន់ ទៅ ១៩៣៦ នៃ ១៩១ <b>១</b> ៣	4 * **
enough interest in percost of organization den	ŗ
ာ ကောင်းသော ကောင်းသည်။ ကောင်းသည် ကောင်းသည် ကောင်းသည် ကောင်းသည်။ ကောင်းသည် ကောင်းသည် ကောင်းသည် ကောင်းသည်။ ကောင်	r
ermengiace hild bhivory of anolders be dis-	;•
fndessitten	1
$ullet \mathbf{Y}^{\perp}$ and width $ullet$ . The temperature $ullet$ and	· · · •
र्वतः । <del> १</del> ००० मान्यम् । १००० वर्षाः स्व १०५५	. ,
A DE HAD been a ub cot be une during the	* **
to the standard the second of the second of the second	• •

And it might

lot of discussions of our rules, and I must

admit they are fairly arcane, even to lawyers.

3

2

MS. KNEELAND: I'm not sure that's

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: But most of

\*\*

the one we will want to cover, but....

5

our cases that come to us do not come on a -- on

7

6

a judgment of the entire facts. We have no

8

basis to review those facts. We are looking at

9

one or two narrow points of law that we are

10

reviewing, and would be unintelligible,

11

perhaps -- many of our cases -- to viewers as a

12

whole without background explanation.

13

be that there would only be a few cases a year,

MS. KNEELAND: Sure.

14 15

even, that we actually were very interested in.

16

We would have been thrilled to have

17

been able to use the video from the Edgewood

19

18

case. It certainly would have made it very much more understandable, and that's probably one of

20

the most important cases you -- you have dealt

21

with this year, certainly, and we already had

22

plenty of video to illustrate that story. We

23

had video of the school -- the school -- the

24

very school districts that you talked about

your -- in the -- in the case, and -- and had

25

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

<i>:</i>	institute of the same of the control of the same of th
· ·	<ul> <li>ఆంగ్రామం లో దారంలోని ఉంది. అందిన కూడా కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ అండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ కా</li></ul>
· •	
S .	••••ពិជា ខែខុឌ ១០១៩ គឺ១១ ១៤៣១ ១០១ គឺ១១១ ម៉ឺង
÷	and the second of the second o
•	na <del>me</del> rina <b>s</b> a na nakali da kana na nakali na
s ·	ాణం ఎందుకు మా <sup>ర్ల</sup> ం చేశారమ్ అంఘార్థుకు కుమెట్ కేగా సమ్మక్షా కార్య ఉం
	and we do not only the second of the second
,.	and the state of t
	en in the later of the same of the same of the same
# # #	on the state of th
10 10 10	•បាល់ស្ទុកាល ១៩ ខាយាយ ប្រាធាល បានក្នុងក្រុម ខេត្ត ស
• •	బ.ంద్ర జీట్ ఎంటెట్
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	ಗರುತ್ತದ ಚಿತ್ರಚಿವರ ಇಗಳಿ ಕರ್ಮನ ತನ್ನಗಳ ವಿಶ್ವಕ್ಷ ನಿರ್ವ
o 25	- All Sob tropics Math. First All supply on god for the
• . •	ovoj na Nokility, apon ov 2 s an ol
	్రాయ్లు కాట్లో ఉన్నాయి. అనిపేశాల కాటేక్ ఉండికి ఉన్నాయి. కాటే కాటే
<b>S</b>	the Mark strain was altaon to Nation is the series
· ·	The plane of marker with the profit of a source of the padages are spread.
ide the third that th	ರ್ಷ-೧೯೮೮ ೧೯೮೮ ರಾಜ್ಯ ಈ ೧೯೬೮ ರ ೧೮೮೮ ೧೩೮ ೧೩೮ ರಾಗಿ ಅಧಿಕಾರಣದ ಅವರು
w jr	ా - గ్రామం - అంగా - ఆతా ఎట్టెడ్డికేందటం - గ్రామం/? గున్కోటి గ్రామం
, e	ు ఇక - ఎం.మూర్లాన్ల చిందాయ్యి ఎన్నడమోద్రమమ్ద్ సరి 6 లక్ష్మ కొతం గృత్వుత్స్త

man -- the interest -- located as my needing the

H

\_

that kind of thing that would have provided background.

One thing I wanted to say, and this kind of relates to that in terms of what you asked about, although, you know, you mentioned a minute. We actually get a minute and thirty.

I'm sure that really soothes your mind, doesn't it, and makes you feel a lot better? We get between a minute thirty and two minutes to present it.

And I would argue that, you know, almost anything you go to could use some editing. You may have felt that way about what you heard this morning. I don't -- I mean, I -- I -- I didn't -- I don't know what you -- you know, I'm no lawyer, so I didn't understand part of what you're talking about, but I would think you wouldn't have minded to have heard the -- a summary, and --

JUSTICE SPEARS: No argument there.

MS. KNEELAND: Okay. And that's

essentially what we do. And maybe sometimes we don't do it as well as you would like, or even we would like, but we try very hard to -- our philosophy is that we're trying to take the

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

to the design of the second of the second second of the se
sont no for the non non or the trapes on the
ေလးကို အေႏြးရသည့် အေျမာက္ကို အေလးကို အေႏြးသည္။ ကို သည့္ တစ္တာအတုိ ကြေသည္တြင္
والإيراد والأولى الأنها الأولى الله في الأوليط الأنها المنظلة الأنهاب الأنهاب الأنهاب الأنهاب الأنهاب الأنهاب
ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.ស.
unmarku
The decay of the decay of the property of the second property of th
which is the state of $\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}}(\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}},\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}},\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}})$ and $\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}}(\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}},\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}},\mathbf{p}_{\mathbf{q}})$
្នាស់ស្ត្រី និង ខេត្ត សេស្តីទេ មាន ប្រធានាធ្វើស្ត្រី សមានសម្រាប់ប្រ
L L clitait Solita and about you Lou
on a rocky green marking. The court in rocky is a
- it me. "." tay have falt that way wi but whit
of the sparsing for Selpt in account to
juq j rungg urûna (plig* Aon knon.∗
<pre></pre>
where the translation of the particular contractions for
the and wakes had been a list Lottent? Telline
Is a this elect a st. A seemped for a pay of any;
professing a security to the action of the second
our conservations and a process from the process.
$R_{\rm cons}$ on which is a spin polynomial constraint $R_{\rm cons}$ on $R_{\rm cons}$
$(a_{i,j}) = \sum_{i \in \mathcal{I}} (a_{i,j} \otimes a_{i,j}) = \sum_{i \in \mathcal{I}} (a_{i,j} \otimes a_{i,j}) \otimes a_{i,j} \otimes a_$
71 d 10 d 61 k (*

But the first the second of th

နက် မြောင်းသို့သည်။ ရေးသည် သေးများသည် မြောင်းသည် မျှနားသည် များသည် များသွားသည် များသွားသည် များသွားသည် များသွာ

**€** :::

٠. ن

,: :

ز ز

34

J 🕽

4 .

: د

: د

14 - 1 4 - 1

. .

. ق

1 2

3

viewer to the scene of whatever we witnessed,

whether it's a trial, or the Legislature in

action, or an accident, or a fire; whatever it

is. But you are trying to go and get the

essence of what happened there, the most

important thing that happened, and present it.

And in the case of trials, you are trying to

present both sides, because there's usually at

least two.

And maybe we don't succeed all the time, but that certainly is our -- our effort, and we could succeed at it a whole lot -- we would be a whole lot more likely to succeed at it if we could actually show what's said in here by intelligent people presenting the argument, and witnesses, than this business that we do now, which is, you know, people running -- chasing people down stairways and through hallways trying to get them to repeat what they said in the courtroom. I think that does the whole judicial system a real disservice.

JUSTICE SPEARS: I hope you understand the spirit in which I said it.

MS. KNEELAND: Sure.

JUSTICE SPEARS: Often what is news

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

```
about the above of the capital of the fe
             Action Lift a trible or the Dog Like no in
     of the fact of the coeffect, and the first profession of the coeffect of the c
                    ್ರೀಟ್ ಕ್ರಾಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಡ್ ಆರ್. ಆರ್. ಬರ್.
                      control of the harpene the reference the control
     the state of the cutting that has broke and traceast us.
          one paterne can now so hatter the correct of the corr
     recient both bider, because blane's urna ly at
                                                                                                                    .cad 1:55
    out fin because they on adven bet
    ordinalist the third continuity is any -- and afforty
         The car of appropriate and the focustry of the
     grafe be a whole lot gare wikely to succeed of
it if no could actually show unotes cail in here
    is in interistant was le precentian the a guadal-
           and thenomore, then this business that we do
               ner, thick is, yet know, propie transper --
                   of mine measing and the delivery and through
   ក្រុម ប៉ុន្តិការ ជាគាខ្លែង ១៨ ខ្លួន ជាខ្លែ ស្ត្រ ខ្លួន ប្រុម្ម ក្រុមក្រុម ក្រុមក្រុម
       noity in the doublebom. I think that fees the
                      .opivnennib Jora a modeve falethur elege
                        ្រុសស្គ្រាស្គ្រាស្គ្រាស្គ្រាស់ នេះស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្
                     ាស់ស្ត្រីទី២០១៩ និង និង ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក្សី ស្រុក
                                                .outtle :f That Will .tt
```

י ר

o Chir

C F

2.5

7 -

**₽** . [

T 🕾

\*\*

Ĵ. ¢.

100

tive the demonstrate and another in the

is what's bizarre, or strange, or unexpected, or 1 dramatic. And sometimes that doesn't -- very 2 often doesn't portray what is really at issue 3 and the issue that the court, whether trial court or appellate court, is trying to focus 5 upon. 7 MS. KNEELAND: Yeah. I would agree 8 with you that sometimes that's --JUSTICE SPEARS: The distractions is

not a problem with me.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. KNEELAND: Uh-huh.

JUSTICE SPEARS: The technology today is -- is good enough that you can have a television camera, and you can have sound, and not disturb any of the proceedings. And I have been in one of those as a trial judge, and after about an hour, the jury forgets all about it, so I don't think it's a problem there.

My concern is its coverage in the way that it is edited and presented to the people, that it be an accurate portrayal of what the trial is really about, rather than some dramatic side issue or side event. Do you see?

MS. KNEELAND: Yeah, and I -- I absolutely agree with you and appreciate it and

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

ាន «២ ជាមន្ត្រីមានប្រធាន ១៣ «. បានប្រជាជីវៈ ១០ «១០១០ម៉ាស់ មួយ១៤ម៉ូល ។	
ನ್ಗಳು ಚಿತ್ರ. ಗಾಗಲ ರಾಜಕಾರ್ಟ್ ಜನಿಕ್ಕಾರ ಕರ್ಮಾನಕ್ಕೆ ಆ ಆ ಆ	(+
ರಾಶ್ ಇದರ ಸ್ವಾತಿಕರ್ ಅಪ್ರತಿಗಳನ್ನು ಭಾರತವರ <b>್</b> ಷ ವಿಶಿಷ್ಣಗಳ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷ	19
tn និងសំពេញ បានមនុស្ស (បានសម្រាស់ 🗗 😅 ១០០០០០, បាន ១៦០០០ បានសំពេញ បាន	;
don to dr ctyritete court, in tryin to reque	**
• FE O T <sub>e</sub> M	••
norma Migno I. Lagr : mmmammm .nm	6-4 (
== ಟ್ರಿಕ್ಟಿಮಿನ ಗರಣ್ಗಿ <b>ತರು</b> ಗಳ ಗರುಳ ಬಿಡಿಸಲ	r
្រំ ខណៈស្រីគាល់ស្នា ១ គណៈ «បាលស្វាញ» បានបញ្ហាប់បាប	>
of a surficial with me.	a.r
.សំសស់−ស់ស :ពេលស្រែកប្រក .សហ	ŗŗ
Z chodenot old sparad in adoptor $Z$	٤.
egeny is cogost annugh tint toon can have n	r r
television calver, and you can have round, an	3. <u>r</u>
ned distant any of the arease lags. Call Deve	<u>;</u> , r
್ಡಿನ ನಿರ್ವಾಧಕ್ಷಣೆಗಳ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷಣೆಗಳ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷಣೆಗಳ ನಿರ್ವಾಧಕ್ಷಣೆಗಳು	<b>~</b> .
chast in loss, the jury Cospets oll, alort its, so	·; r
-ಬ¤ನ್ನಿಗೆ ಸಾರ <sup>ು</sup> ಟೆರಾ¤್ ಪ ಜ <sup>†</sup> ುಕ್ ಸೇಟನಿನ್ † ಹೆಗೆಗಳು ಪ	÷ J.
re dendern statistic the the	ŗr
្រីថា កេដ្ឋា ឆ្នាប់ក <b>១</b> ២៩៦ - កិត្តា សិល្សា ម៉ែង កេដុ ស្រី សាក្រុង ក្នុង	* ,*
nergin, that it he an accur to mortreyal of thet	ŗc
ಕ್ರಾನಿ ಕನ್ನಡ ಸಂಪರ್ಕ ಸಿ. ಇಗ್ರ ನಿರ್ದೇಶಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಿಸಿ	CC
tingite (a title franch or otto ovent. To vit bee?	7.0
" I bee grast : minimum	* 75
ుంది. నీ అశివిందారు గ్రామంటులు దూరిల అందారం గ్రామంలు గ్రామం	i, s

realize that -- that, you know, in the short period of time, it's true that sometimes it is always, of course, the most dramatic and it's going to be reported.

But if you cover a trial over a week's time, you know, that may be one thing that happens one day, but there will be -- you know, I -- I would hope that in the course of that time, you would cover the essence of the -- of the whole issue. I certainly don't --

JUSTICE SPEARS: Those are usually criminal. Those are usually criminal trials in which --

MS. KNEELAND: Yeah. I'm not sure how much you had that was bizarre and dramatic in the school finance case. I -- I -- you know, if there were, we missed that completely.

JUSTICE SPEARS: It was absorbing.

MS. KNEELAND: I'm sure it was.

We would -- you know, and that's why, I think, starting here would be a good place to start. And, you know, you would -- you wouldn't be giving up control of your courtroom. You would -- you would have the authority to decide which cases we would get to do,

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
ាស្តែម ១១៦ ១៤ ខ្លួនភាព សម្បានជនជាតិ 🚗 ១១៩៩ ១១៩៤ ១០
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 . . .
             in the particles of the master the gold of all of
                       ాక్టిస్ స్టార్ తెక్కుడు. కుండి మీకథున్నారికి ఇంది కాండి ఉద్యాహ్హాన్స్ కాండి కింది.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                         white of of of other
                                   -2 1970 0198 5 10ves 209 81 335
                           one did the beingen build which bey an it aftere
             en to the pour our day, but there who a sector to
                  las a lass sit at seed appet habour I -- I greet
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       Ű
  🖚 Ald De object of lat 2000 to Educa big a fid delict
                                                   THE SHARE OF A DESCRIPTION PROPERTY
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                ្សារ៉ា ខាងស្រី សិក្សាស្រីក្នុងស្រីក្រុងស្រីស្រីក្រុងស្រីស្រីក្នុងស្រីស្រីក្រុងស្រីក្រុងស្រីក្រុងស្រីក្រុងស្រីក
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              C.E.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             و چاره و کار است
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      * "
         ond for the cost of the cost
          ្រាស់ ស្នាន់ ស្រែសាស្ត្រី ស្រែសាស្ត្រី បានស្រែសាស្ត្រី បានស្រាស់ ស្រែសាស្ត្រី ស្រែសាស្ត្រី ស្រែសាស្ត្រី ស្រែសាស្ត្
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               • :
ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣಣ ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಣಣ ಕ್ಷಣಣ ಕ್ಷಣಿಸಿದ ಕ್ಷಣಣ ಕ್ಣಣಣ ಕ್ಷಣಣ ಕ್
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  '^ r
                                                         .
             -mak olds am in indakton it mige
                                 The company of the contraction o
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    ٤.
                            r'dodd Sao ,waad doy -- o. nac ol
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    4 1
                                 orby, T tillnk, . Daveing bodd oned be a color
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 * (1)
r y -- lauch wor stond very , of the of evaluation
· . Ordines mean for conduct of the visit of difference
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               7.1
                       and the second to the second of the second o
                                                                                     TO PARTY OF THE MORE OF THE MORE OF THE PARTY OF THE PART
```

¥

essentially. But we sure would like the opportunity, because we feel it would be -- it would be more accurate.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions of Ms. Kneeland?

Thank you very much for coming.

And there's no other witnesses

signed up on this subject -- Professor?

## PROFESSOR PATRICK HAZEL,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

PROFESSOR HAZEL: I would -- if you don't mind, I'm going to say something very briefly again -- Patrick Hazel -- for another audience that would be most interested, at least in the videotapes of the proceedings before this Court, and those are the law schools. I think it would be of a tremendous asset for us to be able to have those arguments, and how the Court questioned the lawyers, and all of the

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

of a critic service or constant of the services	ŗ
$d\beta$ +- of size. A lock ow one star $\phi(d)$ and $\phi$	
•ສຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊຸຊ	
is the parameter of the state	•
South Control of the	;
∙ក្សេខ ១ <b>១</b> ១០% ភ័ពសារ ក្បុខ « ស្រុក បាំស្សសារី	• •
And there is no other additional	7.
ಳಿಗುಡಡಲ20ಗಳ −- ಗರಾಗ್ರಿಸ್ ಗಾಗಿಗೆ ಗರ ಆಗ ಗಿಂದ 's	p
	~
· In two our Innivid Hospitanin	e 1
ពណ៌ ជារាជស្រី និស ស្នាក់សមិន ន <b>ា</b> ជាប្រជាធិ គ្នាធំជ្ <mark>នាង គ្នាក់ពិ</mark> ស្ស ក្ <b>រា</b> តិប្រធានក្រ	7.5
អ្នកក គុខ គ្រួការ ដែលស្នេក គេសា បាន ខុសភា ប្រជាជាធិប្បីក្រុង ព្រះបានក្រុ	<b>~</b> ;
e ances to messa stand of divis Seconder as seen	n t
gerne of the Called Caradorate and Caradorate and Car	<b>p</b> . 40
"ivi my bendo, obsisa on tous:	÷. •
	; ;
राज्य है र चन वर्ष <b>प्रकार क</b> ा क्षेत्र <b>ाहरू ।</b> एका र प्रकारका	ţ. r
Contt mirely "in coing we were concening vern	- m
arielly whith Rabyfeb "anel few another	٠ ;
tringnde that thid be most interchies, at itse cast	ηç
in the vicentanes of the proceedings before th	* ^
fulfil To all code, while the case of the large danger	ឧន
j di dindid so if a tromenando anict des do ba be	<b>~</b>
ాడుకుండా అమెంది బాలంటే నిశాధ గ్రామాయుడుగా <b>ర్స్ గ్రామం</b> తెగ్గాల్ ని ఉంది. ని గ్రామం ఉన్నారి	•
	1 ,

b

proceedings, for all the law schools.

Now, our students in Austin can come down here, but I'm sure you know with class schedules, parking, and all the other, they don't do it very often unless they are in a class that's related to the topic, or something.

But in Houston and in Waco and in -out in Lubbock, those don't have that much
availability. So if videotapes were available,
you might even benefit. We might be able to
provide you with people who could argue a little
better before the Court after seeing the others,
so I speak in behalf of that.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any others on that subject? All right. Then returning to the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, we had gotten through Rule 295. Any comments on Rules 296 through 330?

## HARRY TINDALL,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

.ស.ស. ១០ ១៩៤ ១៨៤ ស.ស. ១៣ ១៣ ១៣ ១៣	r
con non hidny in manne de ano to	•
ಗಳು ಕಾ ಗಿಡಿತಿಗ ಗುರಾಣಿ ಆಗ್ರಾ ಎಂದರು ಬಾಕಿಗೆ ತಥನೆ ಇಂದು ಪಡೆ ಅಲ್ಲ	<b>~</b>
godd (madda o'' lin bar (gaifla) (no'eisdae	
ರ ಗಾಗಿ ರಾಜ ಇಲ್ಲಿಕೆ ಇಲಾಗಡದ ಜನ್ನುಪ್ರ ಇದರು ಗಿರ್ಮಿಸಿಗೆ ನಿಗ್ಗಳಿಗೆಗಾಗಿ	7.
	**
out in immsten on, on occount in	٢
ಇಥಟ ಕೆಡ ಅಥವಾ ೧೮೮೭, ಹೆಗ್ರಿಕರ ಲಿರಡ್ಕಿಟ ಎಡಲಾ ಹೆಚ್ಚರ ಎಡಲಿ	
availed they are continued to the continued available.	•
to ofto of a ship a lastin we been a re-	. ٤.
: "Jalle a on the given ode please lake more there e	۲
್ ಎಂದುನಿಕ ಅಂತರ ಗಳುಕೊಂಡಿಗೆ ಗಂಡಕ್ಕೆ ಮನೆ ಕಡೆಯಾಗಿ ಇಂದು ದಾಗಗಾಗಿದ್ದರೆ ಇದಕ್ಕೆ	<b>:</b>
.ఆనగణి క్షే వివరణులో బ <b>ి మేదర</b> ్లు గ్రామ	. معر د د:
ವಿನಾವರ ಕಾರ ೧೮೦೨ ೨೧ ೪೫೩ - :೧೯ <mark>೦</mark> ೦೮ ೮೮/೯೪೪೪	* •
ရေးရှိ ကြားနှံ့ ကြေးနိုင်တွင်တွင် ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသွင်းကြောင့် ကြောင်းသွင်းကြောင့် ကြောင်းသွင်းကြောင့် ကြော	≪4. ;
සාවත්වල එකර ලබා දෙසා "ගසායා වී (එම් $oldsymbol{ au}$ ).න වෙන්නට ඉහරයා	•ን ፡
end to the the care can also as a contract of the contract of	7
State of the state	i
	6.
The state of the s	· • 6
al compact to the opening of control of the control	£f
ដែលផ្ទុំប្រជាជុំ ចល់ ទៅ នាងក្រុង នៅមានស្ថិត សម្រេច ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុ	36
ranged water essent of Avir Le noise reason on so this	7.6
$\mathcal{L}_{\mathbf{u}}$ is the constant properties of the substitution of $\mathbf{u}$	• ,
gen om mes in der ≠5000 gelock in Die de Stephylopies in der der de Bereich in Die der der	ŗn ·



1	MR. TINDALL: I'm Harry Tindall
2	from Houston, Texas.
3	And somehow in the drafting of the
4	proposed Rule 308a, I think it fell through the
5	cracks and didn't get quite drafted correctly.
6	One clause was left out.
7	JUSTICE SPEARS: Excuse me just a
8	minute.
9	Is is it just coincidental that
10	you have stopped the television coverage of this
11	area, or is the one issue that you are here for
12	already been done?
13	MR. TINDALL: Judge, I had hoped
14	that 308a would be newsworthy, but I'm
15	JUSTICE SPEARS: I think we agree.
16	MR. TINDALL: It's not very sexy.
17	Anyway, it's just a a correction
18	here, and I wanted to get on the record that I
19	think this does correctly reflect what the
20	Advisory Committee figured out.
21	JUSTICE HECHT: All right.
22	Technical change
23	MR. TINDALL: Right.
2 4	JUSTICE HECHT: 308a.
25	MR. TINDALL: That's it.

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

```
TO A TO SECOND TO A SECOND TO THE SECOND THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  - { }
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 the state of the s
               And someless in the exalting of the
      programme the appropriate the company of the company of the
               ా - కై. బోతాల్కా కల్లో కాట్స్ కి. మంటేఖ్యంకా కాటక కట్టాక్కి కాటు కట్టికి క
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      7
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         On. with a work out.
                        ្ន និស្សរួម ស្រាស្ត្រ និងស្ថិត្ត ស្រែក្រុង ស្រែក្រុង
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      ĩ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    and anne.
               It -- in it just crincisons ! chat-
to the seasover and the edition of the season of the season of the color of the col
         arma, of in the one infine firth you are idea ion
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       T.I.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     รือสด กลายแ สูติธาราช
                                    ుర్ధుడ్ ఎంది కె ఎందర్కా :చినాన్ 🕱 . చ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               E I
                                                      Chat are rould be nevalably, but i'm....
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               suppress of the contract of the second
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               ". E
                          Control of the state of the state of the state of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                - J.
              of Control of a -- Country of all gray tife.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               7.1
                      ್ ಪ್ರದರ್ಶ, ನಡಗೆ ಬಿ ಅಗ್ರಾರ್ಡ ಕೆಟ್ಟರ ಅಗ್ರಾಥ್ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರಾರ್ಥಿಸಿಕ ಕೆಟ್ಟರ್ ಪ್ರಾರ್ಥಿಸಿಕ ಕೆಟ್ಟರ್ ಪ್ರಾರ್ಥಿಸಿಕ ಕೆಟ್ಟರ್ ಪ
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           ्रे ह
                                                        think this tee correctly was not that the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             relytrory for mittee figure cut.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 7 0
                                                                                                     Jusgrav Enger: 718 right.
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                IC
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         Teahnica, disage --
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                0.0
                                                                                                                                                                       SELECTION STATES OF THE SECOND
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    ~ C
                                                                                                                         The state of the s
```

The state of the s

.

JUSTICE HECHT: All right. 1 other comments on 296 through 330? 2 comments on the rest of the Rules of Civil 3 Procedure? 5 JOHN WILLIAMS, appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas 10 Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of 11 Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 12 MR. WILLIAMS: I'm John Williams 13 14 from Nueces County, Robstown, Texas. I 15 represent the Justice of the Peace & Constables Association. 16 I would like to comment on Rules 534 17 and 536. We oppose the change in these rules. 18 Let me start off with 534 where it says that you 19 have to give the -- oh, the person who files the 20 21 claim or the citation, that you shall give him back the papers if he wants to serve them. 22 23 As it stands now, usually it's the constables that serve all of our papers. We're 24

25

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

happy with this setup. We don't have any gripes

The state of the s	۳
ga - 9000 comende 1000 de able mos de es	43
ిపింద్రి న్లో దర్శక్తి చేస్తాన్ని ఆ కుట్టుక్కుంటే అ	Ç
ປົວ ກ່າວ <b>ຄ</b> ວາກຕົ	-,
Biological Company of the Company of	7
e nearthno sefere the July one dearth of Monac in	7
all dans called a companies of the compa	7
ខាងការី •្វក្សាទី <b>១០១</b> ១១ និ <b>ប</b> ិសិ ខិស ១៩៩១៣ ព្យុស្សាលា ១៩ ២១១៣១៨១	٠
The noise of the continuous and the the second of the continuous and	₹°.
night i väkenda, dtotol ad 20 kommit (hytin	£ r
	çţ
ersitter ader mit : numre ur .gn	<b>e</b> 2
್ -೧೯೫೮ನ ಕ್ರಾಣಕ್ರಚಿತ್ರ ಕೃತ್ಯಚಾತ್ರ ನಿರಾಧಕಾಗ್ ಬ್ರಾನಿಕ	ĵ. <b>r</b>
್ ಚಿಳಿತಕಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ೨ ಅಂದರ - ಎ.೧ ದಿಲ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕಲ್ ಈ ಅನೆಕ ಬರುಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಇತ	₹ ₹
•ស្ស <sup>†</sup> ្ឋិត្តិស្ត្រូវ	· r
10% count as facilité de partie du mande de 10% par 10	7.7
ane 100. The only paper when the other mile of the other	• •
ణంగా కిందిన - <b>గం</b> న మేక్ అనలున్నిక్కి మహిళ్గ స్థల్ జివితాన్నికి మండ్రి	· ·
್ರ ಆರ್. ಪ್ರತಿಕೆ ಇಳಿದ ಕಾರು <b>ಕಾರ್ ಅನ್ನೇ ಕ</b> ್ರಿಸಿ <del></del> ಅತ್ಯಗ್ ಕ್ಷಾರ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್ ಕ್ರಿಸ್	2.0
ನಕ್ಕೆ ನಾಗುತ್ತ ನಿನ್ನಾನವು ಕಾರಣ ನ್ಯಾಪಕ್ಷ ಸ್ಥಾರಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ಷಾಪ್ರ	ş.,.
- ಆರ್.ವಿದ್ಯರಿಗಳು ಅವರ ಪ್ರವಾಣಗಳು ಅವರ ಪ್ರಧಾನ ಸಂಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ಅವರ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಸಿಗಳು	* <b>(</b> +
ali otal v land la sala sala sala	. • 6•

orial in the state was the state of the state were selected and the state of the st

ಎರ್. ಇ ಇಜ್ಜು ಇಳ್ಳು ಹಿಂದಿ ಅಂತ್ರಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ಷಾಮಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಕ್ಷಾಮಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಕ್ಷಾಮಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಿನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಿನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಿನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಿನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಿನಿಕ ಸಿದಿಕ ಸ್ಥಿನಿಕ ಸ್ಥಿನಿಕ ಸಿ

about it, and we don't seem to have problems getting them served. My worst doubt, I guess, would be in default judgments where if somebody served the papers that you didn't know or wasn't sure if they really got served. If -- I feel like that if your constable or one of his deputies served it, then you are more apt to believe that the papers were served.

As you go on down, they have marked out: "The citation shall further direct that if it is not served in 90 days..." it would be returned. Well, how are they going to return the citation to the court? Are they going to keep it from now on? They have no way to getting it back to the court. So I think this -- this change is bad, too.

And under "Form," b, where it says that the -- should be signed by the clerk and under the seal of the court, the justice court has no seal. We -- we have never had a seal.

So there's a bunch of changes here that we can't conform to. I don't -- and I'm not against changes at all, but there's a bunch of things that we can't conform to. So in 534 we're asking that it go back to its original

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

one has the contract of the co ្រុកស្រាស់ 🐣 🐒 ស្រែក និស្សស្នា 💰 🕻 🕠 ស្រុកស្រែក សភាពនៃ 🧸 កំពង់ស្រែក . . Residence I be an a comment of the relieve to the contraction ក្រុងប្រាស់ នេះ ប្រធាន ប្រើស្រុក ស្រុក ស្នាលើ ស្រុកពេល កស្ដី ប៉ុន្តែក្រុក The state of the arm and the state of the st 7 obid to our to eidedobre morn it foll by a ಾನಿ ಶೈತ್ರ ಅತ್ಯು ಅತ್ಯ ಅಂಗ್ರಾಪ್ ಕಡಿಗೆ ಕಿಂತಿನ ಹಿಂದಾಗಿಯ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಕಿಂಡಿ indicate the time and the contraction of the contra Title even you't the er or not be The distriction of the second of the second control of the second of the 0.5 to the good genus the CC action is to the country to Ι. " returns . Of , box are they est to course The direction to the descript and they going to of you on over yeld fine has been it one ామ్మాగ్ మీ కొంటేన్ ఎందు.కాండర్ భాగ్ ఇంది ఉంది. \* F The Court of the Control of the cont myon da oncin to "the my nothing of 7 a 1. Ship blue -- sland of Gorofe of trops -- sld tidd or is a blood or in a contract the contract of the course 45 THE PARK A GOOD OF WORLD WAS A BOOK OF A SECOND OF A PARK namo ( tananni: Ba donge e eliyebis je je , , - 187 300 His Birth 1 - 10 Indiana 210 Ch រំបស់ ស្រុក សព្ទ ស្រុក ស

್ರ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾಮಾನಿಕ ಕ

0.11

state and stay that way.

JUSTICE HECHT: All right. Any questions?

Thank you very much.

MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you.

# BILL BAILEY,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. BAILEY: Bill Bailey from

Pasadena. If it please the Court, the same
song, second verse. I'm sorry that Justice

Gonzalez is not here. He opened up another
avenue that -- that we weren't really going to

broach in our opposition to the change in -- in

534, 536.

534 we share the concern over the removal of the 90-day. Even if we were to go to a hundred and twenty days, we would like to see some end date on those papers, obviously, and we would like to see some tracking of those papers.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the state of the s MAN CARAGO DIA PERSENTA AMERICA \$5.70.370.00 . Con a greek cong i to T . wet weeks : "Throad . for ari nomest ka domest parentet prid solotes saltabor, a all nietrative desation to densifice provered composition and the state of th ., Ĺ to because course and considered established in the color ాణుకున్నాడు. ఎక్కాడికి 20 <mark>..రి.</mark>.రాషూర్ ...గోట - 1 mesk youldn't fill : aspron . . . . . Todochar. "E it licede the Chryte, the same core, adiona verse. Les esery bind Funktide Congressed in mid hard. The decoding another ې ۲ avenua tiet -- t at ve ter ett set uce. Tr (eing tr Greeder in aus a profeson to the change in -- in · Car y A TE 0.1 174 we where the recent over the \* :\* received of the follows. Even if we were for to 5 % o auniford and toponto energible work filte da sale of the sale of the contract of

- r.

. .

· and any need to be quidebent each och of rills is now

25

536, let me speak to the removal of the emergency language. It's a case where we believe that we want to invoke the doctrine: Ιf it's not broke, it doesn't need fixing. It's worked. And there have been concerns by lawyers across the state, and rightly so, that they have been unable to get good service. Who here doesn't know the name Tracy Maxim (phonetic) in Harris County? That's plagued us for years, and we're still trying to live that down. working diligently, with your help, across the state of Texas to educate and get better service, get a better class of officer on the street. Now, with the TCLEOSE rules, I would like to point out to the Court that an officer has to keep going back for his in-service training. If he doesn't, he's going to be out. That's going --CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Could you

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Could you tell us what those --

MR. BAILEY: Sir?

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: You used an abbrev -- abbreviation.

MR. BAILEY: Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Standards and Education -- pardon

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the troubt object time with the company	
က ကြောင်းကြောင်းများသည်။ သည် သည် သည် အသည် ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းများ	<i>c</i> ,
్ ులడి నవితర పడివే ఎవ్రాంగాణ్ గార్థి మొద్దారు. పాటా ఫోకన్నే తారుకేస్తు	~
≱ಿಸಿಕ್ - ∙್ರಾಮಿಟ್ಕ್ರಾಯಕ ಕಿಂತಿ ಬಾರಾಯ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಇಲ್ಲಿಲ್ಲಿ ಕಿಂತ್ರ ಬಿಕ್ಕು ಬ್ರಿ	•
alem was the carbbook for both of the pull of the code of	
ကြားကြောက်သည်။ ကိုသည် ကိုသည်။ ကိုသည်။ မြောက်သည်။ မြောက်သည်။ မြောက်သည်။ မြောက်သည်။	•
ರಾಗುತ್ತದೆ ಜನ್ನ . ಚಾಲಾಳ್ಗಳು ಅರು ಚರಿಸಿ ನಡೆ ನಟ್ಟಿಕೆಯ ಸರಿಗಳು	i.
r ( liceach) with the seast compact disposes	
್ಯಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿದ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಬಳಸಿಗೆ ಬಿಡು ಚಿತ್ರ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಬಳಸಿಗಳ ಬಳಸಿಗಳು ಬಳಸಿಗಳು ಬಳಸಿಗಳು ಬಳಸಿಗಳು ಬಳಸಿಗಳು ಬಳಸಿಗಳು ಬಳಸಿಗಳು	(
ರಸ್ಕರ್ .ಮೀತ್ರ ಕರ್ಗರಿಸಿ ಅಫಿಫಿ ಕಾರ್ಡಿ ಇಂಡಿಕ್ಟರ್ 'ವಿಕಿಯರ ಅರ್ಜಕ್ಕೆಯ	<u> </u>
. ನಿರ್ದೇಶಕಾಣ ಕಂತರಿಯ ಕ್ರಾನ್ಯ ಕ್ಷಾನ್ಯ ಕ	2.3
සම්බර් සේ ස්වාධ සහ ගම් <b>සමාර්</b> ව මෙම සිට <mark>වර්</mark> වේ	5.3
ರಾಗಕ ಇದ ಸಂಕಾರಿಸಿಗಳು 15 ಸಂಚರಿ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷಣಗಳು ಎಂದು ಸಂಪುರ್ಧ ಕರ್ಮಿಸುತ್ತಾರೆ.	es -
್ರಿಶಾಲಕ್ಕೆ ಒಂದಾರಿಗಳ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗಳ ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗಳು ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗಳು ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗಳು ಸ್ಥಾನಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗಳು	٠.
್ ಕ್ರೌಡ್ಡ್ ಮತ್ತು ಹಾಗಾವಿದ ಹಾಗಾಗಾಗಿ ಅಂತ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್	
column-si by the $C$ pairs, post of said	Ĺ
-1 70 on of galage stor estances and let	<u>;</u> r
The state of the s	
न्तरपुर्वे । १९ जनगण्य । १८ वर्षा १८ १ वर्षा १८ १ वर्षा १८ १ वर्षा	? *
១០០៧៩ ៤០៨៤ on Wies	7:
TARO : 1 BATT TUE M	Ę÷
এটে এ০ লৈ <b>প্ৰ</b> শ্ন <mark>: শহানিক শহান গ</mark> াল গোলা গুল	0
ashter a seriation.	<i>(</i> )
37 A 36 tabet osof : 4777 .f	<b>n</b> 1
no mak noliaon - kan kakin nati - ka kina na	<i>.</i>

me, Your Honor. That -- all sworn officers in
the state of Texas now must have 40 hours

in-service every two years in order just to
maintain his license. We think that's
important.

JUSTICE COOK: How -- how many hou

JUSTICE COOK: How -- how many hours does he have to have to get his license?

MR. BAILEY: Four hundred and twenty -- four twenty -- 420, yes, sir. And that's -- that, here again, is also governed by the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Standards and Education.

One of the things that -- may I use TCLEOSE? -- hasn't addressed that we think, that through your help, and our justice court training center is doing, is on civil process. I think they require eight hours of civil process to get your basic certification. We're offering 20-hour schools, plus, this year, under an extended grant from you folks, we have come up with three classes, three schools of advanced 40 hours, advanced civil process. We have made tremendous strides.

Isn't it odd that the people that want to serve the papers want to serve the easy

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
and stable for a most time to the stable of 
                                       one to the first owner of the most control to the section of the
                               one that however his at the process of the areas
                                                                  interest faile of common functions of the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    THE THE COLD COLD OF THE COLD COLD COLD COLD
                                                       To reter the device over at the device.
                                       ina mondard rugs (resist of the
                        war . the year twenty -- year war.
        The community of the distance of a series of the contract of t
                                                              the Terral Counting on Test University
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            F 5
                                                                                                                                                                     .neideau " has batchas!
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              . .
   of the Configuration of the Co
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  ٠.
dolo edata to doud burn to no dineal -- general
                                                     of are only one one or in ico anutic
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       ; •
          training center to they to out tivil arosome.
                                                  the state they reprise out house it deads
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         7.5
    recess to to your house co. tiltheation. "e'rr
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 1 5
affering ?d-laur schooler, dus, the gears of or
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             ~ F
        an enterder grant from pour se ha, we tave earth
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              ్లలు కారం క్రిక్ ఆ కారిక్ర ఉంది. ఈ ఇక్కువడిన గ్రామంలో చేస్తున్నారి.
                the proof of larger literation connects, the day
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              3.60
```

್ರಾಜ್ಞಾನ ಎಂದಿಗೆ ಅಂತರ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಾರ್ಮಿಯ ಗಾರ್ಚನ್ನು ಅವರ ಅಂತಾಹಿತ್ತರ ಅರ್ಥಕ್ಷಣೆಗಳು

7. P

్ష నియ్యాన్, ఉందార్ కట్టి కేర్మణికి మంది కాన్ కోడుందార్లు

citations? We have not seen a hue and cry from across the state of Texas asking to serve the attorney general's papers where they're — they're exempt from any kind of a fee, and we think that's patently unfair. We — we serve the free papers, and we serve the hard papers, and it's all one price. And we think that everybody ought to sing on the same sheet of music. Reliability, credibility; a peace officer proven by his license that he is an officer of the court; liability. The constable — as an elected official, I am liable from now on.

And let me say another thing: Those of you -- and I'm sure there are some bad constables, and we're working -- we're working harder than anybody to clean up our own act. We want them out of office. We want them out of office and out of town.

But where are these attorneys that are having this great problem? First of all, there is remedy under current law by going in and filing motions, and the judge has the leeway to grant all who serve it. Why don't these lawyers file a writ of mandamus, or some other

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

and set the above as a critic, to serve by the control of control

10 Indicate we say another taking: Thought 20 one take the second its country of the condition of the country o

Also, le

charge, to force that officeholder to do his job? If you-all don't perform your duties, you are going to be removed from office. Same thing with -- we -- we say remove the scoundrels; kick them out. If they're not doing what they're -- they're civilly and criminally liable in many instances for what they do. They should be removed, and they should be filed on. We haven't seen any great deal of that.

Accountability in tracking: In
Harris County we are on a JIM, the Justice
Information Management system, tracking at any
time. All of the papers go, save and except the
justice courts -- and we get them right from our
JPs -- but they go to the constable of Precinct
l downtown. They are put on a computer; then
they are sent to the constables out in the
precincts. Then they assign them to an officer.
All that's done on the computer, and it's
tracking. A lawyer, anybody that's interested
in that case, can find out where that case is at
any time. That would not be the case if it was
given up to a private or individual -- a person
outside of the court.

Also, let me point out to you the

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
the production of the course the base of the party of the second of the course of the 
    ាល។ ព្រះប្រើប្រាស់ ដូចបញ្ជាក្នុង មេនិងស្រាស់ ស្រាប្រ ស្រាប់ ស្រាប
 on 18d on the collection of temperature of on the production
 wold grown aucra - is over so that to -- on -- byte
  or the compact through the state of the stat
      the state of the call craming of his call of the
                             in chargen and what they o. They ober a bo-
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      .
                                       terevec, an alog house be filter in. e.
                                                                           the costs and creat rail of the co.
                             "decombenialty in trackfur: - m
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        " r
                                   Threin conty we are in a 2014 the Justina
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     1.5
         minrantion in acquions pater, the obline of the
the. All of the printer of a core exculting the
iniside aparts -- and us jot their at fire from our
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         Γ
    and we are thing on to lite continuing on interior
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  1. J.
                A dominiown. They are and on a decimber; then
                                 confidence and the area tribled and the fact
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       1. L
  precisets. The they audign has a can eaflicer.
                                            will that the condition of the contract that all the
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       r
                  of panears misses glockyns, anymas in .pa.konad
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  . . .
 its no seno dadd deadw dwo bnil . A color dail it
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   • (
          en tile. If the would not so the east if it is
      q gran to the continuate of the first upon the annual property of
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  attr beeds in a time to
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  î ,•
```

is the term of the of they are done to be a

....

cost of government that this would entail. This would cost county government. We would lose that \$35 service fee. Now, in addition to serving the easy papers, we have the hard papers we have to serve. We also work in the court's behalf on extremely difficult -- writs of attachment where held in tremendous danger sometimes, mental health warrants that we serve.

The point of it is this: that the justices of the peace of the state of Texas and the constables serve. Now, you folks are the highest judges in the land in the state of Texas, and we're talking about the lowest court in the land. But they're going to see more on their docket in a week than you're going to see in a term, in many instances. It's an important court, but it can't be transformed into the Supreme Court under rules.

You see, we -- the written word and the practical application of the written word is many times very different, gentlemen, and I ask you to remember that in your deliberations. We ask that the -- the rules be -- remain unchanged.

And let me say this: that we have

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

Fire allings of the like a little of the loop of the fire of the	
and the property of the aubove confined to an alleger.	.•
provide to the compact of the second of the compact	•
albega, barr, and combour worden made (2 galoviac	ŝ
ការសេវៈ ស្រីថា ក្រី សុខស្នា ១០០ ឆ្នាំ «១២៦» សុខសាល់ សុខ	••
ని గుండిన్నాయి. <del></del> ఆక్టార్ల క్రిస్త్ క్లిక్ ఉందుకోయాల కండన్ టింది	****
အစက္ကြားနယ္ မက္သက္သက္သည္သည္။ ကုိသည့္ ကာလည္းမွာ သိုက္သည့္ အေနာရွိနည္း	ŗ
. we had a first that head that we have a second to we.	•
SOUND CONTRACTOR OF THE SECOND	•
jungford of the scace of the oblice of Tenor and	î. <b>"</b>
మానికి సూడు నమోగణకు కూడాన్ని కాటుక్కారు. అనాగాడు దారవర్సాడు ఉందిన	· . ·
ិស្ស សេវាភេឌីស <b>ខ្</b> លីទី នេះ គឺ ស្រី <sup>3</sup> គឺ <sup>3</sup> ទី ១០ ដូចក្រុង <b>ប្</b> រឹ ទីពក្សក្សិសិ	• 1
Sent. Jane water talking castt line for and wast	
និក ខែ២០ និងក . "ជា២ ២២ ខ្លាំន - ខេស្ស ៥២ ១០០ ១០០១ ០០០	<u>^</u> F
epan ed gulam <mark>ortul</mark> y wastd dress noted <b>deds</b> ) giede	*
in a further many inches or the on its or interest	. ,
what rould be thought on the part of the sould be the second	r.r
.uo.uo nu kan huush bassen	
್ಷಣ ನಿಗರಣ ಒಂದರಿಕೆ ಒಂದರ ದರ್ಚಿಕ ಕಂಡ ಇದ್ದಾರ ಕಟ್ಟ	• д
time reductors of the bilen of the principle or the principle.	· 'h
dia T Bus , noveltne, dasacat PD grave on da grave	ĭ, ,
you to no order think n your aniburations. In	pэ
್ ಬಾರಬ ಈಈ ಗಳ ಗಳಿತು ಹಾಗಿದೆ ಈಈ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ತಿಳಿತು ನೀಡು	* 7*
· s. is re-light	1 15

ಗಳು ಎಎ <mark>ತಗಸಿತ :</mark>ಕ್ರೀಸ್ 100 - 3 1 (ಇಗ

addressed, also, poor service problems, because our association and our group passed legislation recently that a constable could serve in contiguous counties. So if you've got a problem in one county, there is relief available, at least in a surrounding county; and that gives you a wider forum. And we appreciate this forum.

I will address only one other thing, and that is in the future. This is a tremendous step, it's a breath of fresh air, and I appreciate the opportunity of just coming to make our views known.

We would also beg the Court to consider that in the future under rule making that's going to impact the justice courts, that they at least have some impact on the deliberations.

Thank you very much.

JUSTICE SPEARS: Just one question.

We have had requests for the ability to -- for private service for years now. And my question to you is: Why do you think we have had all these requests, if everything is working so well?

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

and the first and ending a second of the sec	ť
(1,2,3,3) , which is the second of the second probability and $(2,2,3)$	
ಷ್ಟಿ ತ∀:೧೯ ೧೯೫೯೪ ಕ ಚಾರ್ಚಿಕ ಕ ನ ಸಮಿತಿ _ುರ್ದೇವರ	
သည်သို့ကေသ မြေသည် ရေးသည် သို့အားမှ သည်။ ကိုသည် <b>ဥေ</b> လိုက်တာလည်း ကို <b>သည်</b> မြို့သည် မြို့သည့် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည့် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည့် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည် မြို့သည့် မြို့သည် မြို့သည့် မြို့သည် မြို့သည့် မြို့သည	
and the state of t	-
ក្រុម ជា នៅ ខេត្តស្រែក ក្រុមប្រជាពលប្រធានក្រុម ប្រ	** V
a de si decembra e la la la companya de la companya	***
•្រ.ក្រ. <u>ក្</u> ឋី	
<ul> <li>I market emboging arms and dust</li> </ul>	,
om og bong i skriftin var birt en skrik av og silt ben	- v
ಸಮಗಳು ಅವರ ಅವರ ಜನಕ್ಕೆ ಮಾಡುವರು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಅವರ ಬ	• •
నవి కూడినుముక కురణన్నమ్ కృష్ణికారు. ఇండ్లు కూడి కుర్మార్జు	υĭ
•คาการกับแบบ การการการการการการการการการการการการการก	" <b>r</b>
್ರಿ ಬಿಡುಗಾರ ತಮ್ಮ ಬಹಾಗಿ ಸ್ಪಾಟಿಕ ಗಟ್ಟಾಗು ಪ	ţ. #
ារប៉ូស៊ី១ ១១២០ ការប៉ុន្មា ជាស្រុក និង នៅ ១០៤៩ (re ianor)	• •
ార్ వి శ్వవ్యాల్లో చాలా ప్రాటక్ష్ అమెక్ ప్రాటెమ్ అవి రాజు 💉 కార్స్ 🕏	
or the mean of a point of the control of the contro	Pig.
• total filtration	<i>.</i> *
-សិស្ស ប្រុស្ស ស្រួស្កាល បាន ស្រួស្កាល បាន ប្រុស្ស បាន បាន បាន ប្រុស្ស បាន	` <i>r</i>
- នៅទាន់ជា ១៧២១ (ភ.ក. : ការ ក្រុក )។	<i>z</i> .
ರ್ಯಾಗ್ ೯೬೬ ಕನ್ನಡ ಕನ್ನಡ ಕನ್ನಡ ಕನ್ನಡ ಕನ್ನಡ ಕನ್ನಡಕ್ಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಕ್ಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಕ್ಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಕ್ಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಕ್ಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಕ್ಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಕ್ಕೆ	0.0
An and post is the strong of the pair as a month	?
	÷

cr .

MR. BAILEY: Sir, I -- first of all, I don't make the premise to come here and insult your intelligence by telling you that things are well all over the state of Texas; it's just not true. Secondly --

JUSTICE SPEARS: What can be done about it?

MR. BAILEY: Well, we're -- we're education, and that's what we're in the process of doing right now. We have thrown -- we have worked diligently to get upgrade in the -- let me tell you something: Peer pressure within our own -- own community is working to the benefit of the state of Texas, to the citizens of the state.

When you have got one constable in the -- in the -- in a county that's come to one of our schools -- schools that you-all have funded -- and he's doing a good job -- he's going to make John Doe get off of it over here; otherwise, he's only got two years before he's got that license that's going to come due, and if he doesn't go to some kind of school, he's going to be gone. Do you see what I'm saying? The process is working.

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

The property of the second of . . ರವಾಸರಣ್ಣ (13 ರಜ್ಞಾನ) ರವೀಕ್ ಅತ್ಯಂತ (10 ರಷ್ಟ್ರಿ ಮುಖ್ಯವಾಗಿ) ಕೆಗಳು The second state of the second min gray of the second Control of the diagram of the control 63 Complete the second of the sec 化对抗性的 化二环烷化 海蓝 医紫色 化二氯化物 化氯磺胺磺胺 有效的 海流 医抗性病性病 and the property of the state o 5 F the common term of the state of \* 2\* that is  $\Omega$  if the form case  $g \in \operatorname{const}(x)$  ,  $g \in \operatorname{const}(x)$  ,  $g \in \operatorname{const}(x)$ of the reconstrate is a second to a set of the contract of the 5.5 • and the comment of th · · · LAM OF A SO HE STATE WAS TOO TO GET THE BUILDING TO 7 -ា∛ល ពីស្រា⇔ស្សាញ ស្នក ស្រាស់ ខាន់ស្រាស់ 😁 ស្រីស្ត្រីស ្រាស្សា ពីស ion -- of long on it ried by -- election two selections are the first selection of the start lies and ా క్వాన్ కాలప్రంలో కాయకుడానాని. అనాను కుర్యం కృష్ణాడ్ మెక్స్స్ ఇట్రి స్వామం కుర్మా 10 Did you note or mains alough canced firld div Ç. .. ्यां कर स्टूडिंग है। अंदर्भ के एक स्थापन है । व्यक्ति है Simply no will ship on a not of the sile of party ^ · ·

in the second of the second of

. .

2

Α

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Now, also I want to point out to

you, Justice Spears, a moment ago I said you --

I know that they've come to you. I think the

motive is two-fold: number one motive, money;

number two, it's the easy way to do it. If they

have got a problem with a man that's not the

sheriff or a constable, okay? either one -- and

let's just put the sheriffs in on this, because

in a lot of counties the sheriff -- this is not

just a constable's dilemma. Why haven't they

filed a writ against him to force him to do his

job? Well, they don't want to do that for

political considerations. Well, now wait a

minute. Now, let's be fair to everybody, okay?

I'm not saying that it's -- it's --

I'm saying it's a far better way to leave it in

the hands of professional officers of the court

and peace officers.

Let me mention one other thing.

We're not welcome guests at a banquet many times

when we serve a paper, even though it's a civil

citation. They don't invite us in whenever that

hated woman that they loved not six months ago

is suing them for divorce and trying to get

their pension fund, and they take out that

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

ကာက အက်ကွား လိုင္းကို လည္သူ အိန္နဲ့ တြင္းကို လူတစ္ခုန္းကို ရွက္ခြင္း မေတြကို of dated on they in placed the dank controlled active to be efelor and or one locks a nonego gold for late the od gas space wide fait your rest which bay, job corablem with a sam chat's net cla out the land areas of Table is a common of the Patholic with a wast and the obreils, in a chia, because van of citt --- bills in out coidings as in the said ್ಯಾಯ ಜ ಹಿತಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಇವರ ಎಂದಾಗುತ್ತಿಗೆ ಭಾರತಿಗೆ ಮುಯ ಪ್ರಾಗಾಗಿತ [ ] nakan di makatan kenalagan dan dan dan berangan daran di Abbertan dan kenalagan dan dan dan dan Abbertan dan d 7.7 the Burgara of the direct direct years allow gray . . . of dina went of the another chiefer of spitting of the ~ r sinute. Toy, Lut's Te fair to everybedy, chay? 4 5 not crying blat (t) -- 't' --it, davige fifte o ker become ray to iceve this is ~ F the error of o. elemenonel afficeur of the court " J. on once officers. 

estif and encounter addition of domination of the entit and entit

frustration on the officer sometimes. 1 2 May I call your attention that they -- that we are still peace keepers also, 3 and I think you're leaving it open to some other 5 worms if you just let anybody go serve that citation. You're going to get somebody's head 6 7 whipped. 8 Thank you very much. We appreciate 9 it. 10 JUSTICE HECHT: Any other comments 11 on the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure? 12 Yes. 13 14 HARRY TINDALL, 15 appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in 16 administrative session to consider proposed 17 changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas 18 Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 19 20 21 Judge, I'm Harry MR. TINDALL: Tindall, and I'm here to -- I was a chief 22 23 draftsman on the Advisory Committee on these 24 rules regarding service, and I feel like

25

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

something must be said for the lawyers of this

• Company of the state of the s	•
ាល់ទី២ ខេត្តទីសុខថ្នាំ ២០១៩ ១៩ ខេត្ត 🔻 🔻 🔻	
and a manager of our time of the contract of the contract of	~
en e	\$
wormer if on just tot an ioly to corve this	.*!
ed the dame. Tenths of the companion of the	ì
. The side	ξ.
to the community of a strain.	
・ <b>ナ</b> キ	.*
កាសស្រាស ដែកនៅមាន ស្រាស់ ស	^ I
ou the Comac Deserons Civil Egrapous CP	J. ·
• music	/^ r
	ņ
	₹. ··
ಕು ಸಂಗತ್ ತೆಗೆ ಎಗರಾಗಲ್ಲಿಗೆ ಎಂದು ಆಗ್ರೆ ದಾರು ಕೇಂದ್ರ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಅತ್ಯ ಕ	14 .
odina om timopämico od ko mnet ovidsuzofninio	
esançan ba messan ilul sa est Civi. Preen une. 1	γr
។ ស្វី កុស្ន 19 ស៊ីមាទេ 🚛 ស្រីស្នេ ១៩ ស្រីន ក្រែក 1 គឺស្រុក ស្រី	· r
*"TV - "VI - mane : taked no follower:	, L
	^
প্রতিভারত <sup>হলা</sup> ২০০০ জিলাইন ২০০০ জন্ম বিশেষ স্থানি বিশ্বস্থান	s. je,
Distance was blue bere to I was a chief	60
dralfichth on the Avidost four tittee on thom.	^ r
rest to the resigne and visited a flow like	ور د

ាស់ស៊ី។ Lin ពិភាពទូលព្រះ ក្រុមដែល ប្រុស្សិស ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុក ប្រុស្តិស

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

state who have dealt in the past with problems on the service of citation.

That rule was considered over about a two-year period, and the consensus of the committee at that time and, I believe, of the court clerk, was that we would entrust to the trial judge the control of the process in their court and how they wanted it to be served. I think that unanimously, if you poll the lawyers, that that has been a great step for improvement in this state. If the trial judge doesn't want it served by anyone but a sheriff or constable, so be it, but he controls the process in his court.

I don't hear lawyers coming down here saying they want to go back to the old restrictive system of allowing only sheriffs or constables to serve papers, and the only voices I hear down here is to go back to the old way of doing business, or those with a self interest in preserving that system.

The truth is, the sheriffs and constables get the easy papers. The private process servers are the ones that you have to hire for the difficult case, or the parties

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE \*AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 \* 512/452-0009

```
Pred to the tree to the section of the productions.
 3
                                 todoug hunders had pro units ofter him buad for
. 3
                               and the process of the first of the contract o
                                                                   the supplied one of the parties of the
o C
i
                               CALLERA TO A NA CARRAGE
                               ្រុកស្រៀក បានប្រជាជាជាក់ ខាង បញ្ហាស្រាស់ សុស្ត្រា ស ៤០ភូមិ សូស្តី១១៦ភូមិស្តី
.. ..
                                a proper summer has not not not been presented to the con-
. .
                                confidence to the property and the polygons
                               and project and Alter conficience for compatible particles and
٠. ١
                                legge applace tast to the to cake to the calc.
                                                                      The strike for the contraction of the second
: .
                                na dona no pre donapt
                                edge includes to a company of the equition and
·.
                               grand, plasty op lokade ja bullete jag e greeling
                                TO MOAD TO THE SPIRE OFFICE THE REAL PROPERTY IN
                               ្ទាស់សំខាន់ ខេត្ត ស្ត្រ ស្ត្រ និង ស្រុកដា ២ សុខសុខ្ មួនប្រើ មួយស
                                L Fig. 2 of the amore, category, for some of the
                               Q LIF OT THE AND AND A TODAY OF TO DE BOILDON ON THE
                               Full of the first acrass on the restable to the
                               doing alorate man abab wa wear caterist to life
                               THE POROTION OF UP BIND OF THE PROTOCOLS OF A
                               \sim 5.4 gc anddolado eq. but f ofton thousand \phi
                                                                   TION LARE BET WE BERGEST TASK TO THE
                                10 Mar 10 11 A 33 27 3 3 5 5 5 5 5 5
```

(-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1) (-1,-1)

moving from county to county, or they are going to be arriving at D-FW, and you have to stake out in two or three terminals because you don't know which flight and which airlines. Those are the ones that you have to hire the private process servers on. And I urge this Court not to go back on that. There has been no outcry that I'm aware of that the judges or the attorneys of this state are upset about opening up the system ever so slightly in the discretion of the judge about service of papers in his or her individual court.

Service has improved on the public level, but I think, in part, it's due to the competitive pressure that private process servers have provided in the service of papers.

A mandamus is an outrage to consider as a remedy for someone who can't get papers served. I mean, litigants should be able to get papers served on the other party and get to the courthouse, rather than having to go to extraordinary remedies for the mandamus.

Efforts have been made to regulate private process servers through the Legislature so that we know who they are and who they are

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

್ಟ್ ಅರ್ಥ ಪ್ರಭಾಗತ್ರ ಪ್ರಭಾಗ ಪ್ರಭ	ŗ
udedo od ovsi ury brs (bes is into i em od	۶.
or i in two or transmissions is Sucause you son't	4.
our eachtecomi ett deitu und füg 11 nothw wonu	*
edevise ರವಿದ ೧೩೬೦ ರಂಗ ರಾಶಕ ಅರುಭ ಚಿತ್ರಿಸಿತ ಅರುಣ ನನೆಡೆ	**
gon danch writ . wh " . w" . ac nicrica nicrots	• •
no go hach in theb. Thus a learn in enterry	;
ខ្មាស់ ។ ប្រឡប់សញ្ជាក់ទៅសី សិខ្លាស់ សិខ្លាស់ សារិក ស្នាន់សា	4.5
ಸರ್ಥ ಬಲ್ಲಾರ ನೆಗೆ ಕುಸಿಗ ದರ್ಶನಿ ಎಂದು ಚನಾರಕ ನಿಶ್ವರಾಗ ರೈತಿಗಳಿನ	
no. ಚಿಂಗಳ <b>ರ</b> ಟ್ ಅಂಟೆಕ ಜಿಪ್ ಸಂಪ <b>ರ್</b> ಗೃತ್ತಿ' ಒಂದು ಗಳ ಜಾಂಕಗಳು ರಾಣಿತ ್ಟ	V 1
C the find e that acresice of me can a who on	£f
hor indivitive man court.	CI
rolvice bar Allreron on ble put Alle	#N 1
ond of out affa garag ni ganaf Y day grev a	* *
ម្រុក ប្រឹក្សាស្រី មិន ស្រុក ប្រឹក្សាស្រី ខ្លាស់ ខេត្ត ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស	l
. course la cuivase sur an Solivern sus l'agevesi	. t
. ಇವರ್ಷನಿಡುಕ್ಕಾರ ಪರ ಪರ್ಕರ್ಷ ಒಂದು ಕೂ ರೂಗಿಗಳು 	γ ۶
ರಾಜ್ಯ ಸರ್ಚ್ ಕೆಲ್ಲ್ ಕೆಲ್ ಇಂಗ್ರಾಂಟ್ ಉಟ್ಟು ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿ ಅಂದ ಸರ್ವಾಂಜ್ಯ	/· .·
Research Journal of middle of middle of the state of the second	7 -
ದ್ದಿಕ ಕನ್ನಡದ ಗಡುಗಳಿಕೆಂದು ನೀರಿಕೆಂದು ಗಳುಗಳು ಬಂದಿಕೆಂದು ಬಂದಿಕೆಂದು ಬಂದಿಕೆಂದು ಬಂದಿಕೆಂದು ಬಂದಿಕೆಂದು ಬಂದಿಕೆಂದು ಬಂದಿಕೆಂದ	€ 6
enushbothe, i then thom it itseefen en automo	,• •

en fort of the hand grade of the analysis the replacement of the second or the second

end north many rounding medical transfer the

 $\mathbb{C}\mathbb{C}$ 

6 45

: ..

bonded by, but those who want to restrict it to the old ways are the ones that lobby in the Legislature to kill those efforts. And if they would join in the regulation of those people, it would be the better approach, rather than trying to always stifle that legislation so that they remain unregulated and strictly controlled by the trial court.

JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, Mr. Tindall.

Any other comments on the Texas
Rules of Civil Procedure?

Yes, sir.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Let me take a poll. How many other people are going to testify on the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure?

JUSTICE DOGGETT: Well, you're including within that the rule on sealed records? We're saving that till the end.

except for sealed records. All right. I guess you're the last one. And then how many -- how many people are going to testify on something else that's on our docket the remainder of the day?

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

George Dis But the color able to medical and the colors.	Ţ
with the species of the probability of $n$ and $n$ and $n$	
vois li bat .adiable ago is a. Fit of oranges ;	
rous signism who sayutation of the correction is	
ាល ប្រាក្សា ស្នាន់ ស្រុស្តី ស្រុស្តីស្នាស់ ស្ត្រីស្នាស់ ស្ត្រីស្នាស់ ស្ត្រី ស្ត្រី ស្ត្រី ស្ត្រី ស្ត្រី ស្ត្រី	•
ಇಲ್ಲಿಕೆ ಹಾಡುವ ರಾಜ ಗಳಕ್ಕಿತಿಕಾಗಿಯು ಅನಾರಕ ರಾ ಬಕ್ಕಿಕರ ಅಭಾರತ ಕನ್ನಿ	~
e isin unsugrizted ind atsianly donisolist by	7.
.ಶಬ ಅಂದ ಗೊಡ್ಡಗಳ ಅನ್ನತ	
• A compared to the strategy and the compared	
· ilso nam	· •
ಪರ್ಷನ್ ಲಕ್ಕೆ ಚಲ ಚರದಲ್ಲಿ ರರ ಇಡ್ನಿತ್ಯ ಆರ್	Ţr
Party of the Company with the company of the compan	\$ 5
Year with	Ç r
នៅស្រី ១៩ <b>១</b> ៤៩ : "បាលក្រាសារបញ្ (ស្រី២ <b>១១១ ១</b> ៩ ១២១	* 5
a poll. For any naker anna are esing to	,:
tentilly in the Teran when of divid D orceurs?	t-
មក្សាសក្ស ស្រី ស្រែក នេះ បានក្រោស្រាស្ត្រ ប្រធានាស្ត្រស្តា	Ţŗ
in the manufacture the sale of an entropy	् र
ruccating their cart that the control of the	ŗ
ে এটা :শংকারনকৈয়েল গোলাগোলান দ্বালাত	24
್ವರಾಗ್ ನಿರ್ವಹಣ್ಣ ನಿರ್ವಹಣಗಳು ಬರುಗಳು ಬರುವ ಮುಂದು ಬರುವ ಬರುವ ನಿರ್ವಹಣ್ಣ ಬರುವ ಬರುವ ಬರುವ ಬರುವ ಬರುವ ಬರುವ ಬರುವ ಬರುವ	20
genita the last the. Int then ber conver ber	
ော့ကုိကေသသမေးက မေတာ့ မွားသိတ္တရား စာရီ ကုန်းချောင္းက ကုပ္သိုင္သည့္ ကုပ္သည့္	2 <b>5</b>
ក្រុក ពីទេ <b>ខេត្ត សេច</b> សេច	50

••

QVC

JUSTICE HECHT: Besides sealed 1 2 records. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, no. 3 Sealed -- that would be sealed records or the 5 local rules or the TRAP rules. All right. I think -- it's my sense -- and let me get a 7 sense of the Court -- we'll finish with your testimony and then take a lunch break. So go 8 ahead. 10 MR. SUITS: Thank you, Justice. 11 12 STACY SUITS, appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in 13 14 administrative session to consider proposed 15 changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of 16 17 Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 18 19 MR. SUITS: Stacy Suits, Constable, 20 Precinct 5, Travis County. I was just going to 21 observe today till I heard the last speaker, and 22 I'd like to address a couple of his comments and 23 be very brief so everyone can get to lunch. 24 In Travis County, I -- just speaking

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

for Travis County, for what I know and my

25

	£
• 1320557	22
.ea ಕಟ್ಟರ್ ಕರ್ಗಡಿಸಲ್ <b>ದ</b> ಚಾರ್ಚಿಕ ಪಟ್ಟಲಕ	•
್ಷತ್ತಿಗಳು ಕಣಿಸಾಧಾರಣ ಎರಡಿ ಕಾರಣ ಕಣ್ಣ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ಈ ಹಿಂದುವರನ	٠,
ಾರ್ಯ - ವಿರೈತ್ "ಎಸ್ - ಇಂತುಕ್ಕು ಆಗ್ರೆಸ್ ಅಂತ್ರ - ಇದು ಗಣ ನಿರ್ಧೀಕ	<del></del>
າ ປາ ຄາ ປະເທດ ອິ <b>ດ</b> ກ —— ວັນທອກ ປຸກ ທ <b>ຳ</b> ສາ —— ປິດຕິພິມ	436
ంగారం. కోమమ్మ మండుకుడ్డి మె కిరాణం <del>గారం మహామామ్</del> చరిన మ్ <b>ర సానణ</b> ు.	4.
್ ಗಾರ್ - ಒಡಲಾಗಿ ಗಾಡಾಗು ಎಂದುಗಳ ಜನಕ್ಕೆ ಇದು ಅಂಕಾರುಗಳು	ì
• <b>১</b> ৭.৮	ŗ
.೪೯೬ ಕಟ್ಟ್ ಕಟ್ಟಾಗಿ ಕಟ್ಟ್ ಕ್ಟ್	t
	r
Branks Saulin	
a seerstag - clesc the for rome tought of Morner in	€.
a hilbint rative donation to consider propore	•
u mai garanna is modea Paline of Civil Civil Crachearo, far u	ָרָה.
್ತು ಸಂಸ್ಥೆಗೆ ಅನ್ನಾಟಕ ಗಣಗಳ ಗಿರುವರ್ಣಿಕಾಗಿಯ ಸಂಸ್ಥೆಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿದ ಸಂಸ್ಥೆಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿದ ಸಂಸ್ಥೆಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿದ ಸಂಸ್ಥೆಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ	7.
៖២១៩ស. ការ កាសជនៈ២០ «សព្ធសង្ឃ ប្រ. ្រ y Ro	۲۰ ٬
•	,
ក្រុម ព្រះក្រុមស្រួស ខេត្តប្រាស់ ស្រួស្សាស ខេត្តប្រាស់ស្គ្រាស ខេត្តប្រាស់ ខេត្តប្រាស់	Δ
್ರಾರ್ ಆರ್ಥಿಕ ನಿಗ್ಯಾಪ್ತಿ ಬರಲ ಪ್ರಾತ್ರಾಪತ್ರಕ್ಕೆ ಅನ್ನು ಪ್ರಾತ್ರಿಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಾತ್ರಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರಾತ್ರಿಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಿ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕ ಪ್ರತಿಸ್ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕ ಪ್ರತ್ತಕ್ಕ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತಿಸ್ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತ್ಯಕ್ಕಿ ಪ್ರತ	
ភភព «២០៧០១៤» និងស ១០១ ១០២៧ ២០០៧ ១០០០៧ ១០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០	.3.0
ចំណាត់ ប្រធានការពេលមេ ខេត្ត នៃ និង នៅការស្មេច (L ពុធ្ធភព្ហា ១ ៤៨ ក្រុងក្រុង គ្ន <b>ុង</b> )	0.1
ချက်သန်ကုိ စည်း သုံးမည္ သဘာလ ဘယ္လေသလုပ္ ကေတး သိုက္ခြင့် မွာ့သွား က စားလုံး	J. C
in those passes are a skalman alrema in	3.3
the first the state of the stat	

knowledge, I'm the courthouse constable. We do an extremely high workload in child abuse cases. Our district attorney is pushing that caseload very -- very heavy; noncompensated for county attorney's office.

For battered women we're pushing protective orders. There is a high caseload on that.

Child support, the attorney general.

And in Travis County we have one of the eight counties statewide who has a domestic relations.

That's noncompensated, too.

where I've been losing business has not been on family law or from this intergovernmental stuff. It's been primarily debt collection attorneys trying to save a little bit on service fees on the front end of a lawsuit that they don't know that they are going to collect.

So I would contest the fact that -that the private process servers are getting the
easy service. Prior to the change in Rule 103,
I was -- just for my own policy, I was -- if it
was -- if it involved a stakeout for two or
three days -- this person is a truck driver and

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ran - and the during a new condition of the met

on the first of th

. .

he's going to be at the Texaco Truck Stop on

St. Johns. I would -- rather than have the

attorney issue the paper and we say we can't do

it and it have to be reissued and charge a

service fee, I would just immediately sign an

affidavit and give it to the attorney's office

to present to the judge. We can't do it. I

don't have the overtime and staff available to

stake out for that amount of time.

But that was very rare that we ever got into that situation, and I would like to end that this is the first year that my office has not been user fee supported, and it's due to primarily seven or eight debt collection attorneys using private process servers that are underbidding me \$10 a citation on service.

And I appreciate you-all's time.

JUSTICE HECHT: Constable, would you please fill that out and give it to the lady in the back before you leave?

MR. SUITS: Yes, sir.

JUSTICE HECHT: Just to help with the scheduling this afternoon, there are no persons signed up to speak on changes in the Texas Rules of Civil Evidence. Does anybody

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

<b>t</b> .	Compared to the the three of the condes. Soon combined
	ourset apears to no bloss ou apeas so propie
÷	and the second the Elika off the material fraction of the Fig.
, 4 · • ,	for the things of for any
٠ ۵	Section 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
J 6	ja jago soj ko Nod jakas
3 6	ារពេលបញ្ជាប់ នុះដូចស្រា <mark>នស្</mark> មាធិបាលប្រៀបសម្រាស់ មួយ ស្រុក ស្រាប់ ប្រ
, ,	unda in madent gosopo tot money to
ذ نـ	yrg i oʻllang kan Zon∓er ku pjra•
	្រាស្ស ( 4 k ( ) ប្រ. ( ) ប្រ. ( ) ប្រ. ( ) បង្សាធារា ( ) <b>១១ (១៤) (១១</b> (១)
.1 .	နော္မန္မာ ႏို႔ နေလာက္ သုိ႔ အေရးမွာတဲ့ သ <b>ားလုတ္သက္ နာ</b> ္လည္းလွုပ
j 🔍	က ကျောင်းရင္း မေလာက္မွာ ေတာ့ ႏွင့္ မေလာက္က ရတ္တယ္တ <b>င္းပယ</b>
<b>.</b> 3	ವರ್ಷ (ಅರ್ಥ ಗಡರ) ಪ್ರಭಾ ಕಾರ್ಡ್ನ ನಿರ್ದೇಶ ಭರ್ಗಿರ <b>೧೮೦ ಕರ</b>
دے شہ	tive this it the distribulence of ognice you
¥ ,	gat late tive attractions and increase who we are
٠ يو	st thet con yet may hist we eyer
<b>~</b>	where $oldsymbol{arphi}_{i}$ is the property of the property of the $oldsymbol{arphi}_{i}$
j	I with looks the consection of the stability of the con-
<u>*</u>	ao వ్యవారాయు దీల నింగి క్రిట్నల. ్లోకి కిల్పుల కేవం ్లో
	$\operatorname{cyc}_{A_{i}}(\operatorname{coa}_{A_{i}}(\operatorname{cyc}_{A_{i}}(cy$
2	ប្រាស់ព្រះ ប្រាស់ ប្រាស់ព្រះ ប្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ប្រុស្សា និង
Ų.	က္က အက်င့္ နာတ္ ကာဏာလလုပ္ ၁ ၂၀ <b>၁.၆</b> ၇ ရာ (၀) က <b>ငွ ဇ</b> (ဇာဝမီးအ (၅)
•>	is the property of the property of the property of the $\mu_{0}$ and $\mu_{0}$ .
	$A_{i}^{\mu \nu} = A_{i}^{\mu \nu} + A_{i}^{\mu \nu} + A_{i}^{\mu \nu} = A_{i}^{\mu \nu} + A_{i}^{\mu \nu} + A_{i}^{\mu \nu} = A_{i}^{\mu \nu} + $
	in the second of

here wish to speak on those rules? And there is only one signed up to speak on the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. Anybody else want to speak on those rules?

So it looks like, Chief Justice, that we're probably ready to take up, after lunch, the sealing of court records pretty much first thing.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: All right.

We'll take a lunch recess, then, until two
o'clock. We appreciate this procedure this
morning. It's been very helpful to us, and I
hope you feel it's been helpful to you, and
we'll see those of you who still want to testify
at two o'clock.

(At this time a luncheon recess was taken.)

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Having a quorum as we do, we'll get started, barely.

Justice Hecht?

JUSTICE HECHT: I believe Mr. Keith was here earlier to speak to the Texas Rule of Appellate Procedure 90, and he has had to leave. Is there anyone else who wants to speak to the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure? Is there

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The state of the control of the cont	
on y one office and a contraction that	?
၁၁ ရက္က လက္သည္ ကာလုပ္သံကို ကို စစ္စစ္သည္ မရက္က လုပ္သံုး ကို တိုင္တြင္း လု	
• Shairs soon no inche	*
နေ့ မေးမျိုးခံရာများမှာ ကြောင်း ကြို့သည်။ သို့ ကြောင်းကြာသည်း ကျောင်းသည်။	•,
ខែសុខាធិស <b>ុស្ស</b> សុខាធិស្តី ១៩ បានស្រែក ក្រុង ខេត្តក្នុង ក្នុងសែល ស្ <mark>ទ</mark> េស	٠,
್ಷು ರವ್ಯ, ಕೆಸಿರ ಜನ್ನ ನೆಗ್ಗಳ ರ. ರಂಟ್ ಕ್ರಾನಿಕ್ ದ ಗರಕ್ಕು ಪಡಿದ	7
· jumuj i nati	
្សាស់ក្នុង ដីដី១  • ១៩ ១៩ ២០ ២០២២២២ ២០ ១២	_
code Fidau (and or den or de on a partit to	?
o'r sel. 't reveciate this posedure that	r r
werning. Thin been very notying be now this E	, .
ಗಡರ <b>,ಬರ</b> ಳ <b>೦೨ (</b> ೮೩೯, ೧೯ ೧೦೦೮ ಜ <sup>್</sup> ೨) (೧೯೩೩ <b>೯೮</b> ೪ ೧೯೭೭)	, L
wetal see those of you who shill want to table?	·
.នាគ្នា មាន មាន មាន មាន មាន មាន មាន មាន មាន ម	;1 <b></b>
(Az Fhás bi s e undbeun serond ee. bollums)	*. •
t • £ v ± v μ v μ	s me ye
ত ভুজানীয়ে তেওঁ 🛊 ইত তেওঁত ত সাক্ষাক্ষণ ও গুলুস্কেল	v v
ಕ್ರಾರ್ಚಿಸ್ ಕಿಂತಾಂಡಿದ್ದಾರೆ ಮಾಡಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಕ್ರಾನ್ಸ್ ಮುಂದು ಮಾಡುವರು	3 5
รสนอ ซ ออปสถกั	0.0
A STANT LANGE OF STANT OF STANTAGE OF THE STANTAGE OF	ï. i.
្ទី២ ១៥២៩ ស្វាម្ម (១៩៩ ១៨ ៨) ប្រុស្មានថា ១៩ ១១ ១១១១ ១៩១	* i*
្រុម ព្រះ ប្រជាជាធិប្រជាជាធិប្រជាជាធិប្បី ប្រជាជាធិប្បធិប្បធិប្បធិប្បធិប្បធិប្បធិប្បធិប្	~ 10
$\sim$ 2 of 20 kg of 20 $ m H_{ m H}$ , where $ m H_{ m H}$	^ n

in 15 bill the management of the contact of the

anyone who wants to speak to the -- those 1 changes in the Texas Rules of Civil Evidence? 2 Anybody who wants to speak on the Local Rules 3 Reorganization project? 5 Mr. Sampson was here earlier. take it he has had to leave. Mr. Smith -- Mr. Tom Smith was here earlier. Which -- what 7 8 subject do you want to address? UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: On the rules 10 of -- on closing the court records. 11 JUSTICE HECHT: All right. We'll 12 come to that in just a minute. And Mr. Groff of the Texas 13 14 Association of Counties was here earlier, and I 15 think he probably got covered with the 16 constables and justices of the peace. All right, then, if it please the 17 18 Court, I believe that brings us to the last subject, which is the project ongoing to 19 20 consider rules regarding the sealing of court 21 records. And just by way of reminder to you, 22 2.3 the Legislature in the last regular session 24 passed a statute requiring this court to 25 consider rules regarding sealing of court

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ទី២ ស្ត្រី។ ប្រើការ នៃស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ សម្រុក ស៊ី	`
and the state of t	•
ទីវិសុខក្រុង ខេត្តក្នុង ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រា	•
• က ကော်မှာ လေသက်က လောက်လောင်လောက်သည်။ ကော်သည်။	
the it williad iad to say, as a first	
Brune to world to another the contract of the second of th	
್ರಾಣದ ಗಳು ಇತ್ತ ವಿಧಗಳ ಚಲಾಳ ನನ್ನ ತಿರ್ಧನಿಗಳು	•
ಮಿನಲ್ಲಿ ನಲ್ಲಿ <b>ತ ಮ</b> ೌಲ ಕರ್ಮಾನ್ಯ ಭಟ್ಕಳಾಗಿ ಅಥವಾಗಿ ಅಹಾಗ	<b>~</b> ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••
•ရက်ကြည်ထားတဲ့ မြေသမားကြာလည်း သည် သည် ကြည်ထား သည် —— သို့သ	
For a subsection of the subsec	₹.
•ອະນະຕິດ ຂ ສານທຳ ກຳ ລວາສະ ເສ ຄວ <b>ວ</b> ກ	٠,
ರಣಗಾರ್ <b>ಅವ</b> ರೆ ತಾನ 13 ಸಶ . ೧೯೬೬	S
್ ಭಾರತ್ ಒಂದು ಅವರು ಕ್ರಾಮಾಯಕ್ಕೆ ಮಾಡುಗಳು ಕ್ರಾಮಾಯಕ್ಕೆ ಮಾಡುವುದು	\$
ာ ကြည်းကြား သင္းမေလာက္မွာ ကိုသည့္ သည္။ ကိုသည္ သည္။ ကိုသည္သည့္	, <b></b>
နောက်သည်။ ကြန်တိုင် ကြည်သည်၏ မြောက်သည်။ ကြန်လေသည်။	7
ទី ១៩៦៦។ ១៥ មិន <b>«ន</b> មេចសី <b>«ជាជាទូវ»</b> ១៥៦	7
ರ 15 ರಿಗ್ಗಳ ಸಂಪರ್ಧ ರಿಗಿಗಳ ದಿನ್ನಿ ಸಹಕಾ ಕಣ ಸುಹಿ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿ	* 1
() ព្រះព្រះក្រ thefologe ទៅ។ ) កាល់សាម «ព្រងព្រំមុន	3 1
າວດີ ຂອງການໃຊ້ພາ ແລະ ການ ການ ການ ການ ການ ເຂົາ ເຄົາ ເຄົາ ເຄົາ ຄວາມ ເຄົາ ຄວາມ ເຄົາ ຄວາມ ຄວາມ ຄວາມ ຄວາມ ຄວາມ ຄວາມ	9.
	7 -
And du t by hay a rowin's co	es (
សារនៃស្រេច «២០១ ១០ ១០០ ១០០ ២០០ ២០០ ស្រែក សារ	r (
ರಸ್ ವಿಷ್ಣಾಣಕ ಗಾಗಿಂತ ಅಂದಿಗಳು, ಅವಿ ನಾರ್ಚಿಕರಿಯ ನ ನಿಹರಗಳು	, <b>N</b> +
for the following at the rest of the softween	** •

records. And so the Rules Advisory Committee appointed a subcommittee to consider such proposal, and they are in midstream of their work, but have a good bit of it done and are anticipating finishing it in the next couple of weeks and reporting back to the committee; but because we're meeting at this point, thought it good for them to report in. So I believe Mr. Babcock is going to go first.

MR. BABCOCK: Thank you, Your Honor.

Chip begins, I think all of you got circulated yesterday a copy of this proposal. I've got a few extra copies if anybody doesn't have one.

And also, Representative Garcia, who sponsored this legislation, just sent a note that he had an emergency and was called back to San Antonio, but I think he is going to forward some written comment to us about his intention on the statute.

**ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES** 

The second of th

TT. For at at a second page of the contract of

The control of the co

common to us about it intoution to the

.odrázda

\* T

P .F.

~ 7

7.5

90

.

00

~ ~

. 5

# CHARLES BABCOCK,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. BABCOCK: May it please the

Court, I'm Charles Babcock. I'm from Dallas,

Texas. I guess by way of further introduction,

I'm a -- I'm a trial lawyer, and in my trial

practice I represent a number of media companies

and organizations, but I also regularly

represent insurance companies and large and

small corporations and short and tall

individuals. And I'm a member of the Texas

Association of Defense Counsel. I'm not here

today representing anyone other than myself. I

put on my sheet that I'm appearing pro se, so if

you will, allow me to make my comments in

that -- in that representative capacity.

As Justice Hecht has indicated, the Court has been directed by the Legislature to promulgate a rule regarding sealed records, and I don't propose to talk about whether we have to

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

. .

and analytic first to the common of the compartness of the remainful tirtive consist to remailer resource chen en to tende "elos e" disti "e de uma: ob ma nado The actual of the given Becommune, east Paper Inter off taring multipleasy nebstacles for defections

# on id oprose ti gran : "the time. or

್ರಾರಾಜ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತಿ ವರಿಸ್ವಾರ್ ನಿರ್ವಾಧಗಳು ಪ್ರತಿ ವಿವರ್ಧ ಪ್ರಾಥಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ſ dende. I deser by way of furth it introduction 0.5 ារីប្រុស្ស ស្រី មាន ៤០១៥មុន៖ ស្រីប្រឹង ស្រីប្រឹក្សា មាន T r reservation T as record a surpost of the confidence . r gardenstant or call of the gardenstant and call of the roserin' inqualinge padianian en' argo indi 7, 5 gentl curreretions and chart and talk 25 factoricustic. In this a cambin of the Page 7.5 stanceintien of medence dennical. The net hear ٦, toury mag enemt a larvery attending than good. .. . at a contract the Cartage artists of second in a contract to the said of the contract of the said -ಇತ್ತಿರುವುದರ ಎಳಸಿತಿಯಿಂದಲ್ಲೂ ಇದ್ದು ಇಸ್ಟ್ ಗಳ ಈಈ ತಿರ್ದಿಸಿ relative to a later of the contraction of the contr

2.5

ించింది. క్రిక్స్ నిట్టులు గర్గతాంట్లు దేశాల క్రిక్స్ క్రిక్స్ ప్రాటె orda in totat balaro yao kabaran ∍dakhu ∍dakhu na. I see the section of the second of the secon

7.0

do it or what exactly the committee, which I'm a member of, is doing.

John McElhaney and Tom Leatherbury have been working on the details and are very familiar with the various proposals that are working in the committee, and I think they are going to talk in a minute.

What I'd like to address is the urgency of promulgating such a rule. I think it is imperative that the Court act expeditiously for a number of reasons. First, the problem of sealing court records is widespread in the state of Texas, and the practice is growing. Second, in my judgment, the indiscriminate and wholesale sealing of court records is unconstitutional, and there is no easy way for the public in the state of Texas to challenge the sealing of orders under the current state of the law.

I think the practice is bad for business in this state. I think that there are some cases that are being sealed which have overriding interest to the public which are being -- the public's interest is being threatened by these sealings.

And finally, and perhaps most

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

19、1877、1943、19、19、19、19、19、19、19、19、19、19、19、19、19、	•
• 74 o n e e n marine.	,
ಳ್ಳಾರ ಗಳಿಗೆರುತಿರಿಗೆ ಎಂದು ೧೮೮೮ ಕನ್ನು ೧೯೯೮ ಕನ್ನಾರ್ ಹಲ್ಲಿಕೆ	3,
The state of the s	4
$oldsymbol{arphi}_{i}$ and $oldsymbol{arphi}_{i}$ . The property of $oldsymbol{arphi}_{i}$ and $oldsymbol{arphi}_{i}$ . The $oldsymbol{arphi}_{i}$	•^
ార్ సాంగ్ర్మాన్స్ కార్స్ మాయ్లు ఎంది అంటే మంద్రి కాటింది. ఆయ్లికి మంద్రి మంద్రి కాటింది. ఆయ్లికి మంద్రి కాటింది.	***
• All the state of the or	Ĺ
ုယ္သံုး လုန္း <b>ခရာလ</b> န္ ကုမ္းတြင္း သည္။ သည္။ သည္။ သည္။	
ವರ್ಷ-ಪರ್ಣಗಳ ಗುರ್ವಜನ ಸಹಕರ ಅವರಪ್ರಗಳ ಪ್ರಾಥಾಗಿ ಮುಂದು ಸ್ಥಾಪಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಾಥಾಗಿ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಾಪಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಾಪಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಾಪಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿಕ್ರಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಾಪಕ್ಷ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸಿ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸಿಸಿ ಸ	7
R stoleyers son the sense of the first state of the sense	f
and waterproperty control on the control of the control of the	<i>;</i> *
లామానా ఓ ఆంగాఖ్ మాక్ సెంద్రామ్ను అంది. మీది అమ్మ ఉంది. మార్టాల్లు సహించింది. సౌకర్యాలకు	<u>:</u>
្នាធិសាលក្រ 🕠 ្ដ្រាស់ក 🏃 ស្រី ក្រុងក្រែក្រុងក្រុមិក្រុងក្រុមិក្សាធិសាលក្នុងក្នុងក្នុងក្នុងក្	3
in or judgeonic who the look inche one wh learth	<b>F</b> .
sociány of avant madari sie raconatitentional,	4
នុស្ស គារ់ មនិទីស៊ីស្គ្រា ៤៩៦ គួចទី ក្រុង ហុងកេស (១០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០	5
ating of Monas to challenge the secuing at	5.
orfers ander two dustrant chots of the son-	ε
గ్రామం నీస్తున్న ప్రధానం అక్కి మె <b>గ</b> ్స్ట్ర్ గ్	2.
Sunda and in this obelo. " think had been and	· .
က္သူ ကိုရာကိုသည္ ကရာ ကျစ္ေတြသည္။ မက္ေတြသည္ ရက္သက္ေတာင္း မ	<u>.</u>
ుశాణ కడ్డాలు కృష్ణిందా ఉంది. అది మిచ్చు ఉంది. సంగ్రీస్నాయ్లు కా	. * •
ကားသို့ကို ရည် (Pr. 2030) ပြ <b>င်း</b> နှင့် မှာ စည်းတွင် မကာ ကျောင်းသည်။	<u>م</u> (
-ಇಗಾಗಿಗಳು ಅವರದ ಬೈಗಿ ಕಡುದರ ಇನ್ನ	^ <i>€</i>
Thomas news and equilibrium	<u>,</u> 7 (

importantly, I think that wholesale sealing, which is going on in this state, is a threat to our democratic form of government.

I want to talk about each of those five areas briefly and give you, if I can, my perspective or my overview of the urgency of the problem.

By way of reference, I have handled six litigated cases involving sealed records, including the only case that this court has considered, Times Herald versus Tuttle and Jones (phonetic), which was decided not on the merits but on a procedural ground.

The <u>Washington Post</u> did a study of the clerk's office in the District of Columbia and found, and reported with some shock, that there were 20 sealed cases in that courthouse. The <u>Dallas Morning News</u>, by contrast, did a study several years ago -- and that's going to be discussed in more detail here today -- but found that over 200 cases in the Dallas County courthouse alone had been sealed recently. In my personal experience --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Over how long a time period was that?

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

\* ...

г	to the company of the factor of setting the setting th
à	ကြည်း အာဏာသောက်သည်။ လုပ်သည် ရေးသည် ရေးသည် မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည် မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည် မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည်
	•ສີກວ່າແກ່ເຮັ່ງ ຊີວິດ ເກົາຊື່ <mark>ອ</mark> ີໄດ້ພູເຄືອກຄົວ ຊີຍຸ
	ಕರ್ನಿಕ್ ನಿಜ ಸ <b>ಿಧಾರ್ಕ ನರ್ಗ</b> ನಿಂದ ನಿನ್ನಿಯ ರಚಿಕೆ ಅವಿಷ್ಣಾಗಿ
	L vo errold brito. y and give same is recastly
î	nut le gemegam old he sedwaswe y to estimographe.
77	a12 <b>6</b>
* >	မေသမီတာသည် လက်ခြင်း ကို ၂၈၈၈ ၁၈၆၉၈ သည်။ မွေက က
<i>*</i>	Ris 090° in the the ownt composite the second
	និប្យាចុត្ត សុរីប់ទី ទី១ La ស្គ្រក្ស សុវធ្វ សុខ៤ ក្នុង ស្រួងក្នុង
۴	ropow Dair a. Fig. gamies <u>z rigot powi</u> ł cion otanie
**	adition city as you to Rec. 35 (edd) (to both)
^	. The document of the same,
٦,	rae I <u>cabin-tam Paga</u> Cid a atmag sa
•	్రిక్ మాక్టర్ ప్రాంత ఆధినమాయకులో ఉంది. ఇక్ గామ్ గామ్ కొన్నారు. ఇక్షి ఉక్కు ఉంది.
<b>~</b> .	ទីសុវីថា ភូមិស្សាស់ សុខស្នាន់ ស្រួស្សាធាល ១១ បាក់ការ ភូមិសុខសុ សុខភ
(****) - •	.ocnovidanas no in an napra ho, ens fis expu o main
٤.	Pac in Long the annual temps of contract, the
0.	စ္သံ မွက္ႏွင့္ လုိက္ကန္း ေကာ္သ မမာ လာက္သည္ သည္သည္က ျခင္းကြားမွာ
•	Specification of the Lord of the first of the specific of
•	Than the court of the account of the cover the control
:	ಗ್
	THE RESIDENCE OF THE PROPERTY
a	చాడు. ఉ <b>లాళ</b> ్ : ంటెంగాను గాంటాలో టెట్టానానా <del>లో</del> టైటాగారం
•	non di con tollo non el la gar

MR. BABCOCK: I'm not sure of the specifics of that. I think David Donaldson is -- has their -- their study, and we talked about it. It is also, I believe, in the materials that -- that has been given to you. But as I recall, Justice Phillips, the study found that the -- the process of sealing records had accelerated greatly over the last five -- the five years prior to the article, which was a couple of years ago.

JUSTICE RAY: Was that a result of automobile litigation?

MR. BABCOCK: No, Justice Ray, I think that the study discovered that many of the records that were being sealed were in the -- were being done by a certain group of law firms and by certain classes of defendants, mostly; on the motion of defendants, mostly.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Are these records sealed in conjunction with protection of any trade secrets or secret processes?

MR. BABCOCK: Very few; very few, although there is trade secret problems, and that -- that's an issue that we all have to be sensitive to. The cases that I have dealt

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ನಲ್ಲಿ 14-00 ಸಮತ್ತು ತಿಂದಲ ಚಿತ್ರ (ಕಿಂಡ್ಲ್ಯಾಗ್ರಾಕ್ಟ್ 1900) ಕಟ್ಟಿ	•
ត្រូវបានដែល សាសា (ទៅសង់) ដែលក្រៅបាន របស់ ស្គ្រា គឺស ព្រះបាន់សិស្សាល្កា	
hen that the thate the plant of the test	-
whent te. "to in a cos T herrove, in the	•
-ಗಳು ನಾರಿ ಇಂದು ೧೯೩೯ರಲ್ಲಿ ಸರ್ವ ಸಹಾಗಿದೆ ಸರ್ವಾಧಿ ಮತ್ನು ಸ <b>ರಕ್ಷ</b> ್ಣ	
ಳ ಚರ್ಚ ಎದ್ದು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕ್ ಸ್ಟ್ರಿಸ್ ಕಟ್ಟ್ ಕಟ್ಟ್ ಎಂದು ಎಂದು <b>ಜನ</b> ಬಿಟ್ಟ	~
್ .ವರ್ಣಗಳ ಸರ್ಕಿಸಿಕ ಹಿಂದಾಗಿ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕರ್ಕಿಸಿಕ ಕರ್ನಗಳ ಗುರುಪ್ರಿಸಿ	**
ಈಗ ಆಳಕ್ಟಿ ಶಿಕ್ಷಣೆ ಇತ್ತಿ ಇತ್ತಿಕ್ಕಾಗು ಬಿಂದಿಗಳು ಬಂದಿಗಳು ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿದ್ದಾರೆ.	3
a naw doding polotice of to the color paper over da	Ş
•ខាពេល ១១១៩ភូមិ ដែល សម <b>ុស១១</b>	•
ដែល ១ ស្រុសថ ១ ១១១៩ (១) :25៩ ស្រុក្សស្រុក	<b>r</b>
ទី៣៩នៃ២១១៤១ នៃ២០១៤១ ខេត្ត មាន ១៩៩៩១ ខេត្ត មាន ១	. •
್ ಕಟ್ಟ್ ಅರ್ಣಕ್ಷತ್ರ ೧೯೮೨ : ಇರು ಕಟ್ಟ್ ಕಟ್ಟ್ ನಿರ್ವಹಣ್ಣ ಅನ್ನು ನಿರ್ವಹಣ್ಣ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರದಹಣೆ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರು ನಿರು ನಿರು ನಿರವಹಣೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದಹಣೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರು ನಿರು ನಿರು ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದಹಣೆ ನಿರು ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರು ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ನಿರದ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕ	
the black that when beady discovered that samp of the	•
sud mi sasu pacon inici oray deld ficinor	₽.,
್ ಬಿಕ್ ಆಂಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಿಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ಟ್	٠
on.' by cortols elabor of about the following and they ea	٠
the notion of defendant, roots.	·
្រែង ក្រុមស្រីក សក្ស : មេសុខភាព ១០ សុស្សាយូស្មាល	
nesded in conjumption with a otherwood of any	۲,
😯 ವಾರಾವರ್ತ ಕರ್ಯವಾಗಿ ನಾಗು ನಿರ್ವಹ್ಣ ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆಗಳು ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆಗಳು ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆಗಳು ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ದಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ದಹವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ದಹವ	e /
nn. pamy tmay dawy dawy verp daw.	* (
$p_{ij}$ , $q_{ij}$ of eq. ( ) to denote the $q_{ij}$ and $q_{ij}$ , $q_{ij}$ and $q_{ij}$	^
e od proj Cirik. Prid or st me rila i dald	V 1

with -- and in the last -- in the last 18 months

I have personally been involved in six litigated
cases, none of which involved trade secrets, and
where entire files from the original petition
through the judgment were being sealed.

JUSTICE GONZALES: Can you tell me what was the nature of those cases, what area of law or issues? Products liability cases, negligence cases, or slander, libel? What was it?

MR. BABCOCK: The ones that I was personally involved in, Justice Gonzalez, was:
One was a lender liability case in San Antonio.

There was another case in San

Antonio that dealt with allegations against a

priest of child molestation, which you may have

heard about -- something about.

There was a medical malpractice case where a psychiatrist was said to have been involved sexually with his -- one of his patients.

There was another case that dealt with insurance, whether or not an insurance company had sufficient coverage to cover a law firm.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

and the control of th	۲'
STATE OF THE STATE	
ాడు. అయినాటలు తెల్కున్నితాలో నటి స్తార్గు నిర్మాత్తు. ఎందు	
ాడికి కేంద్ర గ్రామం అకేహిందుకు గ్రామం గ్రామం అయ్యుల్లు. మండ్రికి కేంద్ర గ్రామం కాంటారు అక్హిందుకు గ్రామం కాంట్లు కాంట్లి ఉంది. అయ్యుల్లు	٠,
$oldsymbol{\epsilon}^{(i)}(S^{(i)})$ and $oldsymbol{\epsilon}^$	
ా క్రాంగ్ లైవుక్ ఆటక్ : కార్డ్ కార్డ్ మార్గాలు మార్క్ కారా	• *
to the analysis and the state of the control of the	,
⊊బలుగుల 2వేఉన్న నమ్ గళంలాని ఇన ద్వరంశాలతున్నాయి. న	
ev ද අවදීම විධාසරේ දරවලකට වර දක්කරකට වස්ස්තර් සිද	`
	<b>5</b> 5.
ಎಫರ ಶಿರ್ವಾತ ನಡಣ್ಣ ಅಂತಾ ಕಟ್ಟಾರಾಗು ಕಟ್ಟಾರ್ಯ	
and the second of the second o	
and make a more than the state of the state	<b>(* ∱</b>
in the state of t	r. r
បានប្រជាពិធី ព្រះ បានប្រជាពិធី ១ ប្រើប្រជាពិធី ១ ស្គ្រា និង ១ ប្រឹក្សា ប្រជាពិធី ១ ប្រឹក្សា ប្រាក្សា ប្រាក្សា	
and the transfer of the same table to the transfer of the tran	* #
•្វីឃុង ស្រីស្នាស្រី -— វីឃុ <b>០៤១</b> 3 គ <b>ា</b> ស្វ	ζ
. Communication of the property of the propert	€ ¥
who can appearate the above to the	<i>r</i>
nil ha one più dilia, "Tounoa dellovni	•
် စစ် <b>ာကလိုင်</b> ကို စစ်စေတာ်သော	
ಕ್ರಾಂಡ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಚಟಕಾರ ಕಥವಾಗಿಗಳು ಒಟ್ಟು ಅಕ್ರಾಮ್ಟ್	tr ·
ing the single of the second second second in the second i	~ .
of the memory of a state of carterial and the size of the carterial	*, (*

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

There was another case involving the dissolution of a law firm in Dallas County where the whole records -- so they -- none of the cases that I have dealt with have had trade secrets or products liability aspects to them, although I'm sure there are some.

JUSTICE COOK: Have you ever been a lawyer representing a party where the records were sealed?

MR. BABCOCK: No, sir. I have handled trade secret litigation, and I have been able to get around those problems.

And when I say -- when I -- when I talk about records, what I am talking about are the records that are filed with the clerk and are used to influence the judge in resolution of the matter before the court. I'm not talking about discovery type information. example -- in a trade secrets case, for example, where you might exchange, pursuant to a protective order, documents among counsel, I have been involved in that type of litigation, but I have never been involved in a case where there's been a wholesale sealing of the file, as a lawyer.

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

10

$\mathfrak{Q}^{-1}\mathfrak{Q}^{-1}\mathfrak{Q}^{-1}\mathfrak{P}^{-1}\mathfrak$	
in the second of the second of the first of the problem is above.	r
and the second of the second o	~
Good the state of the first open to the state of the stat	•
ស្រាន់នៅ កាត់ រយៈភេស (ភេស (អ៊ុន) នៅក្នុង គេនេះគេការ នេះប្រជាក់ នៅមុខគេការ	
•ుకుండాకు అడ్డా అడ్డాకు కూడా ఉంది. మేకాండాకుక్కారు.	, •
and and in ewer ending swart as the termination of the termination o	, F.4
်တာသင့် မောင်းလိုင် သက္က အသင့်သို့အနေသည် အကျစ်သိုင်သည် သွင်းလုပ် အသည့်အလောင်	
to the state of th	
	<b>.</b> .
reserve to the second of the s	r #
·ase in the part of the straight of particular	·· ṛ
The profession of the second o	^ ₽
$M$ ) of $oldsymbol{u}$ is graph and $M$ . The $M$ is a sum of $oldsymbol{u}$ in $M$ and $M$ is a sum of $M$ .	, r
Para the Comment of the State of the Comment of the	۴
is the institution of the second of the seco	* <b>F</b>
The Market and the Andrews and the Lorent Market of the	( • · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
ಗಳ್ಳಿ ∗ಗರಗಡಿತು. ಒಗ್ಗಳ ಹೈಗೆ ಗಾಹಾಣಗ ಎಂಗಳ <b>ಲ</b> ್ಗಳ	
్ ఎక్కు కార్కులు కార్డులు కార్డుకోండా కార్ <del>జున్</del> కార్స్ కుండా	· •
ರ ಕಥೆ ನಿರ್ದೇಶಕರ ಅಧಿಕಾರಿಸಿತು. ಶನಿಸಿಕೆಯ ಅವರ ಅಂದಾಗಿ	<b>Ģ</b> €
<ul> <li>Country of the same specifications of the same specification.</li> </ul>	<del>"</del>
ರಾಜಕಿಸಿದ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಹೊಂದು ಮಾಡು ಬಿಂದಲ್ಲಿ ಸಾಗಿ ಬಂದಲ್ಲಿ ಮಾಡುವ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಅಥವಾಗಿ	79
ಾತ್ರಮ್ಣ ಗಾಗಾಗ ಅವರ ಅನ್ನು ಅವರ ಕ್ರಾಂಡಿಕ ಕ್ರಾಂಡಿಕ ಕ್ರಾಂಡಿಕ ಕ್ರಾಂಡಿಕ್ಕಾರ ಕ್ರಾಂಡಿಕ್ಕಾರ ಕ್ರಾಂಡಿಕ್ಕಾರ ಕ್ರಾಂಡಿಕ್ಕಾರ ಕ್ರ	<b>₹</b> %
as the same of the contract of the same of	<b>k</b>

1,1

. 19

JUSTICE COOK: Where there has been selective sealing, you have been involved?

MR. BABCOCK: Yes, sir, I have, of discovery material only. I have never been involved in a case where -- where I represented a party where pleadings or orders or opinions of the Court have been sealed.

JUSTICE COOK: Do you see anything wrong with selective sealing?

MR. BABCOCK: I think that if -- if a very high standard is met -- and you can imagine different circumstances where it might be -- certainly there are certain circumstances where records should and could be sealed.

I think there are also, however, a species of records that can never be sealed. For example, the Legislature in Article 6252-17a, which is the Open Records Act, says that opinions and orders in the adjudication cases is public information. I think that is a statute that's on the books that is -- that -- that we're all obliged to follow. And, frankly, even if it wasn't on the books, I think the Constitution would compel that the opinions and orders of our courts are public and must be

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

မြို့သည်။ သို့သည်။ သူ့သည်။ သွ	r
$\mathfrak{T}$ or $(\mathbf{v}_{i}, \mathbf{v}_{i})$ where constant that $i$ all projections	
	~
గంగారి <b>బాదా</b> ర్ అంటాకున్న పాటియి. ఇక్కువార్ అంటాకున్న స్టాట్	
తారుగా కార్యాల్లో దూరాలోని ఈఈ కారణంటు కుర్మణం ఉంది. వ్యాత్తుల	-,
ါက္ က <mark>လုိက</mark> ုိက္ေတာ့ သည္ကာ အထုိက္က လူတယ္လုိက္ လုိက္ေတာ့ ကို လုိက္ေတာ့	٠
· Marine Company of the state o	<i>7</i> 7
(18 <sup>1</sup> ಕೆಸ್ಡಾ) ೨೦೧ ಕಲ್ಪತ್ತಿ ಕ್ಷಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಅಂತಾಕಾಗಿತ್ತು	
The John william on Letter of the	n
Element Described the best of the property of the second	c I
e werr litely thereign is and and protein	,f.f.
fine ind (iffinest direamnhanded where it	fr F
v certain y Marc che a venta ci cu utcau	ያ የ
meand records tous are done the realco.	Λţ
್ ಕ್ಲಿಗಾಗಿ ಅಥವ ದಜ್ಞಾ ಮಿನಿದ್ದಾರಿಗಳು	ŗ
• က <sup>ု</sup> ဂတ္က ၁၈ ပတ္တာလည္း အားသစ္ ကို ကု ကု ထားသာသာက သို႔ လွ ့စ္ခြားက	
Similar at arman magaal wad sang aan aan	F *
rorn-170, rition in the Discoula Coscola Coscola ver	21
actuari ujic e d'at cuchro has unctator dous	
ರ ೧೯ ಕೆಳಬಿಕೆ ನೀಡುಕಿನಿಕ ೧೯ - ಚಾರತಿಗೆರಾಜಕಾಗಿಯಿಂದ ಕಿರುಬಿಡೆಯ ಗ್ರಾಹಕಾಗಿದ್ದಾರೆ.	Ú.
ು ನಿಗಕಟ್ಟಿನ ಕುರ್ದಿಕ್ ೧೫ ಕಿಂದ ಇಲ್ಲಿಯ ಗಿಲ್ಲಿಕ್ ನೀನ ಈ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿ ಇಗ	20
్ళ విధానామౌ 👵 మంద్ర - కార్మ్మ్మ్ 🙃 క్రామ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ్మ	٤٠
್ವರದ ಗಳ ಗಳ ಗಳ ಅವರ್ಗ ನಾಗಿ ಅಂತಿ ಎಂದು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯ	r* ·*
ుకు గ్రామం కాండ్ చేశాలు. కాండ్ చేశాల్లో కాండ్ కాండ్ కాండ్ ప్రాటక్ష్మాలు కాండ్ ప్రాటక్ష్మాలు కాండ్ ప్రాటక్ష్మాలు	• •

 $(0,1)^{-n}$  , the limit of the  $\sigma_{\rm p}$  , where  $\sigma_{\rm p}$  , which is the same of the  $\sigma_{\rm p}$ 

public.

-

JUSTICE COOK: What about discovery depositions, say, in family law cases?

MR. BABCOCK: I think -- I think there is room for selective protective orders in those -- in those kinds of cases in the appropriate circumstances, yes, sir.

The -- the fact that the practice is, I guess, widespread, and, in my judgment, growing, I also -- in addition to the cases that I have actually been involved in, I am a member of the board of directors of the Freedom of Information Foundation of Texas, and as such, I man a hotline, which members of the public call in if they have problems with open government in this state. I'm not the only person that does it. There are other lawyers.

But we are getting a number of calls about courts, district judges, sealing court records. And this is not just immediate issue; we're getting calls from citizens for a variety of reasons that want to know: "Can they do that? What can we do to undo that?" -- various circumstances.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: I was talking

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

••

CONDICTION OF THE STATE OF THE PROPERTY.	5
topic sommer to the Double Ambie some that we	7
Strate that the same of the first of the second of the sec	4
in the switches are said to the contract of th	•
ស្រុក្ស ស ១០ ខេស្ស <sup>3</sup> ប្រាសិស្សាស្ថិត្ត <b>ារី ១៤ ១១</b> ១៦១៨៩	••
· in the gradient of april of the formal	7
er ్రంగా ఎక్కి కూరణి ఎక్కువించిన ఆ— సంగా	-
÷ទីកា ប៉ុស្ស បាល ការ៉ា • បុក្ស ក្លុសព្យាក្សាស ស្គ្រាស្ត្រ។	
ನನ್ ಗಾಗಾದರು ರಾಷ್ಟ್ರದರ ವಾಗುತ್ತಿನಗಳು ಆಮ 🗕 o ತಿಗ್ಗಳ ಭಾಗತ್ಯವು	n
in the volume in the description of the theory of the security of	
ಸರ ಕ <b>ರ್ಣದ್ದಾ</b> ಟ್ ಸಮಿಕ ಎನ್ನಡಡಿಕೆ ಅಂತರ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್	•
ರ 🕡 ಕ್ರಾಚಾ ವರ ಒಂದು 📢 ಸಹದಾ ೧೦ (೧೯೯೯) ಈ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳಲ್ಲಿಗಳ	ça
೨೯೦೦ ೬೬ (ಗರ್ಕ) ಅಭಿಕೃತಿನ ಗಡದ ನಿರ್ಣಾಗ ಗರ್ಕನ್ ಕಡಗೆನ್ನಿರುವ ಪ್ರಗಡಿಸು	Ņ
್ ನಿಗಾಣಗಳ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಅವರ ಕನ್ನಡ ಅವರಿಗೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕೃತ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕಿನ್ನಡ ಅವರಿಗೆ ಅಭ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕೃತ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕಿನ್ನಡಗಳು	•;;
thir air to. The not ten entre erack that	٠,
∗ಲ್ಯಾಣಗಳು ಗರವಣೆಕೆ ನಾಗು ಬಡಡಾಗಿದೆಕನ	7
ကရ ဂါက အားလုပ်ကား အ ျပည်သော်တာကို သည် သော သော သော သော သော သော	
ತ್ರಭಾರಣ ಸಾರ್ಕ್ (ಬರ್ಗ ಭಾರಧ್ಯಕ್ಷರ ಮರ್ಥ ಗರ್ಕ್ (ರಚ್ಚರಾಧ ಚರ್ಚಾಗಿ)	^
್ ಎಂದರ್ ಅಥೆ ಕಿ ಆರಂಭಿ ವಾರಾಜ್ಜ್ ಚಲದ ಇದೇ ಮಾರ್ಡಿಕ ವಿಕಾರ ಇದೇಕಾರಗ	٥
కృశ్ ప్రాలం గా కార్ గాకా ఉప్పోస్తు. రా <b>ద్ ద</b> ్వాణ గ్రామ్ ఉప్పారం. ఎంది.	r
ರಜೆ ೧೯೭೫ <b>ಗಳ</b> ಬಿಡಲಿ ಇಡುಗಳ ಆಗಿ ಟುಕಾರ್: ಹಣ್ಣಗಳ ಒಂದು	
and no "Coata of an old to the transfer of the	۳
•ភពពេលសាល្ស ប្រ	ē.

್ರಾಮ್ ಕಾರ್ಡ್ ಬ್ಯಾಕ್ ಗರ್ಗ ಕರ್ನಾಗಿ ಕಾರ್ಡ್ ಕಾರ್ಡ್ ಕಾರ್ಡ್

about the premise that anything that happens in court is public business --

MR. BABCOCK: Yes, sir.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: -- and should be open to the public.

MR. BABCOCK: Yes, sir.

perhaps a limited area in family law -- perhaps we could consider sealing some records in that -- in that area. Do you see any other areas where you can even consider sealing a court record that should be, by definition, open to the public?

JUSTICE COOK: Adoption.

MR. BABCOCK: Yeah, I think that there are certain things that the Legislature has said, adoption being one, that can be -- that are by statute made confidential. And there may be some limited discovery type things that -- that can be made confidential if an appropriate showing is made. But frankly, I see very few circumstances, if any, where the opinions of the Court, the orders of the Court, and the documents that are presented to the Court in an effort to influence those

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

<b>*/</b>	A distribution of the control of the second of the control of the
<b>.</b> :	နေရန် များနှင့် ကရာများသည်။ အည္တာများ သန်နေတွင် မြောင်းသောများမှ ကြောင်းသည်။
ره فه	ay manne ed that courts that the court of the dente.
<b>.</b>	$\mu_{\mathbf{C}}(\mathbf{x}_{1})$ [30] a figure with $\mu_{\mathbf{C}}(\mathbf{x}_{2})$ and $\mu_{\mathbf{C}}(\mathbf{x}_{1})$ where $\mu_{\mathbf{C}}(\mathbf{x}_{2})$
<b>.</b> .	which the properties of the properties of the following $f(x)$
e de la companya de l	that tast commissioned semal semation in our
υC	is an ord well possible promperty of Lacket $\mathbf{A}$ (A) $\mathbb{R}_{>>0}$ by
j, ç	មិស្ត្រ ប្រទេស ១០ ខេត្តស្វាល់ស្គ្រាល់ ១០សីខ្ ខេត្តស្វាល ១៣២៣៣០ • ១៣៣៣
i a	မှာတာ ေသတ္သုိ သည္ က်က္သည္။ သန္မာရီ လကၤ က သည္ လုံး ရက္သည္ သမ≃
14 No.	the are see that a thing of the the the factors
.a	ANT TO MOUNT MOUTH A FRITTE BOLD
	မည္း ေလးေဆြင္သည့္ ေျပခ်စ္တြ <mark>ား</mark>
13 · No.	နာက ကားသော မရာရှင်လည်း
* c.	မေမာင္း သက္မရင္ ေနာ္မန္း မအျမန္းက ျခန္း ညီေရးသည္သည့္မႈမွာ မုိျခန္း
ذ ند	eness cluse Well of a promise with the contraction of the contraction
• •	ನ್ಯಾತಕ —— 'ಒ ಗ್ರಾಂಥ (೧೯೯೬)೧ (೧೯೯೬ರ <b>೮೮</b> ೯ ಆಕೃತ್ಯ
tr	က္ေတြ႕ <b>အေနျ</b> င္း <b>မွာ</b> ကုန္းတြင္း တပ္ထားသည္။ တြင္း သည္လြန္း ျပည္သည္။
	estipa to this top area is distinct to be top at
mil.	
v	en e
	on Circ (p. 1970) i myrryd •
<b>J</b>	Million of Collins in the Sugar was ignored
.;	
•	ាននិងនេះ គ្រឿង និងស្រួញម៉ែល នាស់ស្គ <b>ា</b> ស្ស <b></b>
j.	en e

decisions --

2

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Settlement of the parties.

4

3

5 | a

\_

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. BABCOCK: If the court is being asked to enforce a settlement agreement, if the settlement agreement is approved by the court, as sometimes happens, if the settlement agreement is filed with the court, then I think it should be a public document. If there is a settlement that does not require any sort of approval or enforcement by the court, and the parties choose not to file it with the court records, then I think that -- that the rule that is being contemplated would not -- would not cover that. But the minute that the parties ask -- seek judicial intervention either to approve or to enforce their settlement, then I think it must be public, unless there is a very compelling need and a showing along the lines of the rule that's being contemplated.

I don't want to burden the Court with a lengthy dissertation on -- on the constitution -- constitutional right of access or the common law right of access, or which -- which applies. There's a number of -- a lot of

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	ï
· Community (A)	۶
- 1 : 1 : # 보기 : # 보	
in the state of th	.*
ພາປະສິດ ຄຳຫວາມຄວາກທູກ ຄວາມການຕຳໃຫ້ແລະ ກ່າວຊາເຊີເຄີຍ ສຳ ເລື່ອງ ເຄືອນ	 •
වර්ග් <b>සාවට ව</b> න්වේ ඇති කිලගැනද වූ වල මේ නුකුළ ලබා ලබා පුළු පළමුනුවීමට	**************************************
್ರಾಗ್ರಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಕೊಂಡಿದ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕೊಡ್ಡು ಕೊಡ್	
aggeonate de disportada eda conside esca in blitain	:5
ာ ကားနိုင္ငံ ကို လုိက္သည့္ မိုင္ရေသည္သည့္ ကားသီး ကြာတ္ေတာ့ အတြင္း လုိက္ ျပည္သည့္	r
a the compact bolight demonstration and the terminolation	î
ರ ಗರುಗಳು ರಚ್ಚಿಗಳು ಬಳಕಾಗಿಕೆ ಹೆಚ್ಚಾಗಿದ್ದಾರೆ ಕರ್ಮಿಸಿಕ ನಾಗ್ಯ ಕರ್ಮ	۶.
ర్వణాంధ్ అనిని జేదన్నా చిన్నం. మన్నంది చేసులు సాంధ్ర అనిని మేశ్వాహన	:*
ನಿಕಾಸರ ೧೭೮೪ <b>೦</b> ನವೆ ಕಾಟ್ರಿಕೆ ಈ ಹೇಗಿದೆ ಗೆಬ್ಬಳಿಗೆ ಅತ್ಯಾತ್ರಕ್ಕೆ ಅನ್ನು ಕರಣ	~
den bisser den bisset Basel, roduser intis is	*,
ಇರಾತ್ರ ಇದ್ದಾರ್ಥ ಅತ್ಯವ ಅತ್ಯವಾಗಿ, ಕಾನ್ಯ ನಿಲ್ಲಿ ಕಟ್ಟಡ ನಗಳು	••
at wothin mediavovapami dedatation for in ,	٠
್ ಇರುಬಿರ ಇತ್ಯಂತರ ಚಿತ್ರವಾಗಿ ಕಿನ್ನಡ ಸಂಪುರ್ವವಿ ಇತ್ಯಾರಾಧ್ಯಕ್ಷ	Ç
ev . ಇ' ನ್ಯಾಗಲ ವರಗು ಮಟ ಕೂಡು ಟೆಟ್ಟ ಅವೆ ಗಳತ್ತ ಹಾಗಿ <b>ಸ್ಥ</b> ಕ್ಷಿತ	•,
dongenling need to charance with the wine an	øn.
uho valo ಕಾಟಕ್ಕ ವಿನಿಗ್ರ ರಾಜಗು (೧೯೮೦).	ť,
ತ್ರಾಳ್ಯ <b>ಿ ಎ</b> ಟ್ಟ <b>ದಂ</b> ಗಡ್ಡಿ ಎಂದು ಚಿಟ್ಟಾರ್ ಕ್ರೀಡ್ನ ಪ್ರ	r
of the the section of the property of the pro-	•
ropper to destriction destriction destriction	<b>^</b>
ాగు ఎల్లి కల్లు కొవట్లులో మ్యక్స్ కామె ఏ మార్క్ లోకు కొన్నారి.	PA :
The same of the sa	

2

3

4

5

U

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

briefing that's been done, and I think you have been provided with that information.

I do want to say, however, that procedurally in this state, as a result of some of the procedural decisions in this area, it is very difficult to challenge a sealing order, particularly if one finds out about it after the court has lost plenary power over the underlying case.

In the Times Herald versus Tuttle Jones case, the reporters for the Dallas Times Herald discovered the fact that an entire court file which had been open from the time the case was filed until the time the judgment was entered -- it had been open all that time and then was sealed in conjunction with the disposition of the case, but they found out about it five months after that occurred. This court held that the court had lost plenary power over the records in that case and that the Times Herald was unable to, in the context of the proceeding that they brought, get access to those documents and that the lower courts were without jurisdiction to consider that.

There has been a recent San Antonio

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	gar ,
<ul> <li>def (xip r, n) = f(x) f(x).</li> <li>f(x) = xip r, n</li> </ul>	٠.
$A = B + \pi x y x y x y x A + y y y y x y x y x y y y y$	,
ರ ನಾಗ ನಿರ್ವಹಗಳ ಕರ್ಮ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಗಾಹಿತಿಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಗಳ ಗಂತರ ಗಾಹಿತಿಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಗಳು ಗಂತರ ಗಾಹಿತಿಕೆ ಕನ್ನಡಗಳು	٠.
್ರಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಕ್ರಾರಂಭದ ಮಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾರಂಭದ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರವ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ತ	
yory Eff with the girther; a mosifing order.	**
partuon origis one finel cut about at this th	7.°
dought him tent youngry nove over the under your	}
• A · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	•
officett auccess filesest sants odd as	Ç. F
The case, the reverse to a the manner of the manner	r <b>r</b>
Heraln o'mencered the fact a ct in out me rence	c r
ense od. esta ede serà dece esca esta està	r r
wan same of the same of the graph of the graph of the same of the	
ಾಗಾರವರ ್ಕ ಬಿಲ್ಲ ನಿಲ್ಲಾ ಇಂಡಗ ಇತ್ತಿಗೆ ಕಿಸಿ ಕರ್ಣಿಗಳ ಚಗ್ರ	
then were subled in denginering with the	* *
dingenition of the exert one they would end	4.
Sonut it dive interentited of accompass. The	• #
dourt half that the depot of their trues	~ I
ver the records in their erec ent elect the	າຣ
ties neval was the blockers in the content of	i.c.
೯೯೮ ಸೂಡಗಾರವೆಗೆಗಳ ಸಿಕಿಕ್ಕ ಕರ್ಗಳ ಗಾರಾಣ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಕಡರಾಯಕ್ಷ ಸಂಗ	10 pr.
ology reduced and the tele lower doubter word	, e
-ಚಿನಾಣಿಕೆ ಇದು ಸಹಿಷ್ಣದಲ್ಲಿ ಇದು ಆರಾಭಿಕಾಗಿ ಕಾರ್ವಿ ಇದು ಸಂಶ್ರೇಕ್ಷಣೆ. ನ	• •

· , <u>~</u>

Portain man Company of model has been Im-

1.3

case, the Spears -- Express News versus Spears, where, in conjunction with the disposition of a case, an entire file was sealed, and the newspaper intervened, which had been suggested in the Times Herald litigation as the -- as the proper method to proceed -- intervened after judgment, and the Court of Appeals held that the intervention after judgment was impermissible, even though the order that was being challenged was -- was the judgment itself which had sealed the records, and dismissed the case on the merits. There was a dissent, but -- but that case, with my understanding, is final now.

So -- so right now a citizen in this state who wants to challenge a sealing order procedurally has a number of barriers which they face and which I believe the rule that is being contemplated seeks to -- seeks to ameliorate.

The third factor: bad for business. The secret files, I think, breed suspicion and distrust because we don't know what's there. I can tell you that the journalists are, by nature, a cynical and suspicious group, and when they see a sealed file, it may, in fact, turn out to be very innocent, but their antenna goes

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

. . . .

, T	and the first the variable shall be the first of the second
P	i in koldingen û ditê lêre met rerijast bi se ûte
£.	s is the executor of the section of the end of
*	ပါတယ် (တန့္ကျားက အာတွင် (၁၄) များပိုင်းက မွေးသည်း လောက်ကြောင့် ရောက်ကြောင့် မြောက်ကြောင့် ရောက်ကြောင့် မြောက်က
	ad no on out as sette to tall birnels
	obio perevipada Leoperi pa Ledico, equi
· ·	ការថា ជាចារ៉ាត់ ប៉ុន្តែ នេះ នេះ ប្រកាស្រីក ជានា <b>ប់ក្រុង ១</b> ប្រកាស់ ស្ថានសម្រាស់ <b>បង្គុំ</b>
	្ទ ស្តី គេប្រាស់ ព្រះ ស្រុះ ស្រុះ ស្រុះ ស្រុះ ស្រុះ ស្រុះ ស្រុក្ស ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្
^	೧೯೮೦). ನ ಅ ನಡೆಸಿ ಕೆ ಎಂದ ಪಡಚಿತ ಇಗ್ರಾಕ್ಸ್ ಕ್ಲಾಕ್ಸ್ ಪ್ರಕಟಿನ ಚಲ್ಲತ
4.4	్గుడ్డ్ మండు దోరక్సోనా గవిందావికి మీకుతు ట్రుకాండ్ ఉన్నా ఉన్న ఉన్నా ఉన్న
• I	the stanten, and distinued the ecoo on the
r j	ತಿತ್ತಿಗಳ ಚರಣೆ ದಿಇದೆ ೯. ಚರಣದ " ೧ ೧೦೮ ೧೪ಕರ್ಷ - ಅಕ್ಕುಗಳು
· .	- ಅರ್ಜ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಗಳು ಅರ್ಜಿಕ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಗಳು ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಗಳು
. <b>.</b>	មក្សាធិ ខាន់ សម្រើប្រឹក្សា ស ខាង ដា ប្រែក្រុង ស ខាង 🗝 ១០០
	ne ကြောက်သို့သောက ကြောက်သည်။ ကြောက်သည်။ ကြောက်သည်။ မေးကာ
. ,	ైలకేద - ఇంగ్రామం పారాగాలో విధా గుత్రములు ఇంగారు. ఇంగ్ పార్థుత్తాన్ని
Ĺ	್ರಾಡಕ್ಕೆ ಇವರ ಇವರ ಅಧಿಕ್ರಾಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದರಿಗೆ ಅಧಿಕ್ರಾಮಕ್ಕೆ
*\ #	.សេសិក្សសំរបស់ស្គ្រាស់ ២៧ ២៧២២៦ == ៤៨ ២៧២៦. ក្រុងស្រីហ្ <b>ព១</b> សិក្ស
2.5	-ಆಟರ ನಿಕ್ಕಾರ್ ೨ % ನಿರಂದ - <b>೨೫</b> ನಿರುವಾಮ ಸನಸಿಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭಿಕಾ
n;	The reason III on, I illinit, on a sungial work
3.9	ಿ - ೧೩೯೧ರ ಭಿ <sup>†</sup> ರಿಗಬಳ ಭಾಗಾಮ ಪ <sup>†</sup> ಹಾಗು ಎಂ. ಎಲ್ಲಾಂಡಲ ವರ್ವಕ್ಕೆ ಕೆ.
Ç	មានស ២០១៤ (១២៤ ៥៤២៤ ២៤៤) ម៉ូនណាលាប្រឹក្សា ១៩ <b>០»</b> ប្រ
ps -	no la company de la particione de la company
• .	మాయులో ఇవకుక <b>ెట్ జ</b> ో భాషంతా జీస్ గట్కార్స్ కొందర్శాణకు అని గుని భాతంలోని
• ,	ing. Spackar pickling singlere in english to be

up.

And I can give you an example which

I think is important to keep in mind for just -just how this type of thing can happen and how
an enormous amount of time, money, and judicial
resources are devoted to something which is, in
the bottom line, is totally meaningless.

There is a case in Bexar County by the name of Jaffe (phonetic) versus Sun Belt Savings. The Jaffe family became involved as witnesses in the House ethics investigation of Speaker Jim Wright in Washington. A group of investigators from the House came down to San Antonio to interview the Jaffes and take their testimony, followed by a horde of media. Some of those journalists from ABC News went to the courthouse to check up and see if there was any cases involving the Jaffes, and they found that there was a file styled Jaffe versus Sun Belt Savings that had been totally sealed.

The journalists remembered that

Congressman Wright had been implicated or that

there had been some questions about his

involvement with the savings and loan industry.

They said, "Hmm, Jaffes, Congressman Wright,

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

• P	ŧ
tur t dem girt pro su sur plo d'us l	•
To distinct the district best to applies seen during the	ç
fact sou take tyre of thing can hay en and how	``
enlotive; ban on, on tomes to diament in an	ř
reconstructed that the threshold $u$ . The summething $u$ widely $l=-\pi$	, ,
· who is no record with the forest of the section o	¢ →
ក្សី មួយជាសេស ១០ ១៤ ១៤ ១០១១ ១ ១៤ ១៣១៤២	*
ជាតិក្រុម ព្រះបាន នេះបានប្រទេស (១) ១ (១០១) ការ ដីក្រុម ដីស ១០.៣ ក្រុម	** •
tryings. The laffle fa. ity became involved on	ķ. <b>L</b>
with mann in the fours others investigation of	۲ -
in sour to a typidant of did into aim office	£.f.
್ರಿಗಳ ಸಂಗ್ರೇತ್ರಗಳ ನಿರುವ ಕಿರಿಯ ಕಿರಿಯ ಅನ್ನು ಆಗುರ ಕಿರಿಯ	Ç+ 4.
intenser to interview the Jaffa can total bleir	* f.
the transfer of the contract o	## .u. .i.
of those journalints from NPC Take dept to the	7 r
gan the lagge fit and that out doors of caucityon	<b>7</b> F.
crae, involving the Unfigur, and they frum' teat	4.
ರವರ್ತ ಜನರ ರ ವಿಶಕ್ತಿಯ ಬರಿಗುವು ವಾರಿಸಿದ ಇರುವರುವ ದಿರ್ಧಾರಿಕಾಗಿ	7.5
dowlings that had been tobed by dorlos.	<b>Č</b> t.
က်လုပ်တီး ပါဝက္ကလိုက္သားမဟု အသည် ကြာလု <b>န္အလည်</b> အလုပ်	<b>J</b> . i*
des des des l'éche has been inglisettes un that	<i>5</i> .
uid drude campriler, old recol had ereco	~ ^
.gr/oursiance the sevings and continuous rent	80
್ ಅನ್ನ ಡಬ್ಬ್ಯ ಕಟ್ಟಾಗ್ರ ನಡಚಿತ್ರದ ದಿನಗಳು ಬರ್ಬ ಬರು ನಡೆ	أبع س

savings and loan, Sun Belt Savings. There must be some preferential treatment going on here between the judiciary in San Antonio trying to protect one of its prominent citizens and Sun Belt Savings and the congressman," and I can tell you they were very excited about getting into this file.

well, we got the records unsealed, and I can tell you, as I suspected, this was nothing more than a lender liability suit that went on for about 18 months and then was resolved.

There was an enormous amount of publicity about the case, but the only publicity was about the fact that it was sealed and the fact that it got unsealed. The records were totally innocuous. There was never, to my knowledge, any further comment by any of the journalists, including the ones that had moved to unseal it, about the file.

It was a typical -- what you would expect -- a petition that alleged a bunch of things about a lender that had not fulfilled commitments, and some interrogatories and some deposition notices, and a number of other things

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

•	្នាក់ ប្រធានប្រជាព្រះ និង ព្រះស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រុក ស្រែក ស្រុក ស្រែក ស្រុក ស្
<b>.</b>	ត្រូវ <b>នេះ ខ្លាំង</b> ស្រាំង ស្រាំង ស្រាស់
.•	។ កូចរំ ការ ទ នេទ្សស្នា សេក សេស «ស្គ្រាស់ស្សាក្សាក្នុងស្វា
•	ava na akomitio dhami em odi ka ade deela
Ą	n se to bure the manus of the second contract of the
.~	effil "in thop or a very andite" thout gotting
-	• # 12.0 min/db - 12.0 min/db
,	.ស្នែក ស្រាស្ស (ខេស្សមក្ស <b>១.៨ ១</b> .၅ ខុម ខ្លុំរដ្ឋា
<b>?</b>	ರಾಗ ನಿನಿಮ್ ಕಲ್ಯಾನಿಕಾಣದಾಗಿ ಬಿ. ಕಿಂದಲ್ಲಿ ಭಾರತಿ ಮಾತ್ರಿಗಳು
j. j.	ស៊ី ស៊ីនី ស៊ីនិទាស សស្ដី និង និង ស៊ីនិ សមានគេ គេ និងស្ថិត ស្រាន់ និងស្រីនិង និង និងស្រីនិង និង និងស្រីនិង និង
ਸ਼ਾ <i>''</i>	tint oc. 2011 Dert "1 achtlo in lacito na Bas
·· \$	•βn အသည
c, g	Re dauone aponyone na ray ered
$\gamma$ $r$	ನ್ನಿಶಾಸ <b>್ಥೆಯ ಇ</b> .ಕಾರ ದಂಗಿದೆ ಗಾ <b>ಟ</b> ಣಿ ಇದರ <b>ುದ</b> ಸಮಿತ ನಡಲನೆಗೆ ಸ್ವಿತವರ್ಗೆ ನಂ
., t	ರತ್ನಿ ಗಾರಾ ಚರ್ಚರಗಳ ಅದರ ರಿಕ್ ಚಿತ್ರದ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಅಭಿಕೃತಿಗಳ ಅವರ
" <u>"</u>	ာ ကလား ၈ သမ္မာတာ ဝန္းေျပးသို့သင္း ကား အားလည္း ေဆြးျပန္း တို့အေတြ
7. 1	ಳ ೧೯೮೮ - ಇಲ್ಲಿಲ್ಲ ಎಂಬ ಎಂಬ ಇಟ್ಟಿ . ಕರ್ಯ <b>ರಾಜಕಾಗ</b> ಗಟ್ಟಿಗಳಿಂದ
`. <u></u>	. (ಶ. ೨೦ ೪ <b>೧</b> ೦ ನೀಗಿ ಸಹಕ್ಕಾರಿ ಅದಿ ಅರ್ಥಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಸಿಕ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಸಿಕ
. <b>"</b> .	ប្រទេស ប៊ុននៅ <b>បានជប់ ឧបក្ស ១៧១ ១៧៤១១៤៤១៧</b> (១៩២៦៨១១២២)
00	ed the about it, about as a filto.
	. మహారా <b>జ్యా</b> కొంటేతో —— మేగాంకి. ఇంది పురాణ ఉన
85	သိမ္းမြားမှ က ကြင့်ရှိစီလိုကိုယ့် စည်သည်။ စဉ်မှ ခိုင်းချိန်တို့ကို က ⊸မ သိုင်းချိန်တို့ စည်း
22	angeerd →+ a rabidable. Dirab a. Sacad E seude of

ನಡಕಿದ್ದ ಗರ್ಚಿಕಲ ಓಡ ಇಲ್ಲಿಯಾಗ ಎಂದು ಸಂಸ್ಥಾರವಾಗಿ ಮು ಪರ್ಕಾಟಕ ಸಂಸ್ಥಿತ

that -- but the fact that this record had been sealed bred distrust and suspicion, and, frankly, for a period of time for those people watching ABC World News Tonight, harmed, I think, the image and integrity of our -- of our court system because this -- this file was sealed and the journalists were unsure of what the motive was for sealing it.

The fact of the matter was, although no one ever told me this, I suspect that it was just -- it was just an embarrassment that the plaintiffs didn't want anybody to know that they filed this suit or were involved in this kind of a litigation.

I think any court records that are sealed, that the Constitution -- both our Texas Constitution and the Federal Constitution -- has something to say about that. But there are certain cases where there is an additional factor where there is an overriding public interest in not having these records sealed, and some of those files, in my judgment, are getting sealed.

For example, there was a savings and loan institution that as a standard operating

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

The action of the action of the attention of the term of action of action of action of action of action of action of the action

The state of the s

 procedure, any time they were either sealed -they were either sued or they brought a suit,
they sealed the file on the theory that the
public and the investors would lose confidence
in the savings and loan institution if the
public was aware that they were involved in
litigation.

1

2

3

5

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

There is another case which -- which I'm familiar with. And -- and I've told Justice Hecht that anything I say about this case is derived from the Austin American Statesman. But a psychiatrist was accused of having sexual relations with one of his patients after getting her hooked on dangerous drugs. I wonder if my daughter or wife were planning on attending -or being treated by that physician whether I might not want to be able to go down to the courthouse and see if there were any cases filed against that physician and, if so, what the allegations were and what the -- what the plaintiff had to say about it and what the -what the court records had to say about it.

I -- I raise all this only by way of saying that -- that some of these cases that are being sealed are not just the run-of-the-mill

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	f
ុខនិយាក 3 ខិន់ភ្លាស់ការ ប្រដ្ឋា ១ និងស្រ កាសមិសិស កម្មាយ ក្កាស្ថា	••
తాంగా తా నమికు కారావటింది. ఇక కార్యం కార్మం కార్మం కార్మం	<b>\</b> •
results ind who coupers in the constant ones	4
off the maintenaism and the spain of a dis-	• •
ಪತ್ರಿಕ್ಕಳು ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರ	7
· and in the contract of the c	r (ca
Migre is enobles a seculial this.	
్లుప్రామాలు ఎంకే కాళ్కారాలో సమయం ఈఈ కొడ్డారు. ఎక్కోర్ ఇంకెర్స్ ఉన్నారు. ఇ	•
្នាំ ១៩៣១ ១៤ ដែលជាការប្រទេស ១៤ ១៩៤៨២ ១៤១១ ១៩១១ ១៩១១	· .r.
one of var deem at a <u>final in the channel fine taken</u>	,
(၁၈၈ ) ချစ်စေတည်။ ၈ မဟုဘ္ခရာက လက္ကာ မိသစ် (ကိရာမိမ <b>ာ</b> ) မေတ ()	*, *>
ed. Sefond ofel ne of platiento alter gottino	c £
ಭಾರತಿಕೆ ಸದಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ೧೯ <b>.ದ</b> ್ವಾಗುತ್ತಿ <b>ದ</b> ರುತ್ತು ಭಾರತಿ ನಡೆ ದಿರುವುದರನ್ನು ತನ್ನ	2 t
hes bear on wile rore ຈຸກິດຫລາກg on adronoling	* *
or toing erected by thus physician costics X	146 - <del>11</del> 7
ျဖစ္ပြဲက <b>အဝင္ အခု</b> ရင္ ရစ္ ခြဲခဲ့ေတြ မေတြ အေနာက္ခဲ့ရင္ မေတြးအ	√ €
easttheyn, and end it bloss rest tag ecase fin	^,
១៧៨ ជាចាប់ក្នុង មិន «មិន១ និងប្រឹក្សិត្សិតមួយ និងប៉ាត់ ជាតិការាធិបាន	e <u>r</u>
ನಾಪನಿಕಣಕಾಗಿ ಅವರ ಅವರ ಅನ್ನ ಅನ್ನ ಅವರ ಅವರ ಅನ್ನು ಕ್ಷಾಣ	31.
ಆಗಳ ಕರಣೆಯ ದಾಗು ಅನಿ ಹಿಡಾಗಿದ 3ರು. ಅಕ ರಾವರ್ ಬಿಡ <b>ಕರಗ</b> ೆಗ	រី ភេ
.ಶಸ್ತ್ರಿ ಶಿಚರಾಣದ ಗ್ರಾರ್ಥ ಅವು ಬರುತ್ತಿ ಸರಿಕಾರಿಯು ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಲಾಗಿ ರಾಜಕ್ಕೆ ಚಿತ್ರಾಣಕ್ಕೆ	93
to have her game and the air actions to the t	~ ~
ರಾಗ ತರಗಳ ಗರಬಹುಳ ರಗರಬಳ ಬಿಡ ರಬಹುದ ನಟಗಳ ಈಈ ಪ್ರಾಸಿಕ ಕ್ಷಮಿಕೃತ್ಯ	. r
tutumotimi omagu ed. deni deg era edlaer eriet	; 6

-3

piece of litigation, but have an overriding public interest which make it even more important that this Court move quickly to try and -- try and ameliorate the situation that exists in Texas.

Finally -- and I don't want to waive the flag too much, but -- but I do believe that our democracy is premised upon the concept of self-government, and I think it's further premised upon the ability of the people to make intelligent decisions about the direction of their government.

We also have the old bromide that ignorance of the law is no excuse. How can people be informed about the law and the people who administrate that law if the administration of the law is being carried out in secret?

I think in closing I would just cite something that was said by our founding fathers in this state when they declared their independence from Mexico. It's an axiom in political science that unless the people are educated and enlightened, it is idle to expect the continuance of civil liberty or the capacity for self-government. That, to me, sums up one

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	r
າເຈມ ແລະວິດ ພາກ ເປັນ ເປັນຕາ ອ້າອຽວງ ການ ການເປັນ	**
్షాలో ార్ గ్రైవ్యక్షణం అంటాడు పట్టుకార్ ఈ టివ సౌకర్యం తెల్లాతో ఉన్న సౌక	~
వివాత్ర ముడ్డికి ఇంకికిలో రాజ్కి దవిశాఖలో ఉంది. ఇక్కి ఆ గ్రామం ఉంది. కి. కి. కి. కి. కి. కి. కి. కి. కి. క	٦.
• non Doubles	,
oton i den Lia . 1 Ann Ei dir	₹
သို့သည်။ ကရုတ်သို့ ကြို့သည်။ ကြို့တို့တို့ ဗေဗာ ချီးတုပ် ချေလိုလောင် သည် လူ့အကြို့သည်။	7
% <b>ರ ೨</b> ೧೯೮೮ರ <b>ಿಗಳ ಗ</b> ರಕರ ವಿಲಕ್ಷಿಸಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ೧೯ ೪, ಇಥರು ನಂಬ ಇಥ <b>ರ</b>	
roddryk a'dh dainn Tohna od comacova, -13c i	•
್ ಸರ್ಚ ಅದೆ ಅದ್ದೀರ್ವು ಅನಕ ದಿರ್ಣಕ್ಷನ್ ಗಿಗೆಗೆ ಅನಕ ಗಾರ್ಥ ಅರ್ಥ ಅನ್ನು ಅ	o t
Re noldpouble edd yroda (neo mio. i depublicada)	九五
· Jacana ne vog - u leds	ĵ. t
doubt a two of blo odd over the color of	CT
ie i rende ou the Law o er engule. Tou cen	N.J.
ວມີດູ່ເວດ ຫວິສີ ພະແດ ໝາຍ, ຄະນີສີ ລະຫາຄຸດ ລະຄວາມຄຸດ ເປັນ ແລະ ກວານ	۴.
et a equiption to be bush it uid this ed inichten	ľ
Ciryon will the Gottman greet si will odd Do	, t., t.,
odie domi. Jeog Dirai rin ar darad t	P
្រុកស្រីស្រាញ ស្រាស់ពី ១៩ សុខ្លាស់ពីសុខ សុខ្លាស់ពីសុខ្លាស់ពីសុខ្លាស់ពី សុខស្រីសុខ សុខ	( · ·
másilá Johakook yeda medy oveste elas me	
ing centined from Fource. This an action in	P S
ស្រុក ខេត្ត <b>១០</b> ១ ខណ្ឌ ស្គាល់ ពេល បានសំខាន់ស្រុក បានសំខាន់ស្រុក	A 1
ತ್ರಾರಾಣಗಳ <b>ಕಡೆ</b> ರಚಿತ್ರ ಎಕ್ ಎಕ್ಕಳ ಬಾರುಕ್ರವಳಿಗಳು ಕರ್ಕಾರ ತಾಂತ್ರಾಕ್ಷಕ್ಕಾರ	ĊO
్ ప్రభాసంగా ఎక్కువారు. మార్క్షామ్స్ కార్లు మండి అంది. అంది	* **
ing sure a unit of the confirmation of the con	٠

of our abiding principles of government. 1 2 I think what is happening in this state in terms of sealing of court records now 3 4 threatens that basic premise of our government, and I would urge you to expeditiously resolve 5 6 the question. JUSTICE HECHT: When you say "court 7 records," do you mean the records that are 8 9 actually filed with the court --10 MR. BABCOCK: Yes, sir. 11 JUSTICE HECHT: -- as opposed to discovery which, for whatever reason, is not 12 13 filed? MR. BABCOCK: Yes, sir. 14 15 JUSTICE HECHT: Do you see a concern 16 that one party may use a threat to file discovery in order to extort a more favorable 17 18 settlement or advantage in the case? MR. BABCOCK: Well, I mean, if that 19 20 happens -- I mean, it's not just the filing of the discovery material; there are a lot of times 21 22 people will call you up and say, "Hey, I'm going to sue your client, and if you don't settle with 23 24 me," you know, "we're going to drag this all

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

through the court system." That is -- that's

25

. Sime arms of the above tender, which is the tender.	J.
មើលមិន និង មួយដែលមាន មាន ប្រើបានក្រុង ប្រើបានក្រុង ប្រើបានក្រុង ប្រធានក្រុង ប្រធានក្រុង ប្រធានក្រុង ប្រធានក្រុ	,
what abnumer damner, had non the a west side of the	r.
the combons that basie promise in own covernment.	*
is I monde and a you so not will onely scaolwa	٠
• ##4. 1 00 mg - 1 12	?
the property of the property o	<b>~</b>
ರಾಜ್ ವಿಜನ್ಗಳ ಚಿಕ್ಕ ನಿರಾಣ ಅಭಿವರ್ಷಕಾರಿಗಳ ಅಂತ ಚಿನ್ನಾನಿಕಾರು.	
⇔— కుపు <b>ల</b> ల ఏమి <b>క</b> ేటిన్న ఉంది. ఉన్న కామిల్ల	•
.pln .now :promote .m	# # *
od Donogra no :mroth no mornt	.r ~
ಶಿಕ್ಷ ಸಮಿ ಇಮ್ಮವಾರು ಎಂದು ಅವರು ಕರ್ಮ ಇವರು ಸಿಕ್ಕಿಗೆಯ ಅಲಯಾಗುತ್ತಿದ್ದ	* *
	· . 4.
•380 •30 <sup>7</sup> •7000/34 ./ "	<u>.</u> .
್ನಾರಾಗಿಯ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಥ ಇನ್ನು ನಿಲ್ಲಿ ಕಟ್ಟಿಗಳಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಾಥಾಗಿಯ	
that one party ung use a direat to 4000	7
ರಾವರ್ತನಾಗುತ್ತದೆ. ಎ. ಆದಿ ವಿಭಾವಕ್ಷಣ ಅದೆ ದರ್ಶಾ <b>ರ</b> ಇತ್ತಿ <b>ಉಡುತ್ತಾರ</b> ದನ್ನು	
Soast of the advantage association	· r
ರಾವರ ಇತ್ತಿಗಾರು ಕಟ್ಟು ಪರೀಣಕ್ಕೆ ಕಟ್ಟು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತ್ತು ಕಟ್ಟಿಕುತು	ŗ
ha conu T maan, 15%n ಇಂಕ ಕ್ರೇಥಕ ಅಡಿಯ ಕೆಂಗಳಗಳ ನನ	po
the discovery esterial; there are a let o times	T.
people uilly call you up and sey, "Toy, "to white	22
te and some a tank, are the par contactor and	٠.
ುತ್ತರಿಸಿದರೆ ಅವರು ಅಕ್ಕೆ ಅದೆಗಳ ರಾಜಕಾಲ್ ಕನ್ನಡದ ಅವರ "ಕ್ಕಾಲ್	ýc
ිටිය ට සංස යා පටයි <sup>නේ ලබ</sup> ා කටසේය සු එයියියි. තන්ස් පටුකුලමයි.	;

certainly a possibility. I hope -- I hope it's

a rare one, but I have heard it in my practice

and I suspect all the lawyers in the room

have -- have, as well.

And there are -- I'm not saying that there are not costs to open government; there are. But if someone has material that is relevant to a matter pending before the court and thus can properly file that material in an effort to influence the court's decision, those records should be open, unless there is a very compelling reason why they shouldn't.

If there is material dumped into
the -- into the court record that is not
relevant to any issue and is -- is subject to
being stricken or removed in some fashion, I
think the rule that's been contemplated takes
care of that. But I don't think we -- we should
try to make rules based upon the misconduct of
lawyers in this -- in our jurisdiction, and I
think a threat like that might not be the
appropriate way to pursue litigation.

JUSTICE HECHT: If -- well, just as a concrete example, if, in a family case, one party elicited from another party in a

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

7. 4 7 . 121770 - 7 g. 1757328 - 7	
11 in the convert of the concentration of the contract of the	po denerg
uu megasta ood Tos desigeru Tobas	
-intow - Newsil email 6	
$\gamma = \frac{1}{2} \gamma \gamma$	3 44.6
over an a generative won one order	92949 (:
n tudou byl onorwou it im	With a
st. event to watter constng were	daman ci
dodd esta yfoc och som did se dodd	in, at Lo
្រះស្នងស្រួស ១៧៨ ទមនស្សារិក្សា ១៤ ស្រស់ដើម្ប <sup>ា</sup>	posta i gard
ន ។ ១០ពីស្តេ « <b>សភ</b> ុខ ១៩ ។ ពីស្ទាប់ ១២៤៩១១	galv s ai
control of the contro	
ininodon of enode in	. 241 32
ನ್ನಿ ಇದರ್ಗಳು ಮೇ <b>ಟರದ ಎನಸ ರ</b> ವಿಷ <sup>್ −+</sup> + ನನ ಿಸ	Jo.
who as obtaining to drawn or	უ მიაც.
to thouse abiliaken or valor "ifa abi	6 ·
ng the state of the control of the c	302113 BC
ನಗಳಿಂದ ಕರ್ಮನ ಕರ್ಮನ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಬಹು ರಾಗುಕ್ಕೆ ಬಹುದಾಗಿ	- : ::a • -
្សាស់ សាខា ស្ ១០០១៧ ខាងស្នាស់ ១១.១៣	i caubac
న్ ఉనుఖరైగారాణ్ నుండి ఆ <del>-</del> కృష్ణి ఇద్దు మూ <b>ర్వ</b> ుడుకో దారం చేశాలు మూర్తున్నారు. తార్వి	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
នេះ គឺជាស្រីសា ទាំពណីទី <b>១៧</b> លែ ជាស្រសស្គា ១ ស៊ីស្រីស្គា - ស្រ	
ត្រូវជា ១២០១៩ ៩៩ មួយ ១៩១ ១ភូព១ (១៩	
The state of the s	.១៨១-6 ១។
oni na mara gi inggan na n	Harris Co
မြို့သည်။ ကုန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္နန္န	

deposition some embarrassing or salacious material, and previously there had been an agreement not to file these depositions for perhaps those concerns and others, and following the deposition a party who would be favored by that disclosure of information says, "If you don't agree to a better division of the property, we're going to file these depositions with the court and thereby render them public," what's to -- what do you see to prevent that sort of thing from happening? Or should it be prevented?

MR. BABCOCK: Well, there -- there are two things: Should we prevent parties from threatening each other with that type of thing? And that, I don't think, is going to be addressed by this rule, nor could it be addressed by this rule.

The second question is whether the material that is going to be filed with the court should be open or should be sealed. If -- if material is going to be filed or is filed that the other side believes should be sealed, there is a procedure in the rule that we are proposing that would allow a judge to determine

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

Consentation court of the court of the confidence  $-\pi$  ,  $\pi$  the least block of the front fig. (in Fig. ). ಇಲ್ಲ ವರ್ಣ ಸತ್ತೆ ದಾಲತ್ತು ಅದಾ**ತ**ವೆದೆ ಅನ್ನಾಮಿಸಿ ಸಂಗ ತಿಂದರ ಕಡೆಗಳುತ್ತಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ತ್ತುಗಳು ಬರುಗಳು ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಬರುಗಳು ಬರುಗ the countries of the  $\sqrt{c}$ thet dintionure of the tradits tayes "TI most drawl myree to a bottom fiviring of the nur diaerab coede offic to fille there dansait one ್ಕಾರ್ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಸಂಕರ್ಷ ಸವಾಯಾದರು ಭಾಸ್ತಿಯಾದ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಲಾಗಿ ಮುಖ್ಯ ಮಾಹಿತ್ತು ್ ನಿಷ್ಣಿ ಹೆಗ⊖∀ಅಭ್ಯ ಅದೆ ಅನಿಸಿ ಫಲ್ಫ್ ಅಂದಿ ನಿಗ್ರಾ ಅಈ ತಿರ್ವೇಹಿತ್ತಲ್ಲ O F ಾರಾಟಕ ರಾಗಿ ಹಿನಗಿರು. ಪ್ರಕರ್ಮವಾರ್ಥನ್ನು ಚಿತ್ರವಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ಣಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಸಿಕ ನಿರ್ಣಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕರ್ತಿಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರ್ಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ ಪ್ರಕ್ಷ J.L C edward I .

3

. . . .

~ r

I:

condit -- espaint ( Lad ) : "Condit : . cm ្រែក្រុម នៃក្នុងដែលស្រី និងស្រស់ និងស្រស់ និងស្រស់ និងស្រស់ ស្រី ស្រស់ និងស threatening each sale dain sale of the office by the sale thing? ಾರ್ ಇಲ್ಲ ೧೯೮೦ ರನ್ನು ನಡಸ್ತೆ ಈ ಜಿಕೆಗಳ ಪತ್ರಾನಿಕ ನಡಸ್ತೆ 77 address of the outer, no cours to be ေကာင်တြင္း မရိသည္။ သင္းအေတာ့ အေတြက . .

ned redfort wi kaidenut ûnebee bat

ರಾಗಿದೆ ಚಿಳ್ಳಿಗಳ ಕ್ರತಿ ಇದು ಎಕ್ ಅದ್ದ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕ್ರಮಕ್ಕೆ ಸಹಗಳ ಸಿಪ್ರಾಣಕ್ಕೆ 011 ಸ್ಕಾರ್ಯ .ಶೀ. ಕಾರ್ಯ ಇನ್ನು ಚಾರ್ಯ ಶ್ರೀ ಮಾತ್ರಕ್ಕೆ ಸಿನಿಮಾರ್ಯ ನಿಭಾಕರಣ ಪ್ರಕಾರಣ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಸಿಕೆ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಟ್ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಕೆಗಳ ಪ್ರಕರಣ  $oldsymbol{o}$  of the second  $oldsymbol{o}$  and  $oldsymbol{o}$  of the second  $oldsymbol{o}$ ార్లు ఎం. అంటే ఎమ్మార్డ్ అళ్ళాన్నికల్ అనివేంది. ఇంటేర్డు పునించి మీదినికి ស្រុខ ទេ២ ទី១ដែល ១៩៦៦ ខ្មីស នៅ ខែ «២០០ ១០១ ១ ១ ១ ២ ១១ ១១ ကား ကောင်းသည်။ လုတ်သည် ကိုတာတွဲ ရေးကောင်းသည်။ လေသာ မောင်းသည်။ ကိုသည်များကြောင့်

that, and if the material satisfies the standard which the court adopts in terms of sealing information, then the information would -- would be sealed. And if it doesn't meet that standard, then it wouldn't be sealed. And the improper motives of the person attempting to file the material may or may not be considered by the trial judge. I'm not sure that that is something that -- that would be relevant. I'm not sure if it would or not. But either they are going to meet the standard, or they are not.

that certain discovery would not be filed with the court except under certain conditions and those conditions did not occur, would that agreement be enforcible against a challenge by members of the media, members of the public, or someone else?

MR. BABCOCK: If the -- if the documents are not filed with the court or not presented to the Court so that -- so that the judge is not being called upon to pass on those documents in any way, shape, or form, then I think that then that would be a private agreement between the two -- two lawyers or the

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

గారం ఉన్నది. నోటి టూ మెక్క్ కి క్ క్ క్రామ్ ఉన్న కి కారం ఉన్న కి	•
ាល ចំណុះ បានប្រជាពល ពេល បានស្ថិត្ត ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់	**
THE REPORT OF SOME STATE OF THE PROPERTY OF THE SOME STATE OF THE	
ತ್ರಗಳಿಕ ಚಿತ್ರದ ತ್ರಕ್ಷಣದ ಕ್ರಮಗಳ ಕ	a
రాగ్ర్మాణ 🕠 ్తలం కో స్పా కోంత్రా 👉 💉 శ 🍿 కోంటావు	-,
್ (ಚರ್ಚು ಒಂದರ್ಜ ರಾಗ್ಯಾಣ ಗಟೆಕೆ ಹಾಗ್ಯಾಗಳು ನಿರ್ವಹಗಳು	
and the second of the second o	7
១០ ខណ្ឌីថា បាក់ទី២ ១១២០ ថ្ងៃការ ខេត្ត ១៦ ១៦ ១៦ ១៦ ១៩ ១៩ ១៩	
notes and the second of the se	
గృత్మిన ఉద్వహిశ్త మార్జువ⊧్ర ఇంద్రాల ఎ. మెక్ సెక్ ఉద్మార్ పోషట	
မေလာင္းမာတြင္း ကရားပါတီ နေတာ့ ရကို တာကိုရက္သီတာ လည္း သီးယားကို ကိုတာကို ကတ္ေကြသည့္ လည္း	
ပြားသူတွင် ကြို့တွင်တော့တွင် (၂၈၂၄) ရှင်းလည်း ကြို့တွင်	••
డ్రిక్కా కాలక్షిక్ ఎడ్ తెల్లు కొర్టా కారాణాలు కొర్టాకుకుంటే ఉన్నాయి.	<b>~</b> .
a e and to obtain anto a cartalin denotations and	•
និក្សាស៊ី (និម្មិក្សា «ស្គ្រួក» ព្រះ (និង ) ១៤ (នៃ) ស្គ្រួស្គាល់ (និង ) និង (និង ) និង (និង ) និង (និង ) និង (	
ការ ស្រាស់ ស៊ីលេវៈ២ ៣ ផ្លាស់លោក ១៥៧ ពេក ២០០ ១០១០ ១០១៤ ១៣ ១	•
The section $p=-2\pi/2$ and $p=-2\pi/2$ . We see that	Ñ
ကိုတာကျပညာသာလေး	
	,
ತರಿಗಳು ೧೯೮೧ ೧ <b>೦೬</b> ೧೩೩ ೩ ೮೪೩ ೬೩೮ ೦ ೮ ೯೩೦	v (
ស្នា ការណ៍ជី ១០ ៩៩ ឆ្នាំ ធ្វើ ១០ និងស្វា ១៨៧ <b>១៨</b> ១ កិច្ចស្តិ	
ကျမည်၍ နေးက သည်ရေးမှု ကို ကြသည် ကြားသည်တွေး ချွန်းသည် ကို သည်း ကြားသည်။	• •
် တစ္ပြဲသို့ ရေသည် သူမွာ ရေစာက်သည် မှတ္တြင် <b>ကာညာ ဂု</b> ပ် စ <b>ာရီရာသည် အ</b> ချင့်	7 (

and the control of the state of

and the computer obtained the control of the state of the control of the control

two parties, and only in the event that the Court was called upon to -- to resolve that agreement would that information become public.

If there are no further questions, I'll -- I'll pass this to others.

in your testimony you seemed to either concede or to suggest -- I'm not sure which -- that certain documents or certain cases would be appropriate to be sealed, and one you mentioned was adoption records. And I think you mentioned another and I didn't write it down. Do you remember what it was?

MR. BABCOCK: Your Honor, I -- I -I think I said that there is a -- I believe
there is a statute that covers adoption -JUSTICE SPEARS: Right.

MR. BABCOCK: -- proceedings and makes them confidential. There may -- there may be others. In fact, although it's not within the jurisdiction of this court, I think certain juvenile criminal records may be, by statute, made confidential.

JUSTICE SPEARS: Any others?

MR. BABCOCK: Not that I'm aware of,

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	**
to 10 to 5 to 4 to 5 to 5 to 5 to 5 to 5 to 5	
and the common a distance that are to the common as a common section.	
ျပင္းနည္လိုင္းမႈမွာ ေလးမ်ား ကိုသည္။ လည္း လည္းသည္က လည္းမွာေတြကို သည္။	5
∗ ta vii d un tan π	Ċ
n pro <del>ne</del> pro sama in the composition of the	
ကို ရေးသည်။ မြန်မေါ့ ကြောင်းကြို့ ကြောင်းက <mark>ောင်းသည်</mark> ကြောင်းသည်။ မြန်မောင်းသည်။	
page unite apply that the same	
ు <sup>1</sup> కి.కూరం, అందావర్ భుగ్రామంలో ప్రాటక్ష్మ అంది 17 1 <b>85</b> 7 . ఉన్నా 6 <b>5</b>	
am ក្រុម ប្រទេស ស្តេច សុខាធិប្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ សុខាធិប្រាស់ សុខាធិប្រាស់ សុខាធិប្រាស់ សុខាធិប	
to the company of the transfer of the property of the company of t	
The second secon	<b>~</b> .
	•••
The Constant and the constant of the constant	•
alound the second in the second and by the contract of the second of the	• .
n <del>e</del> político, o pakeon limili atrabado e nebel con it	7
	,
the state of the s	
and the <del>continue</del> of the continue of the cont	
and the first the control of the first the second of the s	
ఎస్.మాట్స్ ఎ.మోట్స్ కొర్కుకున్నారు. అమెడ్డార్స్ కార్మామ్మార్ ఉన్నారు.	p ·
estan de la servición par una como Sociário Como espera	٠ (
aiaiar (11.20) - 68	
The Carlotte of the Common of the Carlotte of	•

Judge, which is not to say that there aren't 1 2 some more, but -- and I don't believe I said -and if I did, I didn't mean to -- that I think 3 there are any situations where an entire case can be -- can be sealed. And I think that's 5 6 what's happened, and that's a problem. JUSTICE SPEARS: An abstract of that 7 case, in other words, should be available --8 MR. BABCOCK: Well, that's certainly 9 10 true --11 JUSTICE SPEARS: -- even though 12 details may not be? 13 MR. BABCOCK: Yes, that's certainly 14 true; but what we are saying is innocuous 15 pleadings like a notice of deposition. 16 JUSTICE SPEARS: Right. 17 MR. BABCOCK: I mean, there's no reason for that to be sealed. 18 19 JUSTICE SPEARS: Thank you. 20 JUSTICE HECHT: It sounds like maybe 21 the sort of underlying premise is that it ought not to be sealed unless there is more than a 22 23 private interest or a personal interest or individual interest; must be some question of 24 25 public policy in order to seal it, such as

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the comparison of the comparis	r
the British of the Demonstrate and the drift constraints	
the first of the second second second second second second	
రంగా కార్మాన్ని కార్మాన్స్ కాట్లో కాట్లు కార్డ్ కాట్లో కాట్లో కాట్లో కాట్లో కాట్లో కాట్లో కాట్లో కాట్లో కాట్లో	•
ರಾಧ್ಯತ್ ಸಾಗ್ಯಾಕ್ ೧೯೬೮ - ೧೯೮೮ - ೧೯೮೮ ಕ್ಕಳು ೧೮೪೩	
	7*
to a disposition of the company of the	
an on j	
Lights of the solution of the proof.	Ę
్ కార్స్ ప్రాటెక్స్ క్రామ్ క్రామ్ క్రామ్ క్రామ్ క్రామ	a
ైమణాపుకుప్పట్టి ఎక్కువున్న ఇంకా : ***** **** •. గ	·
និស្សស្ត្រាក់ ក្រុំ ក្នុងពីពួក ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ពិធី និស្ស ទី២០ ភូមិក្នុង ក្	•
.coline Julia sellana sindii in .coli	•
•မာသော သုံးသည်။ သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည်။ သည် သည်။ သည် သည်။ သည် သည်။ သည် သည်။ သည်။	
en unoscession sou the :Common .com	i.
• က ၁၉၈ ကောင်း သည် သည <b>်း</b> ညစားမြှာ ကောင်းကောင်း	
. noy ledut : north analy	.,
odrawodki abuser o some paripern	,
ក្រុមមួយ ប្រជាព្រះ ប្រសិស្សា ប្រាស់ ប្រសិស្សា ប្រសិស្សា ប្រសិស្សា ប្រជាព្រះ ប្រាស់ ស្រែសាស្សា ប្រាស់	
notes the substance of an expension of the substance of t	
in disesciant lancemoù a me decretat en commi	Ç:
ម ព្រះស្រុកស្រុក របស់ស្រុក ប្រឹស្សស្រុក ស្រុកសុខមុខជាក្រុម ស្រុកសុខមុខភាព ស្រុក សុខ សុខសុខ	* .
a promotion of the state of the	**

protection of all juveniles, protection of all adoption circumstances. Is that sort of the premise, or is it different from that?

MR. BABCOCK: Well, I think -- no, really, the way -- I think I'm coming at it from kind of the -- the other end of the tunnel.

If -- if individuals in our society are calling upon the government to resolve their disputes, then presumptively all the information that they bring to the court to resolve that dispute is -- is open. They can seal certain things if they meet a standard, which is a very high standard, but which would -- which would take into account certain intrasocietal interests. Trade secrets might be something. Something in the discovery area might be -- might be appropriate.

But the rule is for openness, and not the other way; not the other way around. Even if the Legislature were to pass a statute, as Massachusetts did, which said that the public may not attend a rape trial during the testimony of a juvenile victim of that rape, the United States Supreme Court said that kind of a per se rule is unconstitutional.

So even were the Legislature to

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

and the control of the state of ordinate of the state of the st She in a will be made to distinct a grain of . n -- doidy " . that : "po you . " gradity, to a way -- total min contact to the dollars - មកពេលជា ១១៨ មិន ក៏ពុធ ក្រស់ដាំ ១៨៩ 🖚 ១៧១ និង ម៉ាក់ដែ or do no our little on the acciety tree to be we so the jordinary by compare their for than ្នាល់វេ នាទីលើ ជា**ខ**និងសេមាស្ដីស្ដា ១ ដែល វេត្ត ស្គ្រស់ ដែលមានសម្តេច មានស្គ the all subsequent doubter whose a section which is a given r ( your all which read action thin blin b Laby rr rabb v formal v and v and v and v and v being v and vA 6 tyl slich now d -- which would take into account ~ r contain intrapoletel interepts. Traio sevents - P. T micht be se ethine. Tomothing in the distance 7.5 rea withe to -- limit to arrespendent rut the rule i our councers, and 7.1 not the other tip; not the etter was arounded ·~ F ាមមាន នៅ ដែល កា ប្រែស្នងស្រាប់ មេសាស ស្រាយមាន ស្រាយមាន ស្រាយមាន on tashreitanetts did, tir is caid that the the particular racalitude edd waith a 1 % o as o the too too got F 15 g 46 - 16

poff of finyentle violett of back to a, b.e. Paknod

"thebon flut rote flows" and high affile a are to

ru to machablished as".

indictions and interest on the most of the

carve out a certain interest that in its view

outweighed the interest of the public to have

access to judicial proceedings or judicial

records, that would still have to pass the

scrutiny of the courts in the constitutional

sense.

Thank you very much for listening to

me.

JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you.

Next I have -- we have John McElhaney and Tom Leatherbury.

JOHN McELHANEY and TOM LEATHERBURY,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in

administrative session to consider proposed

changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas

Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of

Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. McELHANEY: I'm John McElhaney from Dallas, and my partner Tom Leatherbury from Dallas, and we represent the <u>Dallas Morning News</u> and Bevo (phonetic) Corporation and its various broadcasting properties, as well as some other media clients.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

en tell fact black from the state of the fact of hans in the ife interest records with or justicial resta dade de avent tribba cinari suda 🕡 eleman ្សាស្ត្រស្នាល់ ដែលមាន ខែ ខែ **ស្ត្រី ស្រាស្ត្រ ខ**ៅថា នៃ ប្រាស្ត្រ ខេត្ត .000 C ask industrial actions income by the fit ٢ • 0.0 CANNOT BE TO AMERICAN AND COMPANY end Corrors -- Syst Corro id is ability of the formation and the contraction TARTER BEITTER REST. COMM. There was a series of the serie . . ಾಗುತ್ತಿ ಪ್ರಾಥಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಧಾನಕ್ಕೆ ಅಭಿವಾಧಿಕ ಕಾರ್ಮಿಕ ಗ್ರಾಹಣಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಧಾನಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಧಾನಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಧಾನಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಾಥಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಧಾನಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಕ್ಷಕೆ pit in objetien nearten to dangider jarajasia. 27 6 while to the form indice of the little prodection and the for a substance and common point of the stance of the section 6. Civil viscence state on inllosu: is a granded to the test of the property of the contract of the 4.50 Period, and we so secont the Mallan Septim Street 60 and and such the medition of the topology are the in the many continues of political principal con-

. ada 172 / 175 / 18

Tom and I have written a first draft of a proposed rule, and I believe that that has been distributed to you, and we're here to talk about it and answer any questions about it.

Before doing -- and Tom and I will both participate in that exercise. Before doing that, I wanted to make some general remarks following up a little bit on what Mr. Babcock mentioned.

It's apparent, of course, that we will have a rule about sealing, because the legislator has -- Legislature has directed the court to do that.

rule which, number one, passes constitutional muster from the standpoint that the Constitution does apply, and then, secondly, is a proper exercise of the leadership and authority and moral suasion of this court. And our experience in Dallas, I think, is instructive on this issue.

The statistics that were mentioned in Mr. Babcock's presentation go from 1980 in Dallas to the present time -- the time that the article was written about a year and a half ago,

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

The second of th and the solution of the contract of the contra ್ರಾನಾಣಕ ರಾಜ್ಯಾಗಿನ ಭರತ ಕಟ್ಟು ಬರಾಭಾಗತ್ರ ಕಟ್ಟಿಗಳ ನಿರ್ವಹಣೆಯ ಕಟ್ಟು ಕಟ್ಟು ಬರಾಭ್ಯ ಸ್ಥಾರ್ಗಳನ್ನು ಬರಾಭ್ಯ ಸ್ಥಾರ್ಗಳನ್ನು ಸ್ವ .or freez anni ben san toware oat di enter යන් සිට්ට සිට දක්ව යන <del>සම්</del> වූල් වේ වෙනවා. එම Company well of the state of th out a compliment of the entry of the concept of the contract o 7 ్నివర్ధాన్ని 🕒 ఎన్క్ చిర్మార్ 🤍 చివేది. ఈ విధిన్ 🖰 ఇన్నా 😽 స్వార్ సిందెఫ్ Turn a larrott, oi rouxer, c.ot we ြင္းကို ၈ ၂၈၈၉၈ ခု ကာသီသီသန္း (b တိုက္ ၈ က ၁ ဝေလာက္သည့္ ) (i) ျ 7.5 on the Death and Argent of Street and and a no r. -.ವರ್ಷ**ಿಗೆ ರ**ದಿ ಇದ್ದ ವರ್ಷಗಳು C r ne file jaertáen nerífy in writhin, e constitution as the test the design of the ~3 P ಮುಖ್ಯಗಳ ಕೆಸರು ಹಿಡಿಕ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ರಾಮಿಯಿಂದ ಹೆಚ್ಚಿದ ಹೆಚ್ಚಿದ ದಿಡುಗಳಿಸಿಕೆಗಳು ಮು - . tweet nights ert then, necessity, to a ground Ζ " , τ Such the two of .torop bild Do retains force ಕಾರಿತಿಕೆ ಮಾರು ಅಶ್ವಿವಿಧಾರ್ಥ (ಅಗಾಮಿ ಅತ್ತಿ ಕಾರ್ವಿಕಿಕಿತಿ ಕ ಸಂಪುರ ಅತ್ಯ 7; · · OBTER r oneida a culo esta este este este est ్ష్ లో స్ట్ర్మ్ అత్ అంగార్ కోటిందిన కార్డ్ కోంది. ఇం 5.5 ా వింధినండు పల్పోతో అనికి 🗝 ఉంది. మహియుకుడుకు కాటక అని ఇంది అనికి

Responding the transfer of the state of the

and about 200 civil cases had been sealed during that period of time. At least that was how many the <u>Dallas Morning News</u>, by going to the district clerk, was able to ferret out as having been sealed.

2.5

JUSTICE COOK: How many cases were filed during that period of time?

MR. McELHANEY: Your Honor, I can't give you a number on that. I would -- the -- the way the statistic has some comparative meaning with other things is that the number of cases filed -- sealed during this period of time was so much more than had ever been filed -- or sealed, rather, in the history of Dallas up till that time. Obviously, of course, we have had litigation exposure and many more filings. But the experience was that this seemed like an awful lot of cases having been sealed.

JUSTICE COOK: Does it -- does it approach one thousandth of 1 percent of the cases that were filed during that period?

MR. McELHANEY: I -- I really wish I could discuss that with you, and I think that's a good point, maybe, that ought to be looked at.

But I really feel that it is -- has been an

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

က ရဲ့လုံး က ေမရွက္တာ့" ေလးကို မေျပန္သာ့စားမွာ ေတာ့ တို့တာ တွာ**ာ** ကုပ္ေကြားမွာက္သည့္ ကုိ . . con. We green that with a mark that this him as obli-. . The Control of the co ٠, ٠ .1 ; erron that make the of entire back past to Sporterch one they colled a file feeding of the ٠, The state of the second of the second of the ٠, به Surface Both of double lovely of the a record . 7 IAthe an winder was that this council who exï .. titigation araonese and mena ware filther. Tub ;;; spus post of winds of domines us have to neeled, rather, in the lifetory of Tcheen by the . for the many to a given fine case been \$4 lad -- or ÷ ., cason diver -- nursed during this period of blive 13 continue real ables than a contra that the rander of 5 i, [ The street the sactistic of recordons ablive when you are the bounded in the property of th one was the same four owers passed. dive a day this parter of those Charles in the second with the the Color to the second ျာင္ၿပီး ၁၀၅၇၁ 💌 . > Manadat dustry use this to retail out as highs. and the temperature of the property of the pro the first of the f

THE LOTE OF THE PROPERTY OF THE HEAVEN FROM THE

• ...

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

abuse.

We feel that the problem manifests itself from the standpoint of -- of very lax standards, lawyers merely -- on the agreement of the lawyers, or requests of one of the lawyers that's just not opposed by the other one; oftentimes get a case sealed for no real articulated reason. And this is, in fact, a -a problem, because it's a frustration.

I think Mr. Babcock did a good job of presenting the press's view on that as a frustration and a great deal of suspicion any time a file is sealed. And one of the problems is if you have a rule that says, "We authorize sealing under some circumstances," that sort of invites use of the process. I think that really may account for some of the Dallas experience, because we had a set of local rules that got passed just about 1980, and then we have all of a sudden all this sealing going on. And it's -it's sort of like -- like, "Since it's there, we ought to do it."

And I think it's important, since we are going to have a sealing rule as the Legislature has mandated, that we need to have

**ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES** 

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE \* AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 \* 512/452-0009

14

• )" #( \*

٢

٠, ٠

7 %

OF

1

0.0

7. .

. .

\*\* \*

J .

್ಷಣದ ರಾಜಕ್ಕೆ ಕ್ರಮಿಕ ಕ್ರಮಿಕ ನಿರ್ವಹಣದ ಕ್ರಮಿಕ ಕ

describe for the disconfiguration of more described as a second of the described of the des

encidentary is a side annusch sous deas a configuration of the deast of the configuration of

is with and and of the recorder of the the condition of t

considered by the action of the standard of th

ក្រសួលដែល ខេត្តពាធិបត្ត ខេត្ត ប៉ុន្តាក្រសួង ប្រកាស

မေနရိုင်သူ တိုင်သည်။ အောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည်။ မောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ အောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည်။ မောင်သည် မောင်သည် မောင်သည်။ မောင်သည် မောင်သ appropriate standards. And that's really what Mr. Leatherbury and I are about in our presentation here.

1.5

2.2

I -- I really feel that the abuses -- and maybe this is a conclusion that's subject to challenge as to whether there have been abuses, but we feel that there has; at least there's been too much sealing -- takes several forms.

Number one, the typical practice is it's just administratively easier, if there is going to be some part of the case sealed, to seal the whole case. The judge says, "We'll just seal that case and just send it downstairs and put it in a special section." And that's the easiest way to do it, and that's the way it has been handled in Dallas, and, I suspect, all over the state.

The problem is that that's overkill and overbreadth, because the entire case file is sealed and nobody knows what it's about. And the example about the savings and loan that Mr. Babcock gave is a good example of it. If merely some particularized part of that file was put under seal but the rest of the controversy was

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

 $oldsymbol{x}_{i}$  , which is the state of  $oldsymbol{x}_{i}$  ,  $oldsymbol{x}_{i}$  ,  $oldsymbol{x}_{i}$  ,  $oldsymbol{x}_{i}$  ,  $oldsymbol{x}_{i}$ are all amount one in land out to be seen and · Note main capter 31 1 3 34 4 20 08 4 1 36 1 1 44 1 is some finite parameter x , in this we can be x = x and xand while her followed on prince of Jorgan nel alt oa, thro for the to store tore the ວາມປັດລັດສາດ ກຸກເຂົາເຂດການ ພັກການ ຄຸດພັດການ ເປັນການເຂົາເຄື່ອນ ຄຸດ ເປັນການ ພັກການເຂົາເຂົາເຂົາເຂົາເຂົາເຂົາເຂົາເຂ - ಇಪ್ ಕನ್ನ ನಿನಾಡದಾಗಲು of the care, the type seal magain. It is a fust acatalatetesture y or cler. It blove in ుండి గృత్తి గర్మ ప్రవాద్ జాగ్ని ఏత్పుకుండి ప్రవాసం దూరం స్టోస్తారు. తార్ల

*t-*

93

50

 $\sim$ 

(\*)

្រុកស្ត្រី ស្រុក និង ១៤៤ ខេត្ត ស្រុក និង ប្រឹង្គបំពុស្ស សម្រាជ្ញ ស្រុក និង និងស្រុក និង និងស្រុក និង និងស្រុក ರ್ಷಾಪ್ರತ್ಯದ ಕನ್ನಡಿಕೆ ಅಥವಾ ನಿರಾವ್ಯ ನಿರ್ವ ಅಗಡಲ ಕೆಕಾಗಿನ ಮಾಡಲು ಬಳಸುಕ್ಕೆ outdoile Calo Mano Snow Contain a no though book L o obolina ney to a the en this the will the . ತ್ರಾಣಕ್ಷಣ ಸ್ವಾಪಕ್ಷ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ ಸ್ವಾಪಕ್ಷ ಸ್ವಾಪಕ್ಷಕ್ಕೆ ತ್ರಾಪ್ತ ಪ್ರಾಪ್ತಿ ಪ್ರವರ್ಣಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರತಿ ಪ್ರವರ್ಣಕ್ಕೆ ಪ್ರವರ್ಣಕ್ಕೆ ಪ . Al via ed mave

It is over the test to the test of the second

eig averbree, buy ledando Fbs ontil a erus of coll ್ಷಣ - ವಿಚಲನಗಳು ಅವರ ಅಂದರ ಅಂತರಲ್ಲಿ ಅನಿರಾಮಗಳಿಗೆ ಅರು ನಿರ್ವಾಗಿಗಳು The state of the s ాకుడ్డు. మీర్ ఎక్కువ్త గునుముల్కు నట్టి గుర్వాడు. ద్వాహ్మం కార్డ్ కొట్టుకు కార్డ్ కొట్టుకు కార్డ్ కొట్టుకు కార ្រុម ត្រូវបានប្រាស្ថា ស្រុវបានទី១ ឯកសុខ សុខ ដោយក្រុម ក្រុម ប្រុ ್ನು ಎಲ್ಲರ್ ನಿರ್ವಹಣದಲ್ಲಿ ವಿಧಾರಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ಅಭಿವಾಗಿಗಳು

there to examine, the tension and pressure really wouldn't -- wouldn't be there. So that's one problem, is just the overbreadth of the sealing.

JUSTICE RAY: Wouldn't the press, though, want to know what it was that was sealed, even if it was just one small part?

MR. McELHANEY: Your Honor, I'm sure that's right, but I -- I do think that public confidence is -- is better if at least most of it is there and the sealing is kept down to a minimum. Those parts of it in many of the cases that we have cited in this booklet that we have -- have submitted indicate that, that that ought to be the rule, that whenever you are invading public rights -- constitutionally protected rights, in particular -- the invasion needs to be as little as possible, and the least restrictive method of curing the problem -- least restrictive of the public's right to know ought to be there.

So, Your Honor, yes, we may not completely solve that problem, but I think we have some constitutional reasons for doing it as well as just prudential reasons for -- for doing

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	township and an expedience of the contract of the con-
	util du an language et dia nu tara especies
	သန္းနေသည့် သောကြသည်ကေသည်။ ကေသည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည်။
v.	• gration to t
	នាល់ស្រាក់ ក្រុង ស្ <sup>រុ</sup> ស្ស ស្គ្រា : ២០០ ស្រាក់
<b>*</b>	ាក្រុងក្នុង ពេលប្រាស់ ក្រុងប្រកាសស្ត្រា មិន ជាក្រុង 🔒 ពួកស្រឹង
į.	ទីលី ស "ស្ទី១០ ១៩១ ១ ២៩ <mark>៦ ២១២ ២</mark> ៦ ២៦ ៤១២១ (២៤ ១១
٦	្រុង នៅក្រុងទុសស្មា ខ្លស់ពី ខ្លស់ពី ខ្លាប់ទេសបាក្សស្ថិត្ត
4.9	ರಕ್ಷಣಗಳ ತನಗಳ ನಗಳಿಗೆ ಎಂದು —— ಕರ್ಣ ಇಚ್ಚು ಕರ ಅತಿವರ್ತ
^	ដែល សាល់ធា សាធានការី អង្គ ដីគ្នា ១០១៩១៩ នៅ <del>១២</del> ១៣ ១២៩១១៩ ភាពៈ២
**	ie in Brode the Cooline in it was to a
c	ាភាព មា ខេត្ត និង ស្ត្រាស់ នៅក្នុង នៃការស្រែក ស្រែកការប្រជាព្រះប្រជាព្រះ
÷	the two level ditter in this beaklet that we
٠.	ರಾಗ್ಯ ರಾಗ್ಯ ಕರ್ನಾಟಕ ಇದು ಸಾರ್ವಿಕ್ ಇದೇ ಇದ್ದು ಎಂದು ೧೮೮೭
	anglis i se sula ruja, bira ukonovia you ozo
;	villamoždudiduan: njivirio bi kam ani nam
۲.	ព្រះបានស្រាស់ ១៩៤ == នាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់
	dunon od tomo (oxidiom <b>o</b> ) <b>so</b> singit yn o' of wood
4.	Colfoir odd gafart i deidd Cattofrace
r	າກແປ ການ ເພິ່ງພໍ່ນ ເກືອພໍເຕີນຕູ ພາພ ໝົ <b>ດ</b> ອ <b>ນ</b> ເປັນເປັນຕິດ ໝໍ່ມູນຄວາມ
•	•อาเศส ชา อยากศากา
` •	ទី១ បានស <b>១</b> ១០ព្យុក្ស ភូព្យុក្ស ការា <b>ស្រី</b> ភូព្យុ
	ಲ್ಲಾ ಸಮತ್ತೆ ಬರು ನಿರ್ಧಾನಕ್ಕೆ ಎಂದು ಕಟ್ಟು ಅಂತ್ರಾಯಕ್ಕೆ ಎಂದು
<u>^                                    </u>	on the succession and open to edduct domain elements.

.

tand that the transfer to the terminal of the contract of the

that.

JUSTICE COOK: Have you ever been a party to sealing of any --

MR. McELHANEY: Your Honor, it depends on your definition of "sealing." I would say most of the big commercial litigation that I get into involves at least protective orders. And, sure, that's common. That's just almost routine these days, and frankly, protective orders have, I think, a helpful effect from the standpoint of lessening of the trial court's burden on ruling on discovery. This is easier to get along with the opponents if there is an agreed protective order about some of the discovery, because it hopefully means less disputes that have to be ruled on by the judge as to specific items.

But we're distinguishing in this rule file documents from discovery that's exchanged outside of the filing system.

JUSTICE COOK: Okay.

MR. McELHANEY: And to answer your question: Have I been a party to a generally sealed case? I don't believe so, although I certainly would tell you that our firm has and

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

מורחוי מת מחל : ובעם ייות נענ ב פת ב mm tipe In har solect it to all grand" controlations and "again the the little and being the against the street of the meddagiai' - waren oa gid had ie d ho en in in b the single into another at interpretable of ត្សាស្រីល (ជាដែល) មាន ត្រូវបាន បើ ១០៩៩២ ១០៩៩២ ១៩ ខ្លួន ប probhotive sufere baros " brink, a solulne origed: The tide deams, and each animg of the triet dourt's barden on define on decovery. This is true to get along with the appearance if where is an agreed senteative order clant one of the life tarpy bed has been all of the age in the arm of ed over death than the one amen annost whiten a no no or sub oil - V. r raind raing of the establishment of the design of the contract 3.5 tionat groven at rout of come of the explication of the fit the fall to the try them. The second secon ಶ್ರೀ ಕರ್ಮ ಅವರ ಕರ್ಮಿಕರ್ ಕರ್ಮ ಚಿಕ್ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕರ್ಮ the course on the firm a more than the substitution.  $\mathcal{F}_{ij}$  , which is the post-Pisch disposit for the property  $\mathcal{F}_{ij}$ for and for which is the first than the first section of the

that it's -- it's been a common experience for Dallas lawyers to be involved in some aspect of some sealing and -- and suppression.

JUSTICE COOK: It's quite common that certain parts of the file, like you mentioned protective orders, that's very common.

MR. McELHANEY: Yes, of course.

Now, we're not in any way trying to eliminate protective orders; we're not trying to tread on the toes of legitimate trade secret litigants, or anything of that sort. Our -- our problem, really, is with sealing of filed documents and taking those out of the public domain when they really are in the public domain was the thrust of our rule here.

One justification that's been advanced by opponents of sealing is -- or proponents of sealing -- is that, oh, gosh, it's -- a lot of times it's a condition to a settlement, and the defendant wants to have an agreement as part of the integral part of the settlement that the court would seal the record.

So the parties go to the judge and both sides say, "Well, that's all right with us, Judge, please do that," and the defendant says,

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

្រុស្តី ប្រធាន ប្រធាន មក ប្រធាន មក ប្រធាន ប្តាន ប្រធាន ប្

minthonous poster of the filter take of a manual manage of the filter take of a management of the filter and th

"out the many and the form the control of the contr

anvincer by appointant of analysis that a feed a responsible of acciding to -- or responsible of acciding to -- or first -- a not of acciding the feed of considering for a consistion to a retirement, and the defendant remission for a correspondent of the street state of the same and the rederies settlement that the court would could the rederies retirement that the court would could the rederies

Noth they again "The Lambert of Lambert of the Figure 12 of the Park of the Pa

. .

ن ب

0.1

ر. ن

1 ..

4 -

å ..

1 1

J.

ر. د

. . .

3 3

a u

"Yes, it's just" -- "we aren't going to settle without that."

Well, that's, in effect, bargaining with the Court, and at that point it's very easy and likely that the judge will want to go along with it because he wants to move the docket, and there's a public policy in favor of settlement, and so forth. We think that it's important, really, to actually analyze those arguments and lay them to rest, because we don't believe those are really substantial enough arguments to overcome the thrust of what we are proposing, that is, much more limited sealing.

it, from the standpoint of the defendant that doesn't want all this information to be on public record, if you call his bluff and say, "Well, fine, we'll try the case," it's going to come out, and so it's not -- it's not really a legitimate thing for him to be telling the Court that "We're not going to settle it unless you seal this, Judge." It's kind of a bluff, to me, in my judgment.

Secondly, there could be all kinds of private agreements. There can be private

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

<u>.</u> F	in the same of the
	# • John of the State
t t	inic rand electrolis sobolem inadia (n. 1767)
•	భాగు ఎక్కువారి. జోక్స్ జేకట్రంల తెక్కువి కార్డ్ కొండా ఎందికించారి. ఈ మైస్ట్ మండ్
43	లోను ఎంది మంది విజ్ఞాన్ని మీచాను, కృష్ణా తెల్లు తెలింది. ఇంటుకుండి కృష్ణా
•	్ష - కథకలన కరేజీ కాళాడు. కూరా గనిత్తాని అయ్యే గ్రామంకాణంకి జీక్ మన్ర
<b>f-</b>	್ಕಿ 'ಇವರ್ರನಿಕೆಕೆಯ' ಇತ್ತ ಜನ್ ೧೭ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ಷರ್' ( ಅಪ್ ಚರ್ಚ್ ಈ ಅನಿಕೆ ಅನಿಕಾರಣ ಮತ್ತು ಬಟಕ
•	မောင်းသည်။ နေသည်။ နေသည်။ ကို သည်။ ကို ကောင်းမြောင်းသည်။ ကို လေလာက်အတွေ
	.ಎಸ್. ಎ ೧೯೭೮ <sup>ಮ</sup> . ಅ. ಸರ್ವಿ ಎಲ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಅದರ ಗರ್. ಅವರಿಂದ ಚರ್ವಿ 🕻 ಕ್ರಿ ಸಾರ್ವ
′ r	စည်းသည်တည်း ကို မြောက်သည် စက သည်းကောင်းကို မြောင်းသည်။ ညည့်အသည့်
ŗr	្វី ទី១៩៩៩ គ្រឿង គ្នាស្នាស់ ស្នាស់ ស្នាស
/*	. ក្រោយព្រះ - ពុង នេះស្រស់ ឃុំស្នា ស្រស់ បានក្រៅក្នុង ប្រើប្រុទ្ធភាព
r r	ent sent tederate erse comments of the
, <del>.</del>	್ವಾಗ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ
* 1 - p*	ទី១១៩ ៩៩ ម៉ាល់ ធិច (១៩៩ ១) ៩៩ ១០ ១៩១ ១៨៩ ១ ១៩០ ភូមិ
$\sim T$	Description of the color of the color of the color
णू <b>ह</b>	್ಯಾಸ್ಟ ವಿಚರ ಹೇಳಿದ್ದಾರೆ ಇತ್ತಿ ಎಂದು ಕಾರ್ಯ ನಿಕ್ಕಿಗಳುಂದು ಅತ್ಯಿಸಿದರು
76 p	ನ ನ ಕೃತಕಿಕೆ <sup>ಕೃ</sup> ತಗಾಗು ಅಗಳ ಉತ್ಪರ್ಕಿತ ಕಿಂಗ್ರೌ ಕೃತ್ಯಕ್ಕಳು
~ T.	jos don midú —— dom ofái va imo var ceree
	i sele of the all of the med painty of all all egisters
P 41	un t "Yo'ro no. y in the day of the marcon you
	and the second of the second o

o da epolitar conte. 1 - Original Alberta de Colonia de

.

disputes and private dispute resolution, even,

but once the parties have invoked the

governmental authority and the jurisdiction of

our public courts, the matter is no longer a

private matter. It is part of the

administration of justice, and these are the

public records, not the court's records, not the

judge's records, and it is a question of who is

going to represent the public in this, in

effect, bargaining with the judge over his

ruling that the matters will be sealed if it is

settled.

The judge is the only one who represents the interests of the public and is the only one who has this -- this duty to resist that, because the lawyers are loyal to their clients and represent only their clients, not the public. And, in effect, it really almost puts the court in an unfair position: bargaining, if you will, over whether there's going to be a sealing. It's almost a contractive adhesion kind of a situation because the judge is vulnerable. He wants to get the docket moving and the cases settled.

We think that having a definite rule

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

of Joseph and Lynch the English of the control	
we reflect that $(v_1, \ldots, v_n)$ is the space of the section $v_n$	
ప్రధానులు ఉంది. క్రీక్రాలికి అదిఖి <sub>క్</sub> ర్మార్గాయం క్రీక్	١
dile vi e di si la cidasa ipawis	*1
ារ៉ារី ព្រះ ព្រះស្នាក់ ការស្នាក់ ការស្នាក់ ស្រែងស្រែង ស្នាក់ ស្រែងស្រែង ស្រែងស្រែង ស្រែងស្រែង ស្រែងស្រែង ស្រែង	
ကြောင့် ရုံးသည်။ မြောင်းသည်။ သုံးသို့ ကောက်းများ ရုံးသို့ ကောက်များသည်။ မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည်။ မြေ	***
The Dr. Dr. Bucksterner St. St. Species of American April 9.	
	c
pin on one of all within suals in the	
్ స్టాన్స్ కార్ సందేశం కారణ అని కోళ్ళాలు అయించితోంది. ఎక్కువ కోర్యాణకు ఆయ	۴
•*************************************	c
្តី <b>១៩១ ១៩១ ១០៩ ១៨១ ១៤ ១ ១៤ ១៩១</b>	i,
rentroughts the lite of the edition	
ដល់សំពស់ ស ឬទាប់ សង់ ម៉ែកកា ក្រុស ស្រាវា ១ ភា ១១០ រូវ ស្រាវ	
along the authority of the	
r sanding believes a comparation of	ः
in the second of	
:4520ime, biblio as ok fract call rig	
nturols redicate rove a. In sur like application -	
ការស្រួលប្រើការព្យឹងការ ស្រួលប៉ុន្តែ ការស្រួល សម្រួលប៉ុន្តែ	P
CLEARE TRADITION OF BUILDING A TRADITION OF THE STATE	3
ామెక్ మాల్లు కార్ట్ స్టాన్స్ కార్ కొంటి కార్డ్ కొంటి కార్డ్ కొంటి కార్డ్ కొంటి కార్డ్ కొంటి కార్డ్ కొంటి కార్డ్	2
. Such that the problem of $\mathcal{A}_{ij} = \mathcal{A}_{ij} + \mathcal$	•
్ గాగా కాంగా ఉంది. మందు కాంగా క	ï

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

for the court to rely on in at least setting some standards, if not strictures, on the authority to seal, is a very important part of the concept, because the law of settlement is required -- these sealing orders are required for settlements, really, we don't think, is a -- something that holds up under close scrutiny or close analysis.

Next, we wanted to -- to talk about just the problems of the administration of the sealing of -- the rule that we have proposed. It sets as a standard a compelling need for sealing, and the problem there is that -- our Dallas County experience again -- is that if you don't have a high enough standard or pass constitutional muster, there is a tendency just for everybody to agree and have no real standards at all on -- on sealing. And that's been the experience we have had in Dallas that -- without articulating any reasons, or no reasons at all, other than just the agreement of the party these sealing agreements have been entered into.

The Constitution and the common law have required a much higher threshold, and we

ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

And the control of oil on the contract.

For a ntendering to confident of delice of the like the concent, because the little of retilieness in the concent, because the little of retilieness in the concent to the concent of the confident of a throughts of the concent of the co

Superson in por त्रात्रस्थात र त प्रापुत्रे अत् एम प्रमुख्य देशाच्या द्वाराच्या सम्बद्धाः स भारत् 🖚 । १९४१ वर्ष अर्था व्यवस्थात् व्यवस्थात् । 💴 अर्थाः point the color of the beat an explain nit into the nil on -- or marking. In tutio test on ever bee egge of ybe cyreen and deminituational or corp above in a tenderer just dirait have a bigh enough whenda e or past De las Couply ampediance lasin -- in their if you neations and the sarbie there is that -- our the cotes of a countries of the same and according re fing on -- the suit that we have profes .. Dang gab lang som og pjillngt af ta optiblist og f tund, or stratos to -- to tell bont

្រាស់ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រា ស្គ្រាស់ ស

. . . . .

...

ئىد ب

ـ ز

نيا الله

i

1 0

1 ...

ï ..

1

. .

3 🔾

i T

have articulated that in our proposed rule. And it's variously formulated as compelling need, or most compelling reasons, or overriding public interest, or overriding reasons. These are all essentially synonymous articulations of formulations that the various Fifth Circuit -- excuse me, not Fifth Circuit -- various U.S. Circuit Courts of Appeals around the country have had, and in some cases some articulation by the Supreme Court.

I'm going to ask Mr. Leatherbury, if you will, just to start through the various specific provisions that we have, because essentially we think these are noncontroversial, but obviously any attempt to reduce this to a specific set of rules is subject to some discussion and debate at the very least.

JUSTICE DOGGETT: Those are on pages 25 and 26, I think, of your booklet, if you have got it handy.

MR. LEATHERBURY: Right. And the diversion of the rule on pages 25 and 26 has been annotated with citations to the federal and other state court cases that we believe support this type of a rule limiting sealing.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
The beginning the common particle of the property of the common particles of t
                                                                                           ាទាស្តីសាលាស្ត្រាស់ស្ត្រីស្ត្រី ខេត្ត ស្ត្រី ស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រ
                                                                                              ్రాయ్లు కార్డ్ కార్
                                                                                                                                                                                                            The state of the s
                                                                                              THE LE PAR ..
                                                                                            Ja su, Jun , prink, e . at bush aby all jour be a
                                                                                                                                                                                                    Cartific a book in the agreement of the le-
                                                                                          dinguar on and phate it was rery lend:
. i.
ĭ .
                                                                                           The analysis that by any both a maple of the comme
                                                                                             or system confided the first transfer of the first confidence of the system of the first confidence of
I ..
                                                                                          salabagaggi ba a ayur spraa ako baudaupsonasing ma
i .
I.
                                                                                          pagad form of drink and are persuaded
                                                                                             The contract of the part of the contract of the contract of
4 4,
                                                                                                                                                                                                           The going to take "no horble amit.
1
                                                                                            PROGRAM LANGE LANGE
ل د
                                                                                           and part the same of the who supracy ept to the
                                                                                             descript of the constraint of the constraint of the constraint of
                                                                                           stour in sor later a nout -- Arm say ....
                                                                                          for ulabiant, to I the Werlour Mileta of cuft --
                                                                                          Chancalter warping a number of term attended of
                                                                                          interest, or eserciding restons. Meass are the
                                                                                         ាននិយាល់ស្រាស់ ស្រួសាស៊ី និយាល់សមាល់ការពិធី សង្គមិនស្លាស់ស្រាស់ អាក្សាស្រី
                                                                                          The A life is the gold and the day in the first the
                                                                                          NAME OF A SECOND OF A SECOND OF A SECOND OF THE SECOND OF
```

 $\mathcal{L}_{ij}^{(i)} = \mathcal{L}_{ij}^{(i)} = \mathcal{L}_{ij}^$ 

D

I think it's important to emphasize at the outset that this was a first draft, and it is a work in progress. We have had one excellent meeting with the Supreme Court -- or the subcommittee of the Supreme Court Rules Advisory Committee, and the rule has already been redrafted from what is in your booklet for further discussion at the -- at the committee level, and we have gotten a lot of -- a lot of good comments on it.

I think the first thing about the rule is the procedural protections against the sealing of records -- or sealing of records that -- on this overbroad basis. The rule provides for notice and hearing which are, of course, the cornerstones of due process. The notice would -- requirement would provide that the party seeking sealing would file a written motion. In support of the sealing request, the motion would be open for public inspection.

There would be a notice period.

There is some discussion about what the notice period would be, how long the motion should be on file before the hearing is held, and we're continuing to work on that, although most people

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

DEN CONTRACTOR OF STATE OF THE CONTRACTOR OF THE	: <del>-</del>
గ్రామంలోన్ ఉందింది. మందు గ్రామంలో మందుకుండి కోరు కూడాలు ఉన్న కే	B
para transfer of the grown at the second	•
om to make the ment of the color will be a color of the	
Σర్వాణ్ కొంటుత్స్ ఉంది. మార్క్స్ ప్రాటెక్స్ గ్రామం	·
ည္။ မေးက်ေနာ္ နာန္တိုင္တြင္း မေရးကို နည္းမွားကို ေလးက ရွားမွာ လုံးကို လုံးက	*
$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{J}_{\mathcal{L}}$ , which is the region of $\mathcal{L}$ . The region of $\mathcal{L}$ is the region of $\mathcal{L}$	7
n silver of the members of the more of the contract of	•
ປີ ເປັນ ກ່າ <del>ວ ໃ</del> ຍ່ໄດ້ກ່າວ ກາສ <b>ເ</b> ວັດເກັດ ສະເພີ່ມ ຄ <b>າຍເ</b>	:
er an doe was for	
The state of the s	<b>~</b> •
enting it wild the or a cottout in the twite the	<i>(</i> )
na post in para la mana de la latera de la company	
a na alto entre entre el como poses e fillo les <del>es</del> dante	:
និង «១៦ សម្ពីមនិសិស ស្ត្រី២០ » <b>១</b> ខេស្សី២០ ១៩៦ ២ ស្រីស្មា ក្	<del></del> .
$\mathbf{d}^{m}$ . Then $\mathbf{r}^{-1}$ obtains a negative $\mathbf{r}^{-1}$ or $\mathbf{r}^{-1}$ by	• 4
and a figure of a damage of the end of the contract of	Ţ. T.
constant of the first of the second section of the second section of the second	
n for a normant of the contract of the description of the contract of the cont	. **
. martin justi s Alemo nom var es el s'esta la la tro-	•.•
• ၁၈ ရေး မရာ နေသာက အောင် သို့၏ အေသာ သည်က	
raligna edg vaga daera arinament e da ci "e e	£+ **
The $\Phi(\Phi)$ $\Phi(\Phi)$ is a solution of $\Phi(\Phi)$ . The $\Phi(\Phi)$	••
for the second of the months of the second of the months of the second o	^ ·

.

Ą

seem to indicate three days, or 72 hours, or some period that's compatible with -- with some of the notice provisions already in the -- in the Texas Rules of -- of Civil Procedure.

The notice provision goes further and requires the party seeking sealing to post a public notice at the place where county governmental body notices are posted under the Open Meetings Act, and that is just a convenient place in the courthouse. The proposal on 25 and 26 of your booklet had the notice posted at -- where the foreclosure notices are posted, until our Harris County district clerk pointed out that that could be five to six thousand notices in Harris County, and you really -- that wouldn't provide effective notice. So we took that advice and in a redraft have moved that to a different -- different location.

The notice would specify the hearing, the style of the case, the names of the parties, the case number. And moving party would be required to provide the clerk of the court a copy of the notice and verify that the notice had been posted under the -- under the statute.

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

$\mathcal{N}^{(n)} = \mathcal{M}^{(n)} \cap \mathcal{N}^{(n)} = \{ (1, 2, \dots, n) \mid n \in \mathbb{N} \mid n \in \mathbb{N} \mid n \in \mathbb{N} \}$	
and which were listed to the second of the large at	
A the second	•
.pri ne na pri Europo po por no na li	
no Marine de marine de la Marine de persona de la presentación de la companya de la companya de la companya de	
tent, in the police out the court of the second	
guanas o la la la la table de la table de la	
្រស់ ដោយ <b>នេះ ១០</b> ៤២ ខែក្រុម ស្រុស ស្រុស ប្រ <mark>នាំ</mark> ២០១៩២ ២០១៩២ ១៩២២ ១៩២២	
a In the second of the second	,
the state of the s	
The stable of th	• *
where $f$ and $oldsymbol{c}$ is the first $f$ and $f$ is $f$ and $f$ in $f$ and $f$ is $f$ and $f$	· •
లాంకుండా గ్రామంలో కాటు కాట్. కాట్లు కూడా కాట్ కాటింది.	
The first of the second of the	
్రి కోండా లోని ఎక్కించి కోడ్లు కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కోండ్ కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కోడ్డి కో	•
the state of the s	
. The constant of the second o	٠.
	• `
្រី ព្រះប្រាស់ពីជា ១៩២០១០១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១	17.4
Notice of the second of the se	ĩ s
$ au_{ij} = \sigma_{ij} \cdot ( au_{ij} +  au_{ij}) + ( au_{ij} \cdot  au_{ij} +  au_{ij}) + ( au_{ij} \cdot  au_{ij} +  au_{ij}) + ( au_{ij} \cdot  au_{ij}) + ( au_{ij} $	<u> </u>
	, ,

F. .

•

the Advisory Subcommittee, has come up with a proposal for a limited ex parte order, sealing order, where the court would not have to comply with the full notice and hearing provisions provided for in the rule, but then would follow up promptly with posted notice and a hearing.

And Ken, in his practice, foresaw the necessity of having some sort of limited ex parte sealing relief available if an emergency situation were

Ken Fuller, one of the members of

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Can you give me an example of what type of emergencies you are contemplating?

to come up, but --

MR. LEATHERBURY: Well, the -and -- and, really, I'm speaking for Ken, so I
perhaps don't understand fully what was in
his -- his proposed redraft addressing this
notice provision, but he came up with, you know,
a situation of an abused child, or -- or
something that would require immediate action
and would require filing pleadings laying out in
sufficient detail information that might invade
another person's privacy or a minor's privacy,
or something along those lines. That, again, is

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

~ r

. •

٠.

1 [

: "

**^** •

The state of the s

۰.

part of the rule that is a work in process.

It's not in the draft in here, but we are having some -- some pretty fruitful discussions about some sort of limited ex parte relief.

MR. McELHANEY: Your Honor, I can think of one other hypothetical along those lines. That's to assume that an irresponsible opponent decided he would plead many trade secrets that he had gotten hold of and just make them public records. I think there might be a reason for an emergency hearing, then, to quickly suppress that and then deal with that later.

But we recognize that we're not taking an absolute position that nothing can ever been sealed. We're just trying to work out a reasonable procedure for all of the things we can think of, and I think, most importantly and fundamentally -- then I'll turn it back to Tom -- is setting the standard at an appropriately high threshold so that the practice of just sealing indiscriminately is stopped.

MR. LEATHERBURY: The hearing provision in the draft rule is very

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

· .

r	· The second of
	మహాడు. నారు - కాంటి కాంటక కో కో <del>ద్</del> రా క హీ ఉంది చేంది కో కో
	and the second control of the second control
f	.i.u. on harm to ment in the true tree.
Ç	rest of the state
	తనాయులో కార్ల కొట్టుక్తి మహికాభారం ఇవకిడిన అయికి మెక్కువేది.
r.	on diametrical and that makes but alternion as
ej.	$\omega$ , $\omega$
	tak a situ yak da sa
Ç	en a en en la de la defició de la companya de la companya en esta en esta en esta en en esta en en esta en est
	el participant in the participant in the second of the sec
•5	ನಿಲ್)) ಕಟ್ಟಾರಿಗಳ ಕ್ರಮ ಭಾರತಿಕೆ ಅಥವ ಹಾಗುತ್ತಿಗೆ ಅಗತಾಗ್ ಈ ಅಭಿಕೃತಿಗಳು
	•**:de.
•	వారు. ఇందా కోట్లు మూరావడ్ అయ్ది కాటాకు కాటకారు.
•	ing in the analysis of the second of the sec
	នាន់ សាក្រហា និសី ពិសាស្ត្រី ក្រុងស្ត្រី ស្រុស និស្ស ស្រុស បានស្រុស និស្ស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុសស
ę, s	ా గాడక్సాని ఉన్న హీస్తానికి కాటమీ తారణ అందని ఉన్నాయిన స
ۥ	har to the the company taking to has discontinuous.
<u> </u>	and surface of the off and the grant of
	(၁) ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည် မြောင်းသည် မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည် မြောင်းသည်။ မြော
л:	en dala en la clara de open a opazia josekon
Ć.	្រំ បស្ត្រការដែលរបស់លើ <b>ក្រ</b> ែក្រសួល ប្រាស់ ប្រធានា ជាព្រះជួយ បែប ខ្ពស់ ស្រែកក្រ

THE REPORT OF THE THE PROPERTY OF THE SECOND SECOND

straightforward. It allows any person, whether or not a party to the lawsuit, to appear and oppose the closing of the court records, and Luke Soules has -- has proposed some -- some language tinkering with that a little bit to dovetail with the rules on intervention, and that's -- that's probably a good change that we'll -- we'll talk about at the -- at the subcommittee. The hearing must be held in open court and would -- would follow the notice provision that I have talked about.

The substantive standard that John has been talking about -- Chip has been talking about is the compelling need standard, and that's set forth in our proposal on 25 and 26 and has been taken forward into the redrafts that I have seen. The one phrase in the -- in the compelling need standard that seems to have drawn any opposition at all is the -- the phrase: "A serious and imminent threat to the administration of justice must be shown before you can seal any court records." And while that is one articulation of the test, particularly one adopted by the Florida state courts, which seem to have a lot of experience in interpreting

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

Tipo in la magnituda in terminal de la companya in terminal de la companya de la companya de la companya de la 183 1324 12 (\$ ct of ct of ct of the CAR CONTROLLY BOWN OF AN ON TO ME TO BE A COLUMN 19. 1987 minor Compared to the second second makes again to be a first to the CB (P) OF SECTION A SECTION OF THE S THE VOICE MENT OF A COURT OF SPECIFICATION OF THE Charles as the term of the color of the color of the color သက္သေတာ့ လုပ်ပေသတ္သည် ကိုရိုက်သွားတွင် ကျောင်းကြသည့် ရုပ်ကြီးသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်က အချွှားအသည် 8 control and collect your -- throw the couper with it to be a constant of the second of the second ł. Ł ្រាស់ស្នា មក្សារា ១១០ស្រុកជាព ក្សារាជ្ធប្រកាស់ប្រក ១៩មាន 6 2 THE MIND ACCOUNTS OF THE POST OF PROPERTY OF THE ^ e Ches tractable and the presentant ^ F ကြောင့် ကြောင့် ရေးသည် အတွင်သည်။ ကြောက် ကျောင်း ကြောက် သည်သည် သည်။ ကြောက် and the contract of the contract of the contract of the contract of 7: at the odd by onor to dee off . the end of the ter Note of the following the following the second seco unid ee odd i' wie dit acidicanjo jae acard .... or it as seemed the the activities as the interest of the constitutions of the constitution of the con 26 ကား သို့သည့် ကောက်သောကို သည်။ သည်သည်။ သည်သည် သည် ကို သည်သည် သည်။ ကောင်းများမှုသည်။ 10 dana office has the never damen as the est of the 225

**~** .

ស្ថិតនៅបាន នៃស្ថិតនៅ ស្រីនិ ស្ថិត ការសំពុល អ្នកសំពុល ក្រុង ភិព ១០ សំពុល ប៉ុន្តែ ខេត្តបានសុខស បន្ទេចជា គេ នៃសេសស៊ី ស្រីស្ថិត សុស ភិពសាសសុខសុខ សុស សុស្តិត ខេត្តប្រជាពលរបស់ សុស្តិតនៅ សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស្តិត សុស 1 Florida
2 provis:
3 it's a:
4 elimina
5 there's
6 light of
7 in the
8 sure is

1.5

Florida common law and -- and constitutional provisions along these lines, I'm not sure that it's all that necessary, and so that may be eliminated in future drafts just to -- because there's -- there's been more -- more heat than light over those few phrases in -- or few words in the compelling need standard, and I'm not sure it's really necessary. The result would probably be the same.

The compelling need standard requires a showing that a specific interest of a person or entity will suffer immediate and irreparable harm or serious injury, words to those -- to that effect. It incorporates the less restrictive or least restrictive alternative test, and it requires that sealing will effectively protect the specific interest that is sought to be protected by sealing. And those are pretty well accepted as the three prongs of the compelling need standard that must be shown before you can seal any portion of a file.

The -- I -- I do want to say that as -- as you all have -- have asked questions along these lines, this rule does not deal with

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

- 13

J

contributed from the common transfer of the transfer of the contributed from the contributed of the one of the analysis of the control of the control of the in instead in Meture firette junt so -- cause und that are not the state area of a life -- not condu Link to the borner that the area of the end of the control of the the decided and the second design of the contract of Ĺ. age attended to the medacanancy. The earth to the thought . Dan to be mende The competed on the composition 3: ್ರಾಜ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಬಿಡುವ ಮಾರ್ಟ್ ಕಾರ್ಟ್ ಬಿಡುವ ಆರ್. ಆರ್. ಬಿಡುವ ಮಾರ್ಟ್ ಪ್ರಾಪ್ತಿಸಿಗಳ ಸಂಪ್ರಕ್ಷಣೆ ಮುಂದಿ ಮಾರ್ಟ್ ಪ್ರತಿ ಸ್ಥಿತಿಗಳ 7.7 marker of a ntity with a pullar in brinte and the "I i repare to bot the interestinguery, worke to trape -- to bust effect. It incorrorates the on the rest of the volume tone to technicating . . allowed the continual it is prived that according ~ [ dual value of the defension of the  ${f z}$ 777 F ાં કાર્યા માર્ચિક જેવા કરતા કું કરતારે હતો માર્ચિક છે. કું છે • ಎಲ್ಲಿಕ್ ಳಾಟ್ ಕ್ಲೀಯಾಗ್ಯವ<mark>ಿರು ೧೮೮</mark>೦ .......................... ಅದ್ದಾರ್ಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಅವರ ಸಂಗೀತ ទី ស បានរៀប សុខភាពនៅស មិនគណៈ ស្ត្រាស់ ប៉ុន្តែ**៣០១** ម៉ូទីទី ស. ១១២១ ស n rindum is fold yet can seas any orbiding F (\*) .55 (\* 1

್ರಾಶ್ವರ್ಣಿ ಇವರ ತಿರ್ದಿ ಕಾಗಿಯಾಗ ಅವರ ಗೆ ಈ ಗೆಗೆ ಈ ಕಾರ್ಯಿಕ ನಿರ್ಮಾಣಕ್ಕಳ ಅವರ ಪ್ರದೇಶ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಈ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಲಾಗಿ ಅವರ ಕಾಗಿಯು ನಿರ್ಮಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಎಂದು ತಿರ್ದಾಹಕ್ಕೆ ಆಗಿಯ ಸಂತಿಪ್ತ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಲಾಗಿ ಅವರ ಪ್ರಕಾರಿ

discovery at all, and it specifically defines court records to include documents that have been filed in connection with any matter before the court, and it excludes discovery materials simply exchanged between the parties and not filed with the Court, and it also excludes documents filed with the Court in camera solely for the purpose of obtaining a determination of discoverability. And we thought those were important definitional exclusions so that we could come to some agreement on this rule. It's not to say that discovery and the good cause standard might not be subject of future rule makings, but we just didn't see it as necessarily going in this rule.

The -- while the proposal in 25 and 26 does not recognize the statutes such as the juvenile delinquency statute, the adoption statute, the -- mental health is another area where records are specifically made confidential by law -- some of the redrafts do incorporate that, and that's a good -- a good change to make, because we certainly don't intend to overrule any statutes by this rule and don't intend to affect those specific legislative

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

• ••

The Control of the state of the and the same of the control of the same of రాజమ్నార్లు **విషా**ర్యాల్లో ఉంది. అత్రామం కార్స్ మార్క్ మాయ్ని కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ 1888 కోస్ట్ 1888 కోస్ట్ 1888 కోస్ట్ the country of the company to the company of in the conditional of and their beganders of the ద్రంగా ఉంది. తార్ల కోర్ అండి ఇవ్వాతంటే ఉంది. ఉంది. చేస్తార్ ఉంది. మె ್ರಾಯ್ಯ ಕ್ರಮ್ និស្ស 😙 នៃនាក់ប្រសួល 🧸 នេះ ស្រុះ ខេត្តស្ថិក គឺ២០១២ 🗸 💓 💮 🦠 💮 on the state of th ្សា នាស្មានស្មានស្ថិត្ត នៅ នៅ និងស្មានស្មានសម្រាប់ និងសម្រាប់ សម្រាប់ សម្រាប់ និងសម្រាប់ និងសម្រាប់ និងសម្រាប់ ತಿತ್ತ ... ... ಚಿತ್ರಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಕೆ.ಕೆ. 19 ತಮ್ಮ ನಿರ್ವಹಗಳು ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಿ ಸಿ. ಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ಸಿ. ಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ಸಿ. ಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ಸಿ. ಚಿತ್ರಗಳು ורל נה ממי ל כל ב"חס שיבן חתם לגנ הכחף פני ב and the community and the contract of the cont as di con diabili in the own of the rich mocontering erits, in the rules. mie -- while has semenal in 27 and 37 .ocs not exacert to the table action access to guvenfin felen uchey abrabese, sie rie bien statutes and -- manter har til a anothe a conwhere tears, a see an outfloods had confil and ್ರಾತ್ರ ನಿರ್ಣಾಗ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಸಿದ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಸಂಪ್ರವಿಷ್ಣ ಪ್ರಭಾಗಿ ಪ್ರತಿ ្រាន់ ស្ត្រាធ្វើមេ (១៦) ប្រកាត់ ១៦ ខា ស្រាស់ធ្វើថា ក៏ក្បាស់ស្រាស់ some and the beauty of the contract contract of the contract o or trued only the tentrol  $\mathbb{Q}_2$  which is  $\mathbf{u}_1 \in \mathfrak{on}_{\mathbb{R}^n}$  in  $\mathbf{n}^*\mathbb{U}$ 

is visual integral, millioners of the language in the design of the

7.5 ٠ ٢ ī 77 <u>f</u> - J Ţ, r ~ r Γ. 5 • •

б

determinations that those records, for public policy reasons, should be sealed.

At the hearing, the draft rule calls for the court to -- to enter a sealing order. It requires the Court to make specific on the record findings in the order that the prong -- the three prongs of the compelling need test have been met, and to state the reasons for such findings.

There is, again, some debate about how can you have a specific sealing order and not give away the ball game, not make public what you intend to keep secret, but I -- I think that -- that the language in the rule leaves that to the lawyers to -- to work out, and I certainly think it's possible to draft an appropriate sealing order if you make the showing without revealing what you are trying to keep secret.

MR. McELHANEY: Let me interrupt
there and say we think it's an important part of
the concept to have articulated reasons and
findings stated for the sealing order for
several reasons: Number one, many of the
federal cases applying the First Amendment have

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

1,

in the little of the control of the 3.4.50 B.325 #1.5.3 St. (18.6.5) B.3. B.18 5.5 The profession is a windered for the profession. ್ರಾಣಿಕ ಗಾಣ ಜನಿಸಿಸಿಕಾರ ಇಂಬರ್ ಎಂಬರ್ ದಾಗಾಗಿ ನಡೆದೆ ಜಾಗ ದಿಶ್ವರಿಯ ಜಿಲ ್ರಾರಾಗಿಗಳ ವರ್ಷ ಅರ್ಚಿಸಿ ನಿರ್ವೇಷಣೆ ಪರ ಇಟ್ಟಿಗಳು ಅಂಟ್ ಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ವಿಕಾರಾಗಿಯ the commence of the contract of the property of inter the contract of the passing of the third the contraction mi mi of room partial a residence value of deter to a gree have a lastic traffine process and often may the belong it and said that it white you intered to led nedsot, but " -- " think . . gint -- inar the on urgo in the read increa To Bacon day, duban ki, who side is not be suited as disqui - 5 f ្តាល សិទិស្ស សុខ ៩៤ ៩៤ និងស្រុក្ស សៃ និកា និង សុខិត **១**ស្គម ប្ audit admin tog de robto práchom itatico de 4.1 abouted site out rovers a mark the site of a second . Boate Codace. -  $\circ$   $\tau$ degrated in the second statement with the control of the second of the s 13

no blasse and day we taint it! and interpress of the care and day as taint it! and interpress of the distribution is the careful to the care and day a artist belong to the care and c

recognized that that is a matter of constitutional dimension and there must be articulated reasoning.

Secondly, I think it's a matter of internal discipline for the lawyers presenting these motions, as well as the Court ruling on it, to be required to focus on the specific element; will help reach better informed, sounder decisions in this area.

Third, this is an analogy to the practice that we already have in the requirements under the Rules of Procedure for temporary injunctions and temporary restraining orders. It requires the reasons to be set forth.

So this is not an unfamiliar concept, as far as Texas practice is concerned, and I think the reasons for doing it there, as far as the forced discipline of addressing the right standards and articulating them in an order, is essentially the same policy.

MR. LEATHERBURY: The sealing order would provide that the Court would divide the files -- the court file into an open file and a closed filed; the closed file certainly

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

for the company of the factor were a second	r
n of the problem is the following the state of the state	
• No. 1883 No. 1885	~
To made, in the first of date of the community of the com	•
alas naum un la	
and summer that the source of the summer section is a section.	
post teorem and an automorphism in the pro-	r** 1
30 (1. មើល ១០០) ស្រែកសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសា	. *
∸ాడకారు. ఉన్నాయి. కార్స్టార్ కిండ్స్ట్రాల్స్ ఉందిన ఉంది.	
තරක් කුරු කුරුවර්ගත වෙයි. මෙයි. මේ ද වෙවිදියේ	* <b>1</b>
and the applications of the property of the second	ŗ÷
mol our opens to describe ode monar of memor brief	<b>^</b>
ការពិសាធានិស្សា មុខការ ប្រទេស ស្រង សាធាន ពេលនៅស្រង ប្រធានិស្សា ស្រង សាធានិស្សា ស្រង ប្រ	° r
တို့ရာတွင် မေတီ အများသော ကျင်းကြည်တွင်ကြည်သည်။ မေသောက်သောက	^ ···
a ditul	3.*
motific and man dam will district	<b>:</b>
ar များကားအခောင် အနှင့် လူများမှန်မာလတ္တည်း အကြည်များကြသည်။ မြောင်းမြေသည်	gri ge
ស ខ្លាស់ ប៉ុន្តែ ស្ពាស់ ស្រាស់ ស	Y 6
automalabores o la contigaçõe de la monte de la contigaçõe de la contigaçõe de la contigaçõe de la contigaçõe d	. 6
နေလေး ကို ေျပးသည္။ ကို ျပည္သည့္သည္ မိုက္သည္ မိုက္သည္ မိုက္သည့္သည့္သည့္ မိုက္သည့္သည့္ မိုက္သည့္သည့္ မိုက္သည့္သည	•
• (%i) (e) o ese osid ye a diosmo si jupin	• e
condition of the small and some of the conditions of the condition	
ခြင်တြင် ကြောက်သောကြသည်။ အသည် သည် သည် သည် သည် ကြောက်သည်။ မြောက်သည် သည် သည် ကြောက်သည်။ မြောက်သည် သည် သည် သည် သည	÷0
aur o la nera or on on onle dagos salt — retin	Ŋ. (3)
Number of the <b>croc</b> ers, and the profit	•• •

containing only those limited portions for which a need for sealing exists. The sealing order would always be open and -- and subject to -- to public inspection. I think that, again, is very important because of our experience in Dallas and what the <u>Dallas Morning News</u>'s research showed about sealing orders being inside the sealed files.

б

The -- the last two sections -- or last two points in the proposal attempt to remedy some of the -- the rulings or the procedural problems that the press and other interested parties have had in challenging sealing orders. It provides for continuing jurisdiction, the court to maintain continuing exclusive jurisdiction to enforce, alter, vacate, or reinstate, or modify the sealing order, and provides for appeals of decisions relating to sealing orders by persons not parties to the lawsuit in the same manner as appeals from -- from temporary injunctions are provided.

It -- it further -- the appeals section also states that a court's failure to make the findings, the articulated findings

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

- n considering on constitute embloar documents

  of most of constitutions of a constitution of a constit
  - renewy on a bit the -- the rulings of this . . and the are described that ame come combenes. O.L interest a partier have had in challenging ~ r areling and a "togation is continuing 3.5 forishing the court to sintain continuin r englunive prefediction to englance of to en - T varente, or coin thise, or we lift this eal ng L. i. ordered averaged state to the antique of audiationer 7. resiting to acquing or are by caraans not \* \* A .. erties to the faunuit in the deal and a over the salu less of discontinuous essential continuous content of the content o . . · E ivax. ~ ~
  - ా ప్రాథాలు అట్ని కార్ ఉందిన లో ఉంది. కార్ ఉంది కార్ ప్రాథాలు అయిని అని మాహ్మణులు అది నిర్ణమ్యాలు అది చెప్పులు కార్ స్టార్ ప్రాథాలు కార్ ప్రాథ

required by the rule, shall never be harmless error and shall always be reversible error, in another attempt to enforce the discipline on the lower courts to properly articulate the standards.

1.2

And a suggestion that was made this morning on the plane down from Dallas, which I think is a good one, is the failure to adhere to the posting requirements -- the notice and posting requirements -- would render any sealing order void and should also be -- be reversible. So that's a -- that's a quick synopsis of the point.

JUSTICE SPEARS: Forgive me for not having in front of me the booklet that you talked about. Who would decide and what would the criteria be for whether or not -- for dividing these -- these court records up into different categories, those that are discoverable, those that are not?

MR. LEATHERBURY: The Court would make that decision. I mean, the Court would be --

JUSTICE SPEARS: On an abuse of discretion standard?

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

At the particle of the state of	
and the control of th	
ကာလုံးကို မွန်သည်။ ကောင်းမေးကောင်းမှုတို့ မြို့သည်။ ကောင်းမေးကြားသည်။ ကောင်းမေးကောင်းမေးကောင်းမေးကောင်းမေးကောင ကြောင်းကြောင့်သည်။ ကောင်းမေးကြောင့် မြို့သည်။ ကောင်းမေးကြောင့် မြို့သည်။ ကောင်းမေးကြောင့် မြို့သည်။ ကောင်းမေးက	,
· TSTALLS	
kild e so tou doll offi syg on har	
n de transporte de la como de la	į.
	`
ရောင် ကာလာတို့သို့တာ ကာလာ အသည် သည်သည် တည်းသည် ရေရာက်သောကာလေးသည် သည် သည်သည်ကို ကြောင်းသည်	
ကိုက် ေသာက် သည်။ <del>ကောင္းကို</del> သည္။ ကေတြက ကြန္းမွာ ကို သည့္သည့္	١
the second of the control of the state of the control of the contr	*,
.o. Carry of we Carry in the man level of the	**
១៧៨ ដល់ .iu <b>បក្</b> សាសស្រាក ស ខា <b>ថ</b> ាស់ស +++ ១ ភូមិ, 3. 3 ក្រ	.•
కథణ ఇంద్రమ గళ్హుక్తాని శాగానాండర్ కట్టాటైనికి	<u>,</u>
The state of the s	• · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
ు సాలా కొండాలో ఈ కార్స్ట్రాల్ కార్లు ఉన్న ఎక్కార్లు మన్ముడ్డు	•
కుండు కారా కరణం కారుమ్మీక కర్మా అంది. ఇంక కర్మానికి సంవత్	7
ారం. మూరా ఎంద్రార్ కామ్ కామ్ కామ్ కాట్లో కాట్లు ఉంది. మాట్లో కాట్లో	
గ్రామం మూడ్ కోస్కు ఉంది. మండ్రిక్ అని కోంట్లు కోళ్ళు ఉంది. కోస్తారు. ఈ కోళ్ళు ఉంది. కోస్తారు. ఈ కోళ్ళు ఉంది. క	5
Signal on the first open in the forest of the first open in the fi	,*
ကား ကြောင်းသွားတာလုပ်ပေး မြောင်းသည်။ လူသည် ကြောင်းသည် ကြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည် မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည မြောင်းသည်။	<u>".</u>
သို့ အ <b>င</b> ာ သိသုံးများများ တည်းတွင် လူသည်။ ကို သန္တာသို့သည် လူသည် သို့ မြောင်းများ လုပ်သည်။ မြောင်းများ	· ·
meter man ' ( "	^
And South the state of the stat	^

Thursday San Haidana (1

MR. LEATHERBURY: Well, that's -
JUSTICE SPEARS: Or are there more

definite standards than that?

MR. LEATHERBURY: It's -- it's a mixed question of fact and law that I would think the appellate court would not review on simply an abuse of discretion standard. It would -- it would --

MR. Mcelhaney: Your Honor, yes, we would hope -- and we have not addressed appellate standards in this rule; maybe that is something that should be addressed.

JUSTICE SPEARS: I'm sure concerned.

MR. McELHANEY: We would hope there would not be that -- that -- that deferential a standard of review. When we're dealing with constitutional questions, normally that degree of deference at the appellate level is -- is not appropriate, and it -- it ought to be a review under whatever standards would apply on constitutional review of other important public rights. And I think that it's important at two levels, and it's at the initial threshold for the trial court to apply high enough and then for there not to be just deferential review that

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

man to the first the first the state of the	
್ತಾರ್ಗ ವಾಡಿಕೆ ಎಂದು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರಿಯಿಂದು.	
institute the second of the se	n
more particular to the contract that	••
ស្នាល់ មក ប្រែក ប្រែក្រុង (ស្រែង) ស្រែង ស្រែង ស្រែង ស្រែង ស្រែង ស្រែង	**
in the second of	ţ.~
en e	1
Same to the same of the same o	•
က စားလက် က များကတဲ့ လက္ခင်း တွင် ပြီးသားသော ကာလွှင်းလိုင်းများက	<i>(</i> )
్ కికటిన ఉట్నాడు. ఇళ్లాలు కుట్టికి ఉన్నారు. కా ఉండికి సమామ్ కృష్ణ	rı
<ul> <li>country is a first up to this implication sometimes.</li> </ul>	<b>~</b> .
. :enwhones land, latter : opening to the control	• •
prové provincia de la companya de la	•
ా ఎక్కుడ్డి కట్టింది. మూడామికి ఈం కట్కుడి ఈం కట్కుడి కట్టి లే. కట్టి కట్టి	٠ ،
್ಕೆ ಬರು ಇಕ್ಕು ತಂದರ ಕಾರ್ತ್ ಬರು ಬರು ಕಾರ್ಯ ಅಧಿಕಾರ್ಯ ಮಾಡಿಕಾಗಲೇ	- ,
ក្រុម ខ្លាំងនៅការស្គាល់ ប្រាក់ ស្គាល់ ស្គ្រាល់ ប្រាក្សា ស្គ្រាល់ ស្គ្រាល់ ស្គ្រាល់ ស្គ្រាល់ ស្គ្រាល់ ស្គ្រាល់	i.
in the conservation of the second of the sec	٠.,
$v_{i}$ , $v_{i$	^.!
ge vo ga d'accombanda adoptiva política	* ;
లాగ్రామం (గ్రామంగులు ఓ ఓ ఆ <b>్థల</b> మీర్ వా <b>ల్ శాల</b> — ఓ ఉందింద్దాయి. కారుకుండి	ም ('
ಕ್ರಾಲಕ್ಕೆ ಅವರಿಗಳ ಗಳು ಕ್ರಾಪ್ರೆಕ್ ಕಾಗುತ್ತಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಆಗ್ರಹ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಆಗ್ರಹ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಆಗ್ರಹ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಆಗ್ರಹ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಆಗ್ರಹ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಆಗ	. ` :
ఎంద్రి సంగణించనేది సౌకర్యి కోటికి కోటి స్టార్స్ కామం ఉంది. కోటికి	<b></b>
នាក់ដាន់ កស់ការ សិក្ខាត់ជាល Lipp តែការក្នុងស្គ្រក នៅ និងសុខការ ព្រះការ ខេត្ត	· , ;-

if if we have the stimulation of the space of the strong results of  $\phi$ 

5.5

says whatever -- "He must have had discretion to do that, so we're not going to second-guess the trial judge."

important one -- because hopefully not very many appeals are going to be forthcoming; we're not looking for a new kind of industry -- a new area of litigation to create here. I think, really, if we will have some definite guidelines that they ought to be able to -- the trial courts will be able to deal with them.

I think setting it high enough and certainly well above a standard of just good cause -- that is in the local Dallas rule that's led to all the problems we've got. Good cause is just an invitation to do whatever you want. And we think that the constitution mandates a much higher threshold, and that's why we have attempted to be what appears to be maybe overly detailed by trying to articulate the tests that the certain courts have --

JUSTICE SPEARS: Another category of cases that we have gotten in this court in recent years has had to do with the sealing of discovery in products liability cases, and that

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

of a standard of the second standard of the second standard of the second second	•
ារ ក្រុងព្រះក្រុម សភ <b>ុ</b> ស្ស ខណៈ ស្រីក្រុម សុខ ស្ន <b>ែក</b> ស្រ ស្រី ស្រ	~
en e	•
de la la la la de de de de de la la de de la	
ការពេល បានស ទីពេល ស្គួន នេះសត្តនេះ ការព្យាកា <b>ងស ++</b> ត្រូវតេ នួងស្រាស់ ស	
the street of the second and the greet and the	,
son the a quenumber of temporary a more res	i.
မယ့္ နိုင္ ကား မလိုက္သရိတို့ ကို မမာ့အေနေန မလိုန္း အ <b>စား စာခံ အစ</b> ိုင္ခ်စ္ခုိမည္မွာ ျ	`
్రం ఈ ఉండాన్ ల నాఖాజ్ అనే ఇక్కార్ అవుంది. చాలకుండే ఎక్కార్ ని కార	
ಸ್ವೆಗಳಾಗು ಗಿಂದಾಗಿಯ ಅಲ್ಲಿ ಈಈ ಆರ್.ಎ.ಗಿ. ಇ <b>ಟ್ ೯</b> ೨ ಕಲ್ಲಿಗಳು ೧೮ ಪ	•
೧೯೭೯ ನಡೆಗಳು ಎಂದು ಇದೆ <b>ಅ</b> ಪ್ರೀತ ನಡೆಗಳು	r
t tink pettum dit bityli omopgischi	4 <sup>6</sup> 84
ರಾವರ ಗಮ್ಯಣ ಗಲ್ಲಿ ಪರಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಬಹಕಗಾಣಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಕೊಪಡಿ ಕರ <b>ಾ</b> ಗ	^
್ಯಕ್ಕಿಯ ರಾಜ್ಯ ದಾರ್ಯದರೆ ಸಾಧಾನ ಕಾಣಕ ಗಾಗಿ ಕರ್ತಿ ಕರ್ಷ ಈ ಅಭಿಕಾರ	ŕ
రా <b>జ్యా సంద</b> ా - ప్రస్థాన్నా కథికి ఉంది. అయిన చేసిన మంది కొం	;-
ನ್ನಡ ಆಗಳ ಸಂಶಾಣಿತ್ರ ರಾಗಿ ಸಹಗಾಗಿರುತ್ತಿರುವ no ತೆಯಾಗಿ ಅ	
್ ನಾಲ್ 1981 ಕ ನಿರ್ದೇಶಕಿಂದ ಅಭಿಕಾರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ ಕಿಂದರಿಗೆ	**
eval of 51 to the Soliton Cate of the open in the open	
the more original of the arms on walls and the least of	
where $a = a + a + b + b + a + b + a + b + b + b +$	`
<del>ాగా క</del> ారాగు - <sup>క</sup> ారాగు ఓ ఇద్యమా ఎందా గృత	•
នាក់ ក្រុម ១៩១២ ១០១៤ ស្រុក ស្រុកកាសាស ស្រាកាសាសាស	
and another of the wholeshows a superior by the con-	٠
In the second of the state of the second of	•
of the first of the contract o	

sort of thing. What does your rule do in that area?

MR. McELHANEY: Your Honor, if it does not become part of the public record, it's not dealt with by our rule, and so with the current practice of depositions not routinely being filed, with interrogatory answers not being filed --

JUSTICE SPEARS: Suppose they are filed.

MR. Mcelhaney: If they are filed, the way our rule addresses it is that they are then part of the public record. So once they are filed, if there is something that one party wants to protect, then he would need to invoke sealing order procedures.

JUSTICE HECHT: "The serious and imminent threat to the administration of justice." Is that systematic or just in the individual case?

MR. LEATHERBURY: It's really systematic. We had a discussion about that at the subcommittee and David Donaldson articulated -- took on that question and articulated a pretty good answer to it.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

In the base of the contract of the state of the contract of th	told out one of
O 11.70	
	I 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1.
out in the continue of the specific	្សាស់ « ស្រុកស្រាស់ ស្ន
ా కళ్యా కళ్ళాన్ <b>ఒతక్షా .</b> 2. మందు కూడా కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళాలు కళ్ళ	Marine (Art) Deliver
t dåuk di to in oppløden lag lyr. I t	West, in the W
tion the more plant of the last of the las	don warner yn
······································	
A CONTRACT STATE AND AREA.	And the second of the second
**************************************	
6 1 1 1 7 7 7 8 8 8 8 8 8 8 8 8 8 8 8 8 8	
Millian was the second section of the second section s	ma soft car it
n e on l'art alle jubille rodor	godd caac an .
ido. 98 %) prod: ki slekik ere – p	୯୭ ଓଡ଼ ଅବଟ ଅବସ୍ଥିତ (୧୯୮)
Bergoon and Something and the second	Sevel of boom
	Subject to Subsect to
in a company of the second of	
Mariotara Mila Compressión de la compressión de	មាលី ១ គឺភ្យុង
South Company of the Company	
	y school "
్రాథ్ కేస్ <b>క</b> సంఖ్యంలో ఉంది. అంది కా.	ా కాడికి రోజుతుంది. ఇం
	សមុខថា ៤០
ិស្សីស្ ១១ សី ភេស e= ១១៥% ស្គ ១	Sur noilles
ing the state of t	.C 05 to.

2

.

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

private interests that -- that the courts have

It has to -- there are certain

to protect. And, in other words, if you are

going to invade someone's privacy such that they

would be chilled in bringing a legitimate claim

to the -- to the courts, that would qualify as a

serious and imminent threat to the

administration of justice. It's -- it's --

it's -- it's a combination, really, I guess, of

systemic and -- and individual -- facts of an

individual case that could undermine -- that

could lead to undermine the system.

It doesn't -- you know, I think there was a humorous comment at some point, you know, that meant that all the judges would

resign or that they would all quit, or -- you

know, and -- gosh, nobody had ever -- was ever

going to be able to prove that. That's -- you

know, that's clearly not what it means. It

just -- it looks to the system and how it treats

individual cases.

JUSTICE HECHT: What application, if any, would rules of collateral estoppel have in the challenging of the sealing orders or appeal

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

challenges? For example, one party comes in and

principal state of the last particles	•
the first of the first of the first of the second s	
n than the property of the state of the stat	^
to the track who was the companies as specific and the	4
to be a little of the formation and continue of the	
the real are plant to the custom be bushed the base of	14
AR DE SERVE BOOM SERVE SERVE SERVE	lese
www.co.fig.to.www.co.figton.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in.co.in	
The Community of States of the Market of Contract of the Contr	ż
$(\mathcal{S}_{-})$ , a constraint $(\mathcal{S}_{-})$ is the $(\mathcal{S}_{-})$ and $(\mathcal{S}_{-})$ is the second $(\mathcal{S}_{-})$	- 1
for a menuncial and time to include the formation of the	<u>,</u> * - !
೧೮೯೪೮ ೧ಮಿಕ ೧೯೯೭ ೧೮ ಕನ್ನಡಗಳು ೧೮೮೯	<b>;</b> · ·
ಸದಕ್ಷಿಯ ಇ ಇಂಬಾರ್ಯ <b>೨೦೦ ಶ</b> ಿಷ್ಣಾರ <b>ು</b> ೨೦	
មានរូបស្រីសម៉ែល ៥, ១០ ២០ ២៣១៣១១ ១០១១១១១១ ១០១១១១១ ១១៩៩	3 (
ចិន្ត្រីមេខា ចាស់ក្រឹមដូ ១៩២ ( 20 ១១៩៦ ខាត់១១ ១៩១១ ១៩១៨ ᢏ emme)	
වලට සහ වැට දෙන විට විටක වූ වර්ණ දුන්වේ විටදින් වට ඇද්ථිවිතය	• \ 1
over a tree popol on the can glady en out avent	<b>19</b>
က ကွာ 🖚 ကိုလည်း ချစ်လောင် မတာရသည် တစ်စ် တစ် တောင်းစေးကွာ	· <b>*</b>
មាន «នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ នេះ	٦.
ត្រូវប្រជាពី ដូច្នៃ ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុ <b>ង</b> ស្រុក សស្រុក សស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុ	<i>"</i> "
en partir de la companya de la comp	3° 4°
22 Jan Blood Francisco Società de Company de la company	• •
For the Company tensor and the second of the company of the second of th	<b>/</b> h
error of the two the said search and all all ground are in the	٠,
to a at a los relaciones, el carre lete dan general.	7, 1

.

challenges the order and they have a hearing and they lose, and then another party comes in and wants to challenge the some order. Where do we draw the line there?

MR. LEATHERBURY: That's -- that's a good question. I -- and -- and one that's really not -- not specifically addressed in these rules. You could envision with the passage of time that facts and circumstances would change, and something that was legitimately sealed under the compelling need standard at one point with the passage of time or with the development of some additional facts would not meet the compelling need standard for sealing anymore. So I -- I view it as sort of a -- a fluid field.

I think that -- you know, we thought about and we have been asked questions about "Do you really see this as multiplying litigation unnecessarily? Why is the rule so detailed?" and so forth.

And, really, my thought is that the procedural requirements that are in the rule are almost as important as the substantive requirements. And with the procedural

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

Drug all policy which is to a confiction to the confiction	•
ကြားသော ရပါ ကြားကြားသည်။ သည် မေတာ့ မေတာ့ ကြားကြားသည်။ ကြားကြောင့် မေတာ့ မေတာ့ မေတာ့ မေတာ့ မေတာ့ မေတာ့ မေတာ့ မေ	~
သော လုပ်သောသည်ကို မေသာ လုပ်သွေးလက် သည်လုံးကို သည်လုံးသည်။ သည်းသည် သည်လုံးသည် သည်လုံးသည်။ သည်လေးသည် သည်လေးသည် သ	15
Production and Compression of the Compression of th	~
$oldsymbol{a}^{(i)} = oldsymbol{a}^{(i)} oldsymbol{a}^{(i)} oldsymbol{a}^{(i)} oldsymbol{a}^{(i)} oldsymbol{b}^{(i)} oldsymbol{a}^{(i)} o$	v
out was established with a most common some	•
ు ఉండింది. కాటశాన్ని కాటానికి కొట్టింటి కొట్టినికి ఉంది.	47
mark of the relative common and see proceeding man	•
the the gradient of the contraction of the contract	۳
omin la comma culto de despondencia de la composición de la composición de la composición de la composición de	C
inter a lange of the property of the property of the second	•
ကြားကို ကြည်းမှီအတို့အကြို့တယ်သည်။ လူသည် ကျေးသစ်ကြေး စာကြီး ကြေးသည် ကျေးသည် ကျေးသည် ကျေးသည်	•
in the call of the them the call and the colored	••
	a.
ాట్రాజాను. క్రాండ్ <mark>కార్మాట్ జా</mark> ర్మ్ మాంచ్రి ఆంచ్రి మంద్రి క్రాండ్ క్రాండ్ క్రాండ్ క్రాండ్ క్రాండ్ క్రాండ్ క్రాండ్	,,
ទ <sup>ុសស</sup> ជ័ស () ព <b>ស</b> ្នាដាំងលេខ "ខ្លាស់" ជា ១៧ (២៤ ) (១ ខណ្ឌ ) ប្រ	<b>~</b>
ន ដើម្បីក្រុងស្ពីមាន ប្រាស់ស្គ្រាស់ ស្ត្រីស្គាល់ ស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស	•
महात्व अन्यविक क्षा ए एक एक विकास पूर्विक शिल्ला कर विकास प्राप्त	<i>:</i>
	ŗ:
ာက်မြော လက္နွားမှ သည်။ ကားသံုးကျသည်၍ သည် ရောက္သော သည် မေတြက	•
် က က စား စာရီကို က သကား သည် သို့သည်လည်း က က စာသ မြေ က ရေးက က ျွန်းကို ရေး	**************************************
pur a form of the control of the state of the	

 $-\epsilon_{ij} = -\epsilon_{ij}$  (2)

1.000

requirements where the notice is posted, where there is an opportunity to appear and be heard at the very outset, then ultimately you will have a lot less litigation if you do it right the first time.

JUSTICE HECHT: Is there any intention that the rule be retroactive?

MR. McELHANEY: Yes.

JUSTICE HECHT: So that after -- if the rule were passed, you could go back and move to unseal --

MR. McELHANEY: I -- I say that,

Your Honor, in this vein. We haven't put in any
language that makes it prospective only, and it
does provide for the concept of intervention for
the purpose of filing a motion to unseal
records. Therefore, it could be applied as the
way it's written in that -- in that way.

We recognize, however, that there are arguments that countervail such a ruling on the merits. Procedurally, we are there in court asking for these records to be unsealed, but we would expect that those opposing the unsealing -- in other words, keeping the status quo -- to argue that the rules were different

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	F.
To specify the settle of the model gardings of the settle of the settle	
್ಕೆ ಆಗ್ರ್ಯಾಗ್ರಹಕ್ಕಿಗಳು ಅವರ ಅವರಿಗಳು ಪ್ರಾಥಾಗಿ ಮುಂದು ಪ್ರಾಥಾಗಿ	**
ស៊ីកាលស្រី ស៊ីស្សាស្រី ស្រីស្រី ស្រែក្នុង ស្រែក្រុង ស្រែក្រុ	•
÷tata tilatik	• •
ာ <b>့က</b> ္ေလာက္ သည္သြားေလးက ေခ့္ေကေကာ္ ေျပာက္ကုတ္လည္း	
<b>Υργ</b> άσειση ώσε σελικό πισολία μα έσκε τη διακολία σο διακολία και τη διακολία σο διακολία και τη διακολία σο δια	
	•
. <sup>1</sup> జాగా నగణిక్షా విధమ్మ అన్న ఇది తాతాని 100 కాటా కాటి	
nara da di Baba en Suman mengelegene dan mangkalan berakan	s ·
المراجع الإن المراجع ا المراجع المراجع	r 1
A Company Co	
್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಚಿತ್ರ ಹಾಗಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಎಂದು ಎಂದು ಬೆಂಬು ಬಿಡಿಯ ಮುಂದು ಬಿಡಿಯ	~ .
ing the state of the same of the section of the sec	^ 4
្ត ការប្រជាព្រះស្រីទៅលោកស្ត្រីស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែកស្រែសស្រែក ប្រឹក្សាស្រ្តី ស្រែក ស្រែក ប្រឹក្សាស្រុក ស្រែក ស្រុក ស្	. ,
යට අතුයාවන අතු වෙන සිට	*> *
o Paris de Calabara de la Maria de Maria de Caral de Calabara de C	'⊶ as
e the light of <del>the</del> entry at the <b>fo</b> tbury office was	
a en	z.
e en	,
్ కావాలు కోందాడు. ఈ ఎక్కువారు కొట్టుడుకు కార్యండుకు కావాలు ఉండికుండి. అయిన	<b>.</b>
ស្រីស្រី «ស៊ី២ «១៩» ដោយស្រី «ស៊ី» ស្រី » ស្រីស្រី » ២០៨៥ ២០១៤ «ស៊ី។	٠.
ా మాలు కార్మాలు. ఈ మాలు కాటమ్ కార్యాలు కాట్లు మీది కాండాల్లో మాడుకుండా కాట్లు కాట్లు	er e
to the first of the second of	٠,,

1	when it was sealed; the parties may have entered
2	into a settlement in reliance on that, and time
3	has is on their side. And so that this
4	rule is a procedural rule, rather than governing
5	the actual decision on the merits there, but,
6	yes, it it could result in some motions being
7	presented and filed on on old records.
8	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: That kind of rule
9	we can't rule unconstitutional.
10	MR. McELHANEY: Hope not.
11	JUSTICE SPEARS: I would say we
12	would be the only ones that could.
13	JUSTICE HECHT: A difference between
14	power and desire there.
15	Any other questions of Mr. McElhaney
16	and Mr. Leatherbury?
17	JUSTICE DOGGETT: You are going to
18	look also, though it's not in this draft, at a
19	draft rule for the Rules of Appellate
20	Procedure
21	MR. LEATHERBURY: Right.
22	JUSTICE DOGGETT: since this only
23	addresses the district courts to cover things
2 4	like attempts to seal briefs, that kind of

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

thing?

25

The contract of the contract o	
ាំង គឺនេះ «ប្រែក្រុង មេ» ចេលឈ្មោះ ១០ ឆ្នាំ ១ <b>៣</b> ១១ ១៩១១១ ១០ ប្រឹក្សា	ě
that we do let by the second of a to a to a second of	
. Carrovor in in Links a filter to the contract of the body	r.
ಕ್ಷಳ್ಳಿಗೆ ಅಂದಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಅದ್ದು ಅಂದಿಗೆ ಗಾಗಿ ಎಂದು ವಿಧಾನಕ್ಕೆ 1 ಕ್ಷಣ್ಣ ಕ್ಷಳ್ಳಿಗಳು	
and the second of the Augustian States and the state way.	•
se to 20% was a see as a first to siden in	ς.
The second secon	`
· The strate and see the strategy of	
• Sm Sm s vi in the comment	1
	្រុ
endicate in 200 to the second section of the second section is	4. "
TO OTHER TO THE SERVICE OF THE SERVICE OF THE SERVICE.	٠ ١
entrest in the contract of	^ .
	Tr. ex
	• •
the state of the s	7
వి ఎక్కారం ఉన్నారి. మంది మంది కుండా కాట్లు కుండా ఉన్నాయి. మంది మంది కుండా కుండా కుండా కుండా కుండా కుండా కుండా	
in the state of the second of	r
	3
	, ,
$\mathcal{A}_{ij} = \mathcal{A}_{ij} + \mathcal{A}_{ij} \otimes \mathcal{A}_{ij} \otimes \mathcal{A}_{ij} + \mathcal{A}_{ij} \otimes \mathcal{A}$	
។ ប្រជាជា ១០០០១ ខែ ១០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០	200
Be detter to be a first of the state of the first of the	4 ,

MR. LEATHERBURY: Yes, yes. We'll 1 look at that and also the jurisdictional point. 2 JUSTICE DOGGETT: Okay. 3 MR. McELHANEY: We -- we do have some copies of this -- of a redrafted rule, but 5 since it's still evolving, we don't want to 7 burden you with too much interim. We'll be glad 8 to pass this out or wait and get you something more definitive. And, of course, it's in the 10 hands of all of the subcommittee anyway. 11 you-all. JUSTICE HECHT: Mr. Donaldson is 12 13 next in line. 14 15 DAVID DONALDSON, 16 appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in 17 administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas 18 Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of 19 Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 20 21 22 MR. DONALDSON: Members of the Court, I am David Donaldson, and I'm from 23 24 Austin, Texas. 25 I'm appearing today on behalf of

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

2

3

4

5

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Texas Media. Texas Media is a not-for-profit coalition of professional journalism groups that's dedicated to the First Amendment and freedom of information issues.

Texas Media includes the Freedom of Information Foundation of Texas, the Society of Professional Journalists, the Texas Association of Broadcasters, the Texas Associated Press Managing Editors Association, the Texas Daily Newspaper Association, the Texas Press Association, and the Texas Press Women. As you can tell, it has a lot to do with the press.

In addition to representing Texas Media, I also represent reporters, editors, and broadcasters on a day-to-day basis advising them about how to obtain information and open government issues, and I'm here today to represent Texas Media.

We had another witness whose name is Howard Swindle. You heard references already to the <u>Dallas Morning News</u> study. Mr. Swindle is an assistant managing editor from the <u>Dallas</u> Morning News.

We submitted to the Court some written testimony from Mr. Swindle, and I have

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

19

of the region of the transfer of the first of the second o The first transfer that the first of the fir The second of the second second for a solid of a part office of each The options of the company of the property and the contract the contract of th "我们通过"是种特别,只要是通过"大利"的第三人称单数,还是由自己的一种发展的自己的 of the contract of the contrac and the transfer of the second The state of the second of the spectrum of the second of t · 1 The grant and are the control of the and the state of t ٠. ب ានសុខភាព ព្រះនៅល្ខាត់ ១ ១១ ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខែការក្រុម មុខ។ 7.7 Transference ( to the control of the second of the control of the 7 ··· ាស៊ី (អាសាស្រី) ។ ស្រីពេក្សី (**គ**ើការ កាស្សី) ១ (**...) ស្តាស្តា**ស្តាស្តា above the otherin injection on the sach on the order of the terms of the terms of 7. .a sem brace draws how of om a look in location content told to ٠ ۴ 00 Time to the control of the contro and of the contract of the contract of the contract of 7 " • n and thent thereing without fix Indiana and the district of the seguine was all the

ို ကို ကြားသည်။ သည်းသို့ မေသည် မေသည်။ ဥတို့ ဥတို့ ကော်ကြာသည် မေလာက်သို့ ကွေး

also submitted some written testimony. I don't want to burden the Court with presenting all of my written testimony, necessarily, but I do think Mr. Swindle's statements are particularly appropriate and present information that I think you have been asking for as we go through: How extensive is the problem? How serious is it?

With the Court's permission, I would like to go ahead and read Mr. Swindle's -- at least a portion of his -- his written testimony so that you will have the benefit of that.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: We've got -we've got the copy here, and I, for one, am not
interested in your reading the material. You
know, we're going to read it. I'm more
interested in having your comments about
proposed 76a. Do you see any problems with
proposed Rule 76a?

MR. DONALDSON: Well, in that -- in that context I have an easy answer, Your Honor. I do commend the Court and ask the Court to take a look at it, because it does answer some of the questions about the number of cases that have been sealed, the nature of the cases that have been sealed, and raises, frankly, an issue that

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The properties of the contract of the contract

gradien in de verdeur de la maiorité de la consideration de la fait de la consideration de la fait de la consideration de la fait de

1

one of the section o

I I was the second of the seco

en de de de despeta de la composición de la comp

hasn't been raised so far: the -- the public perception that sealing is available to those with corporate clout, with influence, with some "in" with the Court that assists them in obtaining the sealing of records.

1.5

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: That is not my question. My question was: Do have any comments about the proposed rule that -- that the last two speakers spoke about that are asking us to enact?

MR. DONALDSON: Yes, Your Honor, I do. And that -- my response to that is that we have been working -- I'm one of the members of the committee, and I've been working closely with Mr. McElhaney and Mr. Leatherbury and the other members of the committee in discussing that, and, yes, we are very -- in favor of the rules that are being proposed by the committee, the rules that are being discussed.

There have been -- as Mr. McElhaney mentioned, there are a number of changes in the rules that -- the proposed rules that you have even seen. We have gone through several iterations even today. We're hoping to meet again in early December. Hopefully, we will

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

to be a sets on the second second second and the second second second second second second second second second	~
នា ១៩៩៦ ១៩៩០ ១ <b>ដែល ១៨</b> ១ ១៩៩៩៩១ ខែទី២ ២២៦១៩២៤២ ្	•
swith THE Communications had the top of the communication of	••
et south subjects, bridge to be to be to the top the	^
$oldsymbol{\cdot}$ with the same same same set $oldsymbol{\cdot}$	.,
and the state of t	••
gas vilos a en carritros en en como se en en esta en	7
်က ဒါ 🖚 ဂါတည်း၏ ၈ ကရာ ကိုက္ခရာရွိတာနဲ့ တည်းလို့ ကိုလာရာပါတဲ့ ကည်းအစည်းသည	
នយក ស៊ីបានបាន និយាស់ស ១៧៤ ២ នេះបានស្រី ១៩២ ២៤៣ ១៨៩	
ទី ស្គុធិបា (ស	
್ ೯೩೯೧೮ <sup>೯</sup> ನಟ <b>ಣ</b> ್ ನಾರ :ಕ್ನಾರ್ಡಿಗಳು ೧೮ .0	<i>.</i>
ు ఎక్కావ్స్ కామ కారణిఖో కృష్ణ కుట్టుకుడ్డా ఉంది. కాటా మీఎస్.మీ కూడ్ ఇండ్ కాట్	<b>.</b>
့ က က ကုန် ချောက္ စစ်များ သြန္း ထားက အ <sup>နည္</sup> မွာ မမွာ ရန္နဲ့ရက္ မွာ ရွားစစ္ရွိ လက္	<b>~</b>
e v posíb jažámen niet tvin ina "podlániam odá	· .
- ನಮಿಗೆ ಬೀಕಾಗ ಕೃತ್ವಾಗಿಸಿದ್ದಾರೆ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಅಧಿಕಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಮುತ್ತಾರೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಮಾಡುವುದು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಮಾಡುವುದು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್	•
က္ကားနဲ့ ကြောက္တာကို ကုိ လက္သည့္သို႔ လက္သည္ဆိုသို႔ လက္သည္လို႔ ကို လက္သည္ကို	••
erry no modely to the Kaon et and e of spush equal	7
មួនជាក់ដី ខេត្ត មណីជា ស្គ្រាក់នុស្ស ក្រុងស្គី ខេត្ត ការប្រជាំង សុខបាន	4
• မြို့သည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျောင်းသည်။ ကျ	· •
ក្រុងស្រី ហើយ ស្រី ស្រា == ១០១៧ ស្រី ស្នាញ់ប្	* 1
ປາຊີ ໝາຍ ຮອງຕາມພ້າ Do ກ່າວປະຕິການ ກ່າວ ການ ຄາຍປະຊີ ຊຸ ຄ <b>າດຕ</b> ້າ ຄວາ.	<i>"</i> .
రవారి అని తెగ్టింది. అందారా స్థాబ్లు కూడా కటిపే ఈఈ రెక్షెస్ అందినిన	•:
ನಿರಾಧಕಾರ ಮುಂಗಾ ಸಚಿತ ಕಾಗಿಗಳ ಎಂದು ಬರ್ಗ ಚಾರುತ್ತ ವರ್ಣ	<i>(</i> * /
nam in the second of the secon	^

್ ( ಕರ್ಮ ಕರ್ಷಕ್ರಿಗಳು ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕರ್ಮಕ್ಕೆ

come out and have a set of rules for you to review and with the hope that this, in fact, will be decided.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: I'm only one of -- you know -- one of my ideas. The judges may want to hear you read the testimony. I don't --

JUSTICE COOK: I read it this morning. I've underlined it.

MR. DONALDSON: So you're ready on that. All right. Well, let me make a couple of other comments: One, just to try to bring into focus the role that this information plays in how we -- how we run our government.

The way that we operate in our system is that the citizens use the information that they receive, and they make decisions, including the decision to elect our public officials, based on the information that they receive. Now, all -- all of us would like, I suppose at some point, to have the opportunity to actually be there to get information we consider important to do our job as citizens, but we can't be there, and the people that we rely upon to do that job is the media: the

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

```
District Control of the Control of t

    Bell at a first color red end of the color

                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              Che y las a transfer of the configuration
                             Section of the sectio
                                                                                                                        ್ಯಾರ್ಡವ್ ಇದ್ದರ್ ಧನೆದೆ ಬಿಂದು ಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಬಂದೆ ಬಿರು ಇತ್ತು
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             ....
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            5
                                                                                                             the state of the s
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            The second of the second of the second
                ; ~
- 1
      ကြားသည်။ ကုန်းပေါက်သော့ အတော့ အတွင်း မေသည် မေသည်ကို မေရာက်သည်း မေရာက်သည်။
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            1
                                               and the state of t
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             /~ у
                                                                                                                                                                                          The state of the state of the state of
                                                                                     THE TROOPS OF SHIPS IN THE
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             • 0
               r ils melai ed or rough; is eit seit ni kotara
                                                                            Lacatelect care attack to the contract to the care
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                , ..
                                                                                 indiation to be the term of an expension of
                                               The Control of the state of the
                                    parameters of the two sections of the least one of the
                                                                           or a lie & 4. Complete on the polymer of the complete of the c
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          1 14
                                           Remarkable of a big transfer and integrate of the Company
                                     war to the object of the work of the state of the original of the contract of the state of the s
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            f #*
```

2

3

\_

5 6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

reporters and publishers, the eyes and ears of the public who are there in the courtrooms and who are there in the district clerks' offices who are observing the cases that are being filed and the activities that are taking place with regard to those cases.

Consititutional access to public trials is -- is become -- has become clearly established. It's a matter of constitutional What is it -- there is a trend toward recognition of that access, and several lower courts below the Supreme Court have recognized the right to such access to public records, also. And the idea is that we have to have the ability to see those records in order to be able to do our job as citizens. Because as you realize in civil cases, of all the cases that are filed, not many of them are actually tried. Most of them are resolved short of trial. unless we have the right to have access to that information, we will not have enough information to determine whether our judges are doing the right thing, what kind of cases are being filed, what sort of claims are being made. That sort of information is something that the public

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

• •

$\mathcal{L}_{i} = \{ (2\pi)^{i} \in \mathcal{L}_{i} : (3\pi)^{i} \in \mathcal{L}_{i} : (3\pi)^{i} \in \mathcal{L}_{i} : (3\pi)^{i} \in \mathcal{L}_{i} \}$
en la companya de la companya della companya della companya de la companya della
1. St. \$12 to the first of the experience of the second contract of
លើដុំ ស្ពាល់ដែរ ខេត្ត ដាន់ ទៅតា ១០១១៦ ខេត្ត ស្រាល់បាលប្រជាព័យ ១ ១ ខេត្ត
odelia kapa — naman policina ne na kendalah kecama berigi
•ខាធា ១២ ខាស់ ខេង ខេង ខាង ១៩៣១៩៣
$ \psi_{ij} ^2 C_{ij} =  \mathcal{L}_{ij} ^2 +  \psi_{ij} ^2 +  \psi_{ij$
Two it is stood to be the concepted as $$ in the sale
్రా కానిమెటించ్నారు. ఈ స్థాన్ని కార్కార్లు కార్యాల్ స్టాతంగా స్టాతంగా
្រុងសេស្ស និយាស ព្រះ ស្គ្រាស់ 🗝 នូវ ក្រុងស្ព្រះ 🕡 🕞
thought of an own to be another to define the contribution of
ು ಚಾರ್ಯದ ಅಥವಾಗಿ ಕಾರ್ಯದಲ್ಲಿ ಅವರ ಬ್ಯಾಪ್ ಚಿತ್ರಗಳ ಬರು ಪ್ರತಿಗಳಿಗಳು
ကျော်အားသောင်း မေးပါတော်များ ကြောင်းကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင့်ကြောင့်
in the conservation of the size of a contraction of the contraction of
ಟರ್ ನಿ <b>ರ</b> ವೆ ಇವರ ಅದು ಕಟ್ಟಿಗಳ ಕ್ರಾಡ್ ಚಾಡಾಗಿಕೆ ತಡಗ ಒಮ್ಮೆ ಫ್ಲೌಗಿ ಬಗ್ಗ
អ្នកប្រាស់ ខេត្តការប្រជា ខេត្តប្រជាតិបើបាន ប្រធានធ្វើ ប្រធានធ្វើ ប្រធានធ្វើ ប្រ
ကြားသည်။ သင်္ကာ မေရးသည်။ သည်။ ရှိသည် ရှိသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရေးသည်။ ရ
. This is a might of the constraint of the office of $\mathbf{x}$
ರ್ಷ ಕೃತ್ಯಾಗಿ ಕೆಲ್ಲಾರಾಣ್ಯ ಬಳಕೆಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಅವರ ಎಸ್ಕೆ ಕಲ್ಲಾಗ
್ಟರ ರಾಜ್ (ಜಲನೀತ ಕಾರ್ಯ) ಚಿನ್ನ ಕೆಸ್ಟ್ ಕ್ರಾಟ್
This chion, we it in and it we indicated that the Ci
with the probability of the pro

r

7.

p 15

1

needs the right to obtain.

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

JUSTICE HECHT: Well, in all fairness, how does it help a member of the public to discharge his civic responsibility to know that a party in a divorce case had been involved or had dealings from time to time with somebody else? What public good does that serve? Isn't this just about selling newspapers?

No, Your Honor, it's MR. DONALDSON: And I think every time I have had to deal not. with that issue, that's one of the questions that comes up, and it really is not. You heard Ms. Kneeland this morning describe their efforts to present to the public what's going on. That's not really the effort.

But think for a moment. Of all of the types of cases that our citizens are likely to become involved in, the most likely type of case that they will be involved in is a divorce proceeding, unfortunately. And although the specific and intimate details of those events may not necessarily be something that -- that should be a matter of public knowledge --

**ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES** 

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: But some of them

	.•
ខុស្ស ដែល ស្រី ស្រុស	•
na griditdiraejad, pivir rit, rit i grit od ratu.,	t
ువుకు కథ కాణా ఇ <b>ల</b> జాక్స్ ఇంకి గ్రామంలో ఈ చెప్పుకు కాటికి	•.
algebra entre est entre an el complete est entre el complete de la complete del la complete de l	
Button Color on patential of the Color of the color	
ja s on that worth of the Branch gave a	,,
್ರೀಕ್ (ಪಡುಕಾಣ್ 1855 ) ಕನ್ನ ಕಟ್ಟೆ ಕಾಗ್ ಗಾವ್ ಗಾರ್ . ಕ	^ ;
on the and over the size arms in State Amilon	f' <b>f</b>
อาเปลี่ย์ (ชาว อดีน โดย โดย นาราวนา รูปการเลี้ย์ ปานเลี้ย์ (วิ.ชา	
ျပည္သည့္ <b>အလု</b> ပ္သည့္ ေနရာက္ ေနရာက္ ေနရာက္ ေနရာက္ ေနရာက္ ေနရာက္	
approfile ridoal officol relation to the basison for	٠.,
.40 9% <sup>†</sup> న్, చేశిరకట లో . గా చి.60 మీ.68నర్ని లెక్	;; r
•క కొంటు ఉన్ని పట్ ఉన్ని క	~ *
The first No. 1 community of the Charles of the Community of the Charles of the C	· • -
	· "
in the state of th	r s an
est von de la lavatova de la cata de la cata	\ <u>\</u>
. If $(\partial u) = \partial u$ , the second of $(\partial u) = \partial u$ , the second of $(\partial u) = \partial u$ , where $\partial u$	<b>.r</b> · ·
tarove opoli 20 - Pode i ripolijeki ka polijeki i	
ကြားသည် ကာက သောက်သည်။ နေသည်။ အေရ မောင်း မြောင်းသည်။ အေရာက နေသာ ကျွေးသည်။	
<del></del> the QAM to the first of the control of the con	
5 th 1 out of the state of the	- /.

2 interested in, are you not? MR. DONALDSON: No, Your Honor, that 3 is -- that is not the case. What we're interested in is being able to have access to 5 information that is useful for the public to 7 determine how its courts are operating. It's 8 important, for example, in a divorce case. JUSTICE GONZALES: Well, what --10 MR. DONALDSON: It's important to 11 know whether or not -- whether or not an 12 indiscretion will result in differing --JUSTICE HECHT: We're operating by 13 suffering cases in which this kind of discovery 14 15 is being taken. What -- how does it help the 16 public to know that? MR. DONALDSON: Well, Your Honor, 17 18 that is the --19 JUSTICE HECHT: Mr. Babcock presents 20 the case of a -- of a physician -- a 21 psychiatrist or psychologist; I have forgotten 22 which, although I certainly should know -- in 23 which I read in the Austin paper he was alleged to have been involved with his patient, but --24

1

25

make very good copy, and that's what you're

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

so an argument is made: "Well, the public

of a	and the control of the state $oldsymbol{a}^{(n)}$ . The state $oldsymbol{a}^{(n)}$
3.0	A CHARLES AND ALL CONTRACTOR SERVICES AND A SERVICE AND A SERVICE AND A SERVICE AND A SERVICE AND A SERVICES AND A SERVICE A
· ·	engan i seraj ja granjanja dibelj nasa i rediter
J.C.	
√ <b>3</b>	and operation of the sound of t
J	ႏုန္း မကာတ္ေလးႏွင့္ မမ— အက္လူျပည္ ႏိုင္္မန္တစ္မွား မမ— သ
پ ف	Decamanda Cara Cara
<b></b> •.	g report to the second
13	
<b>.</b> .	- 19 1: <b>G</b> (7 ) prode \$2.0\$.
ï	An interpretation. That we find those in team that
d N	thy to thus so has an ablich this after of thocosy.
:. <b>:</b>	The solution of the $m{z}$ - $m{z}$ of the solution of $m{z}$
v	grading street of the street o
1 T	the constant $m_{\rm tot} = - \alpha_{\rm tot}$ for $m_{\rm tot} = - \alpha_{\rm tot}$
1 · · ·	Edf (222, doing 100, for the configuration)
U	Edde Good Carlotte Land Carlotte Comment
ì	. The particular company of $(a,b)$ and $(a,b)$ and $(a,b)$
ud	colonidad he like com the cause a colonidad.
•	imponistion then so mickly the two wides of
	્યું વેલ્લેન્ટ્રિયા લેવા છે. જે કે
	The state of the s
t	
•	CONTRACTOR OF THE CONTRACTOR O
•	and Advantage in the engineering of the contract of the contra

should know that a man in his position is 1 alleged to be involved in that kind of conduct." 2 3 But just from a person who is trying to get through the unfortunate circumstance of a divorce, how does it help the public to know 5 that in addition to all of that, he has -- he or 6 7 she has done these things in the last five years 8 or 10 years, whatever, which were extracted in the course of discovery in order to, of course, 9 10 perfect a more favorable outcome of the property 11 settlement? 12 MR. DONALDSON: Well, Your Honor, that -- let me respond to that in a couple of 13 14 ways. The first question: What about the psychiatrist? How do we know about that? 15 JUSTICE HECHT: Well, that's an 16 easier --17 18 MR. DONALDSON: That's an easier 19 case. 20 JUSTICE HECHT: -- that's an easier 21 case. 22 MR. DONALDSON: I grant that; I grant that. It is an easier case. 23 24 In the instance where you have the situation that you have described, that's one 25

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the same and will be a sound to the same of the same o	r
The transfer of the state of th	•
the transfer of the second of	۴
និង ខាងការាស៊ីកា ការស្និង ខាងការាស៊ីកា ខេត្តការ និងការការស្និងការការស្និងស	ι,
	•
	No.
్ కుమ్మం ఉంది. మందిన అంటే కుమ్మం కుమ్మం కుమ్మం కుమ్మం కుమ్మం కుమ్మం కుమ్మం	Ÿ
ာ က ျပည္သည္။ က စစ္တာက္က မိစ္ျပည္သည့္ ႏွစ္တန္း သည့္မရာတစ္မွာ ကြိန္း အ	•
ក្នុងស្រាន ពីស <b>១</b> ៧៤ ស្រី ២០១៩២ <b>៩១ ១. នៅឯកសម្</b> ធាស៊ី ២០១៩ នេះ ការស្ពើ	<u> </u>
Talk to the state of the state	٢;
	<i>∕</i> ► •
io ligament al orio or comment language. Ho garage	• ¢
opis openso to the section of the substitute of the section of the	^ ,1
్షాగుండి మేకా కార్మాన్ మందు కార్యం స్టార్ క్రామ్ క్రామ్ క్రామ్	: , <b>r</b>
	• 9
to the second particle and the second professional second	.5
• t* · · ·	′ <b>[</b>
	20
•'	<b>"</b> ,
్ శ్రామం ఉంది. కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా కాటా కాట	£4.73
• dad telovic ne la transfer da ce	• 1•
Studio Mill 1889 - Tubril Commond in the Com	÷ ··
$\sigma = \sigma^2 v = v + \omega v = v v v + v v + v v v v v v v v v v v$	· •

.

that can be presented to the district court, and the district court can determine. If it is even becoming an issue at all, the district court can then determine whether or not the circumstances are such that a compelling need has been met.

JUSTICE HECHT: Well, except in this proposed rule, a person's sensitivity, embarrassment, or desire to conceal the details of litigation is not the greater interest which overcomes the presumption of openness. So how could a party ever resist the concealing of that -- that discovery?

MR. DONALDSON: Well, Your Honor, you are putting me in a position of trying to defend and provide arguments for those who might want to -- to restrict access to information, and that's an unfortunate position for me to be in.

I guess one's response might be,
though, that in order for us to -- well, I mean,
one response may be, "Well, that may be the
result; that may be the result," and it may be
that it is important to know, not just in a
specific case. But suppose that you want to do
a study to see what effect indiscretions have

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the commence of the commence o	ŗ
na 1 4 4 kan kanda . Indonés kan kan k	٠
restriction of the state of the	•
ការស្រុកទៅព្រះស្រួយ ស្រុក ដែល ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក សុខ	а
.:ଚ. ସ⊊. ୮ ୪୮ ୯ ୯ ୮ ଫୁଫଟ ୬ ୯୯୯ ହେଅ ଓଷ୍ଟ	
	×
ing Cinciple to the company of the second of the contract of	5
TOURS SUBJECT OF MUSIC OF COURSE OF A SUBJECT OF THE	
э — రాజం కానకు కాగ్రిక్ కాగ్రిక్ కాగ్రిక్ ప్రాణాలు అత్యాత్రా కట్టుక్కారు. ప్రాణాలు	•
order and to our films. There are no some controls of the controls	2.0

stant track to be seen and the

ಕ್ಷಣೆ ಭಾರತಿಗಳ ನಿರ್ವಹಣಕ್ಕೆ ಅರ್ಥದಲ್ಲಿ ಅತ್ಯಂತ ಬೆಳಗಳ ಬಳಿಸಲಾಗಿ ಬೆಳಗಳು ಬಳಿಸಲಾಗಿದೆ. ಈ ಅರ್ಥ ಶಿಷ್ಟಿತ ಅವರ ಅವರ ಅವರ ಬೆಳಗಳ ಮಾಡಿಕು ಬಳಗಳ ಅವರ ಪ್ರತಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಬಹುತು ಬಿಳಗಳು ಅಂತಿ ಅಂತಿ ಹಿಡಗಳು ಆರ್ಥಿತಿಗಳು ಬಳಸು ಅವರ ಅವರ ಪ್ರತಿಗಳು ಬಳಗೆ ಮಾಹಾಗಳು ತಿರ್ಮಹಣೆ ಬೆಳಗಳು ಬೆಳಗಳು ಅಂತಿ

The first angular case interpretation was to the second

Satisfaction in Soli -- 3 d

2 10

SALOR POLICE TO THE SOUTH OF TH

on committee and management. The state of the same of the second

upon property settlements. Unless we have the
ability to find out that information, such
studies can never be done.

And -- and again, as I point out,
one of the most critical areas -- one of the
areas that most people, if they ever have any

one of the most critical areas -- one of the areas that most people, if they ever have any contact with the court at all other than as a juror, will be in a situation where they are involved in a divorce. It may be that they don't want their particular case to be spread out in front of the newspapers; and as a practical matter, they aren't on a day-to-day basis. But it is -- it would be interesting, and it would be important for their lawyers to know what can happen in cases involving particular types of conduct.

JUSTICE HECHT: Sort of the cost of an affair.

MR. DONALDSON: That may be. That may very well be.

JUSTICE HECHT: Other questions of Mr. Davidson?

MR. DONALDSON: Donaldson.

JUSTICE HECHT: I'm sorry;

Donaldson.

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

	:.
• Long 101 1 1154 5	<i>c</i> *
to the second of	
and the second of the second o	,
which was a constant of the state of $oldsymbol{c}$ , $oldsymbol{c}$ , $oldsymbol{c}$ , $oldsymbol{c}$	
general distriction of the second of the sec	
The state of the first test of the state of	-
1/20 13 13 14 17 17 17 17 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18	
ရွက် ကားသို့မှာတွင် လေသည်။ ကိုလောက်လေသည်က မေသည်သို့တွင် မေသည်သို့ ကားသည်။	~ ·
gas ser er of them to disease and an experience	* b de
en expense of a positive state of the state	ak nu
÷់ស្ល ាស ពី ប្រ. ១៦ សេស្សាសាស្រ្	¿ "
n That out is set of proper the temp	Ţ.e.
• 1.54B.1 <b>6</b> 5	ŗ
to the enterior such as the transfer enterior	2.
	• •
and the Amar Casassa Common growth and	er e
The terms of the second of the	/· 🚗
	** **

٠.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Is that Sam
Donaldson?

MR. DONALDSON: You said Donaldson.

JUSTICE COOK: The only problem that

I had is -- you know, I like numbers, okay? And
you get the impression by listening that -- I
think one of the phrases used was "sealing
indiscriminately," like this is going on, on a
mass, wholesale basis. And -- and I -- I had
someone call up, and in county cases during an
eight-year period, in Dallas you had 133,656.
They didn't have a chance to add up all the
district court cases, but I'm sure they would
probably equal that number. And if you use the
total number that you gave us in the media
report, which was, I think, either 202 or 220 --

JUSTICE COOK: -- 202, even the federal government would say that's really a diminishing number. Now, using the -- you know, it only took me a few minutes to call up there to Dallas and get the correct information.

202.

MR. DONALDSON:

Now, I'm not saying there is sealing done where it should not be done, and I don't think sealing should be done indiscriminately,

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	٢
na na ann ann ann ann ann ann ann ann a	
.ithicky, to little to a common to it is	
ក្នុង សម្ពេចនៅការស្រាស់ ប្រធាន នេះដី ស្រែស្រាស់ សមាស្រាស់ សមាស្រាស់ ស្រាស់	**
ాా కళ్ళి ఉంది. అనేక క్రిట్ కళ్ళికేంద్రం కళ్ళి ఉంది. కళ్ళి క	-
The set of the control of the contro	( <b></b>
and the state of the state of the party of the state of t	•
్, క్ ఆంఞ క్ కూడా అం⇔ా ఉమ్ ⊶ు ఎట్క ఈ కట్డానుక్క శ్రీంచింది.	
at with the approximation of the Language Committee and the committee of t	,
•Pinalite of way to the above of one so this by.	r
The Automotion of the allocations of the second second second	
មិ សម្រា <b>មួយ នៅ ១</b> ៤៩៨ ១៩៩៨ គ្នា ២០១៩ ១៩១៩ ១៩១៩ ១៩១៩១៩២	
ಾಮಿನ ಬಸ್ಕಾರಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಔಚಿತ್ರಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಕಾಡಲಿ ಆಗಾ ಹೆಚ್ಚುತ್ತಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಅತ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆ	· .
್ಕಿ ದಲ್ಲದವೆಗಳನ್ನು ಅಥವಾಗಿ ಮಾರ್ಚಾ ಫ್ಲಿಕ್ ಕ್ಲಾ ಮಾರ್ಚ್ ಫ್ಲಿಕ್	٠,
Harmon Communication of the Co	• • •
	Ÿ
And the state of t	r ·
and the second of the second o	
ನಾರುವಾಗಿ <b>ಪರಸ್ಥ <del>ಕರ್ನ</del> ಕಟ್ಟಿಸುಗಳಿದ</b> ಇದರ ಕರ್ನ ಕರ್ನ ಅವರ ಕ್ರಾಪ್ರಿಸಿಕ ಕರ್ನ	~.
non Winter I have not be greated to the first of the state of the stat	
	**
solution of the state of the st	
unamento de la composición del composición de la	<b>:</b> :

but I don't see the crisis of the dam breaking to the extent that I hear. When you have got several hundred thousand cases in an eight-year period, and you've only got 202 cases that have been sealed, it doesn't really appear that the judges have rushed forward to say, "I'm going to seal everything that enters my courtroom."

MR. DONALDSON: It's not the judges that are going to be doing that, either, Your Honor. What I'm concerned about is that now that this practice has been recognized and now that it is occurring, that it is going to spread. More and more you are going to see this sort of request for sealing, and there are no -- there are no provisions in the rules at this point that -- that control the Court's discretion on that.

And, frankly, if the judge is given a case in which the parties come in and say, "Well, Judge, if you will agree to seal this, we'll settle it and it'll be another case off of your docket," there is nothing that -- there is no real incentive for the Court to keep it on there.

JUSTICE COOK: Well, I was just

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

$(1+2) \cdot (1+1) \cdot (1+2) \cdot (1+2$	.1
and the street of the street o	
to begin to the all units and and sale set units a const-	#
್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಶಿಕ್ಕಾರಿ ಶಾ ಅಂಟ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಸಂಕರ್ ಶೈ.ಎ. ಶಾಗ ಅಧ್ಯಕ್ಷ ಕಾರು ಸಂಕರ್ಣಕ	•
ကာလိုသီး ရှိသည်။ ကာလ က ရည် လူ့လုံးလုံးသည် ကာလေးကို လုံးသည်။ လုံးသည် လုံးသည်။	
to the second of	-
"• Power was gue assumed and allegations of the	:
a subjected to a subtance of a tank three . A	
and the control of the second	
ಕ್ಷ ಸಹಾಮಿಕ ಎಸ್ಸರಕ್ಕಾಗಿ ನಿವರು ಸಂಗಡಕಾಗಿ ಸರ್ವವರ	
TANK OF CASES OF SOME SOME OF BUILDING STATES OF SEC.	
ារ ប្រាប់ថ្ងៃ ១៩ ១៩ ១៩ ៩១៩១ ខ្លែក ខ្លែក ១៩ ១៩ ១៩ ១៩ ១៩	
The second of th	•
ကက် မေးသ ဝင်က သွားသည်။ ကြို့ကိုကို နေ့ သည်။ သွားသေး သွားသည့် အင်္ကာသည့်သည်။ ကြို့ မေးကြာလုံ	
នាប់ដែល ប្រទេស សុខជាក់ ការ៉ា ខាងប្រើសុំក្រុម ប្រទេស ស្ថិតិ	
್ಟ್ರಿಸ್ ೮ ಆರೂ ನಿರ್ಣಕ್ಷಣ ನಿರ್ಣಕ್ಷಣ ಹೆಚ್ಚುಗಳು	,
•6:11 de 3 <b>3</b> 12 e • 1.00	,
នយុទ្ធ ទី ២១ភាព ១៧៩ នៃ « ្រុងជានេះ ១ » ជា។	
សាល្រាល់ពីពេក្ស ការ 🔊 ប្រើដែលក្បាស់ 🤲 និងកែក ស្រួនប្រាស់	
$({ m ch}^{-1})^{(1)}$ . The $({ m ch}^{-1})$ case is a left brown LH in $({ m ch}^{-1})$ . $({ m ch}^{-1})$	٣,
est, anderville in the 2 to an ever do a	••
TO BOUND HE SOUTH CONTROL OF OUR TO THE WORLD FOR THESE	
and in and not seed had the own needs of the	~

and the second of the second o

concerned because you gave the impression that this was something that was going on on a wholesale basis, when statistically, you have got less than one in a thousand cases being sealed.

MR. DONALDSON: I understand your concern, Your Honor. Let me -- let me put it this way: If this issue -- if the possibility of obtaining sealing is as -- in particular cases -- is as easy as it appears to have been in the 202 cases that were outlined -- and it appeared -- the impression that I got from reading the <u>Dallas Morning News</u> information is that the process has accelerated.

As a defense counsel -- and I have been a defense counsel on many -- in many different cases -- I have to wonder whether it's malpractice not to seek a sealing order admitting cases, and if that's the case, we're going to see more and more of these cases, and it's helpful now for the Court, instead of having to deal with it on a case-by-case basis as they might come up to this Court, it's more -- it's more reasonable for the Court to deal with it now by rule and set everything out

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

•

.. **r** 

7.7

· ·

Ç. -

50

THE STATE OF THE BOOK OF THE STATE OF THE ST

The filters and the mean of the control of the cont

2000 కుండు ఆాట్ కొడ్డు దేశాలు మంది అంది అంది అంది. కా కొడ్డకుండా ఎక్కు కుండు కొక్కాడుకు కోట్లు కాట్ చిల్లు కొడ్డింది. అ కా కొండు కొట్టు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కాట్లు కొడ్డింది. అ కా కొట్టు ఉంది. అది మీది మీది కోట్లు కోట్లు కొట్టు కొంటు కుండు కుండు కొట్టు కొట్ట కోట్లు ఉంది. అది మీదికి కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కొట్టు కోట్లు ఉంది. మీది కోట్లు కోట్లు కొట్టుకుండి. కా కోట్లు కోట్లు కూడి కోట్లు కూడి ఎక్కు కోట్లు కూడి కోట్లు కోట్ల

The state of the s

tions of the live in the first of the sections of Affire as a

and make sure it doesn't become an epidemic problem.

JUSTICE COOK: Well, one of the earlier speakers mentioned specific examples. It was clear in some of those cases there were reasons why these files probably should not have been sealed, but I don't see the epidemic proportions you're talking about. And the statistics you have given us do not show year-by-year increases. Moreover, like I say, you've got an eight-year average of one per thousand. You know, that's -- that's not really a very large percentage.

MR. DONALDSON: Well, all I can tell, Your Honor, is that that's the results, and we're looking at one county in one location over a fairly lengthy period of time.

JUSTICE COOK: It's -- it's a representative sample, I think.

MR. DONALDSON: And I don't know -
I don't know exactly the number of cases per

year, but the impression that I have received is

that it is an accelerated process, and --

JUSTICE SPEARS: It would be better for us to go ahead and establish some standards

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

. . . . .

Grant the there is not a second of the	•
	,
• · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
ell la le element divin tem un	
<ul> <li>Programme the body of complete and programme of the complete and compl</li></ul>	•
change of about bedails to courts and somethings as	į
the later of the later to the later and the second of the second	-A
${f o}$ ${f i}$ , ${f o}$ ${f o}$ ${f i}$ ${f o}$	·• ·
ನಾಗಿ ಹಾಡು 🧸 ಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಇದಕ್ಕೆ ದಗ್ಗೆ ತಾಲ ಗುಣ್ಣ ನಂತಿ ಹೆಚ್ಚು ಕಟ್ಟ	
is a committee to apply the transfer of	
ుందుడ్ లోన్ని ఇందార్ అంది. ముందు రవాంధాన్ ఇంది ఈ అ	
သူမွာ မောက္သုိက္ မေျပာလည္း သူမရွိေတာ့ ကုန္းမွာ တြင္း တြင္း တြင္း	r
ាស៊ី ក្រុង សិក្សា សុំពីភូស៊ីស៊ី 🗝 សុវី១ ក៏សី សូវ សូវី <b>ស្ថ</b> ី 🕡 ស្តេចសុវុស ក	<b>*</b> 4
မ္မာ္လည္း ႏွစ္ႏွစ္ႏိုင္း သည္လည္း ႏုိင္းသည္လုိင္း သည္လည္း ႏွစ္ႏွစ္ႏိုင္း သည္လုိင္း သည္လုိင္း သည္လုိင္း သည္လုိင္း	
ರಕ್ಕೆ ಆಡಲ್ಲಿ ಎ.ಜ ಒತ್ತಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಕಡೆದೆ ಎ.ಜ ,ಎಲಗಡನ್ ಇಂಗಾಸ್ ಇಟ್ಟಿಕೆ ಮ	• !
្រុំ និងសេវាស៊ី ស នៅ ប្រាស់ មេ ស្គាល់ បាន ប្រជាជាប្រការប្រាស់ មេ ស្គាល់ បាន ប្រធានាធិបាន ប្រធានាធិបាន ប្រធានាធិប	•. ;
<ul> <li>Alice Da Partas Mullipse : gittint de texto</li> </ul>	£. 1
the state of the property of the state of	1
. Minimum of the company of the company of	1
emme do ation tale de la companya d	~, ·
ರವರ ಗರ್ಚರ ಮಾಗು ಸರಾಜಕಾಣ ರಾಮಿಕ ಗಾಲಕಾಣ ಬಳಗಳು ಮಾಗುವುದಿ ಬ	ب
్ - ఈ లోకాటీని, ఎళ్ళి ఓ కోష్ట్ర ఉంటే. ఆంగ్రామ్ లోని ఎమ్గ ఇగా ఉంది.	
ార్ ముంది. ఇది గ్రామం అంది. కారణ్యములు మంది మంది కార్స్ కార్ మంది. మార్క్ మంది గ్రామం	e v
్షా కేమేళ్లు ఈ ఎం. <b>జల</b> ను జే <sup>క</sup> ్ ఉంది. మాయ్యాల్ కాస్త్రాణ్నార్లు	

r la mora du la comissi de en la comissión de especiencia.

;

now than to wait until it does, perhaps, reach epidemic --

MR. DONALDSON: Frankly, Your Honor,

I would -- I would like to have ignored this

problem and not have to deal with it, but I

don't think I can do it anymore.

JUSTICE COOK: I don't mind -
MR. DONALDSON: I think it's going
to -- I think it's going to affect us once
again.

JUSTICE COOK: I don't want to igore it. I have no problem dealing with it. It's just that the data that was presented, I felt, was inadequate and insufficient, because at the same time it was represented that, you know, the sky is falling.

MR. DONALDSON: Well, I apologize to the extent that Mr. Swindle's approach doesn't give the Court as much information as it would like, and unfortunately there hasn't been a study on the number of -- of cases that have been sealed over the entire state during the last few years, but I could -- just anecdotically I could say that --

JUSTICE COOK: 1981 through 1988:

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	r
and the properties that the more than	
$\sigma^{A}$ is the very large $T$ , $\sigma^{A}$	-
్ ఎక్కువి కాళ్ళాడ్డు కంటార్ చూరి చిత్రాక్టుడ్లు ఎక్క	
•ស ១០១១ ឆ្នាំ ១០ <b>ភព</b> ា ពេល ១៩៤៤	*
moment of the state of the stat	•
grading constitutions of the constitution of the con	
్రాణం ఉందా ఎక్కువకి కథిక్షామి. అన్నార్ ఉంది. ఉంది. ప్రా	,
	£.
	v ·
to \$70 (•2) to to two controls are the controls of the control of	٠- ,
COLORD DE CONTRACTO E LE COMPTE MASSE ANTONIO MARIO	ř
ting the second of the first of the second o	• •
and the state of t	· r
and the state of t	<b>,</b> "
of the contract of the contrac	<i>?</i>
$r_{ij} = 1$ , which is the first that the state of $r_{ij} = r_{ij} = r_{ij}$ . The state of $r_{ij} = r_{ij} = r_{ij}$	* .
to professional to the control of th	
non the substitution of the second control of the second s	
to the first seems to the second of the seco	^
enter de la companya	• •

was incorrect. I was assuming there would be at least as many district court cases as there are county court cases. There are a lot more district court cases, and so the number of one in a thousand is way out of proportion. It's probably one out of every 4,000.

MR. DONALDSON: That may be true,

Your Honor, but even in that situation, the type

of -- the number of -- the type of cases being

sealed may have different merit.

There are some cases that are of extreme importance. The Edgewood -- the Kirby case, the school finance case, for this court to consider, that's a case of extreme importance, statewide importance. How many of those 202 cases may involve defective products? How many may involve professionals who have committed malpractice over and over and over again? How many of those involve matters that affect public health and safety? We don't know.

JUSTICE DOGGETT: Because they're sealed.

MR. DONALDSON: Because they're sealed. And it may be -- it may only take two

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

or three of those cases to affect thousands of people, and so --

JUSTICE COOK: You're generalizing again.

MR. DONALDSON: Yes, Your Honor, I am, but that's because I don't know.

Donaldson, do you see any constitutional considerations on the other side? This Court, two years ago, recognized a constitutional right to privacy. And in a case we had last year -- maybe this year -- regarding psychological testing under Rule 167a, an argument was made -- it was not in our opinion, but it was made by the attorneys -- that the constitutional privacy right was invaded when a court ordered psychological testing that would then be disseminated on the record.

Do you see that an individual who has private information that is not subject to sealing under this standard would have any constitutional argument that the State has, through the court process, invaded any constitutional rights?

MR. DONALDSON: Your Honor, I don't

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

1	believe so. I believe that in those
2	JUSTICE HECHT: No right no right
3	at all, or just not an overcoming right?
4	MR. DONALDSON: Not an overcoming
5	right. There may be instances where particular
6	situations may authorize a finding of compelling
7	need, and the basis for that might be a privacy
8	claim. But, I think, stating as a general
9	basis, does a constitutional right of privacy
10	exist that would stop any effort to produce
11	court records? No, I don't think so. There may
12	be a balancing that would have to be done.
13	JUSTICE HECHT: We have about five
14	other speakers signed up. Any other questions
15	of Mr. Donaldson?
16	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: This is
17	normally our time for a break. Does the Court
18	desire a break?
19	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: I would rather,
2 0	you know, move on and get through with it.
21	JUSTICE HECHT: We're getting down
22	to the end, I think.
23	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, go
2 4	ahead, then.
25	JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, Mr.

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

Control of the contro	
The state of the s	
A SAME SECTION OF THE	
ರ್ಜಿ ಆರ್.ಎಂಗ ಎಂದು ಗಟ್ಟಿಗಳಾಗಿ ಕಾರು ವಾರಾಕ್ಷಣ (** ***	
	•
THE PLANT OF THE SECTION OF THE SECT	7
Situates a la final Materia de des la la	
gradic los filas en l'especianos en la companión de la compani	
confort one dam we now the think the first of the	
g 19 క్రాజ్లో పా <b>ంద</b> ు కోయి మెఉక్కుడ్ కారు కార్యా కారణ కథలు కృత్తి	r
နေတတ္ကို ၃ ကိုမှ တော့လာလုိ ် အားကာ တိုက္၍တို့ ကိုမှာ မှ ကိုကို	
्षात्रे त्राक्षात्र व्यक्षात् । क्षाप्तात्र व्यक्षात्र्यः	
កកសេរ៉ាន់៖ អញ្ ភពនាំង។ ទួល។ 🕠 ១ ខែកញ្ច្រៃ លាខេត្តក្នុង ព្រះមាន	
ভা <sup>ন</sup> এইইটি 👍 চিট্টিটেড আন্তেম চিট্ডেড দুসম্পূৰ্ণ	<b>~</b>
ತಿಗಳಲ್ಲಿ ಗಾಲಿಕ ಗಾರ್ಡ್ .ವಿಲ್ಯಾಗ ಬರುಗಾಡಿ ೨೮ ವಿ ಇಕ್ಕಳಲ್ಲಿ ೩೮ ರಣ	
purse a material	•
្ធកាលស់ខែក្រុមវិសា ការប្រុស្សប្រាស់ព្រះប្រុស្សប្រុស្ស	`
•#% ಗಳ್ಳಿದ ಗಗಳುಬಳಿಕೆ ಸಲ್ಯ ಗಾಮಿ ಬಗ್ಗಳು ಸಂಗ್ರಹಗಳು ಕನ್ನು	,
প্ৰাকৃতি সংগ্ৰহ কৰিছে হৈ তেওঁ কৰিছে বিজ্ঞানীয়ে কৰিছে কৰিছে কৰিছে কৰিছে বিজ্ঞানীয়ে কৰিছে বিজ্ঞানীয়ে কৰিছে কৰিছে বিজ্ঞানীয়ে বিজ্ঞা	ř.
• tinks of the second	(3
And the second of the second o	'n

Constant Constant

Donaldson.

JUSTICE COOK: Thank you. I agree with you that we need to set standards. That does not bother me at all. It's just that I like full and accurate disclosure of information, as do the journalists.

MR. DONALDSON: Absolutely. Thank you.

JUSTICE HECHT: Tommy Jacks is next.

Mr. Jacks?

# TOMMY JACKS,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. JACKS: Members of the Court,
I'm Tommy Jacks from Austin. I am here this
afternoon on behalf of the Texas Trial Lawyers
Association.

I -- you have heard mainly from my friends today who are members of the Texas

Association of Defense Counsel. I think that

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	r
	b
and the second s	
2 demonstration of the second of the second of	
And the second of the second o	
	•
en la companya de la La companya de la co	
1,2 n - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 -	ş •
	t. a.
the state of the s	
ం. ఈ కారానం - ష్లా కట్మార్ కర్యా కర్యామ్ కారుక్కార్ కా	~ jr
Processors teams to a set automos estamble as	
Notice of the months in the months of the second	, t
in the second of	<b>ι</b>
	4 \$1
	, ,
Reserved (a) a i a i u a i a a a a a a a a a a a a a	4 * <b>*</b>
all open to a solate the angle of the post of the	٠,
The grow of the latest to the mean of the state of the st	
• 17 · · · :: : : · · ·	
	•
amort craft to the common to	

(x,y) = (x,y) + (x,y

this demonstrates to me that the issue we're
here about is not an issue of plaintiffs'
lawyers or defendants' lawyers. All of the
lawyers who are coming here before you this
afternoon are asking for your help because we
are being put in a very difficult position, and

it's becoming increasingly common for us.

As many of you know, I mainly represent plaintiffs in injury cases. My practice includes a heavy dose of product liability cases and medical malpractice cases, and these are two categories of cases in which information is increasingly becoming inaccessible to the public and the press, and it is a -- it is from that background that I speak.

There are other areas that some of you have raised in your questions that I don't have any experience or expertise in: adoption, family law, and so forth. And I'll be on very thin ice if I try to venture into those areas, but I would like to speak about the area I do know about.

I -- I come here sharing many of the ideals that have been expressed by those who represent the media, but I think it is not only

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

the state of the s to the Mitter . The terminal to the property of the first of the case of the property of the contract of the case of a passed along army one unlike a many or a Bard gratifical districts where not drap trace of a THE TOTAL CONTRACTOR OF STREET 1. - wintrus Townsaid Bogologic Composition of the Com The second metric of the Carlotter of the second ation has the color force, a reconstruction desired Reduced the domain of the province of the rest of the contract ٦, " กละพันธายน์ พระพรธ ซึ่ง ของประกอนสอบประทำประวาณ ยาม ครา The open to the establishment of the colors the same and the same and the contract the contract of \* **!**\* «សិស» ខេត្ត ប៉ុន្តាម ប៉ុន្តាម ប្រជាព្រះ ប្រជាព្រះ ប្រធានា ប្រធានា ប្រធានា ប្រធានា ប្រធានា 🛶 🕒 🕬 7. The property of the morning of the control of the control of -- F of modern the same tendent and the contract of the modern mentioned and the contract of the modern mentioned and the contract of the contract ,-- ,- ideals and a line, the market extension of the ^ [ normal and one of the same of the same and the same same of the sa ිර් සු මුතුම්බිති විසිට්ට කරන් සිටුවේ සුව සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුව F . ్తాన్నా కార్వం పాట్లో నాటు కుండికాన్ని మీదికి కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ క . 23.73 and the street of the street o

The same of the beautiful the parties of the same of

the media that have an interest. And in my background and experience, my first job as a practicing lawyer was with an organization called Public Citizen, in their Washington office. Tom Smith of that organization will

speak to you later today.

But one of the first cases I worked on was a case that involved the right of consumers -- it happened to be in the state of Virginia -- to be able to get information at the drugstore about the price of drugs. They were challenging a statute that prohibited the posting of prescription drug prices, and it was a case that eventually went to the United States Supreme Court, and addressed their -- the other edge of the two-edged sword of the First Amendment, that it is not only a right that protects the right of citizens to speak and the press to publish, but also the right of the public to know.

Now, I'm not here to suggest that this court should attempt to codify in rule form the bounds of -- of the constitutional right to know; I'm not here to suggest that you should codify in rule form the bounds of the common law

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

	••
en la	r.
The Arthon Sports of the Control of	~
# mid at whom of any win of the section	
Two manufactors of John Roy Mais, To the Late 1970	٠.
•39 az ೧೯೨೮ ಕರ್ನು ಅಂದರ್ಭ ಭ	
uther the common the same of	<i>:</i>
And the following with a standard notice to the standard	>
The Club Colt all the of wear of a gift for the manage	
క ఎం. జల్మికు కుర్మాణ్ ( ) కా తంది. అక్కా అంది. కి. ఈఈ ఆట్లు కూడా	
နေရန်က ကျွစ်းသည်။ နေလ ကာသာ မြန်က စာသုံး ကျေးမည်း ကြောက်သည် မည်	,
ការជា (១០) គ្រោះ មាន ប្រាសាធិ ១៩៩៩៩៩ ៣ កា ការប្រែក្រុម (១៩១	.,
ರ್ ರ ರವಿ ಶಿಕ್ಷ ಕಾರಾಗಿಗಳ ಆಗು ಅರಾಗಿದ್ದೇ ಅಕ್ಕಳು ವಿಶ್ವಾಗಿಕೆ ಬೆಳ	***
andod" bosta sold by family area of dod name is	•.
្នាល់ ព្រះ ប្រាស់ មាន ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រេក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក ស្រែក	
သို့သုံးကို ကြုံးကြောင့် ခြောင်းသည်။ မကျော်သည် ကြုံကြုံသည် မြို့သည်။	•
នាក់ដីក្រុស ក្រុសស្ត្រ ព្រះ ព្រះ ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុស្ស ប្រុ	· •
ក្រុម ខែ ខាង ១៩៩ភូមា ខ្លាំ ការសេស នៅការស្តី ស្រាស់ក្នុង ស្រាស់ក្នុង ស្រាស់ក្នុង	
್ಷ್ ಕ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿ ಅತ್ಯಾಕ್ಷ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿಯ ಕ್ರಾಂತಿ	
• Smile Circle	?*
នានារៈ គឺ នេះ សុទ្ធាតា ។ ១១ ១១១១ ១៩៩៩៩៩៩២ ខ្លាក់	<b>.r</b> .
man Dan Miller (1915) (1915) and the second of the second	?

ក្រុម ស្រុក ស្រុក ប្រទេស ក្រុម ស្គាល់ ស្រុក ស ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន សុខាធិន

of the process of the companies of the second contract of the contract of the

right of access to court records, although there is law there which is of interest.

1.5

I am here to say that I think at some times those of us who are most involved in this system forget that we are here as -- as the servants of -- of the people. These are -- the courts are the people's courts. The documents that are filed with the courts are the people's records, I believe. And it is the interest of the people in the administration of justice that is, I think, objective.

Justice Cook has asked some very probing questions about the extent of the problem. I don't have a survey that I can bring to you today, but I can tell you anecdotally, based on my experience, that in the past seven or eight years, I have noted increasingly the use of court orders to prevent the disclosure of information in which the public has a real interest.

In product liability cases, it is now the rule -- and I think Mr. Donaldson was correct in which he says -- when he says that defense lawyers worry about whether it would be malpractice not to -- to follow this rule -- but

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

•	71	1		* <b>P</b> *	::	•	$\cdot$ $_{G}$	,
			•	12 16				

នេះ ស្រី ស្រី និស្ស ១៩៩៩ <b>១៩</b> ៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩
Sometime as the form of a first of the first of the second
ರಾವು <del>ಕಾರ್</del> ಕಟ್ಟ್ ಕಾರ್ಗಟ್ಟ್ ಎಂದು ಸಂಸ್ಥಾರಕ್ಕೆ ಕೆಲ್ಲ ಆಗುತ್ತು ಕಾರ್ಗಳಲ್ಲಿ
ត្រូវ ព្រះបាន ខេត្ត ខេត្ត នៅ និងសេស ខេត្ត ប្រធានិក្សា ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេ
గు కొన్నారు. కోమ్ లాగా కా మహాగారు కుండి మండినుకు మీరు మరో కారుకు అక్కువే
in the respect would be that the second of t
The transfer of the model and the room required $m{e}_{i}$ , $m{e}_{i}$ , which is the room $m{e}_{i}$
• CW COOK CONTRACTOR OF THE CO

nr

. . .

; r

. .

# The time dept in market of a serve

ានីក្រើបស្រែកប្រាស់ នៅ និង ប្រាស់ ប្រាស់ និង ប្រាស់ ប្រែក ប្រាស់ ប្បស់ ប្រាស់ ប្រស់ ប្រាស់ ប

# in a connect into differ on any are

it is the rule that important records about dangerous products are routinely sealed.

Now, it arises in two settings, in my experience. The first, and the one with which I have far more familiarity, is the very common practice that's been noted of protective orders. Now, I want to talk about that for a moment, because protective orders, I believe, are being abused in our system nowadays.

It is -- and when I say we lawyers are here appealing for your help, we're there in an individual case representing an individual, and all we're looking out for is that individual. So if I'm approached by a defense lawyer proposing an agreed protective order, as long as it permits me the access to the information I need to handle my lawsuit, that's fine. I'm representing my client; that's all I'm there about, and I'm not going to look out for the public interest, quite frankly. I have got a lawsuit to handle, and I have got other lawsuits to handle, and I don't have time to fight about the intricacies of what should or shouldn't be sealed in any individual case.

Trade secrets have been mentioned

#### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

and the second of the second o	•
•"ex a ref to the street of a company	
na kandandan da	, ,
ក្រុងប្រជាពល ស្រីជា ប្រធានក្រុងប្រាស់ ស្រែកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុកស្រុក	
new reference out to the state of the second	
whiles $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , where $x$ is some interest of $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ for $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$	1.5
a reflective to the control of the state of the second and the	7.7
to collect the continue continue that collection is a continue to the collection of	
<ul> <li>បញ្ជាប់ជាបាលនេះ ១០១៩១៩១១១១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩១៩</li></ul>	
and the state of t	A 7
and the second of the second o	, <b>*</b>
, the distribute $oldsymbol{a}$ and $oldsymbol{a}$ and $oldsymbol{c}$ and $oldsymbol{c}$	<i>.</i> •
្នាស់ និងស្រាស់ នេះ ប្រែក្រុម ខេត្ត ប្រែក្រុម ប្រុស្ស និងស្រាស់	-
our show a good stoom only the following twinter	٠.
នេះ ស្ត្រាប់ទេខ បានទី <b>មិបក</b> ស៊ី ទេ២ ប៉ុន្តា ប្រធាន ស្រុក ស្ត្រី ប្រធានសម្រាប់	r
ర్మాల్లో అంది. ఎక్కువలర్ ఉన్న అంది కాండి కాండ	** 1
ក្នុងស្នេង ខ្នាក់ មាន ១០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០០	$\nabla T$
న రాజ <b>ి</b> మాగు <b>క</b> ాణికు కొన్నాయి. అనితారుందారు చెల్లని ఉంది.	r
្សិស្ស ដល្លាស់ នៃ ក្រុង ៤៦ សុខ ៤៦ នេះ នេះ និង នេះ ស្ដ្រីសាល្ស ស្ត្រីការប្រ	٠.:
ests " englighert) und bereichte mehr geliche so	٠.
the same state of the first of the state of the same state of the	e
which is the company of the second property of $(a,b)$ , $(a,b)$ , $(a,b)$ , $(a,b)$	Ca Ph

A decided and the following of the following

್ಯ ಅದ್ಯಾಪ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

here, and I will tell you that if there is anything that's abused in the protective order system that we have today, it is the abuse of what are called trade secrets.

I handled a case a couple of years ago that involved a medical device, a medical device that is used in every operating room in this state every day. In that case, there was a protective order entered into, and thereafter -and this is an example; it's not the only one I could give you -- every piece of paper that came in response to discovery was stamped "Confidential." Now, that included things such as sales brochures that were handed out to doctors in doctors' offices around the country. It included literature that was sent to their sales forces in the field. It -- it -- it included things that, in other words, clearly were not properly confidential. Now, if I had wanted to, I could have gone to the Court and said, "Now, Judge, they're abusing this. things aren't confidential." I'm not going to do that. I have got a lawsuit to handle. I'm a busy man. I don't have time to protect the public's interest. I don't have time to see

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

3

the company of the control of the co ಾರ್ಟ್ edd ಇವರ ಕ್ರಾಫ್ ನಿಲ್ಲಾಸ್ ಮಾರ್ ಮುಂಗಳು the state of the s The mark of the course of Asian Con-The Second Carly Control of the Control of the temperature of the Control of the ా మూడా కామిళ్ళ కార్జ్ చేస్తే ఇక్ కాట్లా ఉంది. ఈ చేస్తున్న on modificate design of the special problem in the contract of the o the Most publicate High for a median about Mississian T a secondary of the first the second of the s r r They are the control of the control of the control of Court against to wheat his to the court of t ora ino reference and the telephological columns : r out in lookand allieth around it doublette Fig. of dans the cold confined to contide ాడికి 🖛 కి.మీ 🖚 కోస్ 🤳 గుమ్మ్ ఉన్ని ఆట్ ఉంది. 💉 గ్రామం 77 ្នាន់ ស្រាស់ មួយសេចស្តេច ស្រង់ ស្រង់ ខេត្តក្រឹក ស្រាស់ ១៩ សេសសេស ſ and the telegraphic contraction are the proceedings of the ; one to the colored of the colored and the colored of the colored o \* .. The Control of the State of the 100 文章 (1987年) 1985年 (1987年) 1984年 (1987年) 1985年 (1987年) 1987年 (1987年) 1987年 (1987年) 1987年 (1987年) 1987年 (1987年) en en la compania de la compania del compania de la compania del compania de la compania del compania de la compania de la compania del compania de la compania de la compania de la compania de la compania del compania and a statement of the second 1966年,1967年,1966年,1968年,1966年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,1968年,19 . .

that everything is scrutinized as it should be.

-3

These orders, generally, are entered into by agreement. Sometimes they are contested, as you know, but more commonly by agreement. And the result is that those records, in which I submit the public has an important interest, never see the light of day. The vast majority of those cases end up being settled, and that's the second setting in which

the sealing of court records becomes a problem.

The -- it is increasingly commonplace that defendants insist as a condition of settlement that either the entire file, or all the discovery records on file, or all the exhibits on file, be sealed, and that the attorneys return their copies of all those records to the manufacturer from whence they came, and the whole case is -- I mean, it's "poof"; it disappears. It's like it never happened.

And, again, we're talking about products, be it cigarette lighters or heart valves or restraint systems in automobiles, that affect the lives and health and safety of thousands of people.

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

The Month of the Community of the Commun	
git is some being a committee that is the contract of the contract of self-of-	••
An exploration of distributions of the energy of the second process of the energy of t	
An experience of the contract	-
And the project of the controver access to the model of the control of the contro	
The first construction of the construction of	
define the numbers of the standard of the stan	,-
The state of the part of pools and the second secon	¢.
The state of the s	,
A CHI THÉ BÀ CHO L'ARCAIN HONG TO HAR HOND  DI TROL DIR HOND DE CHA MUNDE SERVICIO DE CHA DE  DI TELLITE RE LA DICTO HENDE SE L'ARCAIN DE CHA DE  STITU LA LICE ROCAL DE CHARLES DE L'ARCAIN DE CHARLES DE  DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE L'ARCAIN DE CHARLES  L'ARCAIN DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE L'ARCAIN DE  L'ARCAIN DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE  L'ARCAIN DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE  TORRES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES DE CHARLES  TRANSITION DE CHARLES D	Ç r
Distriction of the second of t	, (** **
The state of the mention of the tension of the state of t	<i>e</i> 4 <i>e</i> 5
STOCK LAND OF DEPONDENCE OF THE STOCK BUT TO SERVICE OF THE SERVIC	• .
<ul> <li>១៩៩ ២០០០ ខេត្ត ១០០០ ខេត្ត ១៩០១០ ១៩៩៩១០ ១៩០១៦ ១៩១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១ ១៩០១៩១១២ ១៩០១៩១១៩១១២ ១៩០១៩១២ ១៩០១៩១២ ១៩០១៩១២១២ ១៩០១៩១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១២១</li></ul>	~ ;
The first same of the contract	
<ul> <li>Charles and the control of the control of</li></ul>	•. ;•
ు కాటు కొన్నాయిత్రం కోంటు ఎందుకూడా కృష్ణ కొన్నాయి. అది కొన్నాయి. ఈ కోంటు కోంటు కోంట్ కోన్నాని కాటకోంటుకు ఇందికాడాకు ఇందినాని కోళ్ళా కోంటుకు మూడకి తక్కు ఎక్కువిడాగా కొన్నాయి. మారామ్ కాటన్ను తందిత్తున్నాయి. ఈ కృష్ణ ఎడికి మారక్కువి కాటు కొత్తారు.	t t
• కొట్టి కిందా కోస్కు కిందా కొంటి కొంటి కోట్లు కొంటి కోట్లు కొంటి కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కో కోట్లో కోట్లు కోట్లు కొర్కింది. అందికే అని మాక్రామ్ మక్కి అది కాట్లు కూడికి మామ్రిక్ కాట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్	· .*.
ింగా కొండా కొం కొండా కొండా కొ కొండా హింది కొండా కొ	*
ాగా కార్ ఈ కాండానికి ఉన్న పోయాలు కార్స్ కొర్ది అంది. మాగాఖ కాండాన్ ఈ మాగ్రామ్ ఈ క్రామ్ కార్స్ కాండ్ మార్క్ కాండ్ అ	* * * *
్ గ్రామం కాండ్ స్త్యాన్నాయి. అన్నాయి. కాంట్రాముకోవి కాంట్రామం కాంట్లో	££
	· ·
	: 4
	я.,

Section 18 Section 18

I will concede, Justice Cook, that I think the number of cases, if you look at it system-wide, in which sealing orders are entered or in which even protective orders, although more commonly employed, are entered, is an infinitesimally small fraction of the total caseload. But I will also submit to you that if you were to develop a scale between the importance of the issue to the public and more -- and the likelihood that the information will be concealed from the public, that the problem takes on greater proportions.

If you look at 133,000 cases filed in county court, or a like number filed in district court in Dallas County, that's going to include divorce cases, automobile wreck cases, worker's comp cases, and a vast array of other cases, in which, frankly, the public doesn't have any burning interest.

JUSTICE COOK: My point was --

MR. JACKS: Yeah.

JUSTICE COOK: -- it was --

MR. JACKS: Yes.

JUSTICE COOK: The impression was given the number was somewhat larger.

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

	Γ
ជនិក្សាស្ថិត ក្រុម ប្រាសាស (Minimus) មាន ប្រាសាស្ត្រ ប្រើជាក្រុម ប្រែ	
్యార్జులు ఉంది. కారక్రణ సంగా ముంది. మంది కోటి ఈ మండి కార్యాడ్లు ఇ	,
diverti a gree ro i vidure e mono inite mi po	•
	٠
్రాహ్ ని ఎమ్మీ ఓం గుం చేసేతంగా మీ కనిగ్నా కార్టు ని క్షామ్ కి ఎక్కుడనే ఉంది	**
Note that the description of the contract of t	••
ుమున ముఖ్యమన్ల కి కృత్ కుట్ కా <b>ప</b> ట్టింది. ది. మందుకు మాముక	•
noidh a dhni - dd daid seodhachta a an 15 ge	6 J.
ఎక్కే కోడం మీ ఇంటి ఏటింగు కున్న అంటని కుండా కాయిందు. కోర్ కోతం	ŗ-
•គ្នាស្រុ <b>ជាជាលាក់</b> ជាញ ៤០៧ ក្រុងស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស ស្រុស្	ŗ
positi nemas eenganni en isek men an	• ~
ul losib votuma lill a po (s m m cyman g)	۴. ۴
្នា ក្នុង ក្រុម នៅជាធ្វើជា «ស្លាប់លាក់ ស្លាប់លាក់ ស្លាប់លាក់ និងស្រាក់ នៅក្នុងក្រុម និង ប្រកាស	ŗ
್ರಾರ್ಥ ಸ್ಥಾರ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ್ ಕ್ರಾರ್ಡ ಕ್	ï
n Solar - Normal and a district of the second of the secon	1 <b>%</b> - ee
film of the day wild or drown . Into we special	r
•១៧៣ ១៨១៤ មុន ១១៨០ ៣១៦ ១ <del>៣</del> ២ (	•
	, .
	È,
ener company of the energy of the property of the company of the c	A.S.
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	÷
గారం కుండింది. అందినా ఉంది. మర్గార్ మార్గా	r
• I to the Mark to the section of the	

2

3

•

5

U

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. JACKS: And -- and -- and I

don't think it's a problem of numbers. I don't think it's a problem of numbers if you are

looking at it system-wide. I do think it is a

problem of numbers if you look at a particular

category of cases: product liability cases. I

have not handled a product liability case in the

past three or four, five years, in which there

has not been a protective order entered that has

resulted in the sealing of documents filed with

the court. Now, I'm not saying in every one of

those cases that the entire court file has been

sealed. I am saying that in every one of those

cases, there has been a protective order

entered, and it is in those cases, I believe, a

very serious problem.

JUSTICE COOK: Well, will this correct that problem?

MR. JACKS: Well, it won't. And that's -- you've asked and Justice Gonzalez asked about particular comments about the rule, and I would like to turn to one portion of the rule and talk about concerns I have with it.

I'm talking now about the John McElhaney draft that is before you.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

and the state of the surface of the state of of all the driver of the second specific of the second in the second of The same as the contract of th the sale acceptance of the property of the sale of the 7 ా ఓ ఓ్రోట్లీస్ అన్న కార్యాల్స్ కారుకు కృత్వారికి ఉంది. కిల్లీస్ కార్యాల్స్ కార్యాల్స్ కార్యాల్స్ కార్యాల్స్ కిల్లీస్ B(x) = B(x) + C(x) +POST DELMI CERT DE COMPANION DE LA COMPANION D ί, " and the company of the state of the company of the state names and this during error (12 John 1977) which is . . . State of the control 7 5 or governood to a serve thought to the to me govern at \*\* . To lar mentions into AND A COMMENT OF STRONG PORT OF A 1. E

The diese in diship decision

and the state of t e 5 - 40

The section of the first of the overest of the ುವಾಗಗಳ ಕ್ರಮಿ ಬಿಂದಾರು ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಮಾಡಿದ್ದಾರೆ. ಇದೇ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿ ಕ್ರಮಿಸಿಸಿ or the relation one of error of with them of the . . and the first the state of the first field and the There is a said to the control of th

A Marie Company of the Company of th

JUSTICE COOK: Other than the document which I read this morning, which was going to be read to us, it doesn't mention products liability. It refers to drug abuse, for instance; malpractice, divorce, dissolution of professional partnerships --

MR. JACKS: Well, I would suggest that it may be, because no plaintiff's lawyer in his right mind will file a products case in Dallas if he can avoid it, and so I'm not sure -- I'm not sure how good the example is.

But I would invite the Court -would invite the members of the Court over the
coming weeks to talk to the lawyers you know who
do this kind of work and see if what I'm telling
you my experience is comports with theirs, and I
think you will find it does.

And the part of the rule that I would like to comment on in particular is the definition of "court records and its exclusion of discovery documents" from the definition of "court records," because in the product liability cases that I'm talking about, that's where all the gold nuggets are that are to be mined that would be of use to the public.

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

graph of the model of the property of the state of the s	
and the second control of the second control	~
ស្តាត់នេះ ១០ ស្តីការ ១០១១ ខែ 🕳 ស្ត្រស្នាន់ ១៩២០១២ ១០១២ ១០១២១១	••
ត្រូវប្រាស់ក្រុម ប្រុស្ធារ ស្ដេចប្រែក្រុម ប្រុស្ធារ ប្រុស្ធារ ស្ដេចប្រុ	ì
na viminos 11 guarante grafitata a filo qui una 🙌	
កក់ ឧស្វាល់លេស មន្តិការប្រភពព័ត្ត ស្ពាល់ ដូច	14
and give summer to a light of them.	<i>t.</i> •
ການ ກ່າງປາດ ເພື່ອໄດ້ໃນ ການສະຕິດ ຄົນ ການປະຊາຊາດ ເພື່ອການ ປະຊາຊາດ ເພື່ອໄດ້ ສັດຄຸນຕົວ	
a noso wind on the first of the property of	*1
the state of the contract of the contract of the contract of	e r
· I all all the second the second of the sec	<i>:</i> ·
⇔ಗ ವಾಡ <b>ಾರ್. ಅ</b> ರ್ವ ಅರ್ಗಳಾಗಿ ಅಂಪಗ <b>ಾಣ</b> ೆ ಗಳುತ	٠ <u>-</u>
ರಾಂ.ಕೆ ಗಡುಕುತ್ತಿಕ್ಕಾಗ್ ಟ್ಟಿಕ್ E ಗ್ರಾಪತ್ನಿಗಳು, ಅನ್ನಕ್ಕಿ ಕರ್ನ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಪಾಕ್	
្រុក សុទ្ធារា សុខការ បញ្ជាក់សុខ ១៤៣ សុខ ស្គាល់ ១៨ សុខ្មែល ១៩ ១៩	٠
The said of the first action with the said of the said	<b>r</b> ,:,
్ ఇం గ్రామంలోని మార్గు కున్నారి. అంది కాటుక్కువ గార్గా ఉన్నారి.	
*	i
to the figure of the state of t	۳
in the contract of the contrac	•• •
n fam <b>e</b> ne da familia en	ى ز.
In $a$ No. 1.755 of the Group Masses of $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$ , $\epsilon$	<u>r</u> ,
ရေး က မရာ က ကို ရုံး တက္ကေလာက္ပါ <sup>(†</sup> ရုရုံးသည် ရရွင္ (၁) ရေ	
The two material families of any one of the first	
programme grant with the restaurance	<i>7.</i> 6
in the state of th	

2

3

5

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Now, you know the distinction is made in this rule about whether discovery documents are filed with the court or are not filed with the court. Well, now, you all know that till some recent rules changes you've made in the past few years, they were all filed with the court, and it was not because this court suddenly decided that those records had any -were of any less importance to the judicial process that they weren't filed with the courts, because the clerks didn't have room to put them anywhere.

The cost and the expense of storing documents necessitated changes in -- in Rules of Civil Procedure so that depositions were no longer filed at the time they were -- the Instead, they went transcripts were typed up. to the lawyer who asked the first question, and that lawyer was charged as being the custodian of those depositions until the time for the case to come to trial.

When -- until only a few years ago, interrogatory answers were filed with the court, responses to requests for production of documents were filed with the court, and a

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

property of the substitution of the property of the second	
dominate to the white the control to the control of	· 4
o the preference of the contraction of the design of	•
ing the state of t	
States in the amount of a large contraction of	970 1
in π. τημείου του είναι είναι είναι είναι με π. Δ. δ. δ. δ. δ. δ. δ. σ.	
nangatan ing pagamanan nangan nan Pagamanan nangan na	Ç
entre production of the first section of the sectio	ev .
na de la companya de La companya de la co	
	**
្លាក់កាក់កាត់ ដែល នា <b>រាជ្ញា (១</b> ៤) កា កា ១៤៦ ខ្លួន ប្រភព ខេត្ត	
an de de de la companya della companya de la companya de la companya della compan	
an amor hashe raph of the arm of elements	•
	•
ా కాండ్లో ఉన్ను హోగాహ్ కాండ్లో ఉన్న ఉన్నాయి. ఈ కాండ్లో ఉన్నాయి. మంద్రి మాట్లు మంద్రి	,**
out and door, do to a to allow the groups of the	,
ព្រះ និងស្រែស្រាស់ ស្រាប់	·
nako sud sun ingalik galik galik na unu kun kanan na	•
. గ్రామం లో ఉంది. అంది. అంద	ŗ
요 : 동 : 사 : 한번 시조는 : 사 : ## : 사 (청중선 <del>#***</del> ) 200 년	:
Limet 1970 (1875) on the company of the second	۲,
An architecture of the second second second	•
ing and the state of the state	<del>;-</del>

policy decision has been made -- and it's one with which I do not quarrel -- that the -- the expense and trouble of keeping up with those records should fall to the officers of the court, the lawyers, rather than to the clerks, who have limited budgets and limited space.

But there is no question at the same time that we hold those documents in our custody as officers of the court. And certainly I think any court would take a dim view, for example, if -- if lawyers who were the custodians of -- of these records tampered with them, did devious things with the records. They are the court's records, still. We're simply the ones who have custody of them until the day when they are needed.

It is in these documents in the depositions that are taken, in the documents that are produced by manufacturers, that the information that the public should have a right of access to are concealed.

JUSTICE COOK: So you are saying the bill really hasn't addressed the main problem?

MR. JACKS: I am saying it has not addressed the main problem, and I am saying that

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

ina india mendia di salah s	-
n sain <del>man</del> a ang at ang at a <del>n m</del> anananan ang at	•
ရာက္လုိ၍ သက္သည္။ သည္သည္သည္သည္ သည္သည္သည္သည္။ သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သည္သ	•
and in the BOA old of the graph stands	*,
kan di selaksi mada nada tampa ya gula da da gar	• •
.e⊑ ಸಂತ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಎಂದು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ರಿಯ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ	• A
n na till bligg den ligger bligg bligger	ĭ
ా. ఆంగుము <b>ల</b> గ్రామం గ <sup>ి</sup> జ్ఞ్ గ్రామం గ్రామం ఉన్నాయి. అది సంగ్రామం	<b>^</b>
on the contract of the dame. And surface to the later	
so part not subject to a line of the line of	; <u>,</u>
្រុម ប្រទេស ១០០ ខ្លាស់ ស្រីស្រី ស្រែក ១០១៦ ខ្លួន ១៩១៦៦ (១០១)	9.1
this game and the world to the second of the second	4.6
not the sale of th	
PORTERO MEDIA QUE ON ESCACA A VELLO EN ESCACA	·· •
•	
odli a - Lo apo comeda di el di	r
కార్యాల్లో ఉన్నటి కట్టు కూడా కోడ్స్ మూర్కాన్ని	:
ឲ្យដែលកាធារ៉ា សស្ <b>បស្កង</b> ធ្វាល់ស្នាល់ ប្រជាពិធី ស្រុកស្នា របស់ ស្រុកស្នា របស់ ស្រុកសង្គ្រាស់ ស្រុកសង្គ្រាស់ ស្រុ	
n de la compaña de participada de la compaña	2.5
* కాట ఎ <b>లంగు</b> న్నా నించి కాటా చిత్రింది. అంది. మంది కాటా చిత్రింది. అంది. మంది కాటా చిత్రింది. అంది. మంది కాటా చిత్రింది. అ	r·
$\mathcal{C} = \{ u^{\pm} g \in \mathbb{N} \mid over(u) \in \mathcal{C} \mid over(u) \in \mathcal{C} \}$ . With the state $u$	A
The Charles of the second of t	• •
series de dispair, a se la entro entro en	
na distribution de la servición de la companya de La companya de la co	

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the first thing I would ask this Court to do in any proposed rule is to see that discovery documents are included. Now, that's going to raise some practical problems. Two, in particular, I'll comment about.

There is another way in which information is concealed from the public besides the sealing of court records, and that is at the time of settlement there simply is an agreement entered into that all that information will be withdrawn from the court -- be it trial exhibits -- if it's a case that is settled during or after trial -- discovery documents, depositions -- so that they disappear from the public view, but not because the court puts them under wraps, but because the court enters an order saying that they can be withdrawn. the agreement is they all go back to the manufacturer so that they never see the light of day.

The second is that even in those cases where the -- there is no -- the records never have gotten filed in the first place, I submit that they still are public records, the people's records, the people's documents, and

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

;

and the first term of the first term of the second	۶
The testing of the second of t	
ರ ಇಸ್ಟರು ಗ್ರಾಮಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕ	٦
ri vart iva an our rabilla ly i cha entre	
• Park Control of the France of the State of	
the late of the company of the the	
months to a contract of the above of the above of	7
To do it they are one por James to yell so the	Þ
and the second of the second o	
on 1942 of translation is study of the other	<u>o r</u>
ువ్ర జీస్ నా <del>గాగా</del> మాడ్య టా గ్రామ్ సాన్రామ్ మూర్తార్లు	<u> </u>
in this case was a same of the first second of the	:I
selicandona grandonia em tabal do la moralmo	~ f
్ తా కి.ఎం.కారం కి.మీ.కి.మీ.కి కా కి.మీ.కి కారి <b>కి</b> ఉంది. <del></del> చాడకార్కి ఉంది.	. 'L
ాక గ్రామం <b>విజలు</b> లు నగ్రామ గుండుకుండి దిర్ణుకుంటే ఉంది. అంది కాటకుండి అంది.	•
្រុក ព្រះបានស្នាល់ ដោយប្រសាស្ត្រ (គឺ ១៦២ ១០ ១២៤) រូប ប្រធានិសាស្ត្រ (សេស្សសា	· r
్యాల్ ఎంటాన్ ఎక్కి కార్డ్	er r
that but to do a first post housing a second as for	r
్. ప్రవేశ్వమ్ కాటి కాటాండ్ కాటింది. అమ్మీ మెడ్డికి స్పూర్ అవిట్టారు.	
	n ja
్ కార్మం కార్మాయ్ కార్మాయ్ కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మా కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో కార్మాయ్లో	ĹĊ
n ve i ti un e sant e sen le van kenge	
ing the state of the state of the first and the second control of	m , <b>.</b>
in the second control of the second control	<b>.</b>
en e	

2

they are records to which the public should have access.

3

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Mr. Jacks, if we

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

our lawsuit.

24

25

do that, what effect do you think that's going to have on the settlement of cases? MR. JACKS: I think that -- when I say that lawyers from both sides of the docket are here asking for your help, it is because I think cases will continue to settle. I really do. Cases really settle because, in my experience in these cases, not because of the fear that information will be divulged, but because of the fear of what will happen when the jury returns its verdict. The -- I think cases

process at present. I'm representing my client, David Donaldson is representing his client, and neither of us is overly concerned about what information the public is going to have access to when we're up there on Monday morning ready

will continue to settle, but there is no one who

is representing the public interest in this

to pick a jury and we're talking about settling

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Excuse me. How is the court reporter doing? Do you need a

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

• Control of the cont	•
production of the state of the	<b>^.</b>
	•
	•
and the second of the second o	• •
protestation of the second state of the second	•
r io more en marco, que en porte de grande de la companya de la companya de la companya de la companya de la c	
$p_{ij} = \sqrt{12 - \omega_{ij}} \left( 1 + \sqrt{12 - \omega_{ij}} \right) = 1$ . The section of the section $i$	
TO SOUTH ONE OF THE CONTRACT O	, <del>.</del> .
nother is the end of the soul street of the second street.	<del>,</del>
	• •
$(\hat{x}^{\mu},\hat{x}^{\mu},\hat{x}^{\mu},\hat{x}^{\mu})$ , which is a finite of $\hat{x}^{\mu}$ . For $\hat{x}^{\mu}$ , $\hat{x}^{\mu}$ , $\hat{x}^{\mu}$	· r
kana - Zhorik jaliana ka kulos ka kana ka	, r
$\mathcal{Q}_{t}(x,y) = \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{y}{y} \right) + \frac{y}{y} \right) + \frac{y}{y} \left( \frac{y}{y} \right) + \frac$	÷
and the state of t	•
and the second of the second o	
••	

7

1	break?
2	THE COURT REPORTER: I will shortly,
3	to change paper.
4	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: But I meant
5	your hands and
6	THE COURT REPORTER: I'm getting a
7	little tired.
8	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, when
9	you change paper, we'll take about a 10-minute
10	break.
11	THE COURT REPORTER: Okay. Give me
12	about five to 10 more minutes.
13	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: All right,
14	sure.
15	MR. JACKS: The
16	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: I'm talking
17	about, you know, the
18	MR. JACKS: Yeah, yeah. I
19	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: the Pinto
20	cases, the Jeep cases, or the you know,
21	the that type of a case where where if the
22	industry knew
23	MR. JACKS: Yeah.
24	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: that these
25	documents were going to be given in every case

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

and there was going to be sharing of information --

MR. JACKS: Well, you see -
JUSTICE GONZALEZ: -- what they do

with the testimony --

MR. JACKS: They have already got that problem because of Garcia against Peeples; they've already got that problem. And -- and Garcia against Peeples was -- was very useful in solving one problem with the concealing of information, and that is that other victims who have a case against the same manufacturer were being deprived of information and therefore were having to go through the expense -- and it's expense for the administration of justice, too -- to re-invent the wheel every time. So that problem was taken care of by Garcia.

And -- and manufacturers, when they settle cases, are mainly worried about that, that it's going to go to other plaintiffs' lawyers in other suits. But they've already got that problem.

So I don't think that anything this Court does in seeing that information that I can give, when I settle a case to another

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

plaintiffs' lawyer, might also be accessible by a newspaper or public interest group or consumer association. I -- I don't think the incremental disclosure, in short, will dissuade people from settling cases.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: What about the size of settlement? In other words, sometimes their fear is that -- if the paper publishes -- MR. JACKS: Yeah.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: -- we gave a zillion dollars, you know, is it going to have an effect on other cases.

MR. JACKS: In some cases, it may.

I really think that part of what goes on when -when sealing orders are entered into, or
protective orders are entered into, though, is
out of inertia. I don't care enough to make
that big a fight of it.

But I can't think of a single case where I really believe I got more money because I entered into an agreement about what should be done with the court records.

I will say -- and Justice Hecht asked the question earlier: "Well, aren't you worried about this being used as a threat, that

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

					1	: '		
., .	<b>*</b> *	es:	en en en en en en en en				-,	,
. 7	• • •	.,		'l •****		. · · .		
. ^	Ç			2.7.44	et *	***		
		•				we was		
	drom in	1 2 1	~ **** * * : · ·	* <b>*</b> - 1 - <b>.</b> * + 2 - 2	<b>,</b> ,			
	1.20.00	we f		3	;;	. ~		
,,,,	institution of		i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i	man (* * )	·	· • •		
				<b>F4</b> · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
	) · · • · ·	T MADE ACCORD	8	· · · · · · · ·	· ••• •			
	or or	* ,		• • • •			÷	

Particles of Golden to the CL

The confidence of the companies of the

TELEVISION DE LA MENTE DE MANAGE EN BERT L'ARGER PORTE : R'ELL BOYS L'ARGER L'ARGER BANGE EN L'ARGER BANGE EN L'ARGER BANGE EN L'ARGER BANGE EN L'ARGER BROYS L'ARGER BANGE L'ARGER L'ARGER L'ARGER L'ARGER BANGE EN L'ARGER BANGE EN L'ARGER BANGE EN L'ARGER BANGE REPUBLIC L'ARGER BANGE L'ARGER L'ARGER L'ARGER L'ARGER BANGE L'

THE STREET OF THE CONTROL OF THE STREET OF T

records might be filed with the court to threaten the other litigant?" I would be equally worried if I really thought that bribery was going on where litigants were being paid to keep information from the public, but I don't -- I don't think it's that sinister.

I think it simply is that none of us is in the business of representing the public when the time comes to agree to that order. We are each in the business of representing our clients. But all of us, plaintiffs lawyers and defendants lawyers, think it stinks because we know what's in there and we know that it's information that the public has an interest in knowing.

And we believe, because we do take seriously our obligations to the system at large, that our courts are jeopardized when the public perception becomes that valuable public information is being concealed because high-dollar lawyers are entering into agreements and judges don't care enough to look behind them, because judges are busy, too, and they have got dockets that they have got to move and they sign agreed orders. It's that simple. And

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

1	that's why a rule from this Court, I think, is
2	needed, and I think it must include discovery.
3	There are a few other aspects of the
4	rule I would like to address, but if the it
5	would be a transition to a new subject, and if
6	this is a convenient time for the court
7	reporter
8	UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Yeah.
9	UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Go on break.
10	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: A good
11	time? Okay. We'll take a break till four
12	o'clock.
13	(At this time there was a brief recess.)
14	recess./
15	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Okay.
16	You're back. Is this a problem in other states?
17	Is it are we talking about a nationwide
18	problem?
19	MR. JACKS: Yes.
20	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Have other
21	states addressed this problem with any type of
22	rules or case law?
23	MR. JACKS: I don't know. I have
24	not
25	JUSTICE DOGGETT: Virginia has

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	en de transfer de la companya de la
	. The second of
	្រុក ប្រែក្រុម មេខាស្ត្រី ស្រុក ប្រជាព្យាធិបាន សមានក្រុម ប្រធ្វើក្រុម ប្រែក្រុម ប្រជាព្យាធិបាន ប្រធានាធិបាន ប
:	the term of the Market Burner of the second
	and design from words of topic entails with the second
	ನಿವರಾಕ ೧೯೮೮ ಕನ್ನಡದ ಕಟ್ಟಾರಿಗೆ ಎಂದು ೧೯೮೮ ಕ
rı	en en original de la company de la compa
	. n po™ o :NOT+ ™ o optoble en mom
	And the second of the second o
o i	A grant of the state of the sta
r, r	and the month of the state of t
· r	. to constant
,- e	loir . Bow orms a cold offers) f. 1992
t yr g∵r	• For the standard and the same of the sam
. <b>"</b>	్ ఎక్డార్లు కాడు కోడు కార్లు ఉన్నాయి. కారా ఎంట్ మెరకార్లు ఉన్నాయి. కారాలు
. 1 . 1.	ន ប៉ុន្តាសុខិត្តស ១ និម្មក្សនៈ ក្រុងស្រែង គឺស ខ្លួក កក្ស ប
r J	
٠.	
) n	and the contraction of the contr
r <b>(</b> *	enga yan dalam sambiga kelenderah samban samban.
Ph. Th	Control of the second of the s
	ನರ್ಗವಾಣ್ಯ ಅಗ್ರೋತ್ ಕರ್ಮಾಗಿಕ್ಕು
<b>4</b>	— · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

.

Solver to the second of the second of the second of

passed a statute this year dealing with some of 1 this, but it's -- and I could circulate copies 2 3 to you --CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: I wish you would, because I heard at a speech that we all 5 6 were at, I believe --7 JUSTICE DOGGETT: And Georgia has 8 passed a rule, but it's a much more narrow one than the one that John McElhaney is describing. 9 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Mr. Nader's 10 11 speech at the bar convention --12 MR. JACKS: Yes. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: This summer 13 14 he said that no state had yet responded to this 1.5 problem. 16 MR. JACKS: Well, I think that --CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: And I just 17 18 wondered if there had been some change, so that 19 we would have some --20 MR. JACKS: If that's an over-21 statement, I suspect it's only a very slight 22 It is -- but I have not done research to one. 23 be able to document that for you. I -- I, 24 frankly, intended to do more background research 25 on this issue before coming here today, but I

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

en e	г
The Robert Community with the community of \$100 and \$200 and \$200.	F-9
ent see	,
र पूर्व के प्रतिकृतिक प्राप्त के प्रतिकारिक प्रतिकारिक प्रतिकारिक प्रतिकारिक प्रतिकारिक प्रतिकारिक प्रतिकारिक	•
ರ ಗಳ ತಿನ್ನಿಗೆ ಗಡಲಾಕು ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಲಾಗಿ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸಲಾಗಿ	
mm swot o selector	
	r 14
are the month of the policy of the global value of the second	`
<ul> <li>to final call to make that a complete a case of the part</li> </ul>	
្រីទាក់ គ្រី 🐷 😘 💰 ស្រុកពេល ស្រុសពេល ប្រសិទ្ធ មានា 💢	
min and the state of the state	r
• With the second	4
குற துறை ஆட்டுத்து இருக்கு இரும் முறு நாக்கு இருக்கு கூறு	ŗ
ការ៉ា ព្រះ <b>ឲ្</b> ង នៅព្យុធ <b>ា</b> ការដូច គាល់ក្រុម ស្រី ភាពស្រែក ក្រុម ភាពស្ងា ស្រីការ ក្រុម	•
• 2 <sup>™</sup> <b>c</b> l.	٩
www.dowala.com.com.com.com.com.com.com.com.com.com	••
হা (চা) লি তেওঁ <b>:</b> গালেটিটোলে প্ৰতিক্ষা কৰিছে	<b></b>
ក្នុង។ គ្រា ខែ តា ៤៩ ១០១ <b>ជាក្</b> លា នៃ ខ្លួន <b>១១១១១១១១១១</b> ១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១១	,
m <del>m</del> serve (necessary)	
- revolute 11 Pill : 17 to 5. 12.	,
್ ಗ್ರಾಮಿಕ್ ಕ್ರಾಮಿಕ್	.*
ing the transport of the company of	2
v™ + m = v = v = v = v = v = v = v = v = v =	
Latinit (14) Colored Solve Solve Solve (15) Colored	5

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

J

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

have been a little occupied with one of the other branches of government in the last few weeks, and -- and I didn't get that done. But I -- I gather that research is being done.

I -- Justice Cook and I were chatting about some of the things I've been talking about during the break, and one question he raised was a very good one that I think is worthy of some comment. And he offered the opinion that perhaps the press might be more interested in some of the spicy details of a prominent person's divorce case than they might be about some dangerous product, and -- and there certainly is that chance. But I want to make clear that I don't think that we simply are talking about media access, because there are other groups. In this town, Consumers Union is a good example; Texas Consumer Association is another; public interest groups that have a sincere and continuing interest in the issue of dangerous products.

And this leads me to my next suggestion about this rule, and it has to do with how notice is given to the public that a litigant in a lawsuit at the courthouse is

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

And the second the second second second second	-
Maring the compact of	,
ការា - មេខ ១ ប៉ុន្តែ ១ ស្រី១១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១	.•
· And the first of the second	•
mamma en disko se de se een	
and the second of the second of the protest of the second	; •
ರು 'ದಿನ್ನಾಗಿ ಅವರ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ರಿಯ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್ ಕ್ರಾಮ್	•••
$(\mathbf{c}_{i}, \mathbf{c}_{i}, \mathbf{c}_{i}) \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$ , which is the $(\mathbf{c}_{i}, \mathbf{c}_{i}) \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$ . The $(\mathbf{c}_{i}, \mathbf{c}_{i}) \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$	
production of the contract of the production of	
the state of the s	,
data in the first of the second of the secon	
AND HE SHIP IS IN OUR TO SHIPME OF STATE OF	•
ti de i din 'at d' no . 'ut f vent l'	•
ా కా కుండాన్ని ఉంది. మంది మండి మండి మండి మండి కా అడుకుండు. అంది కాండ్రి	-
$oldsymbol{o}$ and $oldsymbol{o}$ and $oldsymbol{o}$ and $oldsymbol{o}$ and $oldsymbol{o}$	•
್ 4 ನಡೆಗಳು ಗ್ರಾಮಾಣಕ್ಕೆ ಕೊಂಡು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಕ	,-
ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ ကြောင်းသည်။ အသည် အသည် အသည် အသည်။	
ಗಳು ಮತ್ತು ಕೆಲ್ಲಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗೆ ಬಳಿಗೆ ಕೆಲ್ಲಿಕ್ಕಾರಿಗೆ ಅವರ ಕೆಲ್ಲಿಕ್ಕಾರ್ಯ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್	**
្រុស ព្រះ ប្រធានប្រជាពី ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្រាស់ ស្គ្	n
• tritanti (a. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1.	r
John Market er auf er eine er	
$\mathcal{O}_{\mathcal{O}}}}}}}}}}$	
and the standard of the standa	

ing for a small for the control of a control of the control of the

proposing that the court seal records. In the initial draft, which is the only draft I have had, the idea was you post the notice at the courthouse. I don't think that's very useful. I think it's a waste of time, and I gather that --

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: What do you propose?

I would propose the MR. JACKS: following: I don't think it would be burdensome for the district clerk in every county simply to maintain a list, and any member of the public, or any group, like Consumers Union, for example, that wanted to be on the list to get notice. And it could be the <u>Dallas Morning News</u>, or the American Statesman, but it could also be groups of the kind I'm describing who wanted to be on the list would get notice of the hearing that is the subject of this rule. So that notice would go not only to other counsel in the case, but if there were five public interest groups and three newspapers who said, "We'd like to get notice of these hearings, too," they could get notice, or their designated attorneys could get notice.

And the burden, in fact, would be

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

zazi 🐣	. :				, <b>*</b>	٠.	. <u> </u>	*1 *1	6 ១១ភ	
. · ** · * <sub>*</sub> · • •	: **	v . 1	ri.	6.1.	:	<u>f</u> . ∗		. 7.	nelliges.	
•	· ·:	. 1	10	i di di	s 2	. 347	•.		24.3 10	
										ì
ti iti	C	·	: 1		••	* nt**				
									mod e.	

Proposed of the world wash officed to a first ending of the control of the contro

్లు అడుగాణ చేస్తో కార్డ్ క్ కార్డ్ కార్డ్ క్రార్డ్ క్ క్ కార్డ్ క్ కార్డ్ క్ క్ కార్డ్

 $(x,y,y) \in \mathcal{H}_{p}^{\infty}(\mathbb{R}^{n})$  ,  $(x,y) \in \mathcal{H}_{p}^{\infty}(\mathbb{R}^{n})$  ,  $(x,y) \in \mathcal{H}_{p}^{\infty}(\mathbb{R}^{n})$ 

•

. .

Ţ

" T

~ <u>r</u>

' **r** 

٠,

ŗ

50

put upon the litigant who is moving for the motion to see that the list -- which is publicly available to him -- that the people on the list get noticed. It's not a burden on the system. Put the burden on the party seeking to have records sealed, and then it's up to the newspaper or to public citizens whether they want to show up or not.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Do we do that in any other type of lawsuit or any other setting?

MR. JACKS: No, we don't. And again we are dealing, Justice Gonzalez, I think, with trying to protect a public interest and access to information that is not -- is not going to be protected otherwise.

We do, in our administrative agencies, publish things in the Texas Register for public comment. Any time rule making is being considered, for example, matters of public importance, and -- and those settings are -- the public is made aware of them in a different way, but that's not practical for this branch of government for the courts to do, but I believe it is practical to give better notice than pasting something up on the bulletin board over

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

To the Transition of the Application of the Application (Application)	
the state of the second of the	
and the second of the second o	·
Section with an experience to a control of a section of a	
And the American State of the contract of the Additional Contract of the Ad	•
nud on the Park of the an quodosin a compt	-
	•••
i u la companya de la companya della companya della companya de la companya della	
The Model of the following Bullion walness with	· •
regional established committee and the committee of the c	<b>r</b> . /*
in the state of th	•
ကရာမည္မေျပး ေလးေသြားကလူရွိ ေတာ့လို ကတ္ေျခာက္ ကို အေျပးမွာ ေကာင္းမွာ	• •
al od gala dom of do. o dom of conficulty made a	
••• ఎక్. <b>మ</b> నిమింది. కాకింది చేస్తున	* <b>r</b>
ស្វាន់នេះ <b>ថ</b> ពី៣៥៧ ១ ១៩១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១ ១	~ r,
CIPLINGT SAMOT to a contrat of the contrat con	\$ <del>*</del>
ការប្រជាជាស្រុកក្រុម ស្រុកស្រួយ។ «កាលស្រុកស្រួយ។ ១ឆ្នាំ (ក្រុម ១ឆ្នាំ (ក្រុម ១ឆ្នាំ (ក្រុម ១ឆ្នាំ	г
to later the later of the later which we also known to the second of the later of t	; r
oud we are a statute of the ors — as expected to	65 S
€ిగు ింటాక బట్కి కా మంద్ర మహి మూర్ ఉన్నాయి. అన్నార్ ఉన్నార్ క	· •
నర్మాణకు కార్యం కార్య వ్యాప్తియన్నారు. ఇంటు విశ్వేషం త్రాణం	P 4
್ಯಾಕ್ ಗಳ ಬರುಗಳು ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ ಗಟ್ಟಾರಿಕೆ ಕಾರ್ಯಗಳು ಬರುಗಳು ಬರುಗಳು	~
ు. మందర్గామ్మల్ కార్లు ఉంది. మందర్గామ్ములు ఉంది. మందర్గామ్ములు ఉంది. మందర్గామ్ములు ఉంది. మందర్గామ్ములు ఉంది. మందర్	

in the property of the second of the second

at the -- at the courthouse.

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So a second recommendation I would make is that the Court consider notice directly to those who are interested enough to want to receive it, and it -- I believe that's not burdensome, and I believe it would help protect the public interest. And, again, in the particular category of cases that I'm discussing, I think it would be of great practical use.

A third suggestion I would make is that the rule expressly address the subject of trade secrets, because in product liability cases that is the justification that is most commonly given for the protection of records; and yet as I have said, and as I strongly believe, it's abused.

And I -- I don't have for you today a definition or a standard specifically that I would urge, but once the 181 people across the lawn here go home, I would like to submit some written comments, and will do that to the committee --

JUSTICE HECHT: We may not have enough lawyers.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

• so the state of	٠
to the state of th	. •
្រុះ ប្រធិប្រជាជា ស្រុក	:
ನಿ ಕಟ್ಟಿಕೆಕ್ಕೆ ಎಂದು ನಿನ್ನಿಗೆ ಈ ಕಿಂದರೆ ಎಂದು <b>ಸ</b> ಮ್ಮ ನಮ್ಮ ಬರುಗ	•
dead of the side of all modes to a company of	••
and the second of the second o	$\because$
ក្រុម ប្រាស់២ ខេត្ត ២ ដើម ប្រាក្យមន្ត្រី ខេ <b>ត្តប្រាក្</b>	,
districtly of a strain of the solid production of the solid	<b>n</b>
.com .nites	Α.,
្រុសស្វាស់ ខេត្ត ប្រាស់ ស្រុសមានស្រួន ស្រុកប្រាស់	n.
్తి కొండానికి అనికి సమాజికి కార్యాన్స్ కార్స్ కొంటి కార్స్ కొన్నారి.	
ស្ទីដែក <sup>3</sup> ខ្សាធិស៍ ជាស្ថាធិស្ស ស្រាស់ ១ ១០៩២១ ខែ ១ ១៩២១ ១ ១ ១៩៩	
មកជានាក់ ទាំង "២ ជាស ជាកុស្ស" ខ្លាមក្នុងជាង 👉 ជាធាន ១០០០១	٠.
anionesa i contablication null this moving a colle	••
gara the Todocking Classeserics and by A.	• .
. @ W ** * *## (Sweed)(*##	Ĺ.
ాగ్గ్ మీ కుపాన్నారు. మాక్క్ కెక్ట్ర్ —— క్షాత్	
NOTE: CONTRACT COLLEGE OF NORTH PARTIES.	- 1
ಾಮ್ (ದಿ. ಇದ್ದರ್ಥ ಕಾರ್ಯಕ್ಕಾರ್ ಕ್ರೀಟ್ರಾಗಿ ನಿರಾಮ (ಅರ್ಥ) ಕ್ರಾಂಡ್ (ಚಿತ್ರಗಳು)	ŋ
្រុម នៅក្រុម ខេត្ត នៅ ខេត្ត ខេត្ត បានការបាន មួយស្នើ បញ្ជាប់ នេះ បានការបាន បានការបាន បានការបាន បានការបាន បានការ	
రుప్రవే తేవాగూ అందర్గు కుర్ణమం ఉంది. అంది మండటిందా <del>టు</del>	
<del>man</del> ( ) Retrosco	<i>(</i> *)
and we will be the common of the control of the con	,

•

MR. JACKS: We -- well, I did notice that the governor is taking bets. I -- I thought it was another candidate for governor who was advocating legalized gambling, but I see that Governor Clements has gotten in the spirit of things and....

But in any event, I would urge that the court include a standard that addresses trade secrets specifically and puts some burden on the movant to show that what is sought to be protected generally is confidential trade secret or commercial information in which there is a legitimate interest in concealing from public disclosure rather than rubber stamping literally every document that is produced in discovery, which is what happens commonly. I mentioned the one case, but it -- it happens commonly.

The -- it has already been suggested that you consider an appellate standard, and that's necessary, because if there is appellate review, it's most likely going to be through the mandamus route, simply in terms of the timing of the thing. That's when it must occur, I think, and --

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: We don't need any

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

and a second to be form and a second to the first open to deof a tribal to a tribal or or of an indicate a first of the resident of the company of the contract of the frican the of initiation is at all trianspropries with the is able to a control of the second of the se

on the angle of the contract o ್ ಸಂಸರ್ಥಿಸಿ ಸ್ಥಾರ್ಡ್ ಅಭಿಸ್ಥಾರಿ ಸಾಹಿತಿಗಳ ಅಭಿವರ್ತ ಹಾಗೂ ಸಂಸ್ಥಾರಿಸಿ The graph of the first the contract of the first of the contract of the contra នៅការស្រាស់ទៅលក់ ប្រការស្រាស់ បានស្រាស់ ការស្រែក ការស្រែក ការស្រែក ការស្រែក ប្រការ

Carlotto (totalista interest and distribution of the the control of the property of the party

that government of the common order to go daily and the second of the second property spread could be the second Description of the Carlotter of the Carl The second of th

T F

r :

٠.

20

The second secon

more writs of mandamus.

MR. JACKS: And it is -- well, it -it seems to me that it's not something -- if we
are to provide that a group that has an
interest, be it a newspaper or a public interest
group, is to get a hearing at the trial court
stage, I would advocate that there be some
method of review of that decision.

And it -- it makes little sense to postpone it and make it hinge upon whether there is an appeal of a final judgment by the parties to the case, because that's totally aside and apart from the controversy about the disclosure of the public information.

whether you call an appeal or you call a mandamus, I would advocate a ready remedy that can be taken from that order by whoever the agreed party is. And I would say you should not utilize a mandamus standard of review, which is clear abuse of discretion, because the interest that is at stake does have constitutional ramifications.

The -- that really concludes the specific recommendations that I have. And I -- if the Court has any other questions, I'd be

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

o î : ; .; .;	.*
the state of the s	P
	••
en de la companya de	ç €
	es.
en en en samuel en	•
The many property of the second second second	:
er alla en production de la grande de la companya d	<i>(</i> *)
$m{\cdot} m{arphi}_{i} = m{arphi}_{i} $	-
Produce and the state of the st	
gar same na 1800 talen eta	•.
en e	,
And the state of t	
e en la marca de la saparta de la gradade de la Colonia de la sapera de la seconda de la seconda de la seconda	r.
namen in de la companya de la compa La companya de la co	۳.
	<b>~</b> ∶
en la factoria de la companya de la	,,
The Committee of the Co	ć

The proof that the Themps of the proof of the second

happy to try to answer them now. I can't tell you how much I appreciate the opportunity to address these issues, and I can tell you that there are many, many lawyers out there like me on both sides of the docket who share this concern, certainly in this pursuit of categoried cases.

implying or stating that you have had lawyers say, "We won't settle unless you sign this agreed order sealing the records, but we think this is a bad deal that robs the public of their right to know, and privately we apologize to you; that's just our client's position"?

MR. JACKS: I -- Mr. Chief Justice,

I will tell you that I have -- in a number of

product liability cases, and it's now almost

universally commonplace -- have been told that

it is a condition of settlement that records

either be sealed or withdrawn, and that I sent

back not only the depositions I have taken of

their employees, the documents I obtained from

them, but also my deposition summaries, my notes

from my file --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: I

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the first of the out of the contract of the first of the contract of the contr	•
$\mathcal{A}(\mathcal{B})$ is the first of the constant of $\mathcal{B}(\mathcal{B})$ . The first of $\mathcal{B}(\mathcal{B})$	•
not be a lot too it han even by the second	
and the state of t	<b>-</b> .
en and the state of the state o	•
The forest of the location of the many contents of the second	
• 6 3 6 7 5	₹
	•
A TO THE COUNTY STORE TO A SECURITION OF A SEC	*
್ರ ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಯ ಗಳಿಗೆ ಬರು ಬರು ಬರು ಬರು ಬರು ಪ್ರಕ್ರಿಯ ಕ್ರಾಲ್ಯದ	
ಸ್ಥೆ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕೃಷ್ಣ ಅವರು ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ ಕ್ರಾಂತ್ರ	۳ .
ារាំល្បីទី ១៩ <b>១៨៤ មហា ១៨៩</b> ២.៩ ១១៩៦ ១៩១ ១៩១ ១៩១ ១៩១	
ကာ စာသည္ကသို့တာသို့တာသည္။ မလာ ကုိလည္သို႔ သည္။ ကိုလည္သည့္ ကိုလည္သည့္ ကိုလည္သည့္ ကိုလည္သည့္ ကိုလည္သည့္ ကိုလည္သည့	
g m; blaber just on o lenbin joudfileng	•
- 2004 HT B. 1775 1 : 577 .	
and the first of the medical form of the form of the first of the firs	
သိမ္မားသည်မှ ကြာသားသည်။ ကြို့ရာ မြန်မာ့သည် များရှိရှိသည် မြန်မာ့သည် မြန်မာ့သည် မြန်မာ့သည် မြန်မာ့သည် မြန်မာ့သည	7
tral are regions — are de los contratan	
ក្រុមស្រុក ទៅ ស្រុក បានស្រុក ប្រើ <b>ដ</b> ោលស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុ	
. గ్రామం కొరువాడికి స్థాన్నులు కామం కోష్ట్ క్రామం కుట్టులు ఉంది. అయిన కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్లు కోట్	<i>,</i> .
lu i dan ka	
one that the second of the sec	·· •
	- <b>-</b>
managan of the contract of the	۴

en la grande de la companya della companya della companya de la companya della co

understand that, but are --

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. JACKS: And -- and I'm telling you that some of the lawyers representing those parties -- well, David Donaldson and I have had cases against each other, and I don't -- I don't think I can recall a case in which David and I have had that kind of an order, but I'm sure that his firm has represented products defendants who have asked that such orders be entered. And I am telling you that some of the defense lawyers with whom I deal hold their nose when they do it because they are representing their client, but they also recognize that there is important public information here that is being concealed, and as officers of the court who care about how the courts are perceived, they think it stinks, and I will tell you, yes, that I believe, and that I know.

JUSTICE HECHT: Because we are dealing with perception here, another perception is that the reason both sides of the docket don't mind disclosing the information is because it will result in more lawsuits, employing more lawyers ad infinitem to the great expense of the public. Now, that -- that is also a very

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

. •

	,
en de distribuir en som en de s	7
the complete such with a control of the control of	
er en	
	•
	·-
n de la marche de la companya de la	
to the company of the second o	
	•
	- r <sub>.</sub>
the state of the s	·
e a linguage of the entry of the linguistic property of the line o	· 6•
	· •
	r
	2.7.
the state of the state of the growth of the	<i>c.</i>
and the second of the control of the	•
du the contract of the second	r
and the state of the committee of the control of th	′ 0
to the state of th	•
and the province dispersion of the first of	`. `

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

cynical perception of the populace. What -- how do we protect against that?

MR. JACKS: Well, it is -- there are other ways to protect against lawsuits being filed which should not be filed. This Court has made an effort in Rule 13 to address that issue. It is -- I would say that the Garcia against Peeples decision has taken out of the picture, at least in this state, one of the main incentives that defendants have had to see that records are sealed, because now in protective orders it is generally the case that the right is always reserved to see that those records are given to lawyers representing other victims of the same product. To that extent, I think that -- I think manufacturers are motivated by seeking to gain the advantage that they had before Garcia. Certainly, they don't like to see their dirty laundry aired in public, but I don't see -- I really don't think there is a concern on their part that if it is, there is going to be a new explosion of lawsuits about it.

You know, if -- if you have a product that's injuring hundreds or thousands of

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

State of the state of the second The same of the sa ျက်လုံးမှ ကိုရာတို့၏ အသို့ ကိုတားသည် သည် သည် တွေ့သည်။ မေရာက် အလုပ်သည် and the east of the common of the common of the east of the first Model of the purpose of the control of the second of the control of to the contract of the state of or of the sed by does not be at or a second of or in the constitution of the contraction of the contr gd It sea to be trust ato the determinant is therefore the simple property of the policy  $x_i$ repta in North corp and gefauors in the corp రామార్ బాహ్ ఉంది. కారా కార్ట్ కోర్ట్ కార్ కోట్ కోట్ కార్డ్ కొట్టార్ కార్డ్ కొట్టార్ కార్డ్ కోట్ ទី២ ក្រស់ក្រស់ស (សេមា) ប្រាប់ប្រសាទ (១០ ១០០០០) ១៩ ៤០០០ 1 . ್ಯ ಮೇಲ್ 15 ಗ್ರಾ<del>ಗಣ್ಯಕ್ಕೆ</del> ಬೆಂಗಗಳ ಚಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿಕೆ ಅಲ್ಲಿ ಬೆಂಗಗಳ ಚಿಕ್ಕಾಗಿ 7 y in rainvidant are nuadunated not to the fire-city. ్డ కార్స్ కోట్ ఈ కుండానానికి ఇంట్ కాట్ కాటే కాటే మాట్లు and a find well specially and it is the first  $\mathcal{L}_{ij}(\mathbf{z}) = \mathbf{z}^{ij}(\mathbf{z})$  , which is the probability of  $\mathbf{z}$  , which is the iof the first difference of the contract of the second

10

n e ving 15 mai 25 mai 19 Na sangaran sangaran

people around the country -- three-wheelers being a current example, let's say -- those lawsuits are going to be filed and pursued regardless of whether, in particular cases, the documents that have been obtained in discovery are disclosed so that the whole story comes out. Enough of the story has come out so that victims are going to seek legal counsel, and lawyers are going to know that there is something going on there, because there are hundreds of lawsuits going on around the country.

And as a practical matter, I don't see concern about an explosion of litigation being a legitimate reason for saying we should not have openness in -- in this branch of government in these kinds of cases.

JUSTICE HECHT: Well, thank you, Mr. Jacks.

MR. JACKS: My thanks to all of you.

JUSTICE HECHT: Next up is Tom

Smith.

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

# TOM SMITH,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

MR. SMITH: Hi, I'm Tom Smith. director of Public Citizens office in Austin, Public Citizens is a national consumer organization that was founded back in the early 1970s by Ralph Nader. I'm not an attorney, and so my remarks to you this afternoon will be from that perspective, from the perspective of a person who represents the public interest, most often at the Legislature, but often in other forms.

As you would expect, being an organization founded by Ralph Nader, we're keenly concerned about product safety and, as well, the openness of governments, not only in the courts and their records, but the records that are held by regulatory agencies and other bodies.

We're delighted that you are

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

considering this issue and that this legislation has passed. We think it gives you an historic opportunity to once again reinforce and reaffirm some very important principles that this state and these courts have been founded on: the fact that the records are open and that they belong to the public, and that these courts belong to the public, partially because we pay for them, but most importantly because we have created them as ways to deal with the jurisdictional -- the disputes that come between us.

What you are going to be deciding in these rules are literally matters of life and death to many people, or life and breath, in some instances. There are going to be matters of great economic and political and social invitations, matters like whether or not records having to do with crash data, with what happens when an automobile is smashed into from the rear and whether those gas tanks explode, are released to the public and thereby, perhaps, preventing some 500-odd people a year from being killed in automobiles that don't have reinforced gas tanks, or whether the data that might result from litigation about cigarette smoking is

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

released to the public and might somehow prevent more people from smoking or from continuing to smoke who do, who might -- that might document somehow how much information the cigarette manufacturers know and how much they know about how bad cigarette smoking might be for you.

The kind of information you will be talking about and deciding about is whether or not people should know about heart valves that fail, or whether there are birth control devices that might end up -- that they're using might end up causing sterility or miscarriages, or whether they're buying a house over a toxic waste dump, or whether the nuclear plant by which they are living is safe, or whether the -the courts and administrative agences have ended up sealing the records of complaints brought by whistle blowers about the safety of that plant.

These are the kinds of life and death issues that you-all will be deciding when you look at these rules, but there will also be other issues: issues of dollars and cents, the choice of an insurance company, and whether or not an insurance company has been settling claims fairly and rapidly, or whether an

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

investment counselor might possibly have conflict of interest and be sued.

The way the system is now working, parties can go together and say, "We would like to seal these records," and oftentimes do.

We'll talk about why that happens in a few minutes.

Product safety and consumer information have been linked -- or have been likened to a three-legged stool. We depend on all three of these legs to remain relatively equal in order to remain in balance, and those three legs are: regulation, public awareness and ability to act on -- on what they know, and litigation to get unsafe products off the market.

Your decision on these rules will profoundly affect the ability of this tripartite system of protection to work in two ways: It will manifestly affect, obviously, the amount of information that's available to the public, but also how effective the litigation is.

You see, what's happened here is that their -- the attorneys have managed to get themselves into sort of a jam. Not being an

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

Ď

attorney, I -- I'm not sure I understand how all this works, but in talking to attorneys, talking to Ralph Nader and a bunch of other folks who have watched this develop around the country, the jam seems to work like this: They have a duty to represent a client and to resolve the matter that the client has brought to them as quickly and as effectively as possible and for the maximum amount of settlement, if that's what's being asked for.

So you end up suing somebody like

General Motors over a defective gasoline tank.

And you begin discovery, and General Motors

approaches you and says, "We want you to sign a

blanket protective order and we will -- or we

will contest every document you ask for."

Well, you scratch your head and realize this could be a fairly easy case or this could be the case that took the rest of your life, because General Motors has significantly more assets than you do, sitting here in Austin, Texas, or wherever.

So you go ahead and sign, and you find the explosive document, the document that details that perhaps General Motors did know

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

\_

that certain gas tanks in certain models of their cars would explode in rear-end collisions at certain speeds, and that they could have fixed those gas tanks for somewhere between 8 and \$11, and that the risk might be 500 additional lives annually, but they went ahead and chose to market that car anyway.

And you say, "I've got this document," and they offer to settle, but the condition of settlement is: "You've got to keep your mouth shut, you've got to give us all the documents back, and you can never take another case like this."

What's the lawyer to do? Whose interest is more important: the interest of the public or the interest of his client? I think it's pretty clear to those of you who are attorneys that the interest of the client is of tantamount importance to most attorneys. That's the way they have been taught, and that's the way we have said -- said that it ought to be in this state.

What we think we ought to have happen -- ought to have happen is that you folks ought to take the bit by the horns, as it

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

the secretary of the se	•
entropy of the entropy of the second	^
	٢
on the specific of the street	
The first of the fit of the first of the state of the sta	
	¥*-
the field what is supplied to the property of the second o	<b>c.</b>
n	C.
ence of the comment o	•
The first programme of the control o	
The first section of the section of	~ ;
	₹ ,
is the state of the months of the day of the day	
The second control of the control of	
లాగా కాంకాం. ఈ కాంగా ఉంది. అంది. మార్చులో మహారా మంది కాంగా మార్చింది. మార్చికి మార్చికి మార్చికి మార్చికి మార్	
A CONTROL OF SECURITION OF SEC	Į. (
Automotive to the control of the con	•
	-

in the graph of the control of the control of the state of the control of the con

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

were -- the bull by the horns, as it were, and change the rules and say that isn't the way things ought to be, that there ought not be these blanket protective orders that turn into blanket secrecy settlements or settlement agreements that end up being secret. Why?

Let's take a look at the incentives for General Motors and other people like that. If you end up finding that you have been sued and that someone is going to get this document on you and that they can win tremendous amounts of dollars against you, that's one part of their The other risk is a significant loss of risk. market share. The other things that they don't want to have happen is they want to prevent further litigation; they want to keep it from being in the press and generally spread around the United States of America that some of their cars might have been built with defective gas They also want to keep a team of expert attorneys from developing, and one way to do it is to make sure that that information isn't shared with other attorneys and that the attorney who has figured this out doesn't get to take any more cases. It allows them to polish

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	ż			
		. :		
• '	•			•
	£ '		11	•
•			**	
:	, -	. •		
			-	
1				
	•			
1				•-
•			**	
	-3 ,			
				_
			4.7	
		•		
•				
*		•	• • •	
			• •	٠.
		<del>-</del>	_ 1	
			•	•
¥ .			٠, ١	
		-i -		
•		1.5		£ .
•	Γ.			
	• •		•	
		•-		
-	,			-
	•	٠.	•	
!	:			
•			•	
	<b>-</b> ,		- 11	•
			٠,	
+	,			
•	-		•	
	,			
	-	_		
		**		
* 1				9-r
	•			•
•		_		
		;		
		4		
	• •	. 1		*
			-	
		•		•
•	٠.	· •		
	~~	₩-	-	3
•	•		• 1	. 1
			•	
:	. ,		•	
		*F		
		١,	,	•
				* 1
				•
	•		:	
	***		•	
	1.	**	E .	
•			2	
•				-
			• •	(1) 精神 (1) (2) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4
The second secon			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	•	<u> </u>		
		_		
		₹7	• •	
(-7)			••	
• :			•	
. 1				
			•	

44

\*\*. \*\*. N. í .. 71 0 ; ' ; . : 1 ጥ 3 3 4 · • 1. ÷, 7.1 10000 -4.7 . . ... : -1 .t. f . . Jiwi. . τ; 4: • 774 Ĉ, . 1 : 2 ; ;; 7. 7. : 1. 7 11 1 ÷ 2 7.7 .1 !1 • ? +. 1.... 2... ;; CT., ٠; ÷., 41 . C. C. : 9. <u>...</u> 21.5

1, :: :: :: 3) 23 ·i · ٠, , ات ن : 17 7 17 ; · *r*. . ;; †; ສ . #. #1 #1 1) () £4 10 mm 2 mm .... ÷. : 14 . . <u>ပ</u> . .

their defenses.

Now, earlier on, someone asked -- I think it was Justice Cook -- how many of these cases actually were occurring. We don't know the answer to that. But The Washington Post, in an article I will leave with you-all for duplication, noted that there had been 140 cases like this brought against General Motors.

One expert, at least, had testified in 140 cases. And after testifying 140 times on this kind of an issue, you get real good, especially good when you are up against an attorney who is bringing his or her first case on this kind of an issue. So that's the kind of thing that seems to be motivating a lot of big corporations to ask for sealing of these records. Is it just General Motors? No, apparently it's not.

In talking this over with other people, some of the examples that our litigation group came up with were the manufacturers of a heart valve that has been tending to fail, or cigarette manufacturers, or people who are manufacturing birth control devices -- the Robbins Company, among others.

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

• 1 - 10 to A man to be a given by the contract of the con the day of the second of the s ావాలు మ్యాక్ష్ కార్క్ కార్ కాటాబాదారి. ఇక్కార్ కాటింది. ఇక్కార్లు PART OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR The second section of the second second section is the second second second second second second second second and the fire post of the state ・ こうままず マカケラか こうごうしょう カラ カラ サード こうだち みせぎむ CONTRACTOR DE CONTRACTOR D to constitution to the professional control of the profess ~ [ ្រុកក្នុង ដូច្នេះ នៅ នេះ បានក្រុមក្នុង នៅ នៅ ១៩ គ្នានៅ ១៩ នៅ L . and dantings on our or a point har og diller o Bank that I mad the second at the contract the The rest of the contract of the contract of the figure of the contract of the in the common of the description of the common of the comm Constant to the second of the second of the second ្រុក ខ្លួន ២០០ និង ១៨៩៦ និមម្រឹក្សា ១៣០ 🕡 ១២៩១ r r \*#\*\* \* \*# \ \ \ # \ \ \ \ with the same of the same and . . with the figure of the transfer of the  $\pi \phi$  ,  $\phi$  ,  $\pi \phi$  ,  $\phi$  ,  $\phi$ 3 % gray of the fitte to the latter fatter for the con-... ್≼ಸಿಸ್ಸ್ ಕಿಲಾಕ್ಲಿಯ ಕಿಂದರ ದಿನ ಮಾಡಿ ಫ್ರಾಫ್ ದಾಶ್ರಾಶ್ವಿ ٠, of the state of th The time of the contract of the first of the second that

٠ ---

O

This strategy has some bad and importance significance for those of us who are members of the public and consumers. What does it do? First of all, it keeps bad products on the market long after they should have been pulled off. Regulators, press, and ultimately the public, can't tell when a product is harmful and how badly it's damaging people.

But it additionally drives up the cost of litigation and discovery and defense. The defense costs increased dramatically, and they complain about it. They go over to the Legislature and say, "We're in the middle of a litigation explosion; look at our figures."

Because every time somebody comes in on a suit like this, the plaintiffs have to go fishing and have to ask for every record in the book, everything they can possibly think of, and that's part of why the defense costs have increased so dramatically.

It appears that big corporations and folks are using these secrecy agreements more frequently. The <u>Dallas Morning News</u> reported in 1987 that there were, in fact, 282 cases in history since 1920 -- since they had begun

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

1)

1 ---- .

i. ; . 1: : •:-: :: : ' · . • • •

· ,

1

<u>.</u>;

::

; 5. ·, **-,** · . ζ, :-:

. . ٠., ``` 1. 1.1 1.1 . : ت C • •  $\Theta$ . . :30 ٠. ٠: • • 1\*, 13 ... : . • 12 1 :• . ; . i. . 1.3 1:

: : ,; . ò ξ. •

ı:

**5.** 

. .

• ;

; 64

77 **( )** 11 ٠. ;; ٠, :5 ٠, ٠. ، ٠.; • • . : 1 1.7 . . ; ٠., :: ~; ( ; . . . 23

keeping records -- that showed what had been kept secret, 202 of them since 1980 alone, and 139 of them just since 1984.

We think there is a solution. As I mentioned a few minutes ago, the solution is simple. I think you-all ought to just say "no more of the secrecy," that you -- that attorneys are not -- shouldn't be allowed to sign blanket gag and protective orders as a condition of settlement.

in 97 percent, or all but 15 out of some 457 of the products liability cases concluded in 1988, according to the State -- State Board of Insurance and their closed claims study. It's a staggering number. And we don't know how many of these -- these kinds of secrecy agreements were entered into.

But the point that I want to make here is that it is seldom that documents are actually brought forth to open court, and it is seldom that people really are able to -- to hear what goes on in the discussion about a particular product in open court, because settlements occur, and rapidly.

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

province the first transfer of the first section of	
. "ប្រុស្នា ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុក សម <b>្</b> ព	_
The same of the body of the total control of the same	5
្រុម បានប្រឹក្សាស្រាល ស្រីដែលស្រួល បានដូច្នេះ បានប្រើបានស្រាក់ បានប្រែក្រុម	
$\lambda^{(0)}$ Model 2 $\lambda\mu_{2}^{0}$ Given the condition of the state of th	~
್ಕ ಡಾಗ ವಿಶವಿಕ ಕೂಡು ಇವರ ಕಾರ್ಯ <b>"</b> ಸ್ವಾ <b>ಟಾಗಲ್ಲಿ</b> ಅನ್ನ ಸಂತ್ರಕ್ಕೆ	
and the second of the second o	r
e discontinuo de la montra de la companya del companya del companya de la company	·
.dne oo dan in	
in the section $(x,y) \in \mathcal{A}(x,y)$ and $(x,y) \in \mathcal{A}(x,y)$ is set $(x,y) \in \mathcal{A}(x,y)$	r ·
The Total Control of the Control of	
. Of all it priorpe areas j#lal (1) by or oth	,•
equal no bull bho abb dtab. Gora va	ا د
ಸ್ಥಿತ ಗ್ರೀಥೆ ನಿರ್ವಹಿಸು ಸಂಚರ್ಧ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್ ಕಿಂಗ್	
Communication and a member of the arms of the section of the contract of the c	!
శాశం అందారు సైంజ్ఞక్షాల్ ని మండ్రి గ్రామం	•
·adult is a constant	· .
information and the state of th	:
is the post of the second of the definition of the	
្រាះ ទី២ ភព ភូមិប្រាស់ ១០០០១៩ ខេម្មា ១០០១២០១៤ ក្រុម នេះក្រុមប្រ	£
ကြောင်းကို ရေးသား မြေကြာသည်။ ကြောင်းကြောင်းကို သည်။ ကြောင်းကြောင်းကြောင့် မြောင်းကြောင့် မြောင်းကြောင့် မြောင်း မြောင်းကြောင်း	<u> </u>
(x,y) = (x,y) + (x,y	

example of the property of the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

24

25

So as a result of that, we think that attorneys, as officers of the court, should maintain and allow reasonable access to all discovery, whether used or not, or filed or not in court, and that the trial court should retain continuing jurisdiction over discovery issues.

The third thing we think ought to happen is that attorneys and judges should report any apparent violations of federal or state safety, or professional licensure conditions, to the appropriate regulatory body, so when they run across a problem that indicates there may have been a failure to report a chronic failure of a heart valve or a birth control device to the Food and Drug Administration, or a generic drug that wasn't tested according to the standards established by FDA, they ought to have to be required by court rules in this state to report that to the regulatory body, or when it's apparent that someone has malpracticed either as an attorney, a doctor, a chiropractor, whatever, that ought to be reported.

We think that this -- the obvious objection to all this, of course, is that this

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	-
လန <b>င</b> ္းက ရက္ေသလိုက္ေလာက်သို႔ သည့္သည္။ လန္ <b>င</b> ္းက ကြင္းသည္။ လည္သည့္	.4
The state of the s	* ·
entrollemonther Louisman of het had bluet on hits that of an electric section is	
- ខាមី។ បានសុខសុខ ប៉ុន្តែ <b>១</b> នេះ ប៉ុន្តែ សុខ សុខ ដែលក្រុម សុខ	
ទីស្សាស្ត្រីស្ត្រី ស្ត្រីស្ត្រី ស្ត្រី ស	11
Company of the control of the contro	
$\sigma = \sigma + \sigma + 4 \lambda c$ . The $\sigma = \sigma + $	
	r
$\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{A}}(\omega_{0})$ is a property of that $(x,y)$ for $x\in \mathcal{A}$ and $(x,y)$ is a second of $(x,y)$ for $(x,y)$	ŗ
to the first of the second of	. • P
ప్రామాన్ని ప్రామాన్నికి కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్స్ కార్మిన్	F* 1
leste som visk de dan en de leste diet die mit	<b>6</b> -
ကမ္းကို ကိုက်က ကို တင်းသည်။ မြောင်းလုံးမှာ ကြောင်းသည်။	٠
ជីវៈល្បៈ ទោក ប្រារាជ្រុម <b>បក</b> ារ ស្រាស់ ស្ត្រាក្សា ខែការប្រកាស់ ប្រកិច្ចិច្ច ស្ត្រិស្ ស្រួស ប្រាក្សា	7 r
of the windless of a manifest of the contract	\$100 No.
the property of the control of the c	· <b>r</b>
ಆಟನ್ ಕನ್ನ <mark>ದೆ</mark> ಗಳುತ್ತಿಗಳು ಅನ್ನ ಅವರ ಕಾರ್ಗಿಸ್ ಕಾರ್ಗಿಸ್ ಕಾರ್ಗಿಸಿ ಪ್ರ	<u>*</u>
The state $ au_{ij}$ is the state of $ au_{ij}$ and $ au_{ij}$	: •
ាលវាជានិងការរបស់ សារ ខាងក្នុងពី ស្រីការ៉ាស៊ីស្រែស្រាស្រី សារ ស្រែស្រាស្រាស្ត្	ŗ
ကို ႏိုင္ငံကို မေတာ့ကိုမွာ မေရးကလားမယ္မည္ကိုသည့္ ေလးကို ေလးကိုင္းကို ေတြ႔ ရွင္ေလးကြာလည္း	٠٠,
	٠.
and the first of the contract	· n

is going to require -- have all kinds of confidentiality problems, that people are going to be raising objections and the judges are not going to want to sit down and go through thousands of pages of documents to determine which pages may have trade secrets in them.

Well, there are two answers to this. First, we think there ought to be special masters appointed and trained to look at confidentiality issues. But most importantly --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Paid for by the state or by the litigants?

MR. SMITH: By the state.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Okay. We have not been able to get secretaries or law clerks, or --

MR. SMITH: Well, perhaps -CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: -- or
bailiffs or other people for these judges.

MR. SMITH: That's a sensitivity
that I don't have, and I -- I appreciate you
bringing that up to me. And perhaps one way
that this could be dealt with is by having the
parties who are contesting this contribute
toward the purchase -- not the purchase, but the

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

hiring -- wrong word -- of a special master. 1 And I think that has been done in certain 2 3 instances. 4 CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: We have a vast and increasing use of special masters at 5 6 the trial court level to investigate documents 7 and such, but it -- but it is taxed against the 8 losing party to the case, ordinarily. MR. SMITH: I would encourage that 9 10 practice to occur. CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: It's not --11 12 not always --. 13 MR. SMITH: Not being an attorney, 14 I'm not --CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: It's not 15 always a fair practice at \$200 an hour, or 16 whatever some of these people charge. But we 17 18 are also working, on this court, towards better 19 funding for our trial courts which, for 20 instance, are not computerized in most areas of 21 the state. They have no setting clerks. that's a -- that's a -- that's a problem you can 22 23 help us with in 1991. MR. SMITH: Well, I probably will 24 25 speak to that issue in 1991.

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

· The state of the state of the same of th	<i>:</i> *
in the proof of $oldsymbol{u}$ and $oldsymbol{u}$ and $oldsymbol{u}$ and $oldsymbol{u}$ and $oldsymbol{u}$	,44
•	
	•
John March (1975) Administration of the State of the Stat	••
grand the first of the second state of the second state of the second second second second second second second	, ture
	*
	1, <b>5</b>
······································	78 - 48 8
gen national parent derivations and the	
was of the second	
For the transfer of the control of t	
n dro kunn is en	(
to the first of the second of	· •
	••
	# F
and the state of t	~ 0
	<b>&gt;</b> #
3 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	•

It is -- I think that there ought to be a real tight definition developed. I -- the definition developed in the proposed rule before you doesn't seem to have enough precision to satisfy my untrained eyes, and I think that they ought to be limited primarily to things like trade secrets, to family matters, and to areas like psychiatric reports where the issue of a person's psychiatric impairment is not necessarily -- isn't necessary to be brought up in the case that is before the court, and shouldn't necessarily be released.

would suggest that perhaps there ought to be notice to other interested parties, folks beyond just the people in the courtroom, and it ought to be effective notice. I think that the idea of sending -- of allowing groups to file with the clerk a request to be notified whenever a particular products liabilities case came up -- or in our instance we'd probably be interested in products liability medical device cases, disciplinary actions, things of that nature -- would be very helpful. It would enable us to get effective notice. And putting a notice at

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

• ,

.

2. 1

the courthouse is not effective for most of the folks in Texas these days. And as I mentioned earlier, I think we ought to keep the exemptions as tight as possible.

Those are my thoughts on this, and I think that it's important that as you consider it that you bear in mind the kinds of magnitudes of cases that are before you every day, but the kinds of data that's available in these records that are being sealed. And as we are hearing from folks, from the attorneys that we talked to, it is a problem that is increasing, and it's increasing in the big money cases, in the significant product liability cases; and those are the areas where the most folks are likely to be affected, and that's our concern and a concern we'd like to share with you.

We wish you good luck in your deliberations. And as the months go by, if there is any way we can help in the drafting of these rules, we'll be more than happy to do so. And I thank you-all for the opportunity to be here. I'll be glad to answer any questions that you-all may have.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: We hope

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

Solver the management of the Company	;*
that I have a first the first of the second	
The state of the s	
	•
To Digital Control of the Control of	
to the second of	•,
na kara kara da kara d	ĵ
en fan dat it skriver fan stronger met generalde en die begen de generalde en de generalde en de generalde en	
the state of the s	
the state of the state of the second the state of the sta	٠, -
Selection of the community of a contract of the man	्र १
n karantar kijila palaktar na mali kacama karantar biran karantar.	* *
of at an object of the second	
క కాయింది. ఈ కృశావత్వని కృష్ణ ఎక్కర్స్ కార్జ్ ఉన్న కాట్స్ ఉన్న	· ·
్తి గై చేస్ప్, అంజమ్ కట్టులు, కళ కూడి ఈ కళ కళ చేస్తున్న కళ కట్టు ఉంది. ఈ కళ్ళు	
n in the company of t	• • •
• 035 miles to the following of the state o	ź
ntroll who ten is two as a first of the con-	<b>€</b> 7
in the second of	<u></u>
ing and the state of the state	96
one with the second of the sec	is in
ు కార్యామ్ కృత్యమ్మిందిన కార్యామ్ కార్ములు అంటింది. ఈటింది కార్మాన్ కార్యామ్మ్ కట్టింది.	( p
to the other second and the property of the second second	,

A CONTRACT OF THE CONTRACT OF

it's weeks instead of months. 1 MR. SMITH: I hope so, too, but from 2 the way these things progress, I would bet the 3 latter. 5 JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you for your comments, Mr. Smith. 6 MR. SMITH: Let me leave a copy of 7 The Washington Post article with you that 8 details the General Motors case down in 10 San Antonio. 11 JUSTICE HECHT: Next up is Mack 12 Kidd. 13 14 MACK KIDD, appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in 1.5 16 administrative session to consider proposed 17 changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas 18 Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows: 19 20 MR. KIDD: May it please the Court, 21 my name is Mack Kidd. I'm a practicing attorney 22 23 here in Austin. I can assure you that I will be very brief. Some of what I was prepared to say 24 25 has already been mentioned.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	-
	•
and the first the contract of the state of t	,
• to a state of	
with $\Omega_{ij}$ , which is the constitution of the $i$ and $i$	
	• `
သက္ ရွာသားသည္ ကုန္းကို ရွာသည္။ မူတာက မွာတ္သည့္ ကုန္းကို ကြန္းကို ကြန္းကို ကြန္းကို ကြန္းကို ကြန္းကို ကြန္းကို	:
• 4 A to the district of the second of the s	• • •
H. To the import of the second	μ
· · ·	٠ . ٢
Company of the Compan	. •.
	ין זיי
the control of the co	
	5. 5
the state of the first of the state of the s	٠.
South East Transport South English South Company of State South	
	•
	r f
the Common displaying the common section of the section of the common section of the section of the common sec	<b>™</b> 24
the consumption of the first of the constraint of the constraints of t	<b>&gt;</b> .
<ul> <li>A substitution of the substitutio</li></ul>	٠.

.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I will say that I am appearing here for myself, but as a governor on the Association of Trial Lawyers of America -- board of governors -- I can tell you that secrecy in judicial proceedings has become a major problem in recent years, and a problem that has been addressed by resolution of the Association of Trial Lawyers of America coming out four-square against the abuse of protective orders and other secrecy agreements that are frequently being used, especially in product liability matters. I think this has been pointed out by Tommy They are also frequently used in other cases where you have prominent individuals involved, or sensitive matters involved, such as professional negligence, especially in the area of medical malpractice where those are the very types of cases that the public needs to know about the results of those cases and what has gone on.

I will say at the outset that one of the things that I have always admired about Justice Spears is the fact that he has always had a very good historical perspective of things involving the judiciary in cases that come

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

10

Ö

before the Court, and I'm afraid that when we go about examining institutions of government, we have a sense of losing that historical perspective, unless we are very careful.

As the Court well knows, although I am not a great judicial historian, the reason we have open courts and public trials was because of the abuses of the secrecy of the star chamber, and that's the reason why our forefathers brought that to this country. And so I would encourage you when you look at this rule to not lose that historical perspective and to think along the lines that the rule needs to be drafted in favor of the fact that all of these are open records, that these are open courts, that they are open to the public, and it's only under exceptional circumstances that we should ever permit these records to be sealed.

One of the major reasons I wanted to speak with you today is I just concluded one of these product liability cases, that Tommy was talking about, against a major automobile manufacturer.

During the course of that, the

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE \* AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 \* 512/452-0009

entire discovery was surrounded by a protective order that I negotiated for one and a half months before I agreed to it. I thought it was a very well drafted protective order. As it turned out, it permitted no access to my being able to provide those materials to other lawyers, because there were always stopgap procedures that the automobile manufacturer could use to prevent that from occurring.

I had to return all the documents at the conclusion of the case. When the case was concluded -- and I use the word "concluded" because the release contained a confidentiality order in it that I can't even tell you whether there was a settlement that was concluded, and I certainly can't tell you the amount of the amount of settlement -- and finally the court judgment was sealed at the conclusion of the case. That's the type of secrecy that has become the norm --

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: What if you had not agreed --

MR. KIDD: -- rather than the exception.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: What if you had

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

not agreed, Mack, to any of those terms? 1 MR. KIDD: Well, okay. There's --2 JUSTICE GONZALES: What -- what --3 MR. KIDD: There's two problems with 4 And, you know, it's sort of like the war 5 that. on drugs: "Just say no." 6 7 The first thing is from the 8 standpoint of my client, and it's always very 9 well done. I mean, defense lawyers are very, 10 very intelligent people, and they represent very 11 good, powerful clients. 12 13 14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

You work out a settlement agreement with the automobile manufacturer. They are willing to pay you an amount of money which finally your client is willing to accept, and the settlement agreement is all done. And all of a sudden you get this paper work that has a gag order in it, a confidentiality agreement in You pick up the telephone and call him and say, "I'm not going to sign this; no way I'm going to sign this."

He says, "Well, if you don't sign that, you don't get a check. Maybe you'd better talk to your client and see whether your client wants you to reject the settlement amount or

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

/

whether your client's willing to go ahead and sign the release as it's presently drafted."

That's -- that's the problem. You are faced with a conflict of interest between your client and being an officer of the court. On the one hand you realize that your public officer-of-the-court position ought to be, "No, I'm not going to do this. I'm not going to allow my client to sign this."

But on the other hand you realize
that your -- your major duty has to be to your
client, and that's the reason why corporations
are able to exact so much secrecy in these
proceedings, is because they see the big
picture. You only see one little case over
here; you're only one little piece of the
puzzle. And that constantly was an advantage
that the automobile manufacturer had over me in
that case, is because they knew about all of
this. I knew about none of this.

As a practical matter, the problems that it creates is we have a hope, even where you don't have punitive damages involved, that a lawsuit will have some deterrent effect. If a manufacturer can hide all of these documents,

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

you lose that deterrent effect.

documents.

2.5

I can tell you that Bill Whitehurst and I have had it occur with regularity in product liability cases involving exploding tires, involving automobile manufacturers: We will have attorneys call us from across the country that we have contacted who have had similar cases, saying, "You'd better come up here and look at our documents because we are about to be placed under a confidentiality order, and you won't be able to look at anything we have got." And it's been on more than one occasion that we have gotten on an airplane and

The other thing is you have to remake the wheel. It increases the cost of all these lawsuits. The asbestos litigation was a prime example where the plaintiffs' lawyers were having to go back and reprove these things over and over again that had already been proved before.

gone across the country to look at those

In this case, I had a damaging memorandum that had actually been introduced in the trial of a case in Columbus, Ohio. I knew

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

from a seminar paper what the thing actually
said, and yet I spent nine months trying to get
ahold of it, and after the case was concluded,
it went back to the automobile manufacturer. I
had experts in the case that knew about the
memorandum and had never seen a copy of it.

And by the way, when I got a copy of
it, it looked like it had been xeroxed 101
times, that it had come off a microfilm machine.

1.0

it, it looked like it had been xeroxed 101
times, that it had come off a microfilm machine.
It had double red lines between it and it said,
"Produced Pursuant to Protective Order" across
the face of it, so that if I had wanted to make
it into a trial exhibit, you know, it would have
looked like trash.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: So much for the honor system.

MR. KIDD: Huh? Yeah.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: So much for the honor system -- and protective orders in products cases.

MR. KIDD: I really encourage you when you look at the rule to not lose sight of the overall perspective. I mean, what are we trying to do in this rule? And -- and, you know, I know the family lawyers are up here to

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

testify about this, and --

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Can you give us a way that we can protect the public interest without allowing somebody just to get in the National Enquirer because of some unfortunate private circumstances?

MR. KIDD: And I -- I think it's a difficult problem. I think the very first thing that the rule has to say is that court records are open records, and I mean that includes discovery.

Gosh knows -- I got out of law school in 1964. You-all started requiring that discovery materials were not to be filed in the -- in the mid 1980s. Over all of that time, we had judges in Travis County that were involved in divorce cases; we had public officials that were involved in all kinds of cases. I can't remember a single abuse where the Austin American-Statesman, or anybody else, went and read some confidential court documents and published some kind of salacious story regarding one of our -- our district judges that was involved in a messy divorce action.

So the first thing is you have to

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

	• 1
en e	
en e	
	, ·
•	
	•
$(x,y)$ for $y\in \mathbb{R}^n$ and $(x,y)$ is $(x,y)$ and $(x,y)$ for $y\in \mathbb{R}^n$ . The $(x,y)$	43
	ŗ, r
	, 4
	• (
the state of the s	ζ. r.
	•
	<b>:</b>
the first of the state of the s	, a
en de la composition de la composition La composition de la	
the state of the s	

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

start off with the overall perspective that they are open records; they are public records. Now let's build in the safeguards. And I'm willing to build in the safeguards, but the safeguards have got to be, number one, difficult, because the litigants themselves can't agree on these things. Like Tommy Jacks said, there's nobody to represent the public.

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, it's a difficult thing. For instance, in paupers' affidavits we have the district clerk brought On eleemosynary institutions, the attorney in. general is always a party on a will contest, for instance, that involves a charitable trust. it's hard to find any one person who has the financial interest or the incentive to represent the public interest here, and on the other hand, with -- as I mentioned earlier -- more of our counties not having a computer generated system of keeping their records. And all that is guite a burden to -- for them to -- for a deputy clerk to figure out who, among newspapers in the county, and these other people who may have signed up, should be noticed in a certain case.

MR. KIDD: In The Washington Post

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

survey that was done when they came out with their articles entitled "Public Courts, Private Justice," they interviewd one judge in -- in Washington, D.C. His attitude was, "Private lawsuits are private business. I have never given much thought to sealing records unless it's opposed."

And what's happening, especially in the area of protective orders, and I see it now happening in the area of sealing court records, is you have the litigants coming in and they say, "This is agreed to, Judge. We don't have any opposition to this. I mean, both sides are agreed to this." And the judge, being busy and having a docket to control, says, "Well, that's fine. As long as you're agreed to it, I have no problem with it." But there is a problem; there is a problem. And so I think it's got to be left with the courts. It's got to start off with the trial judge and then it's got to be subject to some degree of scrutiny by the appellate courts.

I don't know how to tell you to draw the definition of "compelling need" or "compelling interest" or "the right of the

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

public," but I think that the McElhaney draft is a step in the right direction, and that is, there has got to be some sort of procedure set out whereby the litigants can provide for the sealing of records.

And gosh knows, you-all make it real tough on us, you see, when you come up with examples where any of us, were we sitting on the bench, would seal the records. I'm not suggesting to you that there ought not to be that proviso or that provision.

The family lawyers give very good examples of cases where the records ought to be sealed.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Why don't we hear from them so we can -- in the issue of time.

MR. KIDD: So -- so I'll conclude by saying that -- that I think what needs to be done is to provide the mechanism for it, and then with the guidelines that are drafted by this court, you will provide a way by which those records can be sealed, but only in those exceptional circumstances.

I thank Your Honors.

JUSTICE HECHT: Anybody have

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

1	questions, besides Judge Gonzalez?
2	Thank you.
3	MR. KIDD: Thank you, Your Honor. I
4	appreciate it.
5	JUSTICE HECHT: Next up is Howard
6	Nations.
7	
8	HOWARD NATIONS,
9	appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in
10	administrative session to consider proposed
11	changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas
12	Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of
13	Civil Evidence, stated as follows:
14	
15	MR. NATIONS: May it please the
16	Court, I'm Howard Nations from Houston. I'm
17	appearing here as a trial attorney from Houston.
18	I'm also appearing as a member of the board of
19	governors of the American Trial Lawyers
2 0	Association and on behalf of the Texas Trial
21	Lawyers Association. I will try to be direct,
2 2	to the point, and brief in my remarks and not be
23	repetitious of what's been said already.
2 4	I will reiterate one thing that Mack

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

Kidd said and that is that -- in response to

25

your earlier inquiry, Justice Phillips -- "Is this a national problem?"

This is at the very top of the list of the Association of Trial Lawyers of America of concern. At the last board of governors meeting, there was a resolution directed to this. Most of the board of governors meeting was given over to consideration of these secrecy orders, and it is -- I anticipate that there is going to be an entire issue of Trial magazine that will come out shortly devoted solely to this issue. It's that big a problem nationwide.

And I would like to --

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Would we go a long way in solving this problem by any member of this association taking a pledge among each other that "We will not sign another of these orders," period?

MR. NATIONS: The problem is -that's one of the things I want to address, and
that is that this is far -- this reaches much
further than the attorneys.

I think a lot of what has happened has been solved in 1987 by this court in Garcia versus Peeples in the shared discovery decision.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

But the -- there is a much greater interest here than the interest of attorneys. There is a much greater interest than me being able to give Tommy Jacks information. A lot of that has been taken care of by this court.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I'll -- I'll answer your question momentarily. Let me direct the -- my focus to a very specific thing, and that is the definition of "court records." I feel that discovery must be a part of court records.

Several reasons: First of all, discovery is not a part of court records just quite fortuitously because there's a rule which was adopted as -- as an administrative aid to the court clerks, having to do with storage space. But there is absolutely no doubt that if I go out and take a deposition tomorrow and the witness draws an exhibit on it, and I have custody of that exhibit and I go make changes on that exhibit, then I am tampering with court There is no doubt about that. The records. fact that I am in possession of it does not keep it from being an official court record, and as an official court record, the fact that I have possession of it does not reduce the dignity of

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

it to any degree less than the plaintiff's original petition which is on file at the courthouse.

So this -- if, in fact, there are constitutional arguments to be made here concerning the open courts doctrine controlling these records, then certainly the -- the rights of consumers and other groups to -- to court documents should not be sacrificed on the alter of -- of storage space. That's a totally artificial distinction; it's an administrative matter.

so we -- the first point I want to make is discovery must be a part of this. The second point is that 90 percent -- when you take into account the cases that are settled, 90 percent of discovery -- or 90 percent of the court records in most cases will be in depositions, requests for production, requests for -- and the documents that are maintained by the lawyer, they are much more than they are in the actual court record, because we're only trying 3 percent of our cases, or even less. So all those other cases where there's settlement, we end up with a much bigger portion of the file

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

in the lawyer's office than you do in the court.

So if you -- if you don't apply this to

discovery, then you're -- you're applying it to

maybe 5 percent. You're addressing maybe 5

percent of the problem.

2.0

The next thing I would like to address -- and I hope this is more responsive to your question, sir -- is from an anecdotal point of view. The other side of the coin that Tommy was talking about -- and Mack was just talking about -- is what happens when you seal those court records?

I want to tell you a very quick story of what happened when a court record was not sealed. A case was tried in Hibbing,
Minnesota, in which a product was involved. It was a forklift. There was a \$13.8 million jury verdict. After that jury verdict -- Hibbing,
Minnesota, is not known as the great plaintiffs' bar area; you don't see plaintiffs' lawyers flocking there to practice. So obviously something happened to catch the attention of the jury.

In that case, the plaintiff's lawyers and defense lawyers agreed to a

## **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

2

3

5

6

7

8

13

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

17 18 settlement, post judgment. The plaintiff's lawyers and the defense lawyers went into chambers with the Court and said, "We would like to seal this file" -- both sides.

The Court, sua sponte, said, "No. Why? I represent the public interest. I'm not going to seal this file," and he refused to do SO.

Now, let me tell you what came out of that, because this is the other side of the coin. When that judge refused to seal that file -- the case is one that's been going on since 1954, where forklifts tip over.

When they tip over, they either catch people across the head and kill them; catch them a little lower and then they're a quadriplegic; catch them lower, paraplegic; or the lucky ones get thrown out just far enough that it breaks their legs.

It's been going on since 1954; there's documentation on that since 1954. 1954 they have been sealing documents. Since 1954 they have been having protective orders. There was obviously a smoking gun in that case. The smoking qun was left available to everyone

# **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

by the Court who refused to seal it.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

As a result of that, today, two years ago, that manufacturer has now, after 25 years -- 34 years -- after 34 years of refusing to address that problem, that manufacturer has made a \$35 change in that product which has now solved that problem, which may address your question earlier, Justice Hecht, which is: happens if these records do get out? Is there an explosion of litigation?

There is not an explosion of litigation if, as a result of these records being produced, and as a result of the smoking gun being found, the manufacturer says, "Wait a minute. Everybody knows about this now; we can't hide this anymore. Let's go change our product."

So there are forklifts being driven all over -- all over this country today, made by that one manufacturer, which are infinitely safer than they were three years ago. And I --I'll tell you now that they are infinitely safer because of the brave actions -- I mean, just the -- the totally individual action of that one judge who said, "No, I'm not going to seal this

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

file." And that product was changed as a result.

4.

1.3

1.5

But it wasn't -- they didn't look at his decision and say, "Hey, we'd better change our product. What happened?" And this is where the rest of it comes in besides the lawyers.

There are other people that have a considerable interest in this. Those people are consumer groups. They should have access to the precise documentation that is being sealed, right now.

Consumer groups who have the consumers' interest at heart, the people who are testifying before legislative groups, this court, often say, "This is a matter for legislative mandate; we have to wait for the Legislature to take some action."

All right. Those people who are going to testify before legislatures should have access to those files that are being sealed, and if they did, they could walk into the Legislature and say, "Look, you need new regulations on this. We need new legislation to protect the public."

The -- the persons, the -- the regulatory groups who are setting industry standards should have access to these records.

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

24

25

The same people who testify before legislatures are the ones who testify in -- in industry standards. In that forklift industry, there's -- there's a group that sets the standard for the industry. The people who got access to those records went to the annual meeting and testified before the group that sets the industry standards and said, "These industry standards need to be changed." And now the question is: Can a whole industry now ignore that? And now that -- now that a leading manufacturer of forklifts has said, "Okay, we're going to change it," now you have got a new industry standard, and now everybody else is either going to have to get in line or they are going to be facing -- they will be facing a multiplicity of litigation; either that, or they make their product safer, which is what this is all about, which is the safety of the consumers.

So to answer your question, sir, if all the plaintiffs' lawyers got together and said, "We're just not going to sign these anymore" --

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: We'll extract the same pledge from every judge in Texas.

## ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

1	MR. NATIONS: No. But but it's
2	still
3	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: They're not going
4	to prove any more
5	MR. NATIONS: You're still not
6	JUSTICE DOGGETT: That's really what
7	this rule will do on some of these things.
8	MR. NATIONS: The the problem
9	comes back to the one of "you can't do it
10	because you have got the individual client that
11	you have to represent," and if the client says
12	to you
13	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: "I want my
14	money."
15	MR. NATIONS: You're exactly right.
16	The client says, "Look, you know, I'm
17	paraplegic."
18	JUSTICE SPEARS: "Sign what you have
19	to. Get me the money."
20	MR. NATIONS: Yeah, exactly. "I'm
21	the one sitting in the wheelchair. I'm not
22	thinking about people that may be hurt in the
23	future. I'm the one that's confined to a
2 4	wheelchair for the rest of my life. I want my
25	money, and I want it now."

# ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

You know, I -- I -- I have made an occasional persuasive argument in my life, but I never -- I've never been persuasive enough to persuade an eighteen-year-old paraplegic, as I had in that case, to say, "No, you sit in that wheelchair for a couple more years while I try to work this out for the good of the public," and also you turn down the extra dollars they are going to pay for the -- for the -- for the confidentiality agreement. It just can't happen. And that's where -- that's the problem. That's why we're -- I hope we're making the point that you're the one that has to do this. We can't. The plaintiffs' bar can't. individual plaintiff's lawyer cannot do it, because we have to respond to our client's need. And the -- the group that has to do it is the group that is representing the public, and that has to be this group -- the interest of the public -- and this group is the only one that can do it.

So that's all the comments I have, and I will be glad to answer any questions if you have any more.

JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

3404 GUADALUPE • AUSTIN, TEXAS 78705 • 512/452-0009

MR. NATIONS: 1 Thank you, sir. 2 JUSTICE HECHT: Next to last is Charles Herring. 3 4 MR. HERRING: I think I'm going to 5 pass. JUSTICE HECHT: All right. б 7 MR. HERRING: I think the board has 8 heard enough. I'm co-chair, and we're going to try to have a -- the last committee meeting on 9 10 December 11th and have a rule out by the end of 11 December, but I think you have got a good 12 picture of what it's all about. And the good 13 news is that there's pretty much agreement on most of the structural rule, and I think we'll 14 15 have a good proposal for the Court. But thank 16 you for your patience today. JUSTICE HECHT: Mr. Soules signed up 17 18 earlier, but he --MR. SOULES: If I can just --19 20 JUSTICE HECHT: All right; all 21 right. 22 23 24

1

25

2

3

5

6

## LUKE SOULES,

appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in administrative session to consider proposed changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, stated as follows:

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

MR. SOULES: I'm Luke Soules. I'm here as a practicing lawyer. I don't really have a position to advocate, but there are some remarks that seem to me -- that I would like to leave on the record, at any rate.

The court system deals with the most sensitive problems of human nature, and somehow there has to be consideration to those human concerns and the need, in many of those human problems, for privacy.

In, I believe it was, Griswold versus Connecticut, Justice Douglas wrote -- and I believe that was a birth control case -- that the right to privacy --

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Contraceptives.

MR. SOULES: Contraceptives.

-- that the right to privacy is fundamental under the Constitution of the United States. 0f

22

18

19

20

21

24

23

25

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

course, the right -- the freedom of the press is a very definite right. But the right to be let alone and the right to privacy is also important.

business litigation. I don't represent plaintiffs all the time; I don't represent defendants all the time. I do do a certain amount of family law work in connection with my practice, so I think that the rule that we come with needs to balance those considerations with some of the others that have been stated here.

Second, on discovery matters, this

Court in 1988 wrote a very, I think, meaty rule

dealing with the problem of not sharing

discovery. It's contained in Rule 166b, 5 (c).

It says that a trial judge is to limit

dissemination of discovery only for good cause

shown.

And we know that as a result of

Garcia versus Peeples that outsiders can come

back and decide whether -- and have a

redetermination as to whether or not discovery

should be open. They have standing to do that.

Discovery is not open records.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

The Supreme Court of the United

States and the courts of this state have

balanced the need for openness in discovery and

keeping some of that sealed with the -- the need

to -- to get cases tried; to get them prepared,

tried, settled, and that sort of thing.

Any outsider has standing to challenge a record to seal, and we know that by -- because of the case of -- of Houston

Chronicle versus Hardy. It arose out of nuclear power plant litigation. When Judge Hardy sealed the discovery in that case, I think principally out of regulatory concerns because the licensing of the plant ultimately was -- was very vital, and the extent to which that discovery would later be open for those purposes was -- was to be later determined.

But at any rate, the -- the Court of Appeals wrote that Judge Hardy's order sealing discovery, except for that used in open court, and on a long list of other criteria, that it was a constitutional order. It came to this court. It was writ refused, NRE. It went to the Supreme Court of the United States, cert denied.

2

3

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So discovery can be handled differently, but it must be handled consistently with Rule 166b, 5 (c). The tools for discovery matters are already in the rules. What we don't have rules about are sealing records that are used in open court where matters of significant individual sensity -- sensitivities need to be taken into consideration, and that, I think, is the charge of the subcommittee, together with any other charge that this Court obviously wants to -- to put with us. And the -- the focus of this effort so far has been dealing with records that will be used in -- that have been used in court, and court judgments, and that sort of thing.

Those are my remarks, and I will stand for questions, if any.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Let me make sure I understand the drift of your -- your testimony. Do I hear you say that you disagree with the testimony that was given here by Mr. Tommy Jacks and Mack Kidd and Howard Nations to expand the definition of "court records" to include discovery, and you are saying do not do that? Do I hear you correctly?

2

3

4

5

7

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

\_\_\_

20

21

22

2.3

15

24

25

MR. SOULES: I say that they are different -- discovery products are not open court records under the existing case law.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: So you are not for the expansion of the definition of "court records" to include discovery?

MR. SOULES: Exactly.

MR. SOULES: That is correct. think that the tools for handling discovery products are there. Now, if the lawyers are going to agree to seal records, contrary to what the rules provide, and if the judges are willing to sign orders sealing discovery, contrary to what the rules provide, how do we deal with that by writing another rule? We have already got a rule that says that's not supposed to happen, but the lawyers and the judges are not honoring that rule. The reason that we have that rule is because in 1987 the trial lawyers wanted to raise shared discovery to a -- to a better Before that, I quess it didn't exist at And they came to the Supreme Court Advisory Committee with a suggestion, and that

suggestion, actually, I think, came from the trial lawyers through the Court and then to the advisory committee, and that rule was worked on and it had -- the advisory committee had a contingent of trial lawyers and other lawyers on it. It was worked out and was submitted by the Court and adopted by the Court that shared -- the discovery was to be shared unless there was good cause for sealing it and limiting its -- its disseminations.

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: What was that rule?

MR. SOULES: Rule 166b -- that's the major discovery rule -- Section 5, item (c).

And Section 5 deals with protective orders, and Section (c) says that only for good cause is a judge to sign an order that limits dissemination of discovery or otherwise restricts the use of discovery product in a given case. And, again, Houston Chronicle versus Hardy, and Garcia versus Peeples shows us that outsiders have standing to challenge an improper discovery rule.

So just because Mr. Jacks and his defendant have -- have agreed to an order

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

doesn't mean that the <u>Austin Statesman</u> and -and Mr. Nations and others can't come and say,
"That was an improper order, and we want that
discovery unsealed so we can look at it and use
it."

CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: This is not to say that even if one lawyer signs a -- an agreement, he can get his friend across the street to file suit --

MR. SOULES: I don't know whether he would get his friend across the street to do it, but Mr. Nations, on his own motion, can do it, because that's the Texas law now.

JUSTICE HECHT: Any other questions?

JUSTICE GONZALEZ: Well, let me -- I

don't understand your -- the rule provides: "On

motion specifying the grounds and made by any

person against or from whom discovery is sought

under these rules, the court may make any order

in the interest of justice necessary to protect

the movant from undue burden, unnecessary

expense, harassment or annoyance, or invasion

of personal, constitutional, or property

rights," et cetera. And then it says:

"Specifically, the court's authority as to such

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

1	orders extends to, although it is not
2	necessarily limited by, any of the following."
3	And (c) is: "ordering that for good cause shown
4	results of discovery be sealed or otherwise;
5	that its distribution be limited; or that its
6	disclosure be restricted."
7	MR. SOULES: "For good cause shown"
8	was were critical words negotiated in the
9	rule making process of that rule.
10	JUSTICE GONZALEZ: All right.
11	MR. SOULES: Thank you very much.
12	JUSTICE HECHT: Thank you, Mr.
13	Soules.
14	Mr. Webb?
15	MR. WEBB: Thank you, Your Honor.
16	
17	BRIAN WEBB,
18	appearing before the Supreme Court of Texas in
19	administrative session to consider proposed
20	changes to Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, Texas
21	Rules of Appellate Procedure, and Texas Rules of
22	Civil Evidence, stated as follows:
23	
24	MR. WEBB: I'm Brian Webb from
25	Dallas. I'm here basically on my own, but I

2

3

5

6

7

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

want to speak briefly from the family law perspective.

First of all, I'm moved by the eloquence and the logic of everybody who has spoken today. I think open records basically as a concept is a good concept. I'm also impressed by the Court's concern about family law matters. I'm going to try to be brief. I know it's late in the day.

We're talking about the proposed rule as a standard of serious and imminent threat to the administration of justice. Ι think those of us in family law are somewhat concerned about how we would meet that standard, when what we are primarily concerned with is a right of privacy that our clients and their families have. All they're doing is presenting their personal business to the court to resolve a personal relationship. I'm talking about cases where records are sealed by agreement, for the most part, almost exclusively. I'm not talking about trying to seal records where somebody has committed a crime or a fraud, or something like that.

Somebody earlier today mentioned

### ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

22

23

24

25

Mr. Bass and the abduction attempt that was Without using Mr. Bass, but foiled on him. take somebody in his position, and look at some of the things that are available in the divorce file if you are in his position of prominence and you're subject to that sort of a threat. You not only have your entire financial life laid out in a property settlement agreement of some sort, you have all the payments that you make, all the property that you have, whatever your assets are that you own, what you have had to give to your spouse, one way or the other. You also have things as fundamental as the schedule that sets out day by day, hour by hour, week by week, as to where your kids are, who picks them up, where they are going to be at a given hour.

If you are subject to that kind of a threat from somebody out there in the public that you don't know, that's chilling information to have out there. I don't know why anybody in that position should be compelled to leave that information in the public record simply because he's gone to the courthouse to get his divorce.

There needs to be a standard, I

#### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

2.5

think, that would apply to divorce and family law cases in such a way that it would allow people to preserve their privacy and their dignity. There is no compelling public need to know what problems people have had in their marital life, again, unless there is some criminal or fraudulent activity going on. It's simply their personal business being resolved. Sealing a court file in a divorce is no more chilling to the public interest than pulling the blinds of their bedroom as they fight, or whatever.

Children are -- are always going to be impacted by a divorce, but if you have got discovery that includes depositions about what the parents have done, or not done, or accused each other of doing that remain on the public record, in those cases where parents want to seal the record by agreement, including those depositions, I submit there is no good reason to keep those depositions a matter of the public record where not only somebody else could go back and read them, but these children could go back and read them 10 years later, or 15 years later, or one year later.

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

13 .

\_ \_

There are just all sorts of considerations in the family law area that need to be addressed, I think, differently. We used to have to ask for restraining orders by alleging violent and ungovernable temper, and -- and people would pick that up sometimes in newspaper articles about prominent people. The rule was changed so you don't have to make those allegations. Family law matters are exempted from the requirements of Rule 680 for purposes of restraining orders.

Exceptions are made in the family law area all the time. It's not a matter of saying family law matters are not subject to open records or being open to the public, but whatever restraints on the ability to seal are imposed have to take into account that this is a very different kind of a situation, and I think it's critical to anybody in any position of prominence or public exposure, or -- or anyone who is just simply trying to preserve their privacy and dignity of their family and their -- their family relationship.

One thing I would like to mention -- and someone mentioned earlier -- Ken Fuller's

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

recommendation of an ex parte sealing order. 1 think that's critical in the family law area 2 where you would ask that the record be sealed at 3 least until the hearing. If you are going to 5 have a hearing required as to whether to seal, you ought to have that sealing order in effect 7 until the hearing determines that it should be 8 lifted for some reason. If you have got allegations of abuse, or allegations of 9 10 whatever, you have got subject matters that 11 are -- are in need of being protected 12 immediately in the family law area on a 13 day-to-day basis. That's really all the comments I 14 have. Does anybody have any questions? 15 16 JUSTICE HECHT: Questions of Mr. 17 Webb? 18 Thank you. MR. WEBB: 19 Thank you. 20 JUSTICE HECHT: We may have overlooked someone. I don't mean this to be 21 22 encouraging, particularly at this time, but we 23 don't mean to overlook anyone, either. May I say that we -- the Court is 24

### **ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES**

deeply obliged to -- to all who have had input

25

1	today, because most of most of you have come
2	at your own expense, some time, some distance,
3	and we are very grateful for your for your
Ţ	comments.
5	That's all we have, Mr. Chief
6	Justice.
7	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Anything
8	further?
9	Thank you.
10	MR. WHITEHURST: Judge, let me say
11	that I haven't taken up any of your time and
12	and spoke with you, but I do want to thank you
13	for this process. I think this has been really
14	good today for the lawyers and, I hope, for the
15	court
16	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: Well, we
17	MR. WHITEHURST: and I think
18 .	certainly for the bar and public.
19	And we are very appreciative of your
20	doing it this way, and hope we'll do it in the
21	future.
22	CHIEF JUSTICE PHILLIPS: We will,
23	and we thank you, too.
24	We're adjourned.
25	(Proceedings Adjourned)

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING

1	STATE OF TEXAS )
2	COUNTY OF TRAVIS )
3	I, JUDITH CAROLYN COX, Certified
4	Shorthand Reporter in Travis County for the
5	State of Texas, do hereby certify that the facts
6	stated by me in the caption hereof are true;
7	that the said witnesses who came forward did
8	make the above and foregoing statements as
9	shown; that I did, in shorthand, report said
10	proceedings; and that the above and foregoing
11	typewritten pages contain a full, true and
12	correct transcription of my shorthand notes
13	taken on said occasion.
14	WITNESS my hand and signature of
15	office this, the 18th day of Acember,
16	A.D., 1989.
17	
18	•
19	
20	Vinh 1 D
21	Justin Carolyn Cox, CSR, RPR
22	Certificate No. 2201 Expiration Date: 12-31-90
23	ANNA RENKEN & ASSOCIATES
2 4	3404 Guadalupe Austin, Texas 78705
25	(512) 452-0009

1	CERTIFICATE OF CHARGES:
2	
3	Charges for Preparation of
4	Transcript (Orig.)
5	Mileage
6	TOTAL FEES
7	CHARGED TO MR LUKE SOULES . # 1589,00
8	
9	Via DID
10	Judith Carolyn Cox, CSR, RPR
11	
12	#000,481JC
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
2 4	
2 5	[[

CERTIFIED COURT REPORTING